

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.	Transcript of the Meeting held on 21 September 2010 - Pre Lunch Witness Examined: Shri D.S.Saroya, Director, NZCC	1
2.	Transcripts of the Meetings held, on 21 September 2010 - Post Lunch Witnesses Examined: Shri Shailendra K. Dashora, Director, WZCC Shri K. Sreedharan, Assistant Director, SZCC	21
3.	Transcripts of the Meetings held with Present and Past Directors On 22 September 2010 - Pre Lunch Witnesses Examined: Shri P.K. Mohanty, Former Director, EZCC Smt Rita Sinha, Former Director, NCZCC Dr. R.K. Bhattacharya, Former Director, EZCC Shri Anup K. Matilal, Director, EZCC	47
4.	Transcripts of the Meetings held with Present and Past Directors on 22 September 2010 - Post Lunch Witnesses Examined: Shri Talinokcha, Former Director, NEZCC Smt Angou I. Thou, Former Director, NEZCC Prof. Kamalakar M. Sontakke, Former Director, SCZCC Shri Y.K.Brahma, Former Director, SCZCC Shri S.P. Pathak, Director, SCZCC Shri Anand Vardhan Shukla, Director, NCZCC Sushri Neeru Nanda, Former Director, NCZCC	66

5. Transcripts of the Meetings held with Heads of Cultural Institutions, NGO's etc. on 13 December 2010 - Pre Lunch 96
- Witnesses Examined:
- Smt. Leela Samson, Chairperson, Sangeet Natak Akademi,  
Director Kala Kshetra
- Dr. J. Prasad, Vice Chancellor, Kerala Kalamandalam
- Shri K. Raamamoorthy, Former Director, SZCC
- Shri. Jyotindra Jain, Member Secretary, IGNCA
- Dr. Anuradha Kapur, Director, National School of Drama
- Shri. Jayant Kastuar, Secretary, Sangeet Natak Akademi
- Dr. Debjani Roy, Professor and OSD IGNOU
- Smt. Jayashree Mukherjee, Joint Secretary, DONER
- 
6. Transcripts of the Meetings held with Heads of Cultural Institutions, Cultural Bodies, NGO's etc. on 13 December 2010 - Post Lunch 131
- Witnesses Examined:
- Shri. A. Krishnamurthy, Secretary, Sahitya Akademi
- Shri. Vinay Kumar, Deputy Secretary, Lalit Kala Akademi
- Shri. Chabin Rajkhowa, Secretary, Srimanta Sankaradev Kalashetra
- Shri. Shubhashish Banerjee, NCERT
- Dr. Kiran Seth, Founder Member, SPIC MACAY
- Shri. Asit Gopal, Director, Ministry of Tribal Affairs
- Shri. Avtar Singh Sahota, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Panchayati Raj
- Shri. Waryam, Deputy Director, Song and Drama Division
- Shri. Har Sahay Meena, Director General, Jawahar Kala Kendra
- 
7. Transcripts of the Meetings held with CABC Members, Government Officials/Heads of Cultural Bodies on 14 December 2010 - Pre Lunch 145
- Witnesses Examined:
- Shri S.K. Mishra, Emeritus Vice Chairman, International National Trusts Organizations
- Ustad Amjad Ali Khan, Renowned Sarod Player and Member, CABC
- Smt. Ajit Kaur, Founder Chairperson, Akademi of Fine Arts and Literature

Shri Shailesh, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Youth Affairs and Sports  
Shri Umrao Salodia, Pr. Secretary, Ministry of Art and Culture, Rajasthan  
Dr. V. Venu, Secretary, Ministry of Culture, Kerela  
Shri. Ram Tewari, Director, Ministry of Culture, Madhya Pradesh  
Shri. Bhanu Bharti, Eminent Theatre Director and Playwright

8. Transcripts of the Meetings held with CABC Members,  
Government Officials, Heads of Cultural Bodies  
on 14 December 2010 - Post Lunch 171  
Witnesses Examined:  
Shri Hukum Singh, NCERT  
Shri Jaipal, Government of Tamil Nadu  
Shri Kamalakar Sontakke, Former Director, SCZCC
9. Transcripts of the Meetings held with Directors of  
ZCC on 14 December 2010 - Post Tea 188  
Witnesses Examined:  
Shri. Anoop K. Matilal, Director, EZCC  
Shri. Anand Vardhan Shukla, Director, NCZCC  
Shri. Som Kamei, Director, NEZCC  
Shri. D.S. Saroya, Director, NZCC  
Shri. S.P. Pathak, Former Director, SCZCC  
Shri. S.K. Dashora, Director, WZCC  
Smt. Rita Sinha, Former Director, NCZCC
10. Transcripts of the Meetings held with Eminent Cultural  
Personalities on 15 December 2010 - Pre Lunch. 212  
Witnesses Examined:  
Smt. Sonal Mansingh, Eminent Danseuse, President,  
Centre for Indian Classical dance  
Smt. Bharti Shivaji, Eminent Danseuse  
Smt. Shanta Serbjeet Singh, Eminent Art Critic; Journalist;  
Vice Chairperson, Sangeet Natak Akademi  
Smt. Shobhana Narayan, Eminent Danseuse and Scholar  
Smt. Vidya Shah, Eminent Musicologist, Director Programmes,

Centre for Media and Alternative Communications

Smt. Pratibha Prahlad, Eminent Danseuse

Shri. Vishwas Mehta, Former Director, WZCC

Shri. Rudraprasad Sengupta, Eminent Theatre Personality

11. Transcripts of the Meetings held with Eminent Cultural  
Personalities on 15 December 2010 - Post Lunch.

238

Witnesses Examined:

Shri. Bansi Kaul, Eminent Theatre Personality

Smt. Sudha Gopalan, Eminent Art Scholar, Director SAHAPEDIA

Shri. Siddhartha Kak, Founder Surabhi Foundation,  
Eminent Cultural Personality

Sushri. Maitri Pahari, Eminent Choreographer

Smt. Arshiya Sethi, Founder Kri Foundation, Eminent Art Scholar

**21st September 2010, Pre Lunch.**

**Transcriber's Note**

\*[NC] stands for names/sentences not clear in the transcription

Members Present:

Chairman- Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar

SKM- Shri Sitakant Mahapatra

AP- Shri Amol Palekar

MOC- Ministry of Culture

DS - Shri D.S.Saroya, NZCC

**Chairman:Welcome to the second meeting of our...**

So, shall we start, the today's meeting and tomorrow's meeting are designed to secure for us as much information as we can about how on the ground the zonal cultural centers are performing, as per their own self assessment and then to measure current performance against the kind of goals which have been outlined last time in the interventions that I made and we now have a draft first chapter of our committee's report, it's a very huge draft form, it's largely based upon my own perception of what these ZCCs were set up for so we've set that as kind of background and of course those of you are particularly free to make whatever drafting changes you want, with regard to that, I thought we should measure the original goals against what is currently being done and reflect it though the recommendations of the committee to be made, And we want to do this, that is my hope that in the course of these two days, we not only meet the current directors of the zonal cultural centers but also their predecessors to see whether in some way during this long period of 25 years that has elapsed since the ZCCs were set up, there were changes you know constantly and deliberately made in the kind of objectives there were required to be fulfilled but I understand for the north zone cultural center, which is the first to be established and which in fact played the pioneering kind of role in that movement, we get some of the predecessors but I know that none of the predecessors has accepted your invitation to come and therefore we are more or less compelled to just remain with Mr. Saroya, the present director who is sitting in front of us, what I recommend to my advisors is that they write to these three previous or maybe it can be done through the ministry of culture, whichever way you think the communication will be better and ask them to submit their written report. It really-really matters that we learn from Geetika Kala as to what her perception was of what was to be done and what she did and in that period if I'm not mistaken coincided with exactly the Rajiv Gandhi had run in first 5 year, and I told you about the last time the ZCC movement was

driven literally from the top of the pyramid. Now what happened there after I didn't know except that the interaction I had done with the Ananth Murthy which was 4-5 years after Rajiv Gandhi passed away, there seems to be have been a change in the working, so that information would rather come from Mr. Alhuwalia and possibly from Mr. Jindal too. I'm glad that Mr. Saroya is with us and with your permission what I want to do is to ask Mr. Saroya to make an initial statement about not only the work you are doing currently but to the extent the information is with you. What has happened in the past and in what have been changed and in one obvious change is that we don't have any with us, that was the climactic event first in 1986 and then in 1989. Mr. Palekar was the CEO of Apna Utsav in Mumbai 1989, so he knows exactly how that climactic event took place, so you off-course don't have these things. So we would like to know that what are the things that are changed and what are the ways in which you believe that activities in ZCC are similar to what was happening in first 4-5 years and in what important respects they've changed, so over to you Mr. Saroya and we look forward to hear from you some details.

DSSaroya: Honorable Chairmen and Honorable members of the committee of the ZCC, it's my privilege to make this presentation on the activities of the past 25 years, I've placed a folder before your honor, which contains two written, it is in two parts, presentation on the activities of the past 25 years and then a status report on and ATR on the Ananth Murthy report. I've also bought a small film which depicts the entire period which is in two parts and if your honor first wants to see the film, I'll start it.

Chair: (films are shown), may I request that because we are pretty short of time and I would like our director to continue his presentation but before you do for the fear that those who are seeing your film from last hour or 45 minutes might have the opportunity to comment on what they've seen, before we move on to the rest of the discussion. I would like to make a few comments and my colleagues also to say what their reaction is and then you can continue with your presentation and I'm sure that more issues will come while you'll be doing your presentation. One major change that I had seen since 1985 is that your capital expenditure on your headquarters seems to have grown very considerably. When originally the scheme was devised the idea was that we would locate them in the places of cultural significance but try minimize the capital cost of headquarters construction, so that the focus on the center remains on rural areas and slum areas, rather than either in the headquarters itself or in closed auditoria places where it needs to be go to, now obviously this film is illustrative, rather than comprehensive but most of what I've seen here, seems to be either headquarters or before extremely what little we saw of the audience was repeatedly that of very noble personalities like Governors, Chief Ministers, the former Governor of Rajasthan, we didn't get very much what the audiences were like, with respect to one of the less urban and more rural focused events that you were showing. So I wouldn't like to rush my judgment based on your film and I've had a very quick look as why this film was that such a long presentation of activities in past 25 years, and I see that there is a large number of fairs to which you've been more or less regularly participating. But I would like to know very

much more about the exposures of the that you've put together, for the rural people, for the urban slum dwellers and the proportion of people who in any case are catered to by what I would call like the Siri Fort Auditorium Syndrome, and I say this because I understood it and I was present when you were created, the PM at that time Rajiv Gandhi, while India had made a remarkable improvement in the previous 40 years, in establishing institution, national museums, and its counter parts in the states. Almost all the exposures were to very elite audience, largely urban audiences, largely audiences concentrated in capital cities, a very clear distinction has been made in which classical artists and folk and tribal artists, with remuneration levels to the former astronomically higher than the latter and a kind of localization of our folk and tribal traditions compared to the nationalization and even globalization of our classical folks. From the presentation that we've seen here, are very large number of the events that you were chosen to highlight and those who are appeared to take place in Patiala or as we tried to catch the names of the places as you passed very quickly over the photographs, names like Chandigarh kept getting repeated, whereas the more rural location do not see much attraction and we don't see very much except from one or two during glimpses the course of this presentation, of this very high quality folk and tribal artists being taken to location where people don't have access to these art forms would have the opportunity to interact with them. We had one scene of a kind of Shoba Yatra taking place I think in Shimla or any other hilly region, there is one little sequence of some army people there I don't know about it as you didn't mention it. And at one point we had sequence where members of the audience appeared to be aam aadmi but far too much your presentation seem to be audiences in any case secure access to these art forms, and this appears to be something of a departure from the original aims of the ZCCs, finally at that time there were attempts being made I'm not sure, whether it includes North Zone or not but there were attempts being made to establish Yatras that would go to the one part of the zone to the another part of the zone. Traveling largely through mofussil towns and villages and conducting their performances, out in the open wherever it could be secured, some of the things that you've shown us here are of extraordinary high cost performances, there were troops guides, magnificent backdrops, platforms. I don't know whether somebody else was paying for it or not. But your selection indicates that you want to be at the high end, rather than being at low end which ZCCs were conceptually focused, even in the actual practice, those norms are not broken. These are the comments that I would like to make and you continue with your presentation and you would like to respond to my comments But before I hand over the stage to you, I would like to ask my two colleagues that if they have any comment on these films

SKM: I expected you the even centre has done the maximum number of these circulated and some of it, the maximum number of performing arts as expected from the jury. Now the quality of this we are not sure about it, but the look at this, how many of them are of quality that deserves to be of or it needs to be done at different formats, but in your area the number of centers are already documenting so much, like the Kullu festival and all that, so

much of folk is already there, because one of our interest would be that nothing should be duplicated and that needs to be very carefully, particularly in your Punjab art council and in Sikkim so much of documentation is going on that side and particularly here lot of documentation is done on Utrakhand also. So in order to prevent duplication and now we are thinking that if ZCC is to have an identity, so it should have also carved out an area where it can specialize, apart from this community participation, Punjab is noted for it there is so much for it, is it possible for both side as culture is created by the people but also there are of individuals who give us the culture, such young individuals who deserves to be spotted, taken out for encouragement given all us what were thinking the Guru Shishya Parampara, but even those who are not in family lives, like there are individuals who are so good that deserves to be spotted and give them what they deserves. If in your zone we can even pick up 4-6 people, then this will be something which we can show as we all know and how it can it be located and given benefit out of it. The other point I would like to make is that we are trying to build up a kind of dual linkage, this side take the high culture to the people, the other side also take this, find out and encourage, panchayats and the local shop melas, in this further any kind of problem would emerge, do you have any perception, how the panchyat bodies can be authorized and empower more to do what they expected do, but we should first know that had we give them any adequate services, power, adequate administrated staff so that they can participate, meaningfully and from that side we can make the linkage up and what can ZCC do that way. Even the community parts and other folk festivals are more than other parts also. Punjab particularly but locating

AP: I mainly would take the line which was spread out by Mr. Mani, I would like to know if we are able to at zonal cultural level, A are we able to take the folk arts to the other parts of the country, which are related to your zone so that is one definite way of cultural exchange, and two simultaneously I find almost lacking is the classical arts to the rural areas. You know when we talk of preserving art forms, most of the time we talk about folks or folk art forms, look at the classical art forms they are also on the verge of getting extinct. And those arts take the classical Indian music, forget the top stars and all that, but in today's generation you'll hardly find out a worthwhile performers and those performers are not able to reach to the common man, as again they are either performing in urban places or abroad. For our classical art form to be reached out the common man or to the rural areas, is something which zonal cultural centers must look at and that was the thought which became predominant while watching the things, we are most of the time thinking and talking only about folk arts. Secondly about the folk arts forms also, unless we are able to have the continuation and relation to today, at a contemporary level all these forms are either as Museum pieces and therefore they are to be kept at distance and kept for admiration in a showcase, I don't think particular folk art is ever a museum piece, as folk art is considered to be alive stays alive, take all the corrupt influences of the contemporary world today and still survive retaining its strength, so all those folk art forms, if one can preserve and while preserving it can also interact with the zones of other states and unlike you I saw one, for

example that in Punjab festival, I think it's an excellent not only idea but also showcasing and interacting with other states and where your art forms and culture can be shown and taken to the other states and on these level if we're are making efforts, then I would be more interested to know those.

Chair: Just one second, would our advisors like to ask anything. Ok, please carry on with your presentation and in course of during so, we appreciate your comments and responses to the

DS: At the outset I would like to comment on your last suggestion for taking classical art forms in other states, in fact I must be candid 95% effort is to promote and preserve folk arts and classical art forms our governing body so far we are giving it 5% importance.

Chair: Can you explain the rational for that; why your program committee and other favor their center focusing almost exclusively on folk and tribal forms presenting classical art form to the audience constituting approx 90% of our countries who never get the opportunity to see it?

DS: Because we were constantly reminded that classical art form this is the subject of Sangeet and Natak Akademi

Chair: This is very important point does the Sangeet and Natak Akademi: not concern itself for performing folk arts?

DS: It does but mainly in classical arts.

CHAIR: See, that in fact, that is why Sangeet and Natak Akademi: was chosen for this type of art form and it will their mark to produce their artist who are world renowned, very often who don't need any government patronage to travel the globe because they are and paid so much money, as their children will not have to do work for next 50 years. Originally the idea I don't think was the Sangeet and Natak Akademi will only be on the classical side, but the functioning of the Sangeet and Natak Akademi with respect of the zonal cultural centers appears to be outsourced with leading to a situation in which ZCCs are as much production centers as the Sangeet and Natak Akademi: itself is to the of their function as to be a distribution center which is to concentrate on taking existing art forms rather than cultivating them getting those taken out to as many parts of India and people of India, for those who don't have any exposure to it. I also think we need to know much more from you as that was not shown to us of how much you are interacting with other zonal centers in having your artists go and participate in their functions. Mr. Palekar mentioned, but that's the headquarter of the south zone cultural center, my constituency happens be, just outside it begins 10 - 12 kilometers and they've seen south zone cultural center in the last 20 years except when once when right in the beginning when my older friends were running this center persuaded me to come in, again you said in this presentation, the presentation of the activities from past 25 years. But I don't find here the listed activities in 1985, 1990, 1996 and 2000, you've given

the introduction of what they'll be doing but there's no date or activities mentioned here. And now I would like to handover this stage to you and you continue with the presentation and answer to all the comments of the respective jury.

DS: Chairman sir, I would like to reassure the committee members that whatever is shown here is not the whole thing, in fact our interaction with the poor and remote programs are mostly in rural area but those haven't been video graphed

CHAIR: May I ask why, I mean it seems to me the crust of the matter, you have taken great trouble to video graph Minister of Tourism, and other people. So why hadn't you thought it important to video graph remote areas also?

DS: I just give you 1 example, as we're implementing this Guru Shishya Parampara reaching out to the remotest corners and this is one example, this is a dummy copy and it hasn't been published, I just got it today and this is a monitoring virtue, so folk people are from all the regions, real gurus who are doing commendable work in their line, they've received scholarship from us and they could gather together only at a central place just for review of what they've learned in a year

CHAIR: Mr. Saroya I've to interrupt you again, I'd a very quick look at this dummy copy. It shows a commendable coverage of artists and art forms, it also indicated how you are involved in talent searches, which was not one of the original objectives of ZCCs but which I find from a very quick glance from your report as this decision was of Government of India and which you proceeded to implement, and which I'm happy to learn about because there is no reason why to search for the talent in Urban only when you can search it in rural areas and specially from Guru Shishya Parampara that's a commendable thing. But this talking about also doesn't answer my point about how far have you succeeded in deliberately making center piece of your program approaching those people in urban and rural area who are deprived of access to the western culture and secondly the point that Mr. Palekar has raised too, what extent the exposure even the folk and tribal art of the north zone, south zone, south central zone, north central zone, north east zone, this was not here, they were short surveyed, I saw a bit of Sikkim, Mizoram, I saw occasionally you had these fascinating people dancing to the same beat, which has been for the last 25 years the standard practice, and this is a very effective presentation but in your distributive aspect what had you done, this doesn't answer, but otherwise the presentation is ok.

DS: Sir, we organize this in some urban area then our effort is to send teams to the inside of the country side, for example in Amritsar we've big spectacle that was the festival of North-East, 4 - 500 artistes together in Amritsar for 6 days. We send those artists into villages we grouped them and they performed it there also. We went to Wagah Border 20 - 25,000 people gather there to see the retreat festival on weekends from all the countries, we tied up with BSF and we showed our art forms there also. Artists from my region perform in each and every small town. This is a national exchange program, which is very

successful program and similarly the artists from other culture zone they come to our zone and on very short notice in small village, I can provide you the complimentary lists of all the activities right from the beginning 1985. So, it will be sent to you in advance earlier. Annual reports are very bulky reports. Sir, the number of melas we are participating, I assure you that elite people don't visit melas only poor people visit there. Last year in Kumbh mela there were lakhs of visitors and we send more than 350 artists there to show art forms for 15 days. They performed day and night. It is not that we aren't reaching out anywhere; we are mostly performing in villages also. I'll see to it that we can document that part also.

CHAIR: No, you have to be honest. Suppose you have 1 crore rupees with you, committee wants to know that what percentage you had targeted to urban audience, what percentage you had targeted to Rural audience and

DS: Sir, to be very frank I don't have that much right idea at present.

CHAIR: You can give us the rough idea.

DS: More than 60% is on rural area. Sir, the spectacles you have commented on, that the huge event, for example Punjab government give us the huge project to national games, you organize opening and closing ceremony and you can focus Amritsar art forms or any other art forms. Last year they've also told us to organize the opening ceremony of the Kabaddi World Cup and there will be mostly rural population and it will be telecasted all over the world. It wasn't our program but we've helped them in their program.

AP: Which is excellent, what we are trying to understand and probably which will help you a little to know a better vision of what can be done, ok, now when you say that you go to other state and perform, you perform mainly in the city as you said this function is organized for opening ceremony, along with that had you made any efforts to go beyond that, can you also think of going to the adjacent areas, rural areas or to give you very simple example, when apna utsav was organized in Mumbai, we had insisted that the opening and the closing ceremony will be going in huge stadium, the complete apna utsav was being performed every day from morning till night, in every corner of the state, to each and every place, gali, sub-urban and etc. Like, I haven't heard of your troops coming in my west zone or anywhere, they may come for particular function and troops may perform, but that is for a specific purpose. What one is trying to look at is far beyond that. Ok having coming to Mumbai do you plan to go somewhere else like Pune, Kolhapur and etc. As these are the places where people get exposed to the new art forms and experience a different thing in their life. What are the kinds of things which are being done and this has to be better exchange amongst your counterparts.

DS: Sir, just today there is a performance of folk dances in Faridkot, and it has now established NC now all the artist I have planned will go to NC which is a small place and from Faridkot they'll travel to NC in Haryana and they'll perform in other small towns also.

We've planned like it, so more than 150 artists are performing.

CHAIR: This is very reassuring as you said, but it could be useful to the committee, in fact if you were to prepare charts and show which is the hub and where are these folks, where they'll go, how much time will they spend there. Also you have to let me know whether you have the moving yatras which were the characteristic

of that time, which was or I think the west zone has the Yatra, "Maru se sagar tak" and the artists will proceed with the Yatra. And if you are doing these types of things then we'll be more interested in watching these things in your documentary.

DS: Honestly speaking, during the past 2-3 years we hadn't done these things, but the suggestion you had given we've already implemented it. When I went to Amritsar I have been to rural areas like Preet Nagar and we organized lot of activities in those villages where proper roads are not there and they haven't seen TV there.

CHAIR: How remote it is? How far is Preet Nagar from Amritsar?

DS: Its' on the border.

CHAIR: That's why I wondered why Tarantaran was not there, I also want to know, that's why I wanted to have a chart where you can show that this is the hub and where all places you've been to.

DS: That depends upon the situations on that particular point of time. We've rural

CHAIR: I presume you mentioned Amritsar not as a solitary example but its' an example, so you would have done it at various other hubs, so what are the

DS: We actually did sir, from Amritsar

AP: The standard Rural Sports ya

DS: Which is world famous things, and all the artists were taken to and I think I have video of it.

Chair: Excellent, I mean that is, its' precisely this was what your ZCC is all for, not for the government of Rajasthan. I mean that I would regard the department of culture would want people there. I think they've paid you for it. But I'm disturbed in fact that this film which was not filmed by you and it probably reflects It's so VIP oriented that the mental attitude towards the ZCCs I'll be much I've seen that rural sports there, I've seen there huge number of villagers are coming and in melas, if you are performing there, so that's what you all are for and if your zone is doing it alone and no other zone is doing it then you'll be on a improvised stage or at no stage but you'll have more affect in the villages than the other zones. I've seen many times if any Bollywood superstar or a singer comes on stage people will come from far away to see them, even those people who didn't have much exposure to

these things and the ZCC is all about giving good and memorable experience to those people who doesn't have exposure to these kinds of things. Classical artists should also be invited on stages as we'll talk to Sonal Mansingh and offer her 50,000 rupees to perform on stage.

Moc: The chart the chairman mentioned, you have chart which will show that not only your zone has performed on other 6 zones, the chart would show where you have gone more, where you haven't gone more, similarly other zonal centers where all they perform in your area and how often. SKM: Number 2 whether you are encouraging other groups also, that this complaint that only one group is patronized and not other groups, this shouldn't happen, The chart should show whole concept and show that where all groups have performed in which all areas, doing that, we should encourage local talent there, we should preserve regeneration. And second thing is classical culture is fine, these are showcased in various schools, colleges and other organizations but I'm concerned that they are not showing their art forms in rural areas also. How much that can be done, it is better to travel in a particular region in the country rather than organizing opening and closing ceremony. Your friend Alhuwalia was not coming when I was in the ministry 4 years back, see there the problem is that they tell us they haven't got the fund and time is very less and can't be coordinated properly. Dispersal is also important that also should be kept in mind. One thing I suggest which applies to all the presentation, every director if we ask in 5-10 minutes in the beginning, how had he looked at it, as in 25 year so many people have gone and I don't know how long you have been in charge, so your own perception about the problem, to what extent you have complied with or deviated or not done what Anand Murthy's Committee said. Now you could also say what difficulties have come up and why it hasn't been done, so that will enable the ministry to have proper view of why it has happened, not how much we have deviated from that. That will be useful, therefore every director when he presents before that he can say as a person how he has looked at it, how he's looking at, what has been done in 25 years in his perception, that will give us some idea so that you've also done some home work and present it to us in a responsible manner, each director and in addition to the kind of documentation you have.

CHAIR: and I think we should allow you to be uninterrupted now, you're also running out of time.

MOC: You focus on main points and then we'll come up to main point.

CHAIR: Can you switch on your mike please?

MOC: Sir, the programs of the zone they are conceptualized by the program committee which has over developing presence of our committee and we just told them that these are the objectives and please remain within them, in the end of the presentation, I've listed few irritants or obstacles on achieving those objectives. I'll come to that.

CHAIR: Ya please continue

DS: In 1985 sir, when this society was constituted, the rate of interest offered by financial institutions was 15% and I come to the second point which is troubling all the time, departments of cultural of some of the states are so poorly funded as they pester us year around, day and night the telephone is ringing. Mr. so and so our Chief Minister is coming to them, you send 20 people you send 40 people...

CHAIR: I hope you are noting this; the Chief Minister is going somewhere and

DS: There's a pashu mela you send us 50 people to use them. Ok sir these were the two problems. At least two of my members states, Punjab and Himachal, they are not paying they are not even sharing the funds, 6 crores are due to be recovered from 4 states, they are not paying 1 crore. But they organize 1 crore rupee program once in a year from us, hence recently the other thing is that all the ZCC for the revival of the vanishing arts and definitely stopped the arts from dying, I can name even this; this Baazigar community won't be seen in the future. We've documented this for UNESCO, it's a research based document and sir

CHAIR: So what are you asking?

DS: I'm saying that artists should be motivated to keep their body and soul together. It's enough to survive.

CHAIR: What is your annual expenditure now?

DS: Less than 6 crores,

CHAIR: So you get grants on whatever

DS: Whatever we are earning on own earning.

CHAIR: What are you earning on your own?

DS: We've 16.3 crore for invested in bonds and banks and about 8 crores for reserve funds, which we've saved by previous predecessors, he was a financial wizard and I got a very solid foundation because he spent 4 years in financially stabilizing the committee, and due to his efforts, now we have 8 crores of reserve fund, 24 crores of invested and we get 15 - 18 lakhs in interest. That is reserved for infrastructure only.

CHAIR: My question is what is your annual expenditure and not annual earning.

DS: To the tune of large scale on total it was 4 crore 53 lakhs.

CHAIR: Where did the 4 crore come from?

DS: Most of the money was from Government of India, 2 crores was interest and other was grant.

CHAIR: So you get 2 crore from govt. of India and remaining 2 crores come from?

DS: From interest.

CHAIR: So you reinvested that?

DS: Most of the money was reinvested.

CHAIR: I need to know it more accurately. How much do you get by the way of your income from investments, and how much do you reinvest and spend out of that income?

DS: About 2 crores, 1 crore 80 lakh was the income from invested money

CHAIR: So, this means 2 crores every year from the central government every year

DS: That is not spent on programs because our governing body says that it should be reserved for the infrastructure as we need a permanent infrastructure for ourselves.

CHAIR: So you are doing exactly what we feared you would do and want you to stop from it, you are using most of the income that your income comes from 2 sources, one from Government of India and I need to know from you As far as I can understand your principal source of income is Government of India, it gives you 2 crore rupees and you also have income which is under 2 crore rupees which is from the interest rate and you have additional income which comes from spectacles and organizing events, of the money which comes in which is something around 5 crore a year. Out of this 5 crore how much goes to infrastructure, how much goes for establishment?

DS: Sir, establishment consumes 93 lakhs that is 1 crore and rest of the money was

CHAIR: Then you put some money in the infrastructure

DS: Infrastructure is yet to start it is in the final stages

CHAIR: So you spend 1 crore on yourselves and 4 crores on the activities of the centre.

DS: Yes

CHAIR: That's very commendable but how much of this 4 crore, can you just give me some breakdown of it?

DS: We've scheme wise breakup.

CHAIR: So you spend 1 crore on receiving artists from other parts of India within the zone, can you tell me the numbers that came in from outside and the number of place within the zone?

DS: We've covered from all the states. These artists are from outside, then they are sent to different place of J&K, Uttrakhand, Himachal Pradesh, Rajasthan and Haryana.

CHAIR: And what do they do when they go to these places?



DS: We contact the local department of culture, for example Culture Akademi: in J&K is very strong Akademi: and they organize it in really difficult areas.

CHAIR: I would really be interested in details of that. How are these artists deployed at your zone?

DS: I'll provide you the list.

CHAIR: Let's go to the next core

DS: Then there is theatre regeneration scheme.

CHAIR: What is that?

DS: It is to promote folk theatre

CHAIR: How do you do that?

DS: This is decided by the program committee. I've a complete list.

CHAIR: Do you run these in Patiala itself?

DS: For example in J&K we do it in collaboration with J&K Cultural Akademi:.

CHAIR: For where?

DS: It is decided by them. It was in Jammu.

CHAIR: Which type of people do you train in the theatre?

DS: Children, mostly children.

CHAIR: Are these children from Jammu or outside of Jammu?

DS: We were told that theatre will be for the migrants.

CHAIR: So this theatre in Jammu lasted for how many days?

DS: It was for about a month.

CHAIR: And so, you had theatre experts from Kashmir comes and resides in Jammu on the cost of the cultural Akademi: and the children were generally migrants. So how many children were trained over a period of 1 month.

DS: About 30 - 40.

CHAIR: What was your expense on it?

DS: We paid to the theatre expert who was to hold.

CHAIR: How many theater experts were there?

DS: 2 - 3.

CHAIR: It amounted to how much?

DS: 25,000

CHAIR: How many theatre workshops do you organize in a month?

DS: During summer vacations for children.

CHAIR: Where else had you done apart from Jammu?

DS: In Patiala our headquarter, which is our annual feature, every

CHAIR: One in Jammu and one in Patiala and where else?

DS: To places in Himachal Pradesh, one is Shimla may be in Chambal, it is again decided by state government.

CHAIR: I can read it by myself, you've told me that out of 4 crore rupees you spend 1 crore rupee on National Exchange Program and theatre workshop is very limited budget it is around 1 - 1.5 lakh rupees

DS: We've performances also.

CHAIR: Where do these performers perform?

DS: All over states.

CHAIR: I want to know give me an example, how much do you spend on it and where does it go?

DS: If we organize the theatre in collaboration Punjab University, we've major theater festival which happens in Patiala and in all the states also.

CHAIR: Let me take the example of Patiala, what is the expenditure on to it?

DS: 10 - 12,000 per performance, we do theater festival in Kurukshetra, Rohtak, Jammu, Patiala and Shimla.

CHAIR: Each of these is so well known that they are urban centers

DS: Some theaters are performed only in auditorium.

CHAIR: Look at this how the rules are broken easily, what I mean by theater is that it takes place only in open area Tell me one thing if you are doing theatre festival in Patiala; tell me do the artists who are performing perform in the villages nearby or the audience comprises of the villagers or rural class people.

DS: Sir, street theater is sent to the villages

CHAIR: So, Patiala festival costs you around 4 - 5 lakhs, having spend that 5 lakh rupees in Patiala, what happens to those artists, do you send these artists to the villages to perform or do you send these artists for the next theatre festival which will be held in Rohtak, Kurukshetra, etc?

DS: The theatre which is performed in Patiala cannot be performed in villages as it comprises of only particular type of sets and requirements which can be only fulfilled by auditoriums. We've different artists to perform in the villages.

AP: What is your expenditure on street theatre?

DS: For 10 performances we pay 4,000 rupees, it's around 3 - 4 lakhs.

AP: So you spend 4 lakhs in villages for street plays and 10 lakhs for theaters which are hardly seen by rural people. So far we got only 3 lakhs rupees out of it which is going to right place. Ok where street theaters are plays held?

DS: In Villages, remote villages and districts.

CHAIR: Can you give me more details on it?

DS: For example, Ropar is very-very backward district in Punjab so last year we sent a team for performing in 10 villages, it was on female issues.

CHAIR: That is nice as female infanticide is a big issue in the society especially in the rural class Therefore you have to tell me that you have to spend corers of rupees for these street plays which are relating to females going in Punjab. If it's only 10 villages in ropar

DS: 10 villages in other districts also?

CHAIR: Yes that is why I am saying you have to tell me how many villages for that.

MOC: In Himachal also how much?

DS: In Punjab it would be 10 and also for ropar it would be 10. That was the returns what Punjab was concerned. Now you tell

P2: What about HP?

P1: In which districts?

P2: It was in Himanchal near Shimla

CHAIR: there are other places near Shimla also so tell me where else

P2: Near Shimla only, from this year we have other districts also

CHAIR: That is in Patiala

DS: No that is near Manimajra near Chandigarh

CHAIR: That is even more horrible

DS: There are in those districts, Manimazra near Chandigarh, It is a pocket between panchkula and Chandigarh and nearby areas

CHAIR: It is as good as Chandigarh

DS There are some pockets of slums

M1: Are you concentrating on slum

DS: We are having regular workshops on children of slum into folk singing, dancing and both of them and these theatre workshops also

CHAIR: I don't know manimazra and I accept what you say and I agree

DS: we have our own bus and it goes there and takes children for the workshop and after 2 or 3 hours they are dropped

CHAIR: How much do you spend on it?

DS: Not much there is a lady who is Double MA in dance and singing and she gets 5000 and she spends 2 hours daily. She is volunteer and also a top performer

CHAIR: Give me a big chunk of expenses. I am still to account other 3 crores of rupees

DS: I don't remember

CHAIR: But you would know from your own memory.

MOC: Little bit intervention on rural area as a decisive policy for social policy for gender we have introduced last year. For the last twenty five years intervention has been made for it with a structured body and I would say and ask some of them as we are the second generation. None of them were aware of the mandate of the desirable

MOC: since I was the part of impetus intervention and I was aware of the biases that were desired from this team. You had publically wrapped it as it was more preferential than organic. So I came back and I without ever been told. He then turned around that the first meeting would be done by ZCC and I have my records also. Also to make my stand very clear I told them we had dropped classical as of yesterday. Please get on to pre and natural expressions and get out from this even management mode. It is easier to do it. when the next week when I joined the annual fest in Goa and all the seven directors were there and some of them were there for a week and there business was of pure event management. Then there were other examples of what I found would talk about relevant examples. You are asking me about that sufficient funding were sent to the original target audience but my concern was that our original target audiences were never met. These were rolled down into other activities and somewhere down the line these compulsions of focusing on x, y and z



segments through a, b and c intervention were lost. So this has been lost and required attention by deliberate sources. Some had been doing fair bits of both the urban structure classical and the folk form. We have to move on with the mental capacity. Then octave, republic day had come up and other north eastern facility and once you are organizing it these things are very rigid for those areas which are essentially preferential. We had gone to the initial difficulties that how to choreograph a natural folk scene with the limited resources on stage. I had the one problem in Durgapur as the fellow jumps from the stage. So these are the contradistinctions in the presentation and the rural implementation has not been guided

CHAIR: this is what we are examining right now. Can you please tell me?

DS: you want to know some other large component of expenses, we have one crore from north east state

CHAIR: what is that?

DS: we organized octave for around 8 north east states. This time we organized which I explained

CHAIR: so you got a national exchange programme you spend 1 core and one north east exchange programme you spend 1 crore

DS: yes

CHAIR: what else?

DS: 15 lacs for guru shishya programme and we want to spend more. It is for scholar ship programme

CHAIR: what else?

DS: 25 lacs for shilp gram activities

CHAIR: This shilp gram is in Patiala

DS: No in manimazra, Chandigarh

CHAIR: what do you do there? Are there products displayed there?

DS: it has a one national level mela which was organized in this October. That was in collaboration with Chandigarh administration

CHAIR: so what was your input there?

DS: we would be inviting artists from all over India and also cultural inputs and also artists from all over India are invited. We are providing them temporary stalls free of crafts

CHAIR: so shilp gram is not a permanent thing and it is an annual festival?

CHAIR: yes it is an annual festival and it has open air theatre

MOC: So out of the 7 zcc's, 6 of them have shilpgram. They have shanti nikan which was inaugurated a year ago and has portraits from the contributing states. So they had 10 different habitats from 10 or 11 different states. They also have open air amphitheatre and like in shilp gram we have the same thing

CHAIR: you are spending on what in the ship gram?

DS: they will be continuous from this year

CHAIR: so what have you spent on ship gram for 25 lacs?

DS: it was recommended by the joint Secretary and just for calendar year

CHAIR: so that means your expenditure would increase.

What is your budget grant for this year 2010-2011?

DS: 25 lacs

CHAIR: but the last year was also 25 lacs and if you would have organized your budget it would be much more

DS: but sir we have different national schemes in cultural state program certain people come and in some, other come

CHAIR: so carry on

DS: there is a continuous workshop for painting

CHAIR: so who all people come for this program and it would be children from the area itself?

DS: no sir there is a residential area in which there is a dormitory so people from those areas come here and they are the artist and stage person. They also work there and it is a very popular sport

CHAIR: who comes, Chandigarh people?

DS: they do

CHAIR: I suspect your servants come and not you, I wanted those people who have no access to folk, dance or classical should come here. This shilp gram why it is useful in itself so tell me why it is useful?

DS: it is basically for poor people who come for shilp gram

CHAIR: next item

DS: painting and this is a unique program and everyday something is happening

CHAIR: so for shilp gram you are putting 25 lacs of rupees

DS: yes

CHAIR: next big item

DS: kurukshetra festival and it is a big festival and it is for 20 lacs

CHAIR: where does it take place?

DS: brahm sarovar near kurukshetra

CHAIR: so it is in open, during a time when pilgrims come in a large number?

DS: yes it is during geeta jayanti

CHAIR: ok, so that is 20 lacs so in all you distinguish between melas and utsav? So how much do you spend on utsav and melas.

DS: this geeta jayanti is a very special thing

CHAIR: ok

DS: we spend 25 lacs for silver jubilee celebrations at Patiala

CHAIR: ok, it's good it comes in once in 25 years

DS: and then on documentation

CHAIR: so for arts you are spending 1 crore and very little on domestic front. This national program is interexchange program but what is intra zonal that you do?

MOC: I would like to say. 1 crore is under national program which means artists come to improve and also artist move from one state of ZCC to another state. Practically on the performances which are done. Another crore is the total of various minor activities that includes theatre rejuvenation documentation and it includes guru shishya parampara so nearly 2 lacs. One crore is spent on spectacles the big show the octave and kurukshetra and the programs which have a cost part for lighting, stage and other things

CHAIR: so that is the major count

DS: yes

CHAIR: is it ticketed?

MOC: no and public is welcome. But there has not been a systematic way in the past to get a target oriented. But in last one year ZCC is targeting school children and also giving incentive to the best 5 children of the school for this big event. So this is 3 crore. 1 crore

spend in shilp gram which include staging, renovation and other activities in shilp gram. Another one is on establishments. So that is the breakup of ZCC Expenditures.

CHAIR: any other expenditure in other streams?

DS: no

CHAIR: I want the program expenditure and also the cultural part which is most important. So the total breakup of the program along with expenditure is necessary so we can have the total view of the expenditure and what next needs to be done.

there were 5 crores corpus and ZCC were told to spend from that. Now I find the purpose and the objective of the whole thing was set up is barley being met, because the increased expenditure is going increasingly into head quarter expenditure because the expenditure is happening at Chandigarh from Patiala. So in establishing in Patiala, as has been done at Chandigarh is not right. As far as I can make out ropar is a district very close to Chandigarh geographically. So this means that working of ZCC is in Patiala that is where I want to end and please don't think I am being critical of you and you have done in a better way and it is very clear that you have managed to get a large number of artists. So it is good for artist, Patiala and manimazra. Is it good for generality of people and the answer to be known is important because there are no deliberate attempts to structure your programming out in the field and targeting poor audiences? So this is my principal conclusion what you have presented to us. So I would leave to Mr. Goyal to take forward to get a comparative thing. If we look at the income at 1985-90 from NZCC, it has increased and we can see how much we had spent on artist and target audience so the interest on five crores is nothing to what is spent on proportionality. So my interest is that the money spent by ZCC is towards the target audience and less now days for the aam aadmi so that is the concern for me. What we have to see in the future how it is targeted towards the aam aadmi and what are the money which is spent on the activities which are actually not the ZCC activities. They are utilizing them and we are not into the foreign visits. Here I find that if you were to identify the artists that would be a different thing. As that seems in your own perception that these films seems to have a greater significance than the activities that happen for the common people. so what happens to villages near Patiala. I have one last question to know. The name North Zone is .. and I had given the name. But now the time has come to change the name and also the director wanted to give fancy name to the centre. Would you approve of such names to different zones centres or would you approve the same name?

DS: I don't have a view on it

CHAIR: Do you have anything to add?

MOC: for shilp gram the problem is that the governing body which runs this is dominated by the artists who live in cities.

CHAIR: it should be a principal recommendation that you have to involve the panchayat then what has to be done at least in the block level and we should have that recommendations be taken in.

AP: also the domination of the artists who belong from the cities

CHAIR: there is not much resistance from the director what is your personal background?

DS: Punjab civil services

CHAIR: do you think that ZCC should be run by civil servants?

DS: yes sir 100 percent because the artist who performs there they fight. Shiv Singh thinks he is an international painter and renowned painter. They fight for TA & DA and they are not thinking for the purpose. So it is very essential some bureaucrats who is a writer or some involvement in the administration thing should head this or you have a person interested in culture

CHAIR: what is your personal interest in culture?

DS: I have been involved in culture activities and also other activities in Punjab in which Rajeev Gandhi also came. I was also a part of organization. I had an interest in photography so I have done it across India. I also had my exhibitions across India

CHAIR: did you have any previous experience into the cultural department?

DS: not in department but in CM office and I was handling the departments and programs for cultural development

CHAIR: did you do it voluntarily?

DS: yes as nobody was ready to handle it

CHAIR: I think I would interact with you in the next half. That will be now szcc and wzcc. I would not be surprised if wzcc becomes first. I would suggest a recess now and our meeting would be scheduled at 4.

## 21st September 2010, Post Lunch

### Transcriber's Note

\*[NC] stands for names/sentences not clear in the transcription

Members Present:

Chairperson- Shri Mani Shanker Aiyar

SKM- Shri Sita Kant Mahapatra

AP- Shri Amol Palekar

MOC- Ministry of Culture

SD-Mr Shailendra K Dashora, West Zone

P1-Programme Officer, West Zone

KS-Mr. K Sreedharan, South Zone

SD: I am working in the visual cultural center from last 7 months.

Chair: Which zone?

SD: West zone cultural center.

CHAIR: And what is your background in culture?

SD: Sir, I just do sketching and I used to participate in units.

CHAIR: Did you volunteer for this job or have you been forced to do it?

SD: I have volunteered for it.

CHAIR: Why did you volunteer?

SD: Sir, the fact is, that I belong to that place and my wife is working with us.

CHAIR: So do you think it will be better for us to simply look for people in Udaipur to become the director instead of looking for the PCS officers who may happen to have a connection because, even your first director Aditi Mehta was principally interested because she is married into an Udaipur family and it was an opportunity for her to continue being with the family. So, it doesn't seem to me to be a particularly good motivation to somebody to choose to become the director. So, would you be of the view that supposing we were to

say that after you have finished your turn we just ask to spread out an advertisement in local newspaper and say who would like to come to Bagore ki haweli? Are you still in Bagore ki haweli?

SD: - Yes.

CHAIR: - Thank god, you are there. Why not recruit somebody locally?

SD: Sir, firstly, till now culture sector has got people either from Udaipur or surrounding areas as director.

Chair: As Director?

SD: Yes.

CHAIR: So, they can be with their families?

SD: Family and they can be there for 3 years, 4 years or 5 years' time.

M: If I get somebody who lives in Udaipur I can get him for 20 years and I don't need a promotion, we will get him on contract so he does his job properly. Is that feasible or you believe that because you are a government officer you are able to get things done which a non government officer might not.

SD: Yes, that is true sir.

CHAIR: Such as?

SD: Suppose sir, a theatre person will be more interested in promoting theater. Suppose the local person is there, he will be interested in promoting his things more.

Chair: Then why is it that the Government of India makes the foolish mistake of appointing non government officers as the head of the Lalit Kala and Sangeet Natak and to the museum of modern art, school of drama. They are not appointing IAS officers or PCS officers. I don't know what the situation in the states is but I presume the equivalents are also appointed from out of the art club community.

SD: And sir to add to your information recently we have started recruiting professionals for National museum, for Libraries and archives and things like that.

CHAIR: But what is the work that you are doing which you think a non Government officer cannot do. You give me one reason that because you are not yourself an artist, but you are somebody interested in arts and you will be promoting all the arts together, whereas if we got a musician he will promote the music he will promote himself or theater man will promote the theatre. But don't you think people will order interest in culture of the kind which is found here. I mean we didn't have the experience of having so many of them amongst and there is lot of trouble but as far as I know there was no similar problem with

Ram Niwas. In your Udaipur suppose we got somebody like Narender Bhatti. He is deeply interested in the arts. He is unemployed. He is a bit dangerous because he is a landlord so one never knows when he is going to collect his rents. Otherwise there must be people who are interested in the arts who might be locally available and the other thing is that you are after all an institution to serve several states. How many states?

SD: 4 States.

CHAIR: Does anyone check from Goa or Gujarat, Maharashtra.

SD: At the nearest place.

CHAIR: No that's what they do when they all go to Mount Abu, there is no other commodity. So why do you think a bureaucrat is necessary to run a zonal cultural sector?

SD: Sir. One is the bureaucrat is a generalist second is he got connections with local administration within which rules work. You can get the work done speedily and there are program officers.

M: What is your work experience, you probably throw out some fertilizer, distribution seeds or BDO somewhere, how does any of that help in running a zonal cultural sector? I am not denigrating you I am denigrating your tribe in the case that we had, in the past, I go back to the time when I was associated. Now almost none of the civil servants associated with ZCC had a good career thereafter. There were people who were far too artistic to be able to take the bureaucratic strain so then I think of when I go back to that era before Jawahar Sarkar but Geetika Kala I think has not been promoted as secretary, Aditi Mehta has not she is getting into lot of problem subsequently. That Kamlakar, he was fantastic. He has no civil service background he took this job in Nagpur and went on to the Nehru center in Mumbai. Sheela Priya was a bureaucrat she did fairly very well but not exceptionally well. All these three had an interest in the arts rather than bureaucracy. And I think the ZCC at that time were more fulfilling the objective for which they were set up. At that stage we felt that in establishing these centers you required lot of liaison and governance. Whereas after establishing the centers we would need to have very wide acquaintanceship with the performing arts community all around the zone, not just the cultural department but nevertheless we are of the view that a bureaucrat because he got connections will be able to get things done probably. So you are a kind of extension service of the 4 departments of culture.

SD: Yes, sir.

CHAIR: Isn't that sad. Why does the department of culture need you there? They could be doing their job, you are telling me that Punjab which is the most prosperous state in the country doesn't have funds in department of culture to run their cultural program so they are milking the centre simply because it happens to be at a distance of one phone call from

Chandigarh and they succeeded in bringing almost all the activities there, in the case of east zone cultural centre. They actually removed the headquarters from Shantiniketan, Rabindra Nath Tagore whose 150th anniversary is now been celebrated at a cost of I don't know how many crore's of rupees and occupying rooms that we should be given, but they removed it from Shanti niketan and then to cheat Rajeev Gandhi they say we put it in Salt lake city which is not Calcutta and then they went out to merge Salt lake City with Calcutta so they are happily in the capital. Thanjavur is straining to go out, to be able to go back to Madras and be happy there, children's education and that entire he is not because my constituency is next door to his they all spend time coming to me with petition which has nothing to do with the culture and everything to do with their salaries. They have not petitioned me yet to say we can't do our work, I have not been in touch with the north central zonal cultural sector. We had as a first chairman who didn't have much to do with the culture, I don't know why we came there after that sector. The North east zonal cultural centre was determined to put up a building and one of the basic point made by Rajeev Gandhi was no headquarters building because you are not supposed to do your functions there and yet as soon as he was defeated the north east zonal cultural sector succeeded in putting up such a huge building near the Dimapur Airport that on all my visit to Dimapur I found my flight was delayed. So I went to see the museum and there was no body there, not a single visitor, wonder how was the successor sitting there, he took me around and I looked at one of the museum object and I liked it very much and when I exited they handed over the piece to me and I said how can you give me a museum piece, he said there is no one to see take it at your home. I just feel that we are not achieving what we have setup to do but I must confess with regard to the west zone, the idea of shilpgram that started from there. And we had the great advantage that Udaipur is in any case is a major tourist center a bit like Patiala is attempting to be, a bit like Punjab is a world heritage site and named by UNESCO so you get some tourists. But I ask myself any serious tourist who goes to see the Chaura museum or will go to the south zone cultural centre, there is no comparison between the value of those dusty cupboards and what is been shown at ZCC, there is a less initial grant the idea I remember it was that people from different parts of Rajasthan and different parts of the zone would be invited to come and live there and be permanent. It's an exhibition only because they are doing their work all of them and seeing them became an experience for those who visit. And the Bagore ki haweli was picked because its quite exceptionally beautiful but those peacocks that you have there are irreplaceable. Any where else there was an outstanding view from your window and it was totally neglected and it was taken over and several activities were started there and since Udaipur is very far from Jaipur. And therefore the shilp gram supposed to draw people from all over the zone. Can you now tell me what it is like?

SD: First thing was shilp gram was given on lease money for 25 years but we have taken over for 97 years. So its free of cost.

CHAIR: - Land?

SD: - Land but we don't take NC (14:28-14:34)

CHAIR: Okay I didn't know that Singapore was in the west zone.

SD: No, sir it's just.

CHAIR: You start from there that means you are fed up living there in Udaipur.

SD: No we started international to grass roots, sir.

CHAIR: From Indonesia?

SD: From international to grass roots.

CHAIR: Why you are not supposed to go international. For international there is a ministry of culture and all its production units all these Kala academies so far they are the ones who are doing the talent scouting or are supposed to, they have budget, they have much larger than yours or may be we need a special folk and tribal academy since the sangeet natak academy is increasingly becoming classical rather than others. But why should the zonal cultural sector whose job is to pick up the products of these institutions and take them to people where they live. Who will do that work and if you don't do who will do this? Okay let's proceed. International to grass roots. You have shown international and I am very awestruck, please show me grass root. These are someone's programs in which you participate?

SD: Yes, national programs .

CHAIR: - These are other people programs in which you participate?

SD: -Yes sir, national programs.

CHAIR: Okay you proceed.

SD: Shilpgram utsav.

CHAIR: This is shilp gram.

SD: Yes

CHAIR: Okay, proceed who are yours in audience?

SD: In audience sir outside of Udaipur there are many villages. All the villagers they come in the evening and see the programs and they are free of cost.

CHAIR: Okay this Shilp Gram festival that's a special mega event?

SD: Yes sir it is.

CHAIR: That is held once in a year?

SD: Yes sir. 10 days program.



CHAIR: 10 Days programs and on the other 355 days what happens?

SD: Sir, we have a program mission Prashan where there are so many small stages. In this program continuously programs, dances and songs are going on and tourists come and visit it.

CHAIR: Mostly tourists?

SD: Yes

CHAIR: Not the local people?

SD: No local people also and there are stalls. There are artisans and craftsmen also.

CHAIR: Should you be under the tourism ministry or cultural ministry?

SD: No sir tourism.

CHAIR: Is there any common man. In our country 70% of population is living on fewer than 20 rupees a day they can't come to Udaipur and so for them where do you go coming out of Udaipur? Next one you participate in someone else's festival.

SD: No, sir it's our festival and we do all the things.

CHAIR: Where?

SD: Near Ahmedabad there is Sanskriti Kunj.

SD: - Call it Gandhi Nagar.

CHAIR: So you go there every year?

SD: Yes sir.

CHAIR: Only there?

SD: No there is an utsav in Goa and in Mumbai there is Parampara festival.

CHAIR: In Bombay?

SD: Yes sir.

CHAIR: Where they also have the stage set for national performing arts. Some audience will go?

SD: Yes sir.

CHAIR: In Bombay where do you do your festival?

SD: Sir, University ground.

CHAIR: And do Dharavi people come?

SD: Yes.

CHAIR: Okay, you say you do it in Bombay. You said you do it in the University ground and every year you do there?

SD: Yes sir.

CHAIR: Where is the University Located?

SD: (disturbance from background) and Guru Shishye Parampara till now even 50 this art forms and each art form 8-10 students were taught.

CHAIR: In one year I'll take your Guru Shishye Parampara. How many students you train?

SD: Sir last year we had 80 students. We are doing 8 art forms so 8\*10.

CHAIR: Just 80 students?

SD: Yes

CHAIR: How are you going to make a mass impact with them?

SD: In any discipline sir there is a graduation art form, there are songs also, there are some instruments also then some theatre also, some painting also, it is very common in Kutch.

CHAIR: Would it make more sense to hold your Guru Shishye Parampara for that Kutch Painting in Kutch?

SD: We will do. This year we will try to start.

CHAIR: How many people?

SD: 1-2 Gurus will be there and 10-15 students will be there.

CHAIR: Is that enough? What do you achieve with that?

SD: To start with sir.

CHAIR: No I am saying instead of doing it in Bhuj, how about wandering about, going to other places to reach to those people? A least going to the block level and getting in as many kids as you can? If you restrict this to 10 students how do you select the 10 students?

SD: Sir the Guru selects.

CHAIR: Okay how does the Guru select if he is not from that area?

SD: No

CHAIR: If it is already in the area then what is your evaluation?

SD: But he is not teaching sir, he is doesn't have money. He doesn't have money to perform.



CHAIR: So he selects the state students and you just run the camp for 10 days?

SD: Yes sir.

CHAIR: How much do you spend on that?

SD: Sir 5000 per month for Guru and 2000 for Students.

CHAIR: Okay. Total to student is 20,000 and for Guru is 5000 total is 25000 and your budget is for 5 crore's.

SD: No sir for Guru Shishye we got some 15 lakhs only.

CHAIR: Why I mean it's such an important thing and I regard it as very important. Here you are trying to save a dying art. The cost of it seems ridiculously small. That costs you only 25000 a month. Even if you did it for 12 months as a permanent fixture then just for those 10 students your total expenditure goes to 2.5 lakhs and 2.5 lakhs from 5 crore is such a small amount. If you were to increase the number of students to something more substantive and have the Guru go around at least touch that particular painter and go to all the villages which according to your records were known as the places where this kind of painting was done.

MOC: Sir, until last year we used to give money to ZCC scheme wise, that okay for guru shishye prampara we will give you ten lakhs, for national cultural program we give you one crore. From last year we have stopped this practice, now we are giving them block grant that is okay for the whole year, we are giving you two crore, now you decide.

CHAIR: What I am asking is when you are handling a block grant, it is much preferable in my view to a city base. They should be coming to you and saying what we proposed to do and when they come to you one would hope all these are connected with the message you are either running a public distribution system for the additional secretary of this ministry or you are running a public distribution system for the massive people. Now what the ZCC's are for specifically is to reach out to the massive people so the litmus test of any grant, any approval accorded to a program provided by them should be what is the out reach of that program and if the out reach measured in terms of the kind of audiences that see the performing arts or all the number of students who will come under your Guru Shishye Parampara is adequate.

SD: This is a program that we are undertaking, this is the entire artist from rural area they go to all places and then in each district they perform.

CHAIR: Very good.

SD: And then go to the next district. So till now all the district of the zonal once we are committed is 433.

CHAIR: That's very good. How many district you have in your zone?

SD: Sir must be something like 100.

CHAIR: So your program has taken how long to reach 100 districts?

SD: Sir it took 6 years.

CHAIR: In other words in a single year on an average if we say you reach suppose 96 because it is easy to calculate so you doing about 16 districts in a year. Am I right?

SD: Yes

CHAIR: That's why it has taken you 6 years. So you are doing about 16 districts in a year how many days you spend in a district?

SD: 6-7 days

CHAIR: Then holiday?

SD: No, we go to the next.

CHAIR: If you have about one week per district to cover all the Taluka then you should be able to cover 52 districts in a year.

SD: Sir, we are not doing it continuously.

CHAIR: No, if you have different bus loads I can understand they cant sit in your bus and go on forever. But if you have different bus loads and you have a schedule that said you have to go to all the 100 district in a single year and you have at least some amount of reputation, you spend 2 days in a Taluka rather than 1 day. There will be some intensity in this or come back for 6 months period or 3 months period so that the movement you are creating. How much you are spending in a year?

SD: Sir we start this program first in Maharashtra, Gujarat and Rajasthan. We start this program in these 3 places together. In a bus 60 artists leave and they are from Maharashtra, Gujarat and Rajasthan. We cover 6 districts in a year and the same in Rajasthan all over in 165 programs in 55 days we cover.

CHAIR: Tell me why you do not make this program for 365 days. So how much you are spending in a year?

SD: Now 400000

CHAIR: So in 1 crore which is 20% of your budget, in this expense you run this program. Now I am just predicting may be in one Taluka you can go 3-4 times in a year and you can launch different artists and it will make you popular and people will look forward to seeing you and in this you are tied to different zones of different artists. Then it will be more

exciting so you make this program your Kendreye program and if we copy it in every zone then there it will be much nearer approach to what we need to do. When you reach Taluka how will you spread the information?

SD: We do advertisements and then we do Yatra in the Kasaba.

CHAIR: If you want to advertise this to nearby village you will just make Pamphlets of your show and give it to the Mukhiya of the Taluka and tell him to distribute it in all the houses that this program is being held on this date and you will announce in your Gram Sabha that it is on that day and the meeting which is going on before the function and announce it again that this is a very interesting thing, go and watch. Then people will come in large numbers from that Taluka.

SD: Yes sir.

CHAIR: I am requesting you to do budgeting exercise for this curriculum and let us know whether this kind of programme if it had to become a 365 days in all the seven zones and if not 365, because every one needs a breather. You see what the reason is and given a broad map with some work what is the percentage of rural population that is likely to be touched by this. And then we'll see whether we can't also move this on the up-down style into the urban areas but not concentrated like an example (NC-38:35) but take them to different locations where it will be a rather ad-hoc business to put up some kind of improvised stage or to provide some kind of lighting. But if they apply their mind, you can have own infrastructure equipment which can ensure it if reasonable artistic performance is put up for the people and they not required to sit with the mosquitoes within the dark and not be possible to see the faces of the artist, also the timing that if you hold too many of these things at night then your infrastructure expense will go up. If you do it about dusk, the people are coming back from work and in any case used to normal condition living. I think we have to take rural practices in account and certainly in a rural area. I know, after a days work they come back to eat first before they are in a position to go to a function. So you have to take all these things into account. These are liabilities that we should work out. Can we have the Yatra Paschim Milaap, type of programme done in all the seven states? I think you will find the expense is not the same. Because for one thing, once in Rajasthan, to get from one Taluk to another one, we take much more time than to go from one Taluk to other in Bharatpur and others. Therefore we get to the North-East of the India. There are going to be how many logistical difficulties getting from one place to another. So if we do this exercise through each of the ZCC as to how, if we have this kind of a Yatra organized, what is it that it will take and what proportion from your total fund would reasonably be required to run such a programme. Even we can take it from there and we can see it...

AP: I would just like to take this little example of these Yatras. Instead of restricting them only to performances to be watched by audience if they also can be combined with interacting, like take your gurus and you can pitch their art, their craft to the locals. It would be that

much more exciting and for the younger generation and even people who are not aware of what this is, how a clay pot is made and that it can be learnt from this and I am finding it very exciting. It is not only interacting, also participation from the audience, it makes it more meaningful. So it is not just performance only at the evening, there is a performance, there is audience and you move on. You stay there for 2 days, you publish in advance and the master craftsman comes there. So all these if they can be passed on at a curiosity level or exciting level, I think a lot of energy will be created.

CHAIR: Okay, what is Umang?

SD: Umang is especially for disabled children. Only 50 disabled children.

CHAIR: Where it is done?

SD: we used to do it in villages now this year we will do it in different places.

CHAIR: What are the expenses for this programme?

SD: About Rs. 4-4.5 lakh.

CHAIR: So increase it. Let's go forward.

SD: Children energy

CHAIR: That's only

SD: No, sir, it is done in Daman, Diu.

CHAIR: When I look on 6-7 children you have shown me, they were looking pretty healthy. They appeared to me to be middle class children who must be getting many opportunities. What about the poor, the really disadvantaged. What chances are given to them? So the are their function. I would imagine that all these girls are studying in school where they have school festivals. But there is a very large number of these kids in government schools. They never get any such opportunities. So I would recommend that your Bal Utsav should be a much bigger fund and an emphasis mainly on seeing like your Yatra Paschim Milaap. How to get large numbers of the Aam Aadmi (general public) involved or gareeb involved? I know that a large number of poor are involved. Next programme ..

SD: We have an inauguration programme, work shops, drama work shop, theatre work shops. Work shops are in Vadodara, Gujarat and Jodhpur.

CHAIR: Okay, how do you choose who comes to get trained?

SD: Sir, we have folk theatre groups.

CHAIR: The work shop which you have done, is it professional for professional person or youngsters for their learning?

SD: It is a professional work shop. But students get benefited.

CHAIR: Students?

SD: Yes, students.

CHAIR: How many students for the workshops?

SD: Suppose a university having a work shop department, they get benefit.

CHAIR: (NC) (many people speaking together )

AP: No, but Aurangabad already has drama department where as instead of Aurangabad if you take any other place in Maharashtra where the drama department does not exist. If you have it in Mumbai there is a drama department. So there is nothing new, but if you instead go to a smaller place then the same programme should be more useful. That's all I tried to point out.

CHAIR: In other words, we approve a theatre workshop but we don't approve just sitting back and using some body else's drama department to give a slightly higher level of exposure to top level theatre people to those very students. How do you raise interest in theatre among ordinary people in suburban town, in larger villages, at Taluk head quarters? What is the expenditure on this segment?

SD: It is all about theatres.

CHAIR: That includes plays. How much you spend on the plays?

SD: Rs. 1 lakh yearly.

CHAIR: 1 lakh, so other 23 and 1 lakh for work shops?

SD: Workshops.

CHAIR: Are you sure this is right the information you have given?

SD: It is true that they will be spending more and more on work shops than the plays. But the proportion may not be, it could be Rs. 5 lakh-Rs. 8 lakh for plays and Rs. 15 lakh-Rs. 16 lakh for work shops. That is the average proportion.

CHAIR: Plays that you do are first mounted in Udaipur?

SD: yes.

CHAIR: Do you start the plays or drama from Udaipur or any others place all the time?

SD: There is monthly drama in Udaipur, 1st Sunday of the month.

CHAIR: Okay.

SD: One is 1st Sunday of month.

CHAIR: Okay.

SD: The programme is in Rangshala.

CHAIR: In Udaipur?

SD: No, it is a programme we called people and all the Zonal stages one programme is going on.

CHAIR: I am sorry.

SD: Sir, there is a school of Drama in Delhi.

CHAIR: Yes.

SD: They are doing some programme in collaboration with them.

CHAIR: Okay.

SD: They call expert from Drama and with their leadership they organize the workshops.

CHAIR: Not workshops, plays.

SD: Yes, plays.

CHAIR: But instead of NSD group they have a repertoire.

SD: Yes.

CHAIR: So in any case they are doing the job.

SD: They are also playing host to them.

CHAIR: I have no objection to your playing hosts to the NSD repertoire. But over and beyond, what is the contribution that you can make?

SD: This is the platform for young artists or upcoming artists. We will do activities like Chitrangan. We call students or two students from each and they make a drawing.

AP: Those who are going in to University, those who have come from rich families are ok. how do you teach the visual arts to very ordinary people? We used to have these melas, many melas were taken in 1980, one that I attended and organized by South Zone. In fine art when I went to that place is the District Head Quarter. Anyway it was through out the day and it was first for the South. Anyway what is the matter what the name was? But this was a heavily tribal area and the artists who brought in the South Zone, treating and doing own drawing on their own pottery or other activities and lots of people meeting around them bringing them together. It seems to me to be a far greater exposure even it is just watching. To bring in the university students who are in any case involved with this kind of activities



and giving them bonus, better education. I don't think that your function is repeatedly and constantly being which is speak to those who don't otherwise have access to this kind of arts.

CHAIR: Let's go and move to the next. What is the expenditure on that?

SD: It is near about Rs. 20000-Rs. 25000.

CHAIR: It does not serve all purposes, so we can move one.

SD: The programmes are amazing in different districts.

CHAIR:Where?

SD: Gujarat.

CHAIR: But you never mixed up with the folk and tribal.

SD: Just

CHAIR: I mean there is not part of the Yatra. I'd like to note also, It is very sad that a kind of upper niche is maintained which is the classical or other forms of arts. It is the reason that the artists won't go with you. Or is the reason that you think they shouldn't be mixed up. Item should be performed by top level artist.

SD: Yes, the message came that she was busy, something has come up urgently.

CHAIR: Because I would have liked her to answer this question and I would appreciate a formal answer from them. Why a top level classical artist not willing to give of their time and their experience? So you can have different days.

SD: But our moto is these two have to be mingled. Now this year it is proposed.

CHAIR: Why do you want to have them on the same platform rather than have on different days? You are not talking about getting out of your head quarter.

SD: We are doing it. The same folk and classical

CHAIR: No, in the Thanjavur area apart from what you do in your head quarter, what is the other activity you undertake?

SD: We are doing all basic formals.

CHAIR: Okay, also classical dance.

SD: All these programmes are held.

CHAIR: Okay.

SD: It is possible district basis, rate basis. People are able to participate.

CHAIR: But these two photographs seem to indicate some very metropolitan centers.

SD: It could be professional.

CHAIR: Where is the first photograph taken?

SD: In Goa.

CHAIR: And it is Panaji. Not else where.

SD: It was the traditional strategy.

CHAIR:Whereisit?

SD: Panaji.

CHAIR: It is also in Panaji?

SD: Yes.

CHAIR: So again you know keep getting back to this like metro, rich people, middle class. It must be other photograph of colleges or some kind.

SD: That is also Panaji.

CHAIR: Okay.

SD: People participated in Panaji festival (NC-59:13)

CHAIR: What is your expenditure on this?

SD: Rs. 1 lakh each.

CHAIR: That's it, how many festivals have you participated?

SD: 2 in a year.

CHAIR: In a whole year you attend 2 traditional festivals.

SD: Yes.

CHAIR: How many traditional festivals are there in these areas? You must run in to scores. Have you gone there?

SD: No.

SD: Sir, we go to the villages all the time.

CHAIR: I want you to make a chart by which you will tell me in which city, whether it is big or small city, that you have gone in the villages? Thus I will earn some idea. You have done all the works and the total expense is Rs. 1 lakh why not 100 lakhs. I think the person having huge money doesn't imagine this. If Mr. Manomohan singh was not our Minister so we were a poor country, but now you have sufficient money. I remember that when I went to Goa in

the time of Mr. Rajiv Gandhi for attending a seminar and I told him that the budget of the ministry of culture has been increased, Rs. 12 core annually was given to us and Mr. Khuswant Singh has written that it is amazing that Mr. Rajiv Gandhi has taken a quick step regarding culture. If you were to recast these budget in the direction particularly of getting whatever is being done and all things you are doing is good. For getting whatever you are doing out to the largest number of people might be possible. If we can end by saying that the exposure of seven zones per annum is going to be to 1 crore people, 2 crores people, 10 crores people. Then I can say that making a differential impact to what the other academies are supposed to do but they seem to become the agent for funding artists for other organizations doing their other festivals. They already have a list of good artists. So the divide is not easy, because out of 100 artists, 20 will go to Delhi, 20 will go to Chandigarh and then we don't have sufficient money. I think it is needed to prove we need to reach to people and on that case we see our budgets. We also see to it that this mass distribution of western culture takes place within states, between states, besides a zone, between zone and I don't mind you going to Singapore after all any one who lives in Udaipur has to go to Singapore. That should be least important, main aim should be not be going to Singapore. That means in your mind that is most important thing. North zone did the same. They focus all kind of executive people. The name of Gurudaspur and Bhatinda is not coming.. Your job is to be out in the country and any Director who wants to leave in Udaipur because he belongs to there and it should be discouraged.

CHAIR: How much amount do you give to the artist?

SD: Rs. 400 for group leader. Recently we revised the rates.

CHAIR: How much have you spent on artists? What is the total expenditure on artists? Can you calculate that first and then tell the total budget.

SD: You mean payment to artist.

CHAIR: Yes, payment to artist, transport to artist, for stay, for food. What is the proportion it is going in to? How much of the grant?

SD: and this .

CHAIR: We gave it to Amol Palekar to do a grand opening and closing ceremony. I can't remember what the cost was. And in that opening and closing ceremony there were 3500 folk artists to perform from all over India. That is the excitement to this. We had the opening ceremony somewhere near the airport. Unfortunately, they chose the day that Kehar Singh or Beant Singh one of the assassins of Mrs. Gandhi was hanged. So Mr. Rajiv Gandhi was advised not to go. So he stayed at the airport and I attended the opening but the closing ceremony was at one of the big stadiums.

AP: In fact apart from the closing ceremony which was held in one stadium, was for the first time apart from all the live performances. There were four giant screens which were used and by which each person even out side the stadium could watch that.

CHAIR: Of course he did not in 1989 have the kind of TV coverage. Had we had that .

AP: I had designed it this way so that maximum number of people can witness it, that it is not restricted only to the invitees. It is not required that one has to go to stadium.

CHAIR: Anything else apart from these?

SD: One survey sir, in a view to identify the artist survey been carried out in eleven states.

CHAIR: Very good.

SD: Maharashtra, Badodara, Bhuj, Ahmedabad, Cochin, Gujarat, Jaipur, Jaisalmer.

CHAIR: How was respect on this?

SD: Survey.

CHAIR: This was your own cost?

SD: Yes.

CHAIR: What was the cost Rs. 5 lakh, Rs. 10 lakh, how much?

SD: Depending on artist.

CHAIR: Okay.

SD: Performing art

CHAIR: So what is the cost?

SD: It's all about office. Office people go and not outsiders.

CHAIR: If you tell such a way that a data base will come to us and we will understand what all people of the population are there who participate in our culture. If we do this all over the country, this is becoming a really useful data base so that we know how do you choose your artist or how you handle the culture department.

SD: No, sir we have left it on them.

CHAIR: What numbers of artists list from western zone in your file?

SD: Near about 8000. We have advertised on the paper and registered the artists on basis of their application.

CHAIR: You tell me what do you do?

P1: I am a singer.

CHAIR: Singer?



P1: Yes, folk artist. I sing Sufiana from my school life then when I was in collage. When the artists were selected in Bikaner, I was studying there. I have worked there as volunteer. After that when ZCC has started I joined it.

CHAIR: Then from the starting you are with ZCC?

P1: From 1987.

CHAIR: You are in this from 1987?

P1: yes

CHAIR: And you belong to?

P1: Barmer

CHAIR: Now you are in Udaipur?

P1: Yes

CHAIR: You are there for 33 years?

P1: Yes

CHAIR: You tell me how much you get?

P1: Rs.30000

CHAIR: How much you used to get earlier?

P1: Rs.800

CHAIR: Then you are reaching Rs.30000 per month from Rs.800?

P1: Every year they increase Rs.1000 and now it becomes Rs.30000.

SD: In fact I was asked to bring one program officer also so that you get a feedback from that level also.

CHAIR: You proved to me the kind of quality you have in your program officers, the quality you should have in all your directors.

SD: yes

CHAIR: You provide the continuity. Thank you.

CHAIR: carry on.

MOC: It's qualitatively much better; I think the out reach also has been in doing that. It is much better if you have taken the Rupee. You don't have much money so the little resources you have made the Rupee will travel further. This is what I must say.

CHAIR: This is the consequence of another report. That's very good. What is your expenditure on documentation?

KS: Rs.30 lakhs.

CHAIR: Rs.30 lakhs. Then your expenditure on documentation is one of the most important expenditures?

KS: Yes

CHAIR: And do you find it enough?

KS: It is not enough because in documentations we need some inputs.

CHAIR: Okay, I understand.

KS: Advantage is the total expenditure removal.

CHAIR: Total expenditure

KS: Rs.5 crore is not the case with all of them.

CHAIR: Lot of documentation guided procedure.

CHAIR: Qualitative.

KS: Worthy done so far. That what we definitely have a favor and also I must tell that North Zone and East has been used for daily programs also so that also adds to their size of budget and size of their operations.

SKM: That is not because the other thing is that when they come we can elaborate on that. Whether they do themselves or outsourcing or collaborating with others in documentation, it has to follow the minimized standard of scientific documentation, otherwise it won't be worth keeping.

CHAIR: This is why Mr. Mahapatra Jee, I have been wondering ever since our first encounter. Where are these people who have more training needs, they can't do this.

SKM: They can't do it.

CHAIR: Then why burden them more. You see when you talking about story of standards you got afraid of it and how would I know the standard.

SKM: We have to maintain people involved

CHAIR: Who is responsible for documentation and archives. Is it not the Akademis and the National Museum and places like that?

KS: Sir.



AP: I am not keen that we document. We should never feel that they are already Museum specimen to be documented. Their life arts, sounds when they are performing and they are limited that if I told it should not be a very soft standard thing. Just what you have taken might not be there. Are you looking at all they documented, they may not be. If you view all those that have been documented of all the centers, I don't know what percentage of works archived, whether they are qualitative or not. In that case I know your documentation is better just as the heritage guard heavily and the festival which they do. Certainly much more satisfying how that happens so in the Salt Lake City the east Zone built a heritage thing for their office.

CHAIR: What is that photograph some student's objectives to Mandal Commission Report?

KS: Tribal artist's say.

CHAIR: Okay, so one last question, you finished?

MOC: Have you finished?

CHAIR: Then I have one question to ask you: would you rather continue with the name of the Region Cultural Sector or would you like another name to be found to the west?

KS: Sir is better to have a different name.

CHAIR: What would you suggest?

KS: What you will sir.

CHAIR: What you think let us know. What is your total corpus?

KS: Corpus is Rs.18 crore.

CHAIR: While Punjab has only 16, so Punjab corpus indicated to us

MOC: Govt. of India provides members Rs.5 crore to each.

CHAIR: Yes.

KS: And down the line at one point of time it gives another five so it becomes ten which means a corresponding contribution has to come from states.

CHAIR: Yes.

KS: In some cases states have been intended to pay, in some cases they have been able to extract from the states.

CHAIR: At one stage our states could be members of more than one zone.

KS: Yes

CHAIR: Is that continuing?

MOC: That is continuing but it is posing various difficulties. One particular difficulty about corpuses that they are saying okay, if the corpus is Rs.1 crore and Rajasthan is the member of west zone, north - central zone. They said to give Rs.33 lakhs each and equal rights. Then the member who is paying a crore is protesting that how you are sitting beside me unless you pay your share. So the issues will be brought.

CHAIR: I got 15-20 minutes for you, not more. But where do you start, what you are hearing all this so what are the activities you are undertaking similar to this?

KS: Right sir, I am assistant director south zone culture and I am duty collector SBI state owned officer. I have put 36 years in this service and like I am also a university senior related to this service. So I have prepared report in this field for that we are here. From last 26 years I also was looking after several fields in that department. Previously I was in that part. Before that I was (NC) so every year the works which we are doing, cultural thing they are doing the same work. So in the coming days also when they are doing same job, they will somehow mean specialized team. But in our center they are doing the same job for 25 years, they become bored. They never do job so same work that they are specialized. We have got seven stages 20. Out of 20, 8 are boy's D grade officer 3 drivers 7 special program officer. These 7 are researcher seven types of process.

CHAIR: Okay seven types of process.

CHAIR: To do what?

KS: To do the center, free land given to build a house by regular programs is there.

CHAIR: That's completely wrong. It seems to be got that there is a huge difference between Shila Priya's approaches of the charge what you are saying. People are going to all kind of curious corners of the south. You are asking for an auditorium to be built in a city like Bangalore which must be having 200 auditoriums.

KS: No, any place in there.

CHAIR: Why one place? Why can't you move?

KS: Like the traditional cultural foundation.

CHAIR: Your job is only to have your head quarters in Tanjavoor, your work is supposed to be all over Tamilnadu.

KS: South India.

CHAIR: Then where are you doing programs?

KS: I am going to Hyderabad, Kochi

CHAIR: Every time you mention a big city, you only go to the Hyderabad and Kochi because you fly in there.

KS: No, I go by train only.

CHAIR: Yes, that is a very comfortable train. How many places in South India outside the main cities, have you done anything else?

KS: We have done good programs, summer festivals in South Zone Cultural Center done by myself.

CHAIR: I am asking that's exactly what I don't think you should be doing. I want to know what are the functions you organized outside that place i.e. Tanjavur

CHAIR: I think I speak in Tamil and get some sense of

KS: Only 15 days, that last year we have 240 functions.

CHAIR: (NC, regional language)

KS: All over the zone.

CHAIR: 250 functions?

KS: Yes

CHAIR: In which kind of cities because it is a big number?

KS: Yes

CHAIR: What are the places?

KS: Maximum as you told in cities hereinafter we will go to

CHAIR: Why hereinafter? What you are doing all this time?

Not doing enough outside. What age the South Zone Cultural center has about join in these small documents which I have been assigned. That is relating to the funds and also the corpus fund. Why Pondicherry and Lakshadweep they are giving so much. Kerala, Karnataka had given 100. North and Other Zonal center, Andhra Pradesh has given 50. You may think that Andhrapradesh is another one, another center that is why I have been shocked about that whether I should bother or not. This is what about funding Govt. of India and others have problem in funding. What is this staffing?

CHAIR: This is where you are really wrong. Punjab did it, Jaipur done it, still you are not doing?

KS: How can you shelter in this kind of current situation. Director in charge and other members, they have been old senior officers, they only remain for a while. Nobody is there for that. Then who will take the program forward? I had initiative there. Out of director incharge took over on 21st century. ED was only appointed 6 months ago. The previous AO was superintending on 31st July. New AO is deputed from state Govt. from 1st August, 2010.

The AAO has gone for medical leave. This kind of structure, this kind of funding from state Govt. and support how can you go forward with this kind of situation.

CHAIR: Give me a note this only deals with administrative questions. It doesn't say other people tried at least to show us what they are doing. You give me a staggering figure 250 functions last year. Did you seem it is important to let us know what is that 250 functions?

KS: (NC, local language1. 32.45)

CHAIR: Mr. Joint secretary this is very unsatisfactory. You sent a note that deals with administrative issues only, there is no information about the activities advertisement. But he claims that last year as on they did 250 things. Now if I ask you what are these 250 things he answered that this is only been there for 6 months so he doesn't know. So ask the record if the record is there. So what we need to know is under this different headings what you have done, how many of people you list there if you done this functions? Have you been going into compare what your sector was like in the 90s or in the 80s? What is your sector is doing now, the Rest room culture. You have a beautiful program what it is called?

KS: Maru se sagar Tak

CHAIR: you have done that Yatra.

KS: yes

CHAIR: Have you got a similar yatra?

KS: .NC (regional language)

CHAIR: (NC, regional)

KS: First time I have seen such a thing covered in it.

KS: I am just asking one thing

CHAIR: Please

MOC: One is that two of my centers are very unionized. Nagpur and Punjab so what is the reason of that Punjab and Nagpur is so highly unionized?

CHAIR: is something wrong about the officers, or with the staffs or with the systems what exactly the issue is.

KS: Corruption means in these seven persons only.

CHAIR:.. There are few places in India which have such a long tradition of culture as Thanjavur. It's in the absolute heart of the heart of the heart, every evening you go pass anyhow you'll find the girl inside singing. Every village in the evening function consists of they putting coconut oil in the hair dressed up nicely and then they all sit around and listen

to high classical Karnataka music, also get drunk. Why in a place like that. Tell me what fund somebody other than, someone who has long experience in land records and land acquisition or revenue collection and say that I should say right because you are very good Tahsildar so we shall put you into the zonal centre .

KS: Yes, you have addressed the current policy of recruitment. It says that the person should be eligible to be a deputy secretary to the Govt. of India.

CHAIR: That is ridiculous.

MOC: So, we can rearrange that. That is the reason why we are not finding.

KS: The people are there all are some people are bad. They asked some three crore of rupees which they have not produced for past 15 years.

CHAIR: No, give account of Rs.15 crore.

KS: (NC) for last 15 years. We are home center this far. They want to send me because they are made a lot of compares so are not saving them. We just were keeping them for paying salary. Just sitting and seeing paper putting (NC1.38.10)

CHAIR: Second question how do you decide your programs in case of South Zone do you follow by program committee wants? What the officer wants? Reliable feeling that lot of things are determined from them?

KS: No, sir program committee decides.

CHAIR: Okay.

KS: But the special programs sir, lot of special programs.

CHAIR: Lot of special program done at the behest of?

KS: Rural areas in the lot of places.

CHAIR: How many programs you are doing in Chennai?

KS: Chennai, because most of them are artist. Art functions were there last year. We have some programs from different type of people, from students and among them participated in (NC). Another part of the programs is we have done some painting camps in Pahalgarh with children of age group of 5-8 1st standard to 5th standard only. So, 50 children participated in it. Likewise there is lot of program arranged. In other states also some drama programs were arranged. And the secretary of Kochi also acted in a drama. So there are lot of E- services like art clubbing. So there is no problem when such cooperation is there.

CHAIR: In that purpose you being to Kochi where is SUV?

KS: Rural base I don't know. I don't go there. In rural phase I don't go.

CHAIR: Then where do you go?

KS: For National cultural meet along with tourism minister in Kerala.

CHAIR: You did in one place?

KS: Yes I did.

CHAIR: Which part is really interesting, but how many places in Kerala used?

KS: Kerala in Pirchu, Puru like Kanno in Kerala.

CHAIR: These all are towns.

KS: I follow it in future.

CHAIR: Has anybody been to any rural area there. Rurally you have not mentioned Mannar. You haven't mentioned Sultan Gatari. You haven't mentioned Dagadar. You haven't mentioned Nijumbur. You have just mentioned the capital.

KS: Lot of team goes to Lakshadweep.

CHAIR: Lakshadweep is not Kerala. In only case you mentioned the capital. Has anyone go to Minicoy. This is very useless. I think this is the worst Zone. How you have told that you are the best zone.

KS: Sir we have done it very good roof. Best man should be ceremony thank you.

CHAIR: (NC, local language 1.42.45)

CHAIR: He is already on his way out. You say they, his subordinates keep coming to me. He has come here to tell us that in Delhi they rot us; I suspect that both versions are true. Is really very sad, how it's (NC, local language 1. 43.15)

KS: Nobody knows sir

CHAIR: Are you there for how long?

KS: six months

CHAIR: in six months time as far as I can gather you tender in Cochin, you been to Bangalore and Hyderabad.

KS: Bangalore not at all.

CHAIR: Then where in your Karnataka did you go?

CHAIR: So we shall have the meeting tomorrow at 11.

MOC: There will be 13 in tomorrow.

CHAIR: Then make them into groups because all 13 cannot speak. 4 Zones have to be met. So, two we will meet in the morning and two of them in afternoon.

Thank you very much.



**22nd September, 2010, Pre Lunch**

**Transcriber's Note**

\*[NC] stands for names/sentences not clear in the transcription

Members Present:

Chairperson- Shri Mani Shanker Aiyar

SKM- Shri Sitakant Mahapatra

AP- Shri Amol Palekar

PKM-Shri PK Mohanty

RS-Smt Rita Sinha

PKB- Shri PK Bhattacharya

AKM- Shri Anoop K. Matilal

Chairperson: It is interesting how we found the Khajuraho Temples. Apparently the British District Magistrate in that region of Madhya Pradesh, kept hearing accounts from shepherds who went deep into the dark damp jungles and brought back stories about an ancient city and the abandoned temples. He heard these stories often enough so could not continue disbelieving them, so he himself led an expedition to the middle of the jungles and there he found these temples. These had all been left abandoned by people of their generations to the forest because the invaders at that time were anti idolatery and they would have destroyed all these temples. We have the accounts of Max Mueller and Roman Rolland, and H.G. Well's saying in his "Short History of the World" how there have been thousands of kings & emperors who have crowned the arena of world history, the most distinguished being king Ashoka. I think it is significant for the time that almost every assertion that Jawaharlal Nehru makes in his "Discovery of India" about the genius of our civilization, is validated by a quotation from some western scholars. If Roman Rolland says we were a great nation so we must have been a great nation. There is no self confidence in saying that we are a great nation, it was out of that intellectual inferiority that we had in the 19th century, that somebody like Rabindra Nath Tagore, who came along and shows, that not only was India a great civilization with no need to make any apologies to any one, but was also part and parcel of an Asian renaissance. and that is why at a time when there is no university in the world that had Chinese studies or Persian studies or Korean studies, they were all started at Vishwabharati .And the name is very ideal as there is a combination of universe and India. Who could have thought at that time of regarding India as universal, and only an Indian could have thought like that, that we actually belong to every humanity but we are still

Indian, therefore the concept of "Vasudev Kutumbhkam" as well as bharti into the making of our culture and it was probably the intention of Nehru to introduce this concept of an Asian renaissance, which informs the deliberation of the Asian countries, should be followed by the nation's researchers, which I think is beginning to unfold in front of our eyes now in the 21st century. Now against this background Rajiv Gandhi said to KP Sinde Deo, not in such great detail to him, but I had many opportunities of discussing and seeing how it got elaborated in his mind, and so I have taken some liberties to give you my point of view as informed by Rajeev Gandhi, of why culture is so important. There is the essence of nation hood and we have a sense of being Indian, and we have a sense of being inheritors of a great tradition. Now a lot of our own culture, take for example Bharat Natyam was only the preserve of prostitutes and it was Rukmani Devi Arundale, significantly a women who actually married a foreigner which was extremely rare in those days, who revived this culture and if one reads the biographies of Indrani Rehman and her mother you see the people who went into culture In the 19th century, particularly women, were denigrated and the huge change now is all of us want our daughters to learn how to sing and dance, so Rajeev said to Mr. KP Singh that all you are doing is all very well but how does it reach the people and when he started talking about how he had Rabindra Bhawan and how there was Siri fort auditorium, Rajeev Gandhi interrupted and said only people like you and me go to these functions and the vast majority of India simply have no access to all that your academies and fellow institutions have retrieved from our Heritage and nurtured to contemporary expression and so should we not have a body that will take what already exists and what is being further nurtured by artistes themselves as well as well by our cultural institution, can we not take this out of the academies and take it to the people and that is how the ZCC started, so any activity of yours that involves less than 1000 people is a non-core activity of the ZCC and obviously the artistic quality of what is presented in the village CHAUPAL, can't equal what you could do in Purana Quila or in the Siri fort Auditorium. But is it not worth while sacrificing some of these production values in order that crores of people see the rich cultural diversity of our legacy. I am not talking about hundred's or thousand's crore's of people and to take that figure that is post Rajeev Gandhi and is still being argued between Mr. Chidambaram and myself. Arjun Sen Gupta says that 77% of India's population is living on under 20 rupees a day and the number is 900 hundred million Indians as 90crore out of 1.2 billion have no opportunity of even knowing that the Purana Quila exists or Siri Fort auditorium exists and If they are not involved in this renaissance how can they be a part of our research and I think we see very clearly, emotional integration which was the favorite expression of Jawaharlal Nehru which we all used to hear about when my generation were in school, is virtually gone out of the vocabulary now but it is the absence of emotional integration, which I think is responsible fundamentally for the trouble you see on the streets of Kashmir, the problem we have in the North east of India, the problems we have in the jungles of India and had it not been for the emotional integration which was effected by Jawaharlal Nehru in allowing declared separatists like the DMK to become members of our parliament. CM Anna Durrai was attached to a separatist program for a Dravidian state, as

a break away group from the Indian union and yet he was a member of parliament, and one little book I commend to you is the one detailing arguments between Atal Bihari Vajpayee and CM Anna Durrai on what should be the role of our national set up, and then because the emotional integration was there and there was some acceptance according to them, that when the Chinese invasion took place only then the DMK in 1963 gave up the separatist stance. So there is a lack of emotional integration of the country and I have circulated to you the speech which Rajeev Gandhi made during the Zakir Husain Memorial lecture on the role of performing arts in bringing about nationality and therefore he saw the core of this exercise of taking what was the best in our cultural heritage and in our contemporary cultural expression to the people in the shape of performing arts to which could be attached all other form of arts but fundamentally you cannot secure emotional integration by having an exhibition of sculptures or painting. In the manner in which you can do by having a festival of performing arts which is attended by anybody and everybody, along with that you can have fun and games. You can have cooking classes, you can have foods of various countries, you can have books you can do what ever you want but the core is to performing these arts and these performing arts range from what is traditional in relatively small community to classical art forms which are then claimed by much larger segments of the population of the country. When I was a child Bharat Natyam was clearly something that was totally south Indian, infect it was Tamil. Today I don't think one can say that. It has spread every where and most Tamil audiences are astonished to know that Bharat Muni, who is responsible for the first foundation of Bharat Natyam was a Kashmiri and it is from there the Tamil learnt how to dance. While these classical cultures are very widely claimed now by the whole country and you wouldn't regard Sanyukta Panigarhi or her husband Ragunath to be considered as just Orriias, they are Indians. Our folk art and our tribal art is still very geographically located but there is a sense of commonality which comes out. The most common thing that ZCC's do, and in all your national exchange programs, you get a common drum beat and you put artistes from different parts of India onto a stage and while they are each doing their own kind of thing it is done in harmony simply because the drum beat is common. A Naga artiste is there in Kerala, so it's a wonderful spectacle so, that was the idea that the ZCC's put together, first form within their state, then from within the region and then across the country, performing arts which would have an appeal to people whose earlier access to culture has been limited. How to get this across and how to take it across? If you like a vulgar expression, it is the difference between production and marketing. The three academies and their institutions are the producers of Indian culture and the ZCC's are the distribution agencies so, when the ZCC's start doing the functions of the academies or other sister organisations they are A duplicating them and B probably doing it very poorly. It can't be expected that a program officer sitting in Udaipur or Thanjavur will have the same expertise as somebody sitting in the National Art Gallery or National Museum. So some element of production and some element of collaborating with the production agencies are perfectly legitimate to add to the functions of ZCC. But this cannot justify the existence of ZCC, ZCC's have to validate themselves by being the principal instrument of going where no man has

dared to go before, you have to go into the villages, you have to go in the slums, and you have to go to the deserts, the mountains and the sea coasts and although we made the huge mistake of calling you a center the point was to decentralize culture and this was implicit in a very strict instruction which Rajeev Gandhi gave which have been observed only in the breach since he died or since he demitted office. He had said no ZCC's will have money given for purchasing a building or constructing a huge centre. Simply because he said if you do that then your activities will be concentrated at that centre but of course all the ZCC directors were straining at the leash, so they all violated it. It began with Dimapur where Bandung Ago was absolutely determined to have his great North Eastern Zonal cultural centre. It is a ghost town. I happened to get delayed on a flight and somebody said NEZCC is just next door so I go across there, and there was a huge building and museum and there is nobody there so I was received with great affection, and taken around. I look at one or two object that I really like and they just hand it over to me so I said how can I take away a museum piece, they said who else is coming, who else is appreciative and no one will know that we have given to you. This is not what the ZCC is for; it is certainly not formed as a Dimapur cultural center. Similarly I find that in Patiala where we have taken over this beautiful Sheshmahal, there is a lot to historic value attached and the argument was whether we go to Kilamubarak, or go to Sheshmahal which was initially chosen. They are now sitting in some residential colony, a modern building and therefore an excess of their attention is either in Patiala or near by Chandigarh, and where in Chandigarh, apparently Manimajara which has some pockets of poor people but is essentially for Chandigarh middle class and Chandigarh is the most middle class city of India and for its people to come there and enjoy themselves is fine. But as far as poor people are concerned there is very little connection. The South Zone Cultural Center I have known more because of my constituency. They do nothing and they sit in the Sangeet Mahal and no real activities takes place, now all the rest of you, because we don't know and you are going to tell us. Instead of going into details which you can provide us in writing and which can be distilled by the culture ministry for presentation with tables and so forth for our report. What are the activities that you are under taking which have this mass orientation and what proportion of your budget is spent on these activities? And what is the lumping of all your other activity which should be supplementary activity and your expenditure on them and what is the relationship between your establishment and your program expenses which are mass oriented? Not your program expenses which are not mass oriented and to what extent have you got straight jacketed because you have got programs given to you by the ministry of culture? I am told by the Joint Secretary from this year certain programmes have been given, but still I see the presentations made to us are really in terms of the old categories. What are the innovative ideas you have? I would like us to put all your administrative and budgetary problems away today because if we are going to revive this, obviously the recommendation would have to be to increase the corpus fund. So instead of talking about today's problem lets try to solve, by 5Pm, how much an increase we should suggest. You could give me your larger vision but you can't give the costing today. What do you think you require in terms of achieving this? Getting out of just

sticking like a leach onto somebody else's program. People will come for the Common Wealth Games and the least paid element of the Common Wealth Game will be all the artistes that you are bringing, who are going to get less money through their entire stay here, instead of dealing with those what will you do to go back to the original vision? Your core activity is giving the best in performing arts including popular culture and if there are any famous artistes in your Yatra's you take them into the villages and highlight that for us. Around these hardcore performing arts how do you think other elements of our cultural heritage can be presented, the most important of all is the district wise preferably down to Taluka or block wise and if at all possible down to the Panchayats, then your activities get concentrated there in the first districts of your host state, then in your region as a whole. I was very disappointed that in all three presentations yesterday the first item mentioned was the foreign trips that they have made and this seems to reflect the director's priority rather than ZCC's priority. Actually there is no need to tell me first that we went to 6 towns in the Soviet Union or in Singapore and Malaysia. I have to ask, have you been to Ropad and Bhatinda ?. Foreign things yes If you want to tell me but in the end. What I would like you to tell me is in the light of the background I sketched. How do you think they could be restructured to reach out? Or in this context one very important element of restructuring is, which I would like to have your advice on is, should you continue to be headed by civil servants? Very often it seems to me a reluctant civil servant who is out of favor with their respective departments or being in the UP cadre, there is a kind of Vanvas there and often very little to do with culture and more to do with looking for somewhere to live and even to get back to the family. These are not good enough reasons to run a Center. So though originally we thought back in 1985 that for the first term we have IAS officers usually younger IAS officers and brighter ones, who would tackle the bureaucratic network involved in it, you could then have non bureaucratic heads of these institutions, as we have non bureaucrats in other institutions. But that has not happened and there has been more and more difficulty, as I understand from the Joint Secretary, in getting good civil servants to take on these responsibilities and if they find them it is accidental because there is personal interest and the ability to do it. I can give one example of Neeru Nanda, who is not here, the absent loved one, but I remember who was very enthusiastic, and I don't think her departure didn't affect the functioning of the institution. So finally what do you think? Would you like to give another name to your center other than EZCC or NEZCC? Is there some word, some expression from your region which would identify your ZCC? The example I have is that of the north zone cultural centre. I asked even then 25 years ago why they couldn't be called Dhruva, instead of sounding like a fertilizer distributing company. It is one idea which is thrown up so would you like to do that or is it better to stick with ZCC. That's it. That's the background perhaps we could start from Mr. PK Mohanty. A round of introductions please.

P.K. Mohanty: I was the director of eastern zone cultural center from 2001-2004 presently I am in Kerala additional chief Secretary now, in animal and husbandry department. In east

zone cultural centre in my time we did one of the innovative things like we called all the NGO's in social sector, in cultural sector, all the NGO's from our 8 member states. We did 140 programmes which were co-sponsored by zonal cultural centers. So it was not a question of finance but involving the NGO's and other cultural organization means more of peoples participation, so we really went to small little towns or quarters in fact you might be aware that Orissa has district officers and we did this programme in small towns and all over it and the second thing is we did this in Shilpagram, at Shanti Niketan which had been started before I took charge. Our budget is very limited. Even in my time it was just about 2.5 crore's. We were not getting much Government of India grants in those days and no foreign trips were involved. So we spent 2.5 or 2 crore's on various programs now which would come around 75-80% and 80% probably 60% in villages or in small town and maybe 20% in the center itself and incidentally the name we thought of choosing for the centre was Bharatiam. We thought culture of India should come from the east .

CHAIR: Where is this located?

PKM: This is in salt lack city.

CHAIR: It is a part of Calcutta or not?

PKM: Yes sir, it is a part.

CHAIR: You people lied to me to go there. Not you, but your predecessors. It was located in Shantiniketan. Absolutey in the heart of renaissance of India and you shifted it there for you personal convenience and because the rule was you cannot be in a capital city you declare that salt lack city is miles outside Calcutta, it is a rural entity. Vishwa Bharatiam located at Shantiniketan could have been meaningful. But anyhow now that it is made nothing can be done.

PKM: Sir, there were disadvantages but I think we in Calcutta are the cultural heart of the country we were able to hold something like 20 to 25 programs every month.

CHAIR: Where?

PKM: In Bharatiam and these were by the NGO's. We have dance program and almost 25 programs every month. Government of India has subsequently promoted multipurpose complexes in all the state headquarters, where probably 5-6 program have been held every month but east zone cultural center gives lot of importance and encouragement to the folk artistes and theatre to come to the big city and perform. Our daily engagement column in newspapers always carry news about our programmes. Sir I don't think it's a very bad idea.

CHAIR: How many common people read the daily engagement column? See you are so proud of your achievement. But If you are only spending 20% on that it was not a bad idea. But if we analyze this it's certainly encouraging that in his time the ZCC, whatever money it had for performance, 80% was spent outside and largely in mofussil towns and I certainly like the detailed approach and they did 20% in the center as a principal justification that the folk

artiste is happy to come in and perform at the center. How many common people can actually enter the Bharatiyam complex is will worth investigating?

AP : It is all very fine to say that you bring a folk artiste to the centre but these artistes need open spaces and you confine them to an air conditioned auditorium.

CHAIR: See Calcutta is milling with auditoria. One thing Rajeev Gandhi wanted to do was to pull it from the auditorium and put in on the chaupal. You have in your own Calcutta such a huge tradition of theater taking place in every mohalla, and why are you bringing it into the auditorium? I am sure you are not personally responsible for this but I must say it doesn't offer comfort to what was the original vision. But any way what you said is very encouraging at least you are in the right track even if at the wrong place.

PKM: We have about 6 components in this; we have an air conditioned auditorium that has got a 30 feet high huge stage. So we had regular light and sound facilities and 1100 seating capacity. The daily engagement column regularly gives information about our programmes.

CHAIR: If you are publishing it in the Calcutta newspaper and you are so proud of doing it. It means that the appeal is largely to the literate public. In a country where about 60% of population doesn't read newspaper. So have you spent some fortune on this auditorium?

PKM: Yes sir.

CHAIR: There you are. The whole idea is to spend the fortune on the people not to spend it on the auditorium. There is also one little point I would like to make that the folk artists would like to come and perform in the city which is very valid point and the city audiences should be exposed to these art forms, However whether those art forms which are not found in the procession march and that is the inherent strength of every folk form by bringing then on that kind of the auditorium are we really missing on something or not?

CHAIR: Okay I am glad that you have given us this useful information. If it is East Zone who is it from there, at present Mr. Matilal. Okay what I would like you to do is just prepare from your records, a list of the activities that took place between 2001 and 2004, indicating out the share of the budget given for these events, how much weightage is 60% and whether in fact it is only 20% that was concentrated and how things moved since 2004 I think what you said was when you left, what has been the pattern since there and if it's possible and to check how much it was earlier before this?

Rita Sinha: Sir, I am Rita Sinha, I just retired on 31st July as Secretary. Department of land Resources. I was the Director of the North Central Zonal Cultural Centre. I think it was around 1996 to 1999, but I think it was one of the most enjoyable tenure of my career. Sir, actually the difficulty I found at the centre was the management of the staff and cadres that we have. First of all sir, I would recommend that the scale of the pay of the Director should be flexible. Because I don't know they kept telling me, " you are too senior for this post" I



went there because I am interested in culture as I have spent about 9 years of my career in culture. I don't know if it is very important to have a bureaucrat of a particular skill but to see whether that bureaucrat is interested or not. So that was one point. The other point also was we had the post of Additional Director, Assistant Director, Programme Officers but I found in Allahabad that most of people who came on deputation were from UP itself, they have no clue of culture at all, they came because they were getting a higher scale. For example there was a very trouble some man and he came through political influence. This man who was born in Allahabad, and he is a lawyer. He was getting a higher scale. Because of that thing he did not want to go back, he was politicking and meddling with the Centre, we were unable to do any work. So my suggestion is to have a cultural cadre which is trained in culture, and has an orientation to culture, who can be transferred from one zone to another, they would bring their experience to another zone there at that level and that would be the zone wise experience. Sir when I joined one third of the people were Jhas so, there were some Director Jha, the others were Srivastava, others were Singhs, who have nothing to do with culture, riff raff elements picked up who have no clue about culture. One was a constable you can imagine what his orientation would be. Then I trained them and brought them on stage for performances then they understood what was expected from the artistes and the viewers. Just imagine the mentally they had nothing to do with culture so, the whole time this thing is going on. Then the facilities to the stuff, sir you know if the Zonal Cultural Centre is treated like any other Government office it will not work. Our work actually begins after the other offices close. The programmes sometimes continues till late at night, some times till mid night if it is popular, the audience does not want to leave whether it is a Kavi Sammelan or something like that but they again have to be in office at 9.30 in the morning so there is lot of grumbling about this. I think some kind of compensatory benefits should be given, like we have done for training institutions. If you give to the Zonal Cultural Centre this incentive we get better staff, better people. Right now they have no training of any kind either pre entry nor in service nor orientation so, what I found was that making them act in a play or making them participate, gives them a much better perception of what artistes expect of the centre. Instead of just making payments to the artistes this made them see a different perspective from the artistic point of view or audience point of view. Then I found there, and I think for every programme you need independent assessment as such so, what was happening in my tenure was that the assessment was done through newspaper reports. And that is neither reliable nor capable of judging the programme content. Because I did not know once we had a huge programme, the closing of the jubilee celebration and Mr. Murali Manohar Joshi himself was the Minister present at that function. One reporter of very small little paper did not get an extra pass and he wrote against the function and my explanation was called and the circulation must have been for only 15 people in Allahabad. But all the major dailies wrote good reports but my reward was an explanation called by the Ministry. Just one little sentence because he was a journalist and it is very demoralizing. Some body organizing such a huge programme and the Minister himself was present and praised the function. There after I was called for an explanation, I wanted to just lead the Centre. But

when we started the assessment we have seen that people not interested in art should not get to assess them but prominent artistes and people should independently assess every programme. I feel very strongly on that point.

CHAIR: Good.

RS: So in that future you know how to improve also. So there is virtually no quality control, QCI. It is a list of the number of programme. But what is the quality of each programme? There has to be some kind of qualitative programming. Whether the programme has any quality then it is no problem. Previously I went to attend a programme in Lucknow organized by the Zone, and only 15 people were sitting in the hall. The Governor was the chief guest even he commented that what kind of programme is it. So I think it is the list of the programme that one but I think it has to be some kind of quality is required. So sir I need few minutes for expressing some points.

CHAIR: Yes, please.

RS: Even auditing of culture is done by the AGM of any normal auditing. There is need of cultural auditing for cultural department. The 1st one is the variety of the art form that has been taken up, because they have taken the same art forms throughout the year. Today here, tomorrow there, we have such a vast variety of art form. All of them need to be touched. The 2nd one is the number of artistes given exposure to, what I have found before I had joined in the previous years in NCZCC there were only 3 or 4 artistes going on same pattern and that develops a rot in culture because the programme gets a feedback form the artist. The same artist was promoted. When I joined there were 15 people who were from Madhubani art form. I thought there were only 15 artists all over the country. It was just restricted and I requested the Government to organize a programme in Madhubani. When I went there I found that there are 5000 artists of Madhubani and they do not get to perform. These 15 go to every place in the country and the list is given by the handicraft Ministry and they have also got national award, State award and nothing to it. These artistes are living in mud huts with so many awards but nothing to eat. The Bihar Govt. has done nothing for them. So what ever are we promoting and I found the French and Japanese are coming there and taking them for Rs. 15000 to Rs. 20000 money and patenting those arts. So we are loosing out of Madhubani arts because neither Central Government nor State Government has done anything for the artiste of Madhubani. I think some thing wrong very which we are doing. I was in tears seeing their plight.

There are also the numbers of audience that have been reached out to there is also a list of chain programme. These have taken place in the past before I joined and it is such a scandal. Because the people are to say 15 places we will have a chain programme and at the first one the accountant has given money for all 15 performances and says as far as we are concerned we have done our performances and the programme is over. If you want to go perform do so otherwise it is over. The artiste says I do not just want money, there is no publicity and no audience I want a review in the press, the accountant says, I can't help.

The number of audience that comes to see and it is also part of the cultural audit of the programme. You may have a classical programme which will cost of Rs. 5 lakh and have 30 people sitting as an audience, the average size of audience at a classical programme that I have seen in my 9 years tenure and you may have a huge variety of folk forms so 1 lakh people will attend it so, we should promote that kind of programme, whether 1 lakh people are attending. The geographical area should be covered by the zone, because what I found most annoying was the majority of the programmes are happening in Allahabad, finally I saw there so much pressure from the minister to have programmes in Allahabad, every function he does he wants the ZCC to pay, that's why, very slimly, I must admit, I got the Governing body to pass a resolution that no more programmes in Allahabad. So they started asking West Zone to do the programmes at Allahabad. It was very funny, that we are there and they are paying for programmes in Allahabad. Otherwise you can't resist the pressure.

JS: Because of the over lapping region, they also have a

RS: Yes, they have an over lapping jurisdiction that is how it is happening. We passed the resolution that we are not paying in Allahabad. So then administrative and programme budget we take for 25 to 75 and spend 90% of all budget for rural areas for folk dance. There is one grouse from the states that Mr. Murali Manohar was the centre and the states which have contributed the seed money do not get to know what is happening. There is always a call to enhance the seed money. So there is a need for collaboration with the constituent states. Otherwise they feel alienated and states are separate, so some how they should feel the centre is theirs, the calendar should be common. They participate in zonal programme and zone participates in

CHAIR: Would you think this might be achieved by having some kind of a quota system in your administration which says that 2 employees come from the constituent states and 20 employees can be from the home state.

RS: Not really sir, but at the lower level they don't like it. They do not like to leave their homes as there is lot of family problems, and they are not the best of workers.

Then Sir there are no have clear cut guidelines exactly what the center wants to do. So we worked out our own guideline, identification and promotion of dying art forms. So this is very important. . A very important art form from northern UP Nautanki. And it was slowly dying out. So we sort out the reason why it is dying out. Then we started to promote this. Then I went to Etawa, place of Mulayam Singh, for a function and he was telling me our nautanki is very popular. And over there it was a vey vulgur form. So I said I am promoting nautanki, but Raja Harishchand.

I think the dying art form should be promoted, it is very important thing. We should tie up with schools to promote for the children's exposure. After all they are going to carry forward our heritage. So we trained 7000 children in the Braj art form and they gave a mass performance in the auditorium. When the children started singing it brought tears and

Goosebumps. Then there are traditional wedding songs, so we did a work shop to train women. Because nowadays there are only film songs. Every one liked the traditional songs better. So after that they vowed they would only play traditional songs at weddings.

It is also important to discover new art forms. When we went to Madhubani, we asked local groups to come to perform. For the first time in my life we saw how there is an art from Bihar which is done a lot by Muslim group during ramzan. So we started to promote this group. We have discovered a group in Mirzapur the tribals who howl and cry like tortured animals. We asked them why they do this. They said that they faced so much tension and trouble that to relieve the stress they howl like that. And that is an art form. So I think innovation and experimentation is also important in the traditional art forms. Aditi Mangal Das has done such a beautiful piece with the rhythm and sound of kathak. What I found, Sir, that in U.P. is the home of kathak and no one is experimenting with it at all. Every one experiments this and they take programmes out side. Carrying forward the aged artist is very important, because many of them have special art form and they are very old. If we give them space to teach children then it will be good. A lot of quawwali singers don't train their children in quawwali because they say it is not paying and in their old age they have no pension. People' participation at all levels is very important. Planning, executing and evaluating at all levels. The fees paid by the Zonal Cultural Centre to the folk artist is appalling. We are setting the rate which then gets taken up other institutions. Rates need to be raised drastically. Only proper treatment can increase their interest. So they don't teach their children. They have no prestige. I also saw that the income tax department has passed an order that people with out PAN cards, their tax would be double of those with PAN cards and the folk artist is deducted at 20%. They do not have PAN card or know any thing like that. I think the folk artist should be exempted from that. The income in the year is so low. Even they are claiming refund from income tax people. We should give more emphasis on the exemption for this other wise the art will die.

CHAIR: Thank you very much. Did I hear you say you have retired from the Government? You are no longer with there? Your presentation is quite remarkable and while I do not know whether the Minister of culture who is also the Prime Minister of India will agree to an expansion of our committee membership, with your permission I would like to apply for you to become a member. Thank you. Yes, Dr. Bhattacharyya please put on your mike.

PKBhattacharya: I was the Director of Anthropological Survey of India and I was asked to take up EZCC on dual charge for about 15 days, but it was continued for about 4 years.

CHAIR: 4 years for additional charge.

PKB: Yes.

CHAIR: Which years?

PKB: It was 1996 to 2001.

CHAIR: Before Mr. Mohanti?

PKB: Yes, just one Bhattacharyya, P.K. Bhattacharyya left. I may be little bit pretty because the discussion I mean I won't take much time. Because I have brought it in writing otherwise I know how a talk never really ends. We can begin the discussion of the ZCC by first identifying their key and signal characteristics and the purpose for which they were instituted almost 25 years ago. It is a good time for review. Sufficient time has elapsed for the ZCCs to have carved their own niche in the cultural sector of a composite diverse society. Also this review could help make course correction and change. The ZCCs are younger than some of the bodies and trustees that work for the promotion of cultures your honor just mentioned, like Sangeet Natak or Lalit Kala and clearly the ZCCs were established to fill in the gaps where other bodies or institutions had not entered or were equipped to enter. The ZCCs were equipped to understand, promote and nurture the various strands in our culture while resting on the firm conviction that the synchronic strands form the mainstream of the Indian culture and tradition. In the face of almost westernization and globalization these traditions still stand healthy and have to be specially attended to if you are not to lose them for ever and retain the magic of our heterogeneity. What we consider classical culture or Sanatan dharma could not have grown with out this synchronic strand. It is a relationship of mutual support for mutual growth and development.

I would just talk about the selected aims of the ZCCs, 1st is preserve and innovatively present, disseminate and promote the products of uniqueness of the culture of the zone, 2nd is foster awareness of culture and heritage, 3rd one is to encourage specially the youth to engage with culture through performance and cultural communication. Otherwise they may join the Maoist or may throw stone at the police or so many things or can get drunk too, 4th one is encourage folk and tribal crafts and arts and the last one is strengthen intellectual linkages in the country. Now estimation of impacts of ZCCs, it may be well to remember that the impact of culture is difficult to estimate or assess as the impact is largely intangible and only perceptible when audience's reaction and behavior is studied over a period of time. What we could assess are through audience participation, the feeling of satisfaction or otherwise the performer in terms of audience reception, repeat audience and overgrowing audience I mean the time etc. Motivation of performers involved, whether they have presentation and scope for audience demand for particular function. I may mention here that in our country somehow audience and performers are in a kind of one to one relation or you see a kind of a direct approach on the part of the audience or to talk to the performers is absolutely missing or even if it is there is very poor. I mean ZCCs would really think of doing some thing for that. So the audience really appreciates or talks to the performers about their performance. Now I have a little personal views regarding functioning and impact of ZCCs. The ZCCs perform an important function in cultural sectors and over the years have managed to promote and foster innumerable groups to participate, train or learn some of the others forms of folk culture along with their other activities of livelihoods across the country as well

as given these groups exposure at regional and national level. I have personally been involved with the organization of the festival of the folk dance held for President of India a day before the Republic Day in Delhi. The groups or performers who mainly dance are put up in the same venue. They have spent at least a fortnight under the direction of the choreographer. They may not interact with each other although but there is a certain level of absorption of other forms that is innovatively mixed. Because I have seen the people from Jharkhand coming Santhals and people from Himachal Pradesh coming for dance. So I asked this Santhal, I speak Santhali, whether the girls are very nice or not. I asked them periodically to try to talk to them. They told no. I asked them why? You can also speak in Hindi, they told okay. So this is freedom. I have seen that people from Nagaland or from North East coming, I have not seen them meeting with other people. But one thing they really absorbed the form in which the performers are putting their performance and they try to see you take out certain things that they can incorporate in there. The groups of performers mainly dance are put up in the same okay. They may not interact with each other that also I have said. Also the audiences who fill the stadium surely go back with ideas and a sense of bright richness of their heritage. This emotionally I have written because I know mostly school children are brought there. It is test to translate this enthusiasm for the preservation of the forms that we are still able to show. Like wise the regular programmes that are organized can not realistically be always of high standards or attractive to all audiences that can be brought about if there is some scope for interaction between the performers and the audiences. Regarding the ambit of activities of the Sacs it is not the lack of focus. It is I would say is lack of ingenuity.

My last point is that we think into consideration I am sorry. When we take into consideration content of each tradition and form of art rather than arbitrarily separating art forms. Tribal people dance more for themselves rather than for audience. Dance for them is an expression of community and the art comes from within when all other aspects of their life patterns are met. Thus it is not a question of financial support rather it is a matter of expressing our regard and interest for their forms. They by enthusiasm maintain the same. Besides whether these dances are organized formally or informally in an auditorium or in the open, it should be genuinely spontaneous, as Amolji mentioned. And the last points are how Directors are and other Officials of Ministry connected. Somehow somewhere we have a kind of a continuity of our colonial attitude. The way we meet people, the way we encourage people, the way we try to patronize them, is always colonial. We never consider them as equal. We don't show adequate respects and regards. Thank you, your honor.

SKM: the performing arts as well as the whole tradition, are there, right now there is not really much done but then from now at least we should, whatever the ZCCs try to sponsor, because you don't have available resources to do it for that instant only those which can be done according to the modern scientific standards. Most of our ZCCs performances and documentation are primarily not done by cultural department of state government agencies. If we have some qualitative standards a lot needs to be done. For example you think of the

overall traditional songs, but the Santhali, they have one particular thing it is called NC (1:08:11). That at the time of marriage they sing for about 2-3 Hours and it is a story of their migration from ancient times to today, so there we could make a mark make it proper documentation NC (1:08:36-1:08:43) that the work which legitimately belongs to Anthropological Survey of India, at Calcutta you have got maximum number of cultural manuscripts, go out as the director, see what they have done, compile them, not only preserve but also see that, encourage those which are been innovative among them, never make them feel that you are preserving them, please make them feel that you have participated in this so be a part of it, try to be a part of it. For example if there is in Calcutta an auditorium you have seen some folk forms documented, it will be hopeless. It has to be done in the village I have done myself so many of their life tradition NC (1:11:10-1:11:20) of tribal and folk song of eastern India, which I think Chairman will be happy to see. They have seen in life every thing from marriage to death so you can't take it NC (1:12:51-1:12:59) that culture is something to preserve also.

PKB: Right sir.

CHAIR: And so go on. That will be all right.

PKB: Sir?

Shri A.K.Matilal: Sir should I start the presentation?

CHAIR: yes, how long it will take?

AKM: very few slides that is given to

CHAIR: Okay

AKM: Sir this Eastern Cultural center covering the States of Assam, Bihar, Jharkhand, Manipur, Orissa, Sikkim, Tripura and West Bengal and the Union territory of Andaman and Nicobar islands is one of the seven zones

CHAIR: You make the presentation don't read out it

CHAIR: What is your main point?

AKM: Sir I have joined the eastern zone of cultural sector for the only two months and half back, so I don't have lot of experience but what I find that I agree with madam there has been lot of ad hocism in last 25 years. There is no structured organization that's a great problem to implement things because I am the implementing agency, so most structured organization as you told madam that there has been ad hocopt appointments who are not clear about culture. Number two is as Mr. Mohanti said that we spent nearly 60% of our budget to reach out to the rural area. Reaching out the rural area I found out one difficulty. After my joining I organized one program in Bihar to celebrate the 150 years of 1857. It was exclusively eastern zonal cultural center's program in Bihar not collaborating with any NGO.

Bihar Govt. help me but not in that active fashion. They just show me the way how it can be organized. I went to the district of Bhojpur, Arrah and I organized a very big function. It was entirely the EZCC's function but what I found, that the state authority or state authority they are not involved in that way although it is historical fact where Veer Ali, Veer Kumar Singh involved in 1857 and it was remembrance of those heroes. It is being celebrated but the attachment of Bihar was that much weak. That is a great problem. So, you will have to reach out to the interior areas of the zone. It is necessary what I feel to motivate district administration, the state administration as well.

CHAIR: I would request you

AKM: sir

CHAIR: I would request you to go beyond the district area administration yes of course with district administration to panchayat ward

AKM: Sir

CHAIR: This cultural phase may arise as part of inputs based on functions that are supposed to be devoted to the panchayat citizen.

AKM: yes

CHAIR: When the ZCC started we didn't have this in other states. But its there in West Bengal because there Panchayati Raj preceded the amendment. But the fairs and festival of the Panchayats have been effectively not qualified, now that if it is there a very important element what this ZCC needs to do is to incorporate local Bodies. So the suggestion as to where and how comes from below as much as comes from your part.

AKM: That's what I want to submit sir and this another suggestion I like to say that one of the objectives is to raise special emphasis on the activities or linkages among various areas through evaluation survey of contribution to the larger composite identity of cultural heritage of India. So for this apart from organizing program in the interior areas you also have to carry out research under the aegis of Zonal centres, give fellowships for Art forms, savings workshops on the subject like all this things those are to be organized not only the head quarter it also to be done at sub divisional level should be (NC) The comprehensive data bank which we do not have. The comprehensive data bank of all kinds of art forms of the zone need to be prepared for quick exchanges also not only for the organizing of functions. So that we can exchange forms from Orissa to Bihar, Bihar to Orissa or West Bengal, just quick exchanges of very comprehensive data, so this is all what I want to say or want to suggest.

CHAIR: My own comment is that you are free I see two of all one is your objective and second is your ambition. If such a multiplicity of objectives and issues are to be followed

AKM: Sir

CHAIR: without any kind of advertisement, what are your core activities and what are your objectives? Your core activities are not excessively encouraging because of the difficulties you are facing. As you are describing going to slum people there is also absence of any reference to going into mofussil towns and urban slums in metropolitan towns. I think what we need to work on is at least set the priority as originally emphasized, I am saying that unless you keep the focus of the core activity of thinking what is relevant for production institution, and take it to where the aam aadmi lives.

AKM: yes

CHAIR: All of your suggestions, which are all useful, pertain much more to the production rather than distribution. And that could lead to the detriment of your core area. At the same time I can see the reason why both you and Rita take to all these activities because no one else is doing them. While this cannot be left to individual directors, we need to institutionalize it in some manner

AKM: Right sir.

CHAIR: and still is the Sangeet Natak Akademy being actually involved in doing all this, since they don't do it you said well you know this is not working and you trying to do it with your personal enthusiasm. Apart from personal enthusiasm of the director If you have too many of these other activities there could be to the detriment of the principle activity and the principle activity has not yet been set out in either your objective or your vision as an individual objective etc. what other number of co activity comes in objective A as one of preservation, nurturing, innovating and you are promoting and here the utmost concern is dissemination. This comes much lower in priority.

AKM: Dissemination

Chair: I do believe that all of them need to be perused, that you have to see whether the ZCCs are the appropriate organization to under take all the activities but it cannot be left to the individual desires of directors or institutional organizations whether in the absence of the Sangeet Natak Akademi is do you want to . You need to set up a completely different Akademi useful for folk and tribal forms. You should be there in the principle organization. What I see as huge lacuna is that ZCCs are seen by the existing academies, as rivals for limited funds or as irrelevant entities and there doesn't seem to be integral relationship between the Akademis and yourself and the absence of that leaves each director with an individual agenda and that agenda dies with the departure of the director, this is very, very sad because then you get spurts of activity and then it stops.

JS: 1 typical problem with EZCC is that they charge fees for sending out any artistes.

AKM: That is the decision of the finance committee. I must go there, then they send the

approval for Mela or maybe outside Calcutta

CHAIR: NGOs are collaborating with some NGOs.

JS: All functions are organized by NGO by it is Mela committee or somebody so you always charge the fees, this is substantial. I ask for the project director to go for review of this project.

AKM : Sir.

CHAIR: I truly fully agreed what is happening is you are not any zonal person you are Indian.

AKM: Right.

CHAIR: And it is that exactly what is felt and the worst fears of this idea is (NC) we hereby in Bhartiyam (NC) which is 30 feet high above the sea level and it is fully air conditioned. There were 1100 seats and about 750 for Civil Servants and out of them 350 for VIP and maybe some chaprasis hang around so there is complete dislocation of what the ZCC is supposed to do, not because of such auditorium not a good idea but an excellent idea this should be the function of department of culture, private institute and all or Indian council of cultural divisions. Why all this should be done by the ZCCs. ZCC should fundamentally be a mass oriented organization. An environment exists of what should be nurtured and what is done by other institutions and what is not done by them which is dissemination. That dissemination should be our main objective. You got another 15 minutes before we break for lunch.

AKM: What they used to say sir. Mr. Mohanti also used to tell you sir, these (NC)1.29.00 there is also another auditorium with 900 capacity, there is also a Rangamanch (theater).

CHAIR: That is Salt Lake City

AKM: sir

CHAIR: That is not general sequence this is quite this in my mind is absolute loss. It is not excellent things. It is not for you to do. This is will happen. I am not sure 20% will be the expenditure this year. It seems to be a Greater Noida cultural sector in a city which has a large audience for all this. With the audience overlooked they don't know about it. They do not have access to anything.

AKM: Absolutely sir. So many auditoriums are there

CHAIR: Now at least they started the Salt Lake City. It is created as Refugee town for Bangladesh. Now you can now hold all the programmes there. I think only a habitual part in Kolkata is Salt Lake City.

AKM: Right sir



AP: just a little observation not really with regard to the ZCC or other in general. We will talk of preserving of the folk arts forms or fine arts forms. We necessarily are trying to fully record them and put them in an archive or kind of situation or some type of museum. Why haven't you thought of preserving them by also combining your Guru and Shisya Parampara into that by which we mean some performers? Let them teach art forms, folks forms, crafts to the younger generation and not merely to the generation of that region but the CTT and vice versa that kind of thing and then also the exchange not only amongst your zone but from your zone to the other zone and this activity itself will preserve it not only for posterity but also it will have contemporary meaning and also trying to reach out what many have been saying constantly is the fundamental to believe the grass root. So, trying to reach out to the people of grass root to the soil itself again, it something which I find that unfortunately this is not to be as a thought of not to be mentioned. We are not aware of this.

Rita Sinha: I would like to react to this. Sir why an art form dying it has to be studied., why it is dying? For an example puppetry at one time in UP was the Nabab type of puppetry, it is totally dyed out. So, we studied why it is dying? Sir I found out it is Govt. scheme that has killed puppetry, because the puppetry has become dependent on promoting family planning and all the Govt. scheme which public finds very boring. So, when they put the puppet shows in melas or whatever it is like Ram Leelas, I find there is no audience. The children can't understand what they are saying, Children used to love puppetry. I had a talk with the puppetry people and I said why your art form is barred. He said that it is too expensive first of all the scripts. So, we had a workshop with theater people to write good scripts, modern scripts which is contemporary for people like them. The second thing is for every show or new type of scripts we don't have the money to make the costume that is very expensive for us, every time to create puppets so we started we had the thought of creating a puppet bank, so that they can hire costume like we have scripts with costumes. They can hire it when they want to do a show, so that would help them and the kinds of things they are showing, modern child doesn't link with them at all. They have to come into a modern environment to be relevant and not be irrelevant. What has killed them is Govt. funding and using them for propoganda all the time. Otherwise like acting (Nautanki) I find is one of the dying art form. Now they insist or singing in that high scale mode. Modern children neither have time nor interest in high scale mode so nautanki has to scale it down to what the modern child can do and what modern children appreciates. See nautanki was taught in that high stream; when there were no mikes, so it carried to far distances. Today when we have mikes still high scale insistence on it for their own sake so, we have to come out from that environment. Now they keep on doing "Sultana Daku" when you see you will say what is this and it is like dance more and it is completely irrelevant to the modern script, modern theme. What is the remedy and how much the center can help and whether it can actually revive it?

CHAIR: Good well we have arrived at 1:30 and I think it's unfair to ask NEZCC to come in now (1:41:19-1:41:23) so my suggestion to you if acceptable we come back together a little earlier than we had originally planned. We will be back together say 3o clock and try to finish by 6. So for your information Lunch has been served here. So those who want to stay behind here, have Lunch and chat with each other, are welcome to do so. Those who wish to go for some reason are also welcome so we try get to do the remaining work. Thank you then so I meet you at 4 PM.

**22nd September, 2010, Post Lunch**

**Transcriber's Note**

\*[NC] stands for names/sentences not clear in the transcription

Members present:

Chairperson: Shri Mani Shanker Aiyar

SKM: Shri Sitakant Mahapatra

AP: Shri Amol Palekar

MOC: Ministry of Culture

T: Shri Talinokcha

AIT: Smt Angau I Thou

SP: Shri S. P Pathak

KS: Kamalakar Sontakke

AV: Anand Vardhan Shukla

Neeru: Smt Neeru Nanda

**Chairman: Welcome to the second meeting of our...**

T: I am former Director, North Eastern Cultural Center and I have been with this directorate for the past 5 months. We are expecting our new director by next week.

CHAIR: By next week?

T: Yes

CHAIR: So you are only going to be there for 5 months.

MOC: No he is Joint Director there and the post is vacant.

CHAIR: And who is your new director?

T: Mr. Kamei.

CHAIR: Please carry on. And, you were the director there?

AIT: Yes sir.

CHAIR: Good. We want to listen to you as well.

T: North East zone is a tribal region having more than 209 tribes. Each tribe has their distinctive culture and practices. So working in the North East is a very interesting challenge and it's a challenge for us to cover 209 tribes. The area will have so many neutral grounds. The transportation, communication, network everything is very poor. When I share the problem with other centres, they didn't take a note of the problems like what will happen in the North East region. NC (2:03-2:17) and secondly the insurgency problems NC (2:22-2:29) So we discuss these activities. We have cultural exchange programs, recommendations generally UMANG and Guru Shishye Parampara all those NC (13:15). We have some additional activities; one is Border area programs. North East has an International Border. So we have Border area programs.

CHAIR: Your Boarder Area Programmes are funded by the Ministry or by the ZCC's?

T: We have taken out some portion of the grants and we are implementing these under the border area programs so as to reach the border areas.

CHAIR: I have a question for the Joint Secretary here. Under the norms which have been applicable since 1997, all ministries are required to spend 10% of their development grant in the North East. Now the development grant, 10% of your total budget, could be I think substantially used to supplement whatever is the normal grant. And equally I imagine that the border area program which is not only an economic development program, would also have funds equally from Nehru Yuva Kendra Sangathan. And also more funds for this kind of activity and are often instructed by the ministry of home affairs to deal with these areas and they have special schemes relating to two areas in India: one is the north east and the other is Jammu & Kashmir.

MOC: And if you also remember north east council.

CHAIR: Yes. And the North east council is also supposed to be funding. So my suggestion would be that if all zonal cultural centers are to be treated at par, I think it will be a bit unfair on them if they are given more than others. But their funding can be very supportive by what is available on this and I think the problems that he has brought up, especially of the transport, they are horrendous. Many of the state capitals are not near to the Border. Much of the movement has to take place through extremely difficult terrain. Given a state like Arunachal Pradesh, moving from one habitation to another could take upto a day or two. So I think our committee should specially look into these logistical problems of the North East and any other logistical problems of other regions and see what we can do about it. Because only if we can conquer them, will we be able to reach out to the most remote areas. And to illustrate my point, in Arunachal Pradesh we were told in a confidential meeting of the foreign minister, by the chief minister of Arunachal that out of a population of 1 crore, 2 lakhs have got relatives on the other side of China. And the Chinese thrust in Tibet is so remarkable that it has two aspects. On one hand, is the destruction of the culture but on the other hand there is so much funding available for all kinds of activity including culture, that

there is a tendency among these people to learn from their relatives what is happening in Tibet and contrast it with the conditions they have. These are the kind of people who acquire the best level of what is available in China and starting with the numerous cultures of the North east I don't think any other part of India has progressed there. But starting from the north east itself, it can also extend to other parts of India. But the cost of doing any of this in North east is likely to be disproportionately higher than the other parts of India. So this problem of logistics is something we should look into.

MOC: Sir I may inform you that earlier we were constrained in term of providing funds from north east because we were treating them as one of the seven. What I did after coming on the scene was to distribute all the money for ZCC's among the 6 ZCCs and to any ZCC, I have not given any money from ZCC head because I have a limitation, so out of that I am giving them as much as they propose, so now they are getting about 3.5 - 4 crore's. Their share is also increasing because now it is divided only among 6.

CHAIR: That's very good.

MOC: Yes

CHAIR: So that would appear to indicate you got much larger scope and function. Please carry on.

T: Sir another important issue is that in North East, Dimapur, is the Centre, but they are not seen as a unit. We see them as North East, but amongst themselves, they don't. So there is a lot of resistance in other states that why should we go to Dimapur, we would rather go to Calcutta. That kind of attitude.

CHAIR: No, but we don't have to go to Dimapur at all.

T: But the fact that it is located in Dimapur puts them off.

CHAIR: Well, I think it's capable of being overcome if the activities are not Dimapur centered. And for that, there should be a very careful planning in such a manner that in an equivalent way you are in all states and particularly in the difficult areas. So you go to Tripura and then you should go into those parts in the East where they have all their tribal issues. Then you go to Manipur it doesn't get limited to Imphal. So physically, the director of the center, will have to spend time in the Itanagar and Agartala zone so as to make them feel like yours as a center for the North east. We had this problem when I was the Minister of Panchayati Raj, then the NEC from Shillong got itself accessed in the other parts of the north east partly because there are resident representatives of these areas of all the states who live in Shillong and constitute the majority. It was satisfactory. And therefore also I think that this question of staffing patterns, particularly the higher it gets, mentioned that the class 4 type or even the class 3 type would want to be of that region. And at a more senior level, clearly we would need a very much larger staff structure consisting of

professionals. So Dimapur is now getting safe and am told that the only danger to you in Nagaland is that if you are a Naga, you might get caught in the cross fire. There might be terror readings for all of us if they get together or it may mean restoration of peace, lets see. I think they have a very challenging task, one that you can rise to, if you don't allow yourself to get caught in one state. And now you have some air connections from Dimapur to other north eastern capitals, so atleast getting to the capital shouldn't be too much of a problem.

T: Second scheme is women activities. In the North East, there are so many art forms which are especially with women, like Textile designing. Man has nothing to do with the textile designing and weaving. So by realizing its importance we introduced another scheme, the women activities. These schemes are traditional festivals. Now most of these traditional festivals NC (14:22-14:31) which is very important and people are satisfied with this scheme and another scheme that we have introduced is reviving traditions after introductions of Christianity in the North east and also it was modern implications, and more than education there is a long strong tradition of Christian cultures. Second part, in the north east except Manipur there is no academi in the states. There are no Akademis of activities other than states.

CHAIR: NC (16:17) in your region? There must be Akademis in Assam / Manipur.

T: yes we have Akademis in these state and centers have more responsibility of those Akademis.

CHAIR: Are you from Manipur?

AIT: No sir I am from Nagaland.

CHAIR: That's a very Manipuri name you have.

AIT: Yes sir because the word above gives Manipuri Mitti.

Sir I took over NEZCC in January 2003 till 31 July 2006. When I took over, unfortunately, as you have mentioned in your speech, the corpus fund was of 5.6 and they were eating into the corpus fund. So my main activity was how to raise the corpus fund. And I would like to appraise all of you that with the cooperation and initiative of the former Governor, we could raise it. And of course, with the help of my staff. They worked very hard and the corpus went up to the tune of 21.60. So I think there was a big change which I feel that I should not take credit for. I would give the credit to my Governor who was really supporting me to see that we are really raising the corpus fund. At that point of time when I took over, the corpus fund was almost extinct. It was almost about to close. When I took over, he said, even for the construction of the building, it should go to the ZCC. Governing Council. Sir I fully agree with you that proper briefing should be given to Directors. Because when I took over, at that point of time I was there in a remote district as a Deputy Collector. Governor said you have to come into NE ZCC, so I was just thrown without

knowing what it is all about. But I took it as a challenge. I was sharing with Rita and Mam also. It was a big challenge and I enjoyed my short stint as Director, NE ZCC and it was a wonderful exposure. Selection of directors should be done properly. Person who becomes a director should have the capability to use the money judiciously and should not eat into the money. Then another thing is the main thrust of the Director of ZCC is discipline of art, which has been disappearing. We participate in the national, state level, district level but I feel that this art form, which is dying now, should start, not only from the global but also from the village level. Fortunately or unfortunately, after staying in ZCC for 3 years, I have had the privilege of working with the education department as a director of Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan. We give money to the tune of Rs. 25, 000 per student. With this money we are encouraging that we have teachers to teach the art forms in Nagaland. So now the Gurus that we have taught through the NE ZCC, we can use them to teach the art forms and after I have completed my stint of service there, I have seen to it in Nagaland that the youngsters that are coming to learn how to sing folk songs and also the art forms that have been dying. And so I would like to apprise that the gurus who have already been used, if they can be given honorarium through the State or the convergence of the departments. Many gurus have been training the shishyas.

CHAIR: What do you think of Mr. Palekar's suggestion that instead of this Guru Shishye Parampara program being for a few days of the year, it becomes continuous. That in effect, you convert the program into a large body of Gurus who are then assigned on circuits where they go through different schools, different panchayats, or village councils and in effect they are getting a salary / honorarium and it makes the guru feel not only that he is being looked after but that any of his shishyas looking forward to a career in culture sees that its not well, if his voice breaks or he cant dance anymore, the teacher gets abandoned. But he still continues as a Guru. So if you were to do that, then I think we'll have a magnificent body of people, who will be able to pass on their tradition to another generation. And there will be no fear. I have seen this in Cuba in sports, where they have gone from non existence before the Munich Olympics that was in 1972 to being in 32nd position in Montreal in 1976 then they got to 8th position in 1980 then they were in 4th position in 1984. The way they do it is that all sportsmen are told that because we have so much sports education taking place all over, all of them after the cessation, being active sportsmen become coaches and teachers and then they have a system where this will continue till the normal retirement age, at which point they are entitled to a pension. So if we did that as a Guru Shishya, some would be useless and some would be very good. That is how the net would be spread sufficiently for everyone to be involved in cultural activities and some to become great performers or great artists.

AP: Those who don't become artists will become very informed audiences. And that is a big advantage. There have been instances where when the guru - shishya is over, they are left high and dry. They become hungry.

CHAIR: This is the best way of preserving a dying tradition. They get an assurance of lifetime patronage.

AP: In a small country in Latin America, in slum area, they took up a program of teaching them western classical music starting from Chelos and Violin and all that and through that they have managed to create an excellent symphony orchestra which is a living example of how you can utilize the talent of Guru's and talent which is, as Mani was repeatedly pointing out, not with the school in cities in educated people who in any case have exposure, but people from slum areas who don't have any chance or any exposure, take them, and give them all this and you can create wonders with that.

CHAIR: As the term goes for the ZCC's you need true culture. In a diversified country, I think it has to start at the base and we have to go all out to see that our country is emotionally united. The unity and integrity of our country is in true culture and it is the only language that can reach across all barriers and all misunderstandings. As we come back into the North Eastern states, especially Nagaland, it always appears to be in a turmoil. If we look at the present scenario of the country, most of the states are under communal fear. And I am sure culture will be the vehicle in order to bring about changes and unity so that unrest is wiped out. I'd like you to be doing these programs on the border of Nagaland and Manipur, and if you succeed,

AIT: We live as one family. Not only the north east, I think India should live as a family.

CHAIR: You are just in the department of education.

AIT: Sir I have just handed over the department of Education in Nagaland. I have taken over as secretary of vigilance commission.

SKM: I'll just make a small observation. Unlike other zonal centers, where it is the national cultural exchange program, inter zone, in your case, even intra zonal is a problem. You must be aware of that. Within the seven sisters, because of its logistics and other problems and also because of the cultural enmity sometimes. You are aware of Nagaland and Manipur. That is why cultural bonding, it is not easy for you. How much you have to take to in Arunachal, how much you have to take to Manipur. North east occupies a special place in cultural matters. All government departments give special importance to north east. The second thing is, when you are documenting, particularly in the field of textiles etc. and wherever your zonal center has participated, so emphasize it. So much of the craft is the finest in the country.

AIT: Sir actually this problem that has come up between Nagaland and Manipur has just started this year. So now when I was in ZCC in 2003-2006 I had no problem going across the 8 states of North east. I have even gone to far flung areas of Arunachal Pradesh and villages. I truly endorse what you have said. I think the 8 north eastern states should really work hard so that unity harmony prevails in this country. We are trying to differentiate

ourselves but we just cannot do anything because we have nothing at all. And until and unless we work as one country, we just cannot prosper. Because we really do not have anything in our state. Where do we go? The concept, the mind set of some people has to change. We have no place to go. And if we resolve that we will march forward with the aim that we put our people together, we can achieve anything. I think I have taken too much of your time but I have 1-2 points more which I want to suggest. ZCC is the bearer that connects the central, the country and also the state and I feel that ZCC has to be revamped and strengthened.

CHAIR: How revamped and how strengthened?

AIT: Sir I would like to put it this way. I would not say that from the point of view of any ZCC, we have sufficient money now. So I suggest that they go right up to the village level in convergence to the other department like education. I have already taken a step that I introduced art forms, folk dances in all schools and now if we ask the children to dance the folk dances and if they are asked to participate at National level, I tell you without any doubt, the children of government schools of Nagaland will perform beautifully.

CHAIR: What about contacting village councils?

AIT: I am yet to contact the directors to give us the Gurus who have already trained but we also have teachers who know the art of dance and song in the village. And giving them honorarium. And sir from our time, I am not criticizing, I am not underestimating the old aged Gurus or the artists but I have already appointed from the North east cultural center the artists we have sent across to the other zones or even to the capital. We will send only young ones. The reason is I am not underestimating the old ones but the young ones would learn. See, culture is the only language that speaks of unity, integrity and diversity. My humble submission is that please strengthen the ZCCs and there will be a change. The unrest that we see in the country will surely change. One humble submission from the north east: we are tribals. Our food habits are different. Sometimes they might face difficulties. If the directors could have sympathy towards the north east. I am not talking about Nagaland. If artists can be treated properly, since most of them are illiterate.

CHAIR: I need to understand this better. Is this specifically with the regard to food habits or when you say 'treated properly', I want to know what that means. Because I am sure it is true, what I want to understand is what it is that is troubling you.

AIT: Sir, I think the need to explain that. Maybe there are instances where we are not treated properly.

CHAIR: Is it that they are called Chinese or something like that?

AIT: Yes sir. Even if we are called Chinese, we are Indians. There is already a big gap.

CHAIR: 50 years ago we tamilians in the north were often treated exactly the same way.

Now we have taken them over. But I just want to know what this improper treatment is. Can you switch on your mike please?

AIT: Certainly this NC (38:18-38:29). Artists from North east, they always need non-vegetarian food.

CHAIR: They need non-vegetarian food and they keep serving them sambhar. I can understand the problem.

MOC: Now one particular difficulty we have in Delhi when we get them in Delhi is that we either put them up in Gandhi samiti or in Raj Bhawan. Now these are places where non-vegetarian is not allowed. So we have instructed directors that please liberally give them non-vegetarian food. But sometimes such kind of constraints are there and then what we have to do is get them non-vegetarian food when they come out for their rehearsal. Sometimes the host state is not sensitive to this requirement.

CHAIR: Okay this is an important point and I think what we need to do is, as a standard procedure, that every time you from the North east are going out, you write to your counterpart director that our food habits are such and please ensure an adequate supply of non-vegetarian food, and copy it to the ministry and the ministry can have standard instructions on it, so that if it doesn't happen, they can see how to compensate.

AIT: Sir 2-3 sentences again, see ZCC is the best vehicle to coordinate the culture of our country to foster unity among the diverse culture of the population by organizing constant cultural exchange programs to bring about harmony, unity culture to strengthen the integrity of our country. Last but not the least, the directors, I feel, who ever is supposed to do the ZCC should be carefully selected. It should be someone who knows the concept of running an autonomous organization with proper and judicious management of the corpus fund. The director should be a person who has interest in culture.

CHAIR: What I think I would like you to do is, apart from your evidence here, to continue to be associated with us in the drafting of our report particularly with reference to the North east, also because I think your overall philosophy applies to the entire country and not just to the north east.

AIT: Thank you sir, I would love to associate.

CHAIR: Okay now the obvious person for us to handover to is Mr. Shukla but because we heard from the north center but haven't yet heard from South Central zone let me asked Mr. Pathak first and then Mr. Kamalakar and Mr. Brahma, and then we will come back to you and finally I want the summing up of all.

SP: Thank you sir. I have taken over as additional charge. Actually my background is science background. I am incharge of rubber science center in Nagpur. So I have both the duties. 50% I have duty in science as well as

CHAIR: Why, in all of Maharashtra they didn't find anybody?

SP: Sir this is in Nagpur. He was an officer in Nagpur under this ministry. So it was easy for us to ask him to hold a different charge, and science is a part of ministry of culture. He is holding one of the science museums. So as far as activities and experience, I don't have that much of experience, just 2 months. I took over in the month of June. But what I felt I'll just mention it here. From program presentation area I think I had one slide presentation but most of it talks about the activities of the center has done so far. I think those circulations have already been given and you must have gone through that. Some definite pattern of program presentation may be decided for all ZCC's to take in common so that as she has mentioned that there will be a sought of commonality or sort of integration among all the ZCC's that the program presentation is done on the standard methodology, then naturally the folk and tribal arts.

CHAIR: Won't it be very unfortunate if all artistic programs and performing arts are presented in a standard format?

SP: By standard I mean what happens is, that the programs are changed as per a person's liking.

CHAIR: Give a specific example so that this point will be clear?

SP: Suppose I may not like to see more folk dances, I enjoy the classical programs more. So I may promote only the classical programs through ZCC.

CHAIR: See the point was made yesterday that we have too many high artists in the program, who tend to focus on their disciplines or their shishyas who are then relentlessly promoted. And therefore we would be suggesting that there should be larger intake of people from other disciplines. You are suggesting that an individual director can determine the program.

SP: No, individual directors can't determine the program but when some schemes which are getting executed find the back seat, they may not be promoted during the particular year or during his tenure. Sometimes it happens that classical programs are being presented more, rather than concentration on folk and tribal art. That's what I felt from the previous records and state level programs in the participating states should be extended to the other zones so that the artist can go from one zone to another and perform.

CHAIR: Is your national exchange program just that?

SP: Yes, the quantum should be more, rather than just limited to one or two in a year. And all ZCC's they have NC (49:12) so they can be identified as a brand leader or agency for promoting a particular art form in that region, like in Khajuraho, you have a particular center which can promote more of stone and wood carving and vast metal articles. And these things can be exchanged along the ZCC's. The rural centres can be identified as authentic

chain outlet at district level initially, promoting these artifacts of the region, thereby we will have proper state-wise development of handicrafts. Then all these database of artists from one zonal cultural center can be circulated among all other cultural centers so that they can have a larger database and periodically it can be updated so that all the centers of ZCC's can get to know the new artists getting added at a particular zone and the new artists can be invited to perform in different zone's. Because normally what happens is that we have to request a particular zonal cultural center for the database and by the time we get a reply, the date approaches. So naturally, many times a short cut is taken by directly calling a particular artist or group of artists and asking them to perform, then more transparency can be maintained while dealing with the artists. And similar difficulties as north east faces, regarding food, can also be taken care of. Because many a times directly the program officer gets in touch with the group leader and calls him for the program. In order to complete the calendar, probably the program is done. So in most of the cases it is sort of a ritual rather than an enthusiastic and interest bearing performance of the center. So these are some of the things. The documentations which we do of other forms can be circulated among other ZCC's and more thrust can be given. I think there was a good gesture by IGNOU that they agreed to collaborate with ZCC for giving support to Guru Shishya Parampara so that some certification and some recognition to the Shishyas can be given through formulation of course and giving them proper training in a particular field. That is also being worked out.

CHAIR: Basically presentation should focus on art and artists. Please remember that the ZCC's primary function is not to improve the art or the artists, there are other institutions for that, but to be able to take the existing art out to a large number of people so that it itself becomes a form of patronage to the artists. So I think the focus should always be 'whom you reaching' rather than 'whom you are taking out'. Whom you are taking out will automatically get benefitted by whom you are reaching. One of the critical performance criteria should be numbers. That a person who has promoted 50 events with 30 people should be regarded as lower in ranking than the person who has taken 3 events to 1 Lakh people. This is how we should measure ourselves. Thank you very much for your interventions now to Mr. Kamlakar.

KS: Thank you very much. It's a great opportunity for me to address this gathering. While listening to all my colleagues and present directors, I was slightly surprised, put back to rather brooding on my ideas. When the zonal centers came to exist, it was absolutely a clean slate. With no background whatsoever, we had no background in administrating the arts in a larger context and probably that was the challenge which was accepted by most of us. I was more fortunate that I had probably the richest states so far as art forms are concerned: Andhra, Karnataka, Madhya Pradesh and Maharashtra. They were progressive states and very demanding for that matter. Nothing was on the verge of extinction. On the contrary, people were aspiring to achieve greater heights so far as artist's content was concerned and we probably approached the total zonal programs in this background. So we were not trained to rather manipulate and even conceptualize larger programs. But we were true to the forms

which we had. As a result we started with the folk, tribal and traditional forms. That was the biggest domain on which we worked and we proved, fortunately, at the time of inauguration of south central zone which was planned for 50000 audience members and we'll be grateful to Mani Shankar Iyer ji that he encouraged us. The chief minister was briefed, the Governor was fully supporting us. As a result 7 ministers were there to assist the director of the zonal center who was staying in 1 MLA hostel room with friends like Brahma with me. There was no staff structure at all. I was rather imported from state government to do the event, I was not aware that I will ultimately be a part of zonal sector and believe me 843 artists were rehearsed by me and my creative directors who were program committee members, they were staying, eating and working like Amol Palekar did, with the artists. As a result artists were probably at the highest of their creative spirits because they never saw such a big gathering coming from not only participating states, but thank god, from all the other zonal centers which were about to be established and some of them were not established. But I had my state contacts through which I could rope them in. The program was 3 days away and I was given a brief that 50000 is not likely to be your turnover but it may exceed to 1.5 lakhs. Special screens were brought in, Kastur Chand Park had a beautiful structure 150 years old from British era. At the adjoining points, we had huge screens probably used for the first time, 10-15 projectors were brought in. There was 3 lakhs of audience, the program was delayed by 45 minutes as the Prime Minister had to go and pay visit to some of the centers, and believe me not a single person moved from his place or was restless. I am fortunate whether it is Apna Utsav Delhi, Bombay or any other program, I never was faced with law and order situation. People managed themselves. So that was the background with which we started. Then we decided what are the major art forms where we need to address ourselves. So we had folk old traditions, we have folk theater forms, folk dances, instrumental forms and some of the tribal forms which were probably the combination of everything or much more than that also. So we devised different schemes to address all these forms and I am fortunate that I had one to one participation for all the schemes that the zonal sector implemented during 4 years. So that was the major folk forms all of which were presented in Maidan situation and I never had less than 3-4 thousand audience members. I avoided the capital cities of states, even major district centers of states. I used to go to taluk place and from there I used to have a fanning programming. So we used to go down in smaller villages and the same 150 artists used to be divided in 4 groups and they used to have additional program. As a result the total district which we took for 1 particular program, it almost created a sense of awareness throughout from, common people to the bureaucracy to the people in power, that there is something that the zonal center has brought this thing to us. So this is the story of folk, tribal and folk music forms. Now I wanted to do justice to the classical forms also. I never wanted to dabble with the veteran artists of what they are doing but I wanted to tap the younger generation and that was probably the pride scheme of south zone cultural center and it was called the Yuva Sangeet Nritya Mahotsav. We requested all the Gurus in the state as far as possible through program committee. We used to have 4 centers every year with 22 artists, 5 days program and equi-

distributed on those 5 days. I used to have Bhim Sen Joshi, I used to have Anna with me, and I used to have Malti Rajurjar, I used to have these entire veterans to bless my younger artists. They used to stay together, they used to eat together, my boys used to record and even have still photographs and yesterday's photographs would be available in the morning at the time of their Breakfast. They used to discuss, they used to interact, all the Guru's were requested to stay for all 5 days and they were staying with the disciples. This will never happen. I know everybody has managed the classical artists but they forgot who they are. And these 4 centers were at Taluka places and that too in exchange. Andhra will go to Madhya Pradesh, Karnataka will go to Maharashtra, next year the cycle will keep on changing. Unknown artists, how they were in a position to get packed houses wherever we performed. There was a management and that was art management in the country. I used to send my program officers sitting next to me. They used to go 2 months in advance, do their survey, plan the best venue, plan the accommodation, plan the fooding. Wherever the 25 artists or more are, there the fooding used to be common Rasoi for everybody. So that used to be an opportunity for everybody to interact with each other. Then a mailing list of 1200-1400 people, invitations were made and it was distributed 3 weeks in advance. The press conference was so organized. I used to invite 7 top most living artists of that Taluk place or the region and felicitate them. I am a shrewd administrator. I used to get all the photographs of my elderly artists on the front page and followed by performances of my Yuva. Before, they used to be thrilled, they have given up their performance. Somebody who has come from Nagpur center were recognized at the age of 80 or 85. They were given the first row and minister of the state used to be the host there without temptation he used to make it, with no paraphernalia, no body used to attend on him, he used to manage himself because I used to address them: look here, you have to bless the artists. The final round used to be held in the Capital city. That used to be the only program that used to be held in the Capital city. No other program. And the award winners, about 12 of them, they have to be given performance and platform, so those used to be sent on the request of either the governor of my participating state to the Raj Bhawan whenever they wanted but it was part of my scheme and not the demand of my governor or minister or anybody. This is the 2nd thing. You have said about work shop, I used to have work shop in Puppetry, in instrument making. It is only south cultural center who have done a workshop in traditional temple architecture, nobody has done in it with the best of the Guru's like Vadiraja who used to come along with the team. 20 days work shop, 24 artists at the base of the temple, staying together, working together, using same stone with the same stone and believe me if you want to replace the Shilp, it is still protected in our Zonal center. I took the zonal center ideology a step ahead. I persuaded some of the state training centers to invite my artists and get the sculptures done at the training center. In around 3 states, 4 trucks of Shilps are ready. Only food is required to be provided, and the honorarium which I used to give. The leather puppet tradition is in Andhra, Karnataka, not in Maharashtra, and less in Madhya Pradesh. Believe me, I compelled scholars in the region through my program committee members, my friend that there is somewhere a tradition. So they took paintings from Pothi and they were

converted into leather puppets with specialty of that particular region. I think this was one of the great achievements. I had specialists of others area's painters coming and interacting with this workshop. So that means for 3 weeks the workshop will go on and during the 4th week the Nation's best would give demonstrations. I am sure they will not copy it. Definitely not copy it but try and understand the nuances or other forms which they are not aware about. The same is applied for classical Indian forms, dance forms. Oddissi tradition was not in Maharashtra, it is not in Madhya Pradesh but I wanted my youngsters to get trained in addition to their own form, 1 or 2 other forms. So Oddissi is not his form, he is enriching himself with the Sahitya, with the prati, with the tallas and with the demonstration part of it. And I used to get Kelu Charan Mahapatra who very easily used to come, spend 7 days. I used to invite the malkham people and yoga people to work with my dancers. What they are going to do otherwise through out the day? And believe me in those 6 years all the classical artists from the 4 regions would have visited the workshop, some of them are making big name for themselves and for their region also. So I think forms are never you have said about major classical artists, major artist I used to have Parambit Mahotsav, the expert, because I never wanted them to be a critic of ours. It happened at the time of Apna Utsav, I used to invite them for the work shop and then I used to give them programs: that sir for you we are planning 3 programs in a year. All those programs used to take place in open air, where the city mayor, the collector and even the common rickshaw wala used to sit together with no barriers, no protocol and no instructions by anybody. For your Sangeet Narityam also I used to go self sufficient with my own setting, with my own lightning. Secondly, something which nobody has done and we are proud of, with my colleagues, national visual art contest and competition. From Gujral to Krishan Khanna, they would come as judges, they came as guests. We promised them that if they stay 2 more days, do paintings and they used to be happy. It used to be a great outing for them judging the worth and not only that, I used to have 16 centers exhibitions again at taluka place. You would wonder about the lightning system, exhibition hall etc. I had planned 160 running feet foldable partition plats with foam on it and with softboard, where we take our own tapes and wires. And for every program we used to have 4 languages, A grade Souvenirs, where all their artists were given their bio datas along with the photographs along with the work whether it is sculpture, painting or anything. Tell me after this, what more goodwill could we want. I used to have 4-6 districts covered every year for all these art forms, the program calendar used to be ready in print 9 to 10 months in advance, so that it is circulated to all my states and wherever I went, I used to go with my budget. I never begged for money. It used to be a very modest budget but my budget, and then wherever possible I used to get local people coming forward that sir you have to feed all children and the people used to be very happy, they obliged me. I never took services without single penny, I paid for even the local transport of my state officials. As a result, the morale of my zonal center was at a very high level. My program assistant used to go and approach the highest local official, university vice councilor; they use to seek my permission that give us permission to raise our status. And now you'll wonder how I managed with such little staff. Nobody hosted ICCR, it was

the south centre zone who played host to ICCR program, minimum Bhramasar, Teen Ta Char. Every year Teen Ta Char program would come, we would send them to Nagpur, and from there we would take them to every city, with the best possible facilities, with the best possible audience participation. We have never faced audience problems, never called any chief minister for any program. We have never waited for anyone and my program used to start absolutely on dot at the given time. And probably it was because of my colleagues who were hand picked, as you have rightly said that they didn't have background. But there was a sense of sincerity, a sense of commitment, commitment with me which was supported by my committee members, my state and above all my governor and the department of culture. I was the most admired officer among my colleagues also that time. South cultural centre zone was the first center which formulated program rules, payments rules, even recruitment rules and we had the toughest people. Narayan was our chair person in our finance department. Manmohan Singh scolded me that why are you taking him, but I was so happy and he was so happy with me. We used to sit together drop down things, he would say: I will complete and have it sent to you, you take off for your program. I never had quarter margin audit Para so long as I was working at Nagpur center, thanks to my colleagues again. My time was entirely free, I used to have 16 flights in a month because in addition to my own work I used to be invited to handle and to host one program or the other which gave me additional confidence in handling my own things. A different perspective all together and I think that it was the gift of my responsibility with which I was asked to head. Second thing is, I trained my Drivers, Mali's, Chaparasi, there was no attendant as such and they were multipally utilized people. The driver, after dropping people off, would help you to set up. I have never had my staff sitting at headquarters, even my accounts officers used to be on the field for programs. We did not concentrate much on documentation because documentation may not be a big thing. But we researched on our art forms. When I used to send my officials and state officials, the Adiwasi people used to run away to mountains, because they used to think that a government jeep has come, we must have done something wrong, and they will round us up and take us to jail and punish us. We met such people and boosted their confidence. Artists from the north east get into a trance while performing. To become a different person and to elevate yourself, this is Indian culture. It is not amiri, gareebi. I think this insight is given to us by artists. But after we provoke them into the areas, I think there is a lot in this country. If we talk about zonal centers, maybe the briefs were given to us by government of India, but we were not taken repeatedly to task, even our objects with refreshed ideology and with refreshed targets time and again. If it would have happened probably things would have been different. I was the first person to recommend government of India through ministry of culture that it is high time now that we have special courses on the lines of MBA for art administrations. If there are art administrative courses more than half of the problems would be solved. And I used to have my 50% staff members doing their spread work, 50% on field and again. They were given 1 month to come back, submit their audit and account. As a result, there were no complaints. So I think there is a need for funds and finances. I never got into infrastructure. My office was not even painted

and renovated for 2 years, the old buildings because of this man where renovated, because I had the infrastructure in all my regions, why do I spend on it? I would be humble and request for your resources. Why should I repeat or duplicate it? I will spend the resources on things which are not available and which would not be made available through other agencies. It is my responsibility, moral responsibility. So I think repeatedly briefing the zonal centres, to build their confidence, to equip them. And by equipping, I mean I used to have my whip in my hand and my people used to work till 10 p.m. late at night without grumbling. But I saw to their interest also. All the barriers of class 1 going by air were broken by me in the zonal center. My photographer and my steno used to travel by air with pre-sanction of my finance committee. My staff members, because they used to be maximum out on this field, I used to pay them 50% of there monthly salary twice a year, again with the sanction of my program and finance committee. Rules can be amendment and that's why the autonomy. Otherwise why do we call them autonomous centers if you are to fall into the pyramid structure? I never had Pyramid structure. I kept on rotating people and that enriched their experience also, because they were treated to be confident people, in whom you can lay your confidence. I think zonal centers, leaving aside the administrative lacunas, for this the artist community of this great country should not be neglected, just because we are not in a position to monitor them properly. Monitoring is our responsibility and we should find ways and devices to address these issues.

CHAIR: Thank you very much for taking us back to the original spirit with which these zonal cultural centers were started. I can't claim that all ZCCs at that stage were functioning as effectively as Kamlakar's was. But there was that kind of spirit that was infused there. But I think one major reason for that was that the involvement of the ZCC then was right at the top government. These people were meeting the Prime Minister every three months.

KS: Every three months.

CHAIR: The ministry here, he used to very frequently bring them in, talk to them, see how things were going, involve them in decision making process. I had a very dynamic interaction with them. That was something that was important for creating the ethos, and should find way in our own report. Now I am sorry I am running out the time, as every body is. Can I just ask the NC ZCC.

KS: I have only to add a couple of things, especially the art gallery, so that people use to come, even village people for seeing that. Furthermore, we had been having programs, Madhya Pradesh, Andhra Pradesh and all other way. So whatever the base was actually established, we worked on that and especially our youth programme, which was exhibited in different parts of our centre. There was competition of painting and for senior people. Usually we had artists, senior artist, and we also had lectures. That helped us quite a lot. Only thing was, that it was the beginning of the administrative structure, that actually handicapped us and that still needs to be done. The core staff, such as accounts and administration, should be permanent staff. The rest of the program staff can be temporary

or on contract. So otherwise the centre has been functioning extremely well and we got lot of co-operation from all the directors of the four centres.

CHAIR: Thank you very much.

AP: One, I am so happy that Kamalakar retains the same passion for his work and the zonal cultural centre, programming etc which I have seen. I have been fortunate to associate in several programmes which have been referred into. I also witnessed several programmes which he arranged for the Ministry of culture and several occasions we have roped him in for our programme. Second is that the several points he has made have been recorded. But what stands out from it is this: that Directors are to be fully committed. Because I have walked together for many years and know it well. For such time I was there for holding the job that kind of total commitment to the job, doing the best that they can with the available resources, that is essential; and that is an important point.

CHAIR: I think again that Kamalakar should make himself available to us for some of the drafting of this report. We have heard you, it has been recorded and some notes have been taken. But specifically for what Kamalakar said, if you could kindly get a transcript of what he has said and send it to him for editing. I think a lot of this will have to find its way into what we trying to do, because it is a kind of indication of how we were setting out. So we will continue to avail your honorable services to prepare the report. Now I have to be off in the next 10 minutes but the meeting is going on. Mr. Mahaptra will chair the meeting after I have left. I would like to hear Mr. Shukla and then I'll pick up from what Neeru has to say. She was one of our most dynamic and effective ZCC Directors in the post Rajiv Gandhi period. I have heard her before. So I will give myself the liberty of leaving in the next 10 minutes.

KS: Thank you.

AS: My name is Anand Shukla, I have taken over as director of the North Central Zone last year in June, 2009. I come from Rajasthan cadre.

CHAIR: Rajasthan cadre?

AS: Yes, I am IPS Officer of Indian Police Service.

CHAIR: A cop?

AS: No sir, I have already done 30 years of policing. Actually I had a tenure with UN for 2 years as a human rights instructor, so I have been around the globe. I have seen the culture and authenticity from around the globe in the 2 years that I was with the UN. When I was SP in Jaisalmer, I gave a new thinking to the desert festival that you see today. Even in Bikaner when the Camel festival started, we did lot of things in Kota. So what I am today, I am not against the film. I welcome film. Maximum people attendance is in a film show. I created something new in Kota when I was SP City. Instead of the film evening, that



is Sonu Nigam night or whatever, more people were coming to the folk evening. More than 50000 people attended. That is what made folk available to the people. So when I am taking a troop to Bikaner, I brought them to Khajuwala, the border villages, to Pugal, to Nokha. When I was sending them to Chhatra, they are going to the Shone mela or Dabri mela, so I am sending the villages' downside where the people can see.

CHAIR: This is a SP or Director?

AS: No, as SP only in Kota.

CHAIR: Okay.

AS: We should not deprive the city people as well, because you know folk people also want to come and see the cities. One example from North-East, last year we had 450 artists from the north east. They remained with me for 25 days. They performed at Allahabad, Surajkund mela. We brought them to IIT Delhi, we brought them to Lucknow and when they left, they all were crying. They started learning Hindi in 25 days.

CHAIR: Did you give them meat to eat?

AS: Of course. All of them sang Sare Jaha Se Acchha Hindustan Hamara even at railway station for me. So that is what, I mean they still call me over the telephone and I have a relation with them. I have 450 homes in North-East where I can go anytime. When we set up to cut across territorial boundary to reach the larger identity culture relationship and community across the zone, the Director should meet more and interact with each other and learn from each other.

CHAIR: So you mean that you are not? Because we have been constantly in touch with each other.

AS: This is required sir.

CHAIR: The way is again and again coming together and giving a focus to the activity.

AS: We have to look after the folk artist and tribal artist also. While the ZCC was to emphasize the separate identities of the constituent states, they were to bring out the cultural kinship among the states. When I am bringing north-east artists here in the main land of Hindi, we also want to go to north-east with a lot of people from Lavni, Maharashtra, Rajasthan to Manipur to perform. Last year I had sent and it was a very good response from that area. So we want to exchange. In last year I proposed the CM of Bihar that I want to do a Maharashtra festival in Patna. His first reaction was: are you mad? I told him that sir, I am responsible for that. He said go ahead and we brought the Marathi people performing in Patna. It was welcomed like anything, Bihari student singing Jai Jai Maharashtra Maja. I prepared that. So it was exchange programme and we want to use it for national integrity.

CHAIR: This point of national integration has to be strongly highlighted.

AS: We did Kajiri festival in Pune. Before last year we sent a team to Kajiri which is from eastern U.P. and it was welcomed. So it is a platform we are using. Actually I have prepared a presentation of one and half hour but I don't think I will be able to do justice with all. But my people are going to the smallest village in our seven states, they are performing, they are getting the regular demands from those collectors. Now, this year I received a letter from Bikaner from the collector that we want the folk groups this year not the other groups. The ZCCs are not for the classical. You can do it at 10-15%. We are using the industry related to folk. We are doing the Katputli workshop. You will not believe, in Central U.P., you won't find a person who is playing Sarangee. No one plays Sarangee. One fellow in Benaras, none in Allahabad, two in Lucknow, that's it.

CHAIR: The main reason is that the .reducing the number of quota.

AS: No sir, this is not. We have selected the gurus.

CHAIR: There is also a side story to this that great Sarangee Maestro is more asked to sing, after his popular song in film, rather than play Sarangee.

AS: No, we are getting the Guru. I have started an experiment in Allahabad with Anubhav Prayag. It is used in rest of the Rajasthan as a folk instrument. They are playing Sarangee with groups. So we have selected some of them, we have given them Guru-Sishya Parampara. They have agreed to do it. I have experimented this in Allahabad with Anubhav Prayag. I brought the people who are 75+ on the platform. Now show your worth. One lady called Mala Tankhan, she must be 87 or 88 years. She played the Sitar and was in tears. No one has thought. Now I am bringing those types of people in Bhopal, in Benaras preparing the students. And this is a good thing that IGNOU has taken our project. Now they are taking over Guru-Sishya Parampara and they will give a certification. Why only akashvani? We can also give them. So it is tied up. Now in all the seven states, with due respect to every body, I am visiting most of the states every year. I am on telephone with my secretary, culture from all the states. Every day they are talking to me, this is a programme, this is to be done. I want my folk people to perform. When I am going to Narmada festival in Jabalpur, I am bringing them to a smaller village, just go and see and perform there. So we don't want light and show and sound, we just go in the field and perform. So we are doing it and folk dancers will be in position to patronize the time folk art also. You know Lavni from Maharashtra and Nautanky from U.P., no knows about Rambak from western border of Rajasthan. Rambak singing is the same singing which is in Pandvani in Chhattishgarh. Rambak has now gone to basically Sindh, Jaisalmer, Barmer area. They sing the stories of the histories and all those things like Bhati Raja and such. We are patronizing that we will prepare the Rambak group. Rambak singing is same like Lavni. Now we are bringing those Lavnis, I am not bringing any kind of Lavnis from Bombay, I am inviting them from Karat from the village. You know this nimbura nimbura is famous song in film sung by Aishwarya Rai. It is originally sung by Bade Kazi Khan.

CHAIR: Yes.

AP: So I have gone and recorded in the village what the nimbura is. So it is totally changed when it comes in the film but I am happy in whatever melas they are bringing the folk groups. Next year they are demanding we don't want film. We want folk. So we are promoting and doing and about the industry also we are doing a lot, Guru-Sishya Parampara we are doing a lot. We ensure that every penny spent gives a return and it is properly used for the welfare of the artist and it goes down to the village to the country side. This is what we are trying to do. My suggestion would be that entire Directors should first of all learn what our mission is and for what purpose the ZCCs are made.

AS: So there is no confusion as to there being more of folk or more of classical. We should know what we are doing. We should sit together, visit each other's center, because sir we speak only that which we know of but we listen to what we don't know of. This is what we will do in the best possible way in the coming time also and we are locating the other folk arts also which have not been yet located where they are and what they are doing like Madhubani man said that there are so many artist in Darbhanga. I went to Vrindavan there is folk dance called Charculla. There are 3-4 groups and every time these groups are only going and performing. When I went to the village every alternate house has Charculla dancer, so why not. I went to Bikaner, camped there and even gave an advertisement with the help of collector calling people who were singers and saying that we will give platforms. Within 5 years, I am talking long back about Mukhtiyar Ali, who is a small singer from a small village Pugal on the border of the Bikaner. He started singing and I thought: he sings very well. We gave him an opportunity and today he is performing in Belgium, France. Now he is become Meer Mukhtiyar Ali. He is a folk singer but he sang the title song of Tashan film. Now he has a big chance like Kailash Kher. So we are bringing talent from those areas where no one has reached. In December we are planning a journey of the artists, along the border where we will sing for the border security force, for the jawan's performing there, for the Army, Air Force people coming for the exercise, with the villagers. I saw that whenever the north east come, I mean one officer said that they are not mixing, but I think North east people are very mixing. They are dancing with Lavni girl, they are dancing with Gidda and Bhangra girl, they are mixing with each other.

CHAIR: Because you provided them with Non vegetarian food.

AS: Yes, Sir the only problem we face is Gandhi Darshan, no where else. So we will patronize folk and we'll give folk a proper place where it belongs to. Because sir classical is our culture and folk is our life. How we can forget life? Life comes first. I am going to the villagers recording from Soha, Baliya and Gajipur recording from the local ladies of the house who were singing it because that is the authentic thing, not coming from Mumbai. So we are recording the original so we went to Khandua for Humadi geet recording. So we are locating the things and we are bringing it and we'll make a proper documentation of it and keep it for all the zonal centers.

CHAIR: Can I interrupt you? I welcome you to continue after it. I am already 10 minutes late and I just wanted to deal with some logistics before I leave, and then we'll just continue under Mr. Mahapatra's chairmanship. Number 1- do you think visiting the zonal cultural centers is a requirement. And if so, may I suggest that owing to president Obama coming and therefore our old schedule of parliamentary session being under mild overthrow, its very difficult for me during parliament session to know whether I am free to come or not and certainly its impossible to spend an entire amount of time here. So could I suggest that in the course of the next 2 months you draw an itinerary and Seema Nayyar can be attached to one of you and Amit can be attached to the other. And you cover the 7, I said I'll go to Patiala myself, we'll see about that, but certainly 3 and 3 can get covered. Because we need to gather the basic data without which our report will not look as if it is serious and substantial. I think we should try and get Rita associated. I have already written to the prime minister in the afternoon asking that she should preferably be made a member and if for any reason which I am not able to spot she cant be give an appropriate designation with us, I would like us to continue the involvement with the selection of directors over here and I would very much wish to see Ms Anga involved, Neeru who I could not hear today but I know she is very interested, Shukla Sahab, very impressed with what you are doing because you're Director of a ZCC that was a disaster zone in the 1980s.

AS: I think because of the recruitment there, as Mam has rightly said, it becomes a social welfare center. There is a telephone and there is an appointment, that is the purpose. It is a Rehabilitation center.

CHAIR: Also I think processes of drafting what we have to say, I am not coming to the recommendation structure, that we will have to spend more time for ourselves. What we have heard, what we have seen, if you can start putting it down on paper between the two of you, and then we'll get together again perhaps for more than one session in the month of December and on the one hand try to see what we are writing, whether it is coming along, that would be among the smaller exercise, but on the other I do want to be able to meet with previous joint secretaries and secretaries apart from yourselves. We could perhaps do that during the parliament session. The best would be a Friday. I think 8th is Monday so, we can get together on of those Fridays. Since they will also be here they can spend some time together and then we will get together with other meetings in the month of December. But what we do need are the tables, the facts, the figures that give an edge to an otherwise dull report.

AS: One thing that comes in my mind that when we think of the directors how to select at least so far the ZCC's directors NC (1:49:26-1:49:33)

CHAIR: So I don't think we need any inclusions or exclusions but in selecting them the net should be cast as wide as possible. Somebody who really wants to do it is the one who should be given. And if you think that somebody is a good officer and can do it, and is willing to do it, then maybe we can consider that as well. So, we talk about all these matters, if you

start putting pen to paper, then I think even in the month of November, we can spend some time and see what can be done, but we devote October in particular and it could spill over in November in visiting these ZCC's. And at the time that we go to the ZCC headquarters, if some of those who have or have not come today, can come atleast to the ZCC center and share with them in a more intimate way connected only with that center, what they think should be done, I think we can have a fair exposure. I think we need one session to see all the Akademis and the institutions. I want to see that how they become partners of these organizations instead of being rivals. We can call upon the general artist community to know what they think. I think our ZCCs are in the best positions. As far as the Delhi artist crowd is concerned, I am sure the cultural ministry itself spots the usual suspects so that they can be brought in. In the zones we want articulate artists and people who have sympathy with what we are trying to do. So if you have got big names, like Mr. Kamlakar said for his zone, those are the kind of people who we want. And in terms of numbers, I would suggest you for your consideration, that if the numbers are larger then this table, we can think of the vigyan bhawan annexe having a substantial conference room on the ground floor. So our next meeting will be in November and we'll fix the exact date. So thank you all so much. Today has been a very productive day. Thank You very much.

Neeru: I think I'll be very quick because I am sure everybody needs to take off and, yes, I think I should perhaps do bit of summing up because basically what has been said does apply to my own experience and the only thing interesting which Mani pointed out was that when I took over, it is just after Rajeev Gandhi lost the election, and Mani persuaded me to agree to this Allahabad posting and they lost the elections. So we were in a little bit of a wilderness and the whole focus of the flood lights which was trained on ZCC's, they had a lot of importance and publicity, all that just vanished over night. We were relegated to the position of having to trot out some kind of performance or some kind of dance item, when and if the center required. That will be a good thing because they left us with our own resource and Allahabad is culturally very rich indeed. So, I could get guidance from the local people who are very highly intellectual as poetry, poets, writers, theater's people and musicians. So we could build up our own structure actually without much interference, if I may use such word without any sense of being offensive. My colleagues spoke about structuring program. May be there is a communication gap but programs can and should be structured, otherwise the whole program can be tilt. So, we structured it as per the cycles, you know in April we would have the Cheti Gan and we began it in Allahabad but under the peepal tree because Ason Takia Sahab said those were the days when we didn't want to spend on infrastructure at all. And I think you should flag this issue sir that how much should the ZCCs spend on infrastructure? Where should the focus be? Because the Akademis are there and the Akademis are spending on infrastructure. If infrastructure is to be made, ZCCs could be involved in consultation, in planning, but should they really be getting into infrastructure. I am not talking about immediate infrastructure like a small auditorium or something like that. There were chaiti, we would come to kajiri, savani geet. We started

bringing them to Delhi and this was in all the ZCCs. And somebody told me today that why don't you tell the ministry that one great achievement has been that all the event and impresarios, this folk parampara has become common place. They have been integrated into the main stream event management. And they are paying people very well now and one of the very outstanding events which annually occurs here in Nehru Park, we have the most beautiful folk based devotional music and folk based stretches from Bangladesh to Pakistan crossing marua and a lot of these artists were brought out by the ZCC. So may be this could be flagged as an achievement. I would like to just flag the other issue which is very important regarding the cultural context, because while anybody has in some way or the other mentioned that a problem is arising with selection of artists or that something is not very relevant to the audience. At the same time we hear, we get the feedback that when there is a very authentic folk event or performance, there is pin drop silence and 50000 people listen, why is all this? Vulgarity and obscenity has a certain niche. Our rituals, our festivals, our cultural traditions have given a certain niche to vulgarity because whether has to be little diversion of that kind. But it should not takeover, this is a threat. Where money is important, events are happening, problems are getting the hold of the artist, this is an issue which has to be flagged. Let me put the most unimportant one first. How do we insure certification of artists. If there is the Guru and Shisya parampara with IGNOU certification, I do think that this committee and the ministry should look into that very carefully. And you may like to ask everybody that what is their experience of the All India Radio Certification. In my experience, it is top notch, but nothing can be perfect. However, it is closest to a good certification. So, if that stage has arrived, this should be question marked. Larger context is the cultural context. I think it needs more discussion. Why a form like Lavani should not be showcased in the traditional way, have we had a role in promoting a form which is almost a travesty? So this does need some enquiry. So, how we go about it, we need to flag the issue. People definitely point figures at us. Perhaps this is one of the weak points. When you expand so fast, there are so many events, you keep coming in going, this thing can happen. I had seen it happen quite fast in Himachal. I would ask them for their groups and I didn't like their groups. They were just college boys and girls, so I went like Sukhlaji to the villages and I picked up absolutely fantastic groups so, it is very important. I think it's tied up somewhere with a Guru-shishya, with a training. I was lucky enough to go from the Zonal Cultural Center, Allahabad to the Navoday Vidyalayas and there is a Navodaya Vidyalaya in each district. I knew the resident the folk artists of every stream I knew them so I structured the program, it is called "Kala Sarit". I structured it, I got the scheme made out, I got the sanction from the education department / ministry and I built it into my budget and so we had resident artists in every district. We would have three or four clubs so we would have the singing and performing club and they would learn from Ram Kailas Yadav, the whole song. Then we had a literary club which would write down the songs and bring them out, write them up, stick them up the walls, bring out a magazine and then we had a points club as a part of literary club, they would write poetry in the kajiri or some other style. Then we started bringing out publications of artists. Then we had a painters club in the same

school so the painters would visualize the songs and the Art teacher would guide them in that. So it could be reviewed what's happening in the Navodayas now and has it again degenerated into performances. Has the authenticity of the art forms managed to be preserved. So again I noticed the public schools are also picking this up. I introduced in the Navoday a theater program. Actually we haven't spoken much about theater. Allahabad had a very strong theater movement. We had to have at least two major theater festivals in a year. One only of the local theater group and one which was really huge because we would move from state to state and then have their groups and we used to have five plays in a row. In my opinion we should make it compulsory for collaborations with local state bodies. We invariably collaborated with Lok Adivasi Kala Parisad in Bhopal, Sahitya Kala Parishad in Delhi for the theater. Uttaranchal was a bit weak so we had to go on our own. Himachal had the Kala Academy. They are very good. So could this be strengthened more because you get that inflow of what Amolji was talking about, the cultural context. You know the Kala Academy is of the states. They do know the cultural context. It has been their job to document it and they may tend to degenerate into performances. So that gives us a certain feedback and it is enriching. I do feel that more linkages with the schools, more of the Guru-Shisya parampara through schools and certifications. I do think these are the issues that need to be further discussed and then finalized. I just want to say about the north east. Do you think you could also add and take upon yourself the responsibility of promoting your wonderful Rock bands, your wonderful modern singing, and your folk singing? Amazing singing and they are doing it on their own. Why don't you also fund it and there is very good theater in Mizoram. Manipur has theater tradition. Assam has very good theater. They also have films. You think of these. The vaishnavite tradition is another theme. So they can continue to have the Assam, Manipuri, may be the Khamtis and you pick that one tradition on round and then you take the Buddhist and you take the Rock bands, you take the choirs singing, you take the different theaters and why have just, you know folk dancing The thing is that the things available at home become monotonous. In the Intra zone you need to also adopt the things that young people really like. Why just think you are only to showcase, your tribal dances for us people. Thank you, sir.

AS: In furtherance to what madam said I would like to submit that we contacted on the direction of JS sir last year, Professor Kiran Seth of spic macay. So, he made me responsible for it that we bring folk to spic macay, going to the University and colleges. We did it in IIT Delhi, we did it in Bhopal, we are doing it in Bikaner University. The folk person cannot give lecture but we prepare our presentation and they perform, so it is also coming up very well in university and colleges. Now they are asking for the folk performances in the spic macay and we are going to the school and college.

AP: In the folk tribal context, the performative tradition is very different from other traditions. In that tradition, there must be three things singing, dancing and ritual celebration. When a mural painting is done by folk people, simultaneously let us say a Sourav painter whatever painting he does only three things take place simultaneously. There is

singing, there is dance performance also going on either solo or in group and simultaneously ritual celebration. Sometimes offering to Gods, nature or whatever, they do three things together and that is from where they take of this performative tradition. It seems very important that in this context, folk tribal context, they keep that alive. That is really necessary. Second thing is that what we have discussed all through the day, there is one point which comes to my mind, that the more we take from one cultural center to another program. At least the teams which we send out, we know that there will be some under political pressure. It is necessary to keep an eye on their performances. It is also important to decide on the issue of tenures.

SKM: I had said many of these things in our first meeting, since you were not present in that, some of the points I would like to share with you. First and foremost I begin with congratulating the Ministry of culture for holding this kind of an exercise to reassess and have a relook at one's self. Very rarely one does this kind of an exercise and therefore to have this exercise and say that yes I have made the mistakes here and these mistakes are not to be repeated. Even going to the extent that I think we need to close shop. Whatever it is, but to have this exercise itself, I think it really needs all the congratulations to the Ministry. I think it will be the right step in reassessing and therefore reviving many things which may have become dull or dead or whatever. My congratulations once again.

Neeru: Number two, I do believe that today's times are far more difficult.

AP: In any case as we look at all the institutions which are floated by the Govt. it is a simple pattern as I was sharing with Rupa this afternoon that is launched with a great fan fare, with great enthusiasm and it also has a tremendous vibrant atmosphere in the beginning and then invariably it starts fading down and becomes either just a Bureaucratic jungle or a non performing kind of insignificant entity. Why this happens is something for all of us to apply our minds and whatever reforms particularly on administrative level. I am least qualified to talk about that, with SK here and Mani, both being experts on that, their inputs will be very useful. I would not be able to comment on that but on the creative side, I feel that today really without our realizing, has become so much more difficult because on one hand as I mentioned in the morning also whether you like it or not you have to compete with the TV monster which is into your bedroom whether you like it or not and the bombardment which is made, without your realizing, makes such corrupt brainwashing that you have no escape from it. Just to give you concrete example, whether you like it or not, Rahul Mahajan becomes a star and the whole exercise of how he beats up his girl friend and all that is hyped so much that you are part and parcel of all that. Against that if you have to talk of purity of folk forms, how you are going to survive is the real challenge. Once you realize this, then you would know that you will have to find a niche for yourself, otherwise you cannot compete with this. And when I mentioned about the vulgarity, I was talking about this part which is encroaching on our life whether we like it or not and we have no choice but to live with all this. On this, may be this would be a solace to come out of that and atone to all this which

we have to go through in our lives. This is how I look at it. I also look at it from my personal experience and personal point of view. Since you kept on referring to me as films, and sort of relating me to Bollywood. I am probably a harsher critic of Bollywood than any of you could be. I, as a film maker who believes in main stream cinema and even in non main stream cinema, regional cinema, to do that and to survive all these years has been a struggle but a very proud struggle. And how to do it and how to find my space, how to find the platform where I can be heard, I have to keep struggling. Just to again give you so that you know a film like forget films like 3 idiots and all that which is obvious and the kind of budget which are there for promotion are astounding. But I am giving you a recent example of Peepli live it is a non star cast film, very small film talking about realistic cinema. Now just because Amir Khan chose to promote it on a big canvas and big scale and the amount of money he spent on promotion was far more than what was spent in the cinema itself. But with that kind of promotion the film became the talk of the town everybody wanted to see and it became a success. So it's that a kind of a vicious circle but this is today's reality. I say hat's off to Aamir Khan. In fact my film was also being released along with that and I wish I had a producer like Aamir Khan with me, who would tom tom about it so much that people would want to see it. I don't have so I have to live with the reality and yet make my presence felt. On the other hand I had mentioned last time but once again this time I just mention it and then sum up. I have been Kamalakar is not only aware of it part and parcel of that. I have been doing a theater festival in Pune for the last five years. Theater festivals with a complete difference theater by its own existence, can't be preserved, can't be archived because it's a live art which live human being performs for another live human being. That is theater, to put it crudely and in a simplistic way. But if I want to compare this with any other art forms, I can see a complete work of a writer and judge about his writing, his progress. I can do the same thing with a painter, singer, film maker. I don't have an access to theater. Many people don't know that Kamalakar has come from NSD and has a brilliant career as an actor. Today's generation doesn't even know about this. Now what is to be done? So I have started this theater festival which is a retrospective of living legends of Indian theater, starting with Badal Sarkar. What Badal Sarkar meant to my generation and what he did to many and by presenting a number of all his works through different troops and through different ways and different means, I could excite today's generations and as a direct result, in our annual state drama competition which is a very exciting platform in Maharashtra. Suddenly, there were several Badal Sarkar plays again revived and came from younger generation. So, younger generation somewhere they didn't know of Badal Sarkar, they got excited, they got influenced as I was as a young theater buff had got many many years back. All this can be done and all you have to do is, have the will, have the commitment and have the passion as he very rightly said and things can be done. One last thing I can suggest - today's times as everything needs a Brand Ambassador and this and that. I have always felt that and I always fought against it that as a Brand Ambassador why does it need only star. Why do you need Amitabh Bachan and Amir Khan. Amir Khan picking up the Olympic flame is a shame according to me. We have so many sports stars. Amir Khan

picked the Olympic flame but that's why I keep fighting. But on this subject I was just thinking that for North -East you have such huge stars like Bhaichung Bhutiya, you have Marry Comm, you have so many people. If you can ask them to be associated with you and say that can you be my brand Ambassador. I am quite sure they would also feel proud to be associated and their presence would also bring so many people who would be curious and want to know. Just at loud thinking level but may be the Zonal Centers if they can find such Brand Ambassadors who themselves are really shining stars.

Neeru: And they have their fan following. If they get associated with your activities I think good benefit can be achieved and we can all work together towards some exciting times which Kamlakar recalled and all that, and all of us are hoping whether those exciting times and throbbing times can be re created again.

RS: Sir we have been talking about the art to common people, to mofussil towns etc. but that is only one side of the story. We also have to look at the artists per se that this artist has some livelihood issues, some aspirations, some professional aspirations and what do we do about that. To give a platform to artists is itself a commendable job. The second issue is who is being benefited but the artists who have given opportunity through ZCC to perform either in Singapore, or in Delhi, or in Jaipur, or in Hyderabad is being a service to the artist. So if we do not take care of our artists by means of giving them some sustainable livelihood, some hope for the future, some social security for their old age then we will have nothing to take to the people. So we have to look at both sides of the coin. The artists should prosper, the art should prosper and then if they are there then we see that we are targeting the right kind of people so that our money which is been spent goes to their benefit.

AP: Now this social aspect was never considered during our period, Mahapatra Saab, because we were just trying to get acquainted. This tale is much more important for which friends of a more, your friends also and my friends they have been criticizing us that you bring people, let them dance, how about their survival? Who is going to take care and there is no point in arguing that no traditional artist is bringing their own sons and daughter in this dance form. They would make them chaprasi rather than become a Powada Gayak or Pandawani Gayak, Gayika or something like that. So this issue will have to be addressed because now we have gone through 86 to now, around 25 years and 25 years is not a small period that you ignore one major aspect totally and completely. By giving sustainers to Gurus will not solve the problem, we will have to tackle this issue socially and one incidence Mahapatra Saab at the time Delhi Apna Utsav that all my artists carry Rajeev Gandhi's photo with his autograph. Can you imagine I could solve the issues of lands which was acquired by Aamirs, Sahukars, minimum 30 cases were resolved just because of that photograph and certificate from the prime minister office. So this thing might seem small but it is big. Deliberately I insisted that all artists should be photographed along with the prime minister and VVIP. Those photographs gave a sense of dignity to my artists when they travel back to their villages. All my colleagues are thankful till this date that this social evolution among



this bureaucrat was brought out only by one certificate and one photograph of the prime minister of the country. I insisted that the prime minister should play a host to all my artists. Sonia ji and he spent 4 hours with our artists. I think that this might be small gesture but in theaters a small gesture can convert into rituals and can bring out miracles.

AS: Sir what I have notice is that most of the classical dancers have their daughters learn the classical dance. At 18 they do the arangetram, that is the introduction professionally. But in folk I am yet to come across the person who has his son and daughter persuing the same. So people are moving away and to help to create conditions they want their children to learn and be with it.

AS: I am just interrupting here but another way to look at it would be to try and bring it into the schools, teach the children and let it be part of society. It wasn't like our women or men are going to be cultural show, they were part of our every day life. So I would like to give another point of view for consideration only because you know the demand for folk song is always there. I would like to give just a suggestion that stop thinking of folk in terms of performances. Just start thinking of it as it used to be a part of our life. And the only way we can do it is through schools again. In our Navoday Vidhyalya we have theater, people come in and do blaze with our students and they were fantastic and they were so happy as sir pointed out about cuba because the children of the slum, the talent they have. Naina Kanodia did a workshop in one of my schools.

AP: As Kamlakar rightly pointed out, it is a social issue and needs to be tackled at many levels, not at just one level. But having said that I would also like to mention, in one of my theater festivals which dealt with Sangeet Natye Parampara of Maharashtra and Karnataka, we felicitated 27 living artist who are completely forgotten today, they are finding it difficult to manage 2 meals a day in that condition. We traced them, brought them in and they were felicitated. And the youngest of them was aging 89 so you can well imagine. Now in whichever way we need to support them. More than just financial support, I think what is more important is that they are wanting that people have not forgotten them, still love them, people still bow to them and clap to them is the bigger tonic to them. Of course the financial help is required, no doubt in that, but this is what is required and utilizing their talent. Their children may not want to be trained for obvious reasons. A Sarangia's son, he would rather be a chaprasi as rightly said by everybody. But those are social reasons which need to be dealt differently. But that sarangia if he can pick up some 10 children who in any case have nothing to do and if one of them starts playing sarangi I think we would have achieved so much. So that Guru Shishye Parampara instead of only sticking to selected few cities, if we can spread it out also across the zones, like all the folk forms which are from different zones. I still remember from Manipur Pungcholam when people see they go mad and youngsters would want to learn this and pick it up anywhere. It's the same thing and if one can just help them to go across to grass root level as much as possible, I think we would have done a great job.

AP: Can I make one point. You know what is stopping payment in the rural for folk culture is, you know when we are the director of culture, for example, there is a classical artist, when he starts out we give him less. As he matures as an artist, he makes a name, he starts demanding more and we give more. You have frozen the payment to folk artists. So no matter how much they mature, how much they grow they will still get the same amount as when they started.

AS: This is not the scene now for example Gulabo for the Calbelia dance from Gulabo she won't charge less than 50,000, if you want Gulabo gives 50,000.

AP: How many Gulabo's are there?

AS: At least 10. Pandwani Teejan Bai will not charge less than 2 Lakhs.

AP: While chatting I had this question and it is our mindset which also needs to be changed. I would say that if I invite a classical singer I won't mind paying 2 Lakhs and if I invite folk artist, and I took same name Teejan Bai, I would only think of hundreds or thousands or five thousand. It is good if she doesn't come. And if any classical dancer and Teejan Bai should come on stage at par, both are equal to me but unless we change our mindset all this situation also can't leave.

R: I feel that zonal cultural centres should pay and set a benchmark for others.

R: I think that awareness has to be created; gradation has to be made according to grade. There can be not only A-grade artists, there are star artists now. So why not star artists from among the folk also that should be considered. Sir, I think you have mentioned that now performing arts training should be part and parcel at the school level as personality development training, not as music or dance training. At least you take up some models or you take up some schools, you take up some reasons. If this gets rooted, then I think it would be an answer for several question regarding sustenance. Thank you.

R: Yes, bigger but it has to be generated somewhere. Because no body is going to do. State is waiting that Central govt. accepts. They have some recognition committees to do it. There are several subjects which are redundant at the school level and not the personality development where the child will come out with the colors absolutely.

R: We have received representations from the senior artists to stop this, otherwise all our practitioners will become teachers. Teaching is a different thing than practice and practice will suffer.

R: You must enquire into that.

R: Yes.

R: It brings a miraculous change.

R: Yes.

R: 15 days or 20 days with any theatre person, dance teacher, voice teacher. They are different teachers all together, the children.

SKP: Well, now I think we will sum up. At the end of it, I have already thanked the Ministry. Not only has the Ministry done the excellent thing of sending so much literature that all of you have produced to all the members, but this inviting all the Directors and the previous Directors, it has been one of the finest things they have done. As per the feed back from you, the times are changed, how you look back upon your experience is also been very useful. Now everyday it is becoming more difficult to deliver, to take things to the people and to also document what they have produced at the ground level. But still whatever we are doing against the enemies not only the idiot box television, the internet. So at this juncture it is taking culture to the people and making the younger generation interested. So at least it is teaching culture to the people and also making the younger generation interested. The tribal boys will not be performing what they used to be in their context. But they would like to see whatever is speaking of their culture. In the morning I have mentioned about the UNESCO publication which they have published in the UNESCO collection of representative works. It has gone four years of my sabbatical from govt. working in the eastern zone of Orrisa, Bihar, Jharkhand and then also western part of West Bengal. That I have done, how it could be done, I want to tell that experience a little.

R: Its not that I could do it only as an officer that's why I took the sabbatical. I have stayed in school, villages and then gone out, mixed with them in the villages, only then collected all these tribal songs which have been firstly published at eight anthologies of poetry of these tribal folk regions. Only the UNESCO thought of publishing a compendium. It takes efforts and you know how it is done even not also known when I go back, at this juncture also, despite everything, I have gone back to these folk and cultural areas particularly the tribal areas. Now one instance I can give you. The Chhau dance has also been documented and has given me 2 experiences. Chhau has been performed by artists who were rickshaw pullers, working in the fields as farmers. I would like to take little credit that Chhau should be put on the international map. They are so good and Chhau performance is done very well. There is a whole night program. People take their dinner and sleep there and at least 20000 people watch the program whole night. At that time the Zonal center took the special advantage of it. The artists have been rehabilitated by giving some training, not by the Zonal Cultural Center, but others have also done it. That is why this kind of collaborations become important for us because we don't have enough funds. At one time we were thinking that an alternative could be to close shop but there is strong survival instance. In my view it should not just survive, it should flourish. And there are lots of ways of flourishing, not merely by asserting that we have an identity but also they have to give them back up in terms of funding, in terms of staff, in terms of logistic support. So, once again I thank everybody for taking the trouble of coming. Only last night I was very happy to know that Kamlakar is

coming. I was so glad because you know I remember those days. So, once again I thank all of you. I thank the department of culture. All of you who want to give additional feedback are welcome. And thanks to the chair.



## 13th December 2010, Pre Lunch

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Let us begin our meeting on time and people will be joining us as we go along.

First of all, my deepest gratitude to all of you for having taken the trouble to come before this review committee. The background, I expect, is known to all of you that about 25 years ago, the Prime Minister at that time, Shri Rajiv Gandhi, established seven ZCCs and in this Silver Jubilee Year, the present Prime Minister, Dr. Manmohan Singh, who is also the Minister of Culture, felt that it was necessary to undertake an in-depth review of how they have been functioning and to see the extent to which they have adhered to the initial purposes for which they were set up, to see what changes have taken place since then and which of these changes should be encouraged and which of them should be discouraged and what is the manner in which we could contribute to strengthen the role of ZCCs in fulfilling the purposes for which they were established. I should also add that among the suggestions made for the future of the ZCCs is that they should be wound up because they do not serve any purpose at all. So, that too falls within our Terms of Reference, although I must confess that I would be very sad to see my own little baby being killed, but nevertheless if that is the consensus opinion, that will have to remain the consensus opinion.

Now with a view to orienting this series of meetings, we are meeting today, tomorrow and day after and trying to cover the entire spectrum of all those who might have been at an acquaintance with or interest in these ZCCs. I have prepared a kind of draft Introductory Chapter to our report. The purpose of that draft Introductory Chapter being to explain what was the rationale behind establishing these ZCCs 25 years ago and attempting to summarize the extent to which the actual performance of the ZCCs appear at first glance to be at variance with the outcomes that were initially envisaged.

There is also a set of about 25 recommendations that have emerged from our previous interactions first among ourselves, then with the Ministry of Culture and then with the existing ZCC personnel and to some extent with those who have been associated with the ZCCs in the past. So, you have before you two sets of documents. One is Introductory Chapter and another is the set of recommendations and my hope would be that during the course of today, we would not only hear from you orally as to what your comments on these issues are, perhaps we might also expect from you written amendments or additions or suggested deletions from what has already been prepared. This would certainly enable the report to more accurately reflect, and in your words, what you wish to say rather than our attempt to decipher from the recording of your interventions what it is that you were attempting to say. This brings me to the point that all your interventions are being recorded, will be transcribed and will constitute part of the record of the ZCC review committee, possibly too we might even publish them as part of the annexes to this report. But while discursive oral comments might appear in that transcribed record, I think, if you are going to make a genuine mark on the work of the ZCCs, the points that you have to make, if you

have not already sent them to us in writing, even while you are sitting here, you could perhaps reduce what you intend to say into a few words, at least pointers, for your own interventions. Let us have that document so that we can try as best as possible to reflect what you have to say into our proceedings.

I also have my colleagues here led by Shri Amit Goyal, who will be taking notes of what you are saying, both in terms of your recorded interventions as well as in terms of the notes that will be prepared by my staff, but most importantly in terms of your own notes. I think, we will be able to constructively move forward and do our very best to get your views reflected in our report. I would also like before calling Ms. Leela Samson to inaugurate the discussion to introduce to you my two fellow members with both of whom you are already familiar. On my right is Mr. Sitakant Mohapatra who was Secretary (Culture) and continues to be a luminary on the cultural scene and on my left is Mr. Amol Palekar, who organized our Apna Utsav in January 1988 and who has been named a fellow member of this group. I trust that the others will introduce themselves as we go down the line.

While I think about three-fourth of those who are supposed to be here today, have already arrived, the remaining people as and when they come, I dare say if they come, will be introduced to you as we go along. May I request Ms. Leela Samson, who apart from her mutli-cultural persona is currently looking after somewhat despairingly the SZCC, which I think has the distinction of being currently the worst of our ZCCs, to begin.

SHRI .. : She is also the Chairperson of Sangeet Natak Akademi there.

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is why I said 'multi-cultural persona'. She is also the Chairperson of Sangeet Natak Akademi and is also effectively running Kala Kshetra.

MS. LEELA SAMSON: Sir, since SZCC is particularly in a bad shape, I do not know whether I should start because there is just so much that is wrong with it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I think that is precisely why you should because if we start from the bottom, we are more likely to build fort of the ZCC effectively. We would also like you to reflect upon what kind of a relationship might be established between the Sangeet Natak Akademi and the ZCCs, a relationship which we had hoped would be an extremely dynamic and symbiotic one, but which I do not think has actually happened. So, just share with us your thoughts and maybe we can come back to you again later.

MS. LEELA SAMSON: In general, I would say that one of the things that struck me first about the SZCC is that it serves Tamil Nadu rather than all the other zones and that is very marked in the kind of appointments that are made. The Revenue Department actually does feel that the gazetted posts and non-gazetted posts are their prerogative. We have had a case where previous AD was appointed two months before the Director left. So, neither saw to the Annual Report. The day a high-level committee came, we had to post him out under pressure from the Governor's office. Then, the new person who took four days before he left

and three days later, he was posted out. This is badmashi. So, it has no AD. That CAO had come in two months before I came in. So, nobody is actually responsible and this is happening. I know that in my six months' period, everybody is being posted out without any reference to the Director or to anyone. We simply get a letter from the Governor's Secretary that please allow the person to leave and under threat that if you do not, he will be penalized etc. This is something you cannot run a ZCC with.

The other thing there is that the post of Director seems to be where somebody is biding time, waiting for another appointment or just sidelined for a while from his regular postings and is also somebody who has no inclination towards the arts. So, my submission would be that unless there is a nice combination of somebody who has an artistic inclination and has a passion for folk arts along with somebody who can handle finances and deal with governor process, it may be difficult. There is not really much in the Department. If the rules and regulations are laid down, especially on the financial front, it would help. The problem with many of the Directors who have been there is that they are attracted to big names. They are attracted to the names of people who are in the classical arts, but that is not their work. They should be dealing in outreach programme. I think, it should become more 'outreach'. It has become a kind of power centre unto its own. So, for the bigger festivals, it is not the folk artistes who seem to be summoned, but the big artistes of Chennai, who do not need that patronage.

The Annual Reports are a bit of farce. The other Members and Secretaries of the States will tell you that they are deeply disappointed in the way the agenda for the meetings are made because they have no substance and therefore, there is no accountability. I have been meeting with the others who are very effective Secretaries of Culture, both from Kerala, Karnataka and Andhra Pradesh. They are at a loss to know what they should do. It seems that in Thanjavore, the situation is so weak, but is controlled, while they could have actually controlled because they are much more efficient.

Regarding the appointment of gazetted officers and non-gazetted officers, I think the Ministry should have a say who is appointed as the Director and the Director should then appoint the non-gazetted officers, maybe in collaboration with the local Collector, but not that the Collector makes the appointment and the Director knows nothing about it. Similarly, about the transfers, I would submit that all repatriations and appointments must be with prior approval.

As far as documentation and all this is concerned, it is so pathetic over all these 25 years. They do not have anything in their archives. If I may say so, now with the experience we have in documentation at the SNA, even if there were and they had collected a large amount of documents, it would be no use just lying over there. It has to be upgraded and it has to be digitized. That is why it is of no use to the country at all. There must be some way in which the process continues in more informed circumstances, given to private parties to upgrade so that the country and all other zones benefit from those archives. They should not

just be lying in the stacks. They just do not know how to document, they do not know how to archive. It is just a small show in a small place. The local photographer of that little village is called in and the quality of documentation is very poor. Anyway, it really did not happen much. I think, an Artistic Consultant must be appointed to every single ZCC or even a small little two or three people for each zone because it is not possible for the Director. Let us say at present, the new Director was DCP (Traffic) who has been accepted by the Governor and the recommendation has come. I doubt whether he will be able to make an artistic choice between one or another group. So, he will have to be a consultant. This is clearly non-present.

In the SZCC, actually the workers have managed to convince the Chairman to change the Service Rules and they were changed in 2008. I do not know whether you were made aware of it. A copy of the Governor bringing this before the EB and GB meeting was to actually get modifications done to suit the workers. There are only 10 or 15 workers in total. So, they should have been handled. They are seeking benefits of the Central Government Rules as well as the State Government Rules. So, there is a lot of confusion. As soon as one mistake is committed or somebody was conceded to, then it becomes a precedent and then everybody says that he was given and therefore, I should also be given the same thing for medical or whatever they are not following there. They are following the both. This is a very serious problem.

I think if the SZCC is only serving the Governor of Tamil Nadu, then they should equally be serving the Governors of all the member-States. This is a very partisan kind of situation. It really was not working because there is obviously very high pressure from the Governor's Office. There are people lower down in that office who are very much in nexus with the workers in SZCC. It is a very big and complicated nexus. Thank you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. I think, that is an excellent kick off to the discussions and several of the points that you have made are, in fact, reflected in the drafts that we have prepared. Your suggestion regarding an Artistic Consultant or a small committee of artistic consultants is most welcome and would add greatly to what we are attempting to do. We would certainly come back to you in light of the further discussions. But since we have broached the SZCC, perhaps we could just complete that in the first round. In that context, may I request Dr. J. Prasad, the Vice-Chancellor of the Kerala Kalamandalam, a deemed university in Thirussur, to now intervene? Sir, I have just received your written comments. So, we look forward to listening to what you have to say.

DR. J. PRASAD: Actually, I represent Kerala Kalamandalam and Sri Shankaracharya University of Sanskrit. I am Vice-Chancellor of both the university. Sri Shankaracharya University of Sanskrit is also having Music and Theatre Department and also painting. I have already sent the e-mail and submitted my comments.

There are in all 11 points. First, the organizational structure should be modified. As far as

organizational set up of ZCC is concerned, the present design, unfortunately, has not been helpful in fulfillment of its objectives. A professional but democratic system of management would be the most ideal for the ZCCs. A proposed organizational structure to this effect is placed below for consideration. The tenure of the Director is three years. The Director may be appointed in rotation from all component States/UTs. The nomination of the participating State Governments may be (a) the Minister of Cultural Affairs of the State; (b) the Secretary to the Government, Cultural Affairs; (c) the Chairman of State Akademis; (d) Five eminent artistes nominated by the Governor of each component participating States from a panel submitted by the Government. Then, regarding the nominees of the Central Government, the present format can be followed. The other Statutory Committees of ZCCs should also consist of representatives of component States selected in the above manner. The practice of appointing the Governor of the host State as ex officio Chairperson of the Government Council of the ZCC should be followed. Secondly, prioritization of training of art forms should be there. Training may be taken as a major priority of the ZCCs. Since propagation of culture can be effective only when there is an assurance of continuity of traditions and traditional forms, there are many traditions performances and art forms that have little urban representation or acceptance and are languishing due to lack of the support system that would ensure their continuity. A significant case would be that of shadow puppetry of Kerala, which has steadily dwindling number of artistes practicing it and very few of the younger generation are taking it up because of the paucity of support and popularity. Significant support for individuals, institutions and agencies, that are engaged in the training of traditional endangered and local forms, would serve as a new lease of life for many that are on the verge of extinction. Institutions following unique teaching methodologies in the training and dissemination of art forms may be provided with special financial assistance to further and develop their pedagogue practices. Along with this, scholarship may also be instituted to talented young artistes being trained in such forms. Meticulous care needs to be taken to ensure that such support is extended only to the most deserving recipients and not to urban affluent class.

There is a need for support to innovative attempts in traditional forms. One objective envisaged for the ZCCs is encouragement of innovation, especially in relatively new domains of culture, such as photography, cinematography, graphic arts, hybrid arts etc. Such encourage and support may be extended to innovative attempts in traditional forms too because it is a proven historical fact that it is not static but judicious change through which new and contemporary concerns are addressed and art forms are guaranteed their survival. The innovative efforts that aim at making traditional forms more contemporaneous, even while maintain their fundamental performatic and artistic culture, could be supported, thereby giving a contemporary dimension to preservation.

The next one is about inviting the proposals from the recipient areas and institutions. At the moment, the ZCCs are functioning in top-down manner wherein the nature and system of programmes are pre-decided by ZCCs. If it were possible to amend this style at least to some

extent and solicit suggestions and proposals from the recipient areas and institutions about possible programmes in accordance with their aspirations and requirements, it would go a long way in addressing different realities of different localities and provinces in the zone. For instance, if the system is amended, Kerala Kalamandalam, a deemed university, will be able to come up with proposals for training and performances that are in keeping with the fundamental culture of Kerala art forms.

The next one is about the nodal agencies in component States/UTs. A major problem today is the very unequal distribution of funds and efforts over the total territory of this whole zone and also nationally, primarily due to the centralized nature of ZCCs and the varying degrees of geographic, linguistic and cultural proximities. In order to rectify this situation, a system of nodal agencies should be introduced whereby under each ZCC, there will be one or more nodal agencies functioning in each State/UT in the zone. The budget and programmes of each nodal agency can then be pre-allocated, thereby ensuring fairer distribution of funds and efforts and also opening channels of dialogue between the Centre and the periphery. Such nodal agencies could also co-ordinate inter-zonal programmes. It is because last year we had got only Rs. 2 lakh. We rejected it because what such a grand deemed university will do with Rs. 2 lakh.

Now, I come to the welfare schemes for artistes. Hundreds of artistes working in the field of arts, especially traditional arts, are in dire straits today that even their day-to-day survival being a veritable challenge. Although several institutions are engaged in preservation and promotion of the arts, their scope of activities are restricted to imparting training and providing opportunities for performance. In specific instance of traditional performances, the only recourse open to artistes of Kerala most often are the performances and programmes they get as part of temple festivals taking place from late September to early May every year. The income they get from such presentations is hardly enough for their livelihood for the festival period, with the rest of year offering nothing but bleak prospects. An Artistic Welfare Fund may be instituted under the aegis of each ZCC. This could provide assistance to needy artistes through different schemes such as 'Pension Scheme for Older and Incapacitated Artistes'. I think, Kerala is the first State in introducing the pension scheme for artistes. Then, there should be an assistance scheme for artistes suffering from ill-health. We may also have an assistance scheme for artistes pursuing art forms whose presentations are periodic in nature. Then, there should be a pension scheme for artistes not regularly employed in any organisation or institution that has a pension scheme. A sizeable amount should be earmarked for these schemes every year and norms for selection of recipient artistes can be formulated by the ZCC.

Financial assistance may be given to institutions to undertake such programmes as seminars, workshops, lecture, demonstration etc. with a view to encouraging and involving the youth of each zone to familiarize themselves with traditional culture and art forms and to foster link among themselves and with those all from the rest of the country for creative cultural communication. The last one is follow up action. The draft recommendations of 3-member

committee should be circulated. That is all. Thank you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. Thank you particularly for giving us in writing. This is going to enable us incorporate some of the suggestions that you made. You would have already noticed that there is an element of contradiction between your suggestion that the Governor should continue to run the show and the problems that are apparently arising out of its being Tamil Nadu centric, but nonetheless these are capable of resolution. Your other suggestions are, by and large, most interesting. We will continue this dialogue.

SHRI K. RAAMAMOORTHY: Actually, I was Director of SZCC from 1997 to early 2001. I am from Kerala Cadre and probably I was the only person from outside Tamil Nadu State to be the Director of SZCC. Quite a lot happened, but I would like to go by the note circulated so that I could cover by and large all the points.

I would admit right at the beginning that formation of ZCC was a wonderful concept. It has still not outlived its utility even though some of the centres, including SZCC, are not doing very well. So, I am one who does not support the idea of closing down the ZCCs, if that is the thinking of the Ministry of Culture. Rather we have got to find out ways and mechanisms as suggested in the open to tone up the situation.

My first point is about the composite geographical regions. The ZCCs should not be State oriented but composite geographical regions. As far as SZCC is concerned, we find Karnataka and Andhra Pradesh are on both sides - SZCC and NCZCC. That has to be removed. These two States benefit to a large extent from both the centres, but their contribution to the corpus fund is far too less.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Is your objection only that they are not contributing or do you not want them to belong to more than one ZCC?

SHRI K. RAAMAMOORTHY: That can very well be with the SZCC. They should draw funds only from one Centre.

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is your only objection, but not culturally.

SHRI K. RAAMAMOORTHY: It is only about funding.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let us get this point straight in our mind. It is certainly wrong of them to belong to more than one ZCC and not make its contribution, but I think we also need to recognize that from the larger point of view of the functioning of the zone, if you took what is often called Hyderabad-Karnataka, its connections with Beedar as it used to be, its connections with the whole of NCZCC are very close, culturally speaking. This is also probably true of the Telangana area of Andhra Pradesh, which is why we had this process of having them inter-mingled. At the same time, I would imagine that the Konkan area of Kerala as well as Koorg area of Kerala would have very strong cultural links with Karnataka even as the Bangalore area would have very strong links with Tamil Nadu. That is why, we

thought that they should really be allowed to function in more than one zone. Of course, the expectation was that since States are getting doubly the benefit of an isolated State like Tamil Nadu or Karnataka that they would also make double the contribution and yet one finds that they are baulking at that. That is a critical point. Maybe it is a consequence of our having decided in 1985 that we would decree that Andhra Pradesh would belong to two zones as also Karnataka would whereas. Perhaps if we had left it to them and said that look from your own cultural point of view, you ought to belong to more than one centre, but if you choose to belong to more than one ZCC, then you also should accept the financial obligation involved.

SHRI K. RAAMAMOORTHY: Initially when the ZCC was started, it was inaugurated in Thiruvayaru. You know it very well. Then, it was shifted to Thanjavore, but unfortunately, Thanjavore is still the centre while most of the Directors operate from Chennai as they belong to Tamil Nadu cadre. She rightly said that they treat it as a parking lot. Temporarily, it is okay, I will try and then go back when the situation is better for me. This has to be somewhat done away with. In fact, I had written a letter to the Secretary, Mr. Sarkar, when I saw an advertisement in a newspaper calling for the applications for the post of director. I said that this is the limit. There are no takers for this assignment.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are no takers in the Civil Service or in the cultural community.

SHRI K. RAAMAMOORTHY: Unfortunately as she said, they try to tap only the Civil Servants.

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is the point I would like you to address. As somebody who has served for four years as Director of SZCC, do you think that the task you were undertaking could be undertaken by any member of the cultural community?

SHRI K. RAAMAMOORTHY: Why not? That is covered somewhere in point (e). I thought that I would talk about that. My suggestion is whosoever is selected as Director should operate only from Thanjavore. It should be made mandatory; otherwise, he should not be appointed. The appointment should be done with the approval of the Ministry of Culture. Otherwise, the Ministry of Culture does not have any role. In the name of autonomy, they play havoc in the field of art and culture.

Then, Governor is the chairperson of the Governing Body. In my letter to Mr. Sarkar, I have indicated that this is not working all right. So, I have even gone to the extent of saying that you can have a nominal head as Governor as the chairperson, but you have to have a co-chair in the form of an eminent artiste from anyone of the States, maybe with two or three year term. We need a co-chair. Governors do not have time. They only chair a couple of meetings and get some programmes organized in Raj Bhawan or UT. They have no stake in that. Left to me, this should be done away with and culturally competent, well trained people should be made the co-chair.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Do you think that the SNA would be the appropriate body to name such a chairperson or a co-chairperson?

SHRI K. RAAMAMOORTHY: Why not? We take a decision. If the Government of India takes a decision, they will have to fall in line. Of course, there will be some reservation, but it does not matter. We will have to go through it, if we want to retain these ZCCs which have done, by and large, a good work.

Again, I am touching upon the points Ms. Samson has highlighted. I would like to elaborate them. There is no administrative rule. There is no financial rule. Whatever is beneficial to them, they will say that here State Government gives me more, here the Government of India gives me more, I will avail of that facility. Twenty five years have gone by, why has the Department not come out with Administrative Rules? Why do we not have Financial Rules? In the name of autonomy, they have an auditor who comes and does a hotchpotch work and walks away with money. So, something needs to be done. People should be made accountable. I am sure, Mr. Amol Palekar and others had gone to Thanjavore. There, advances to the tune of Rs. 2-3 crore are still pending. I am sure that will be the case with all ZCCs. It is not peculiar to SZCC alone, it will be the same everywhere. Unless and otherwise, we penalise people for holding on to money - this is called temporary defalcation of government funds - it will not work. It being a public institution, it is the money of the Government of India and the State Governments. Nobody questions. I do not know whether RTI Act is applicable to them and anybody has questioned them. At least not during my time and even now, nothing is happening. So, I would advocate for proper uniform Administrative Rules, uniform Financial Code for all ZCCs. Whatever details you ask for, they will produce it and try to convince you. I am sorry that it is all bunkum.

Then, the appointment of Director should be done with the approval of the Ministry of Culture. I will also go to the extent of saying that the staff pattern should be properly defined. As of now, it is left to the Director or anybody in the Centre. If somebody is my relative, I bring him in. He may be a third rate fellow; he may be a peon or clerk or anybody. They are all getting unionized now. It is sad and spoiling the whole centre. It is not at all desirable. It is time that we put a full stop to that, if it is possible. The Director should be supported by a Deputy Director or Assistant Director (Admn.). Then, there shall be a Deputy Director of Programmes who should be an eminent artiste from the zone. You have umpteen number of segments of art forms and he should coordinate all the programmes of the ZCC. He should give direction. If a bureaucrat comes, he does not know dance. Fortunately, I was born and brought up in Thanjavore, the seat of culture. So, culture is imbibed in me. So, I could easily pick up and do justice to my job. Since I left, it is terrible. We need Asst. Director (Admn.), Deputy Director (Programming) and Programmes Officers. The guys there do not know which art form is tribal, which art form is classical and which art form is percussion. So, we need programme officers. The staffing pattern will have to be properly delineated.

Then, you cannot throw away all the members of the staff who are in position now. The best way out is that you pick up one guy and train him in one particular art form. Let us say, one Assistant is there. Train him in tribal art form and another person in folk art and another one in classical and another one in puppetry and so on. Then, all of them should be trained. During my time, I had promoted the concept of clubs or connoisseurs of art and culture. Of course, there was lot of opposition from my side. What I aimed was that you do not have to depend on the Government alone. There are lot of moneyed people who could contribute for the betterment of the Centre. So, you can tap them. For that, we can have a club of industrialists, philanthropists etc. There are lot of people who could contribute. There was opposition, but I constituted a forum of friends of SZCC which is really thriving well in Thanjavore now. That has taken roots and it has out beaten SZCC. The 1000th year of Jagdishwara Temple in Thanjavore was recently held on 26th September. This Brahmatyanjali Foundation, which I started, is now an NGO, which is doing very well. They were asked to bring in 1,000 Bharatnatyam dancers from all over. Lot of people had come from overseas and every year, they conduct Brahmatyanjali. This is a one week long programme in the temple of Thanjavore, just like Natyanjali in Chidambaram. I wanted to have it in Thanjavore, that being the headquarters of SZCC. That is really doing well. My only suggestion is that if an NGO does a very good job in that region, bring it on board. Let them be on your Executive Board and question you. For example, Surya Krishnamurthy's Foundation of Kerala is wonderful. No NGO in the country could beat this foundation. Such people should be brought on board. I would be for the inclusion of local NGO on the Executive Board.

About nomination by the Government of India, of course, some Joint Secretary or Director is on the board of the three committees - Finance Committee, Governing Body and Programme Committee. None turns up. You should stipulate that any meeting should be fixed up in consultation with the Ministry so that officers designated could attend. I remember that Mrs. Anand was Joint Secretary and Mr. Vajpayee was Addl. Secretary during my days. There was interaction between us and also periodical discussions used to take place. We held lot of huge programmers like Apna Utsav, so many programmes in Republic Day Parade and Arts and Crafts Festival. The nominees of the Government of India should necessarily attend these meetings.

MR. CHAIRMAN: May I just ask you here this. Since Joint Secretaries and Directors are rather thin on the ground, would it not be appropriate if the Government of India were to actually get somebody as the Ministry of Culture's representative, who then has to consult with the Joint Secretary before attending any meeting but might perhaps be somebody who is located in Chennai.

only people who are based in Delhi to be attending these meetings in seven ZCCs. If you make a simple calculation, seven multiplied by three becomes 21 and 21 different bodies are to be attended by one and a half person. That is the reason that you do not get them to come. So, reflect upon that as to whether while being nominees of the Ministry of Culture on these

Committees, they are not necessarily the officers of the Ministry, is that feasible? Can the Akademis be brought into this? These are the questions that I would like you to address.

SHRI K. RAAMAMOORTHY: Since it is a Government of India nominee, it does not mean that the Director should come. You can nominate anybody. In fact, Lalit Kala Akademi, Chennai are on the board. The Sangeet Natak Akademi is also represented. All these Akademis are represented on the boards of these ZCCs, but during the five years of my service, I did not find anybody attending this programme. Even the Chennai-based officers did not find time. They are artistes. I am sorry that if they do not join, we have got to take a fresh look at it. We have to make it mandatory that the Government of India's nominee, either a government officer or anybody from the Akademi, should compulsorily attend the meetings.

I hold the view that Director need not necessarily be from the State Government. There is no consultation. If a circular is sent to all the State Governments, probably only officers, who would be interested to come here and work, may come. At this stage, I would like to mention that now we have established it in Thanjavore. There was a dilemma to shift it also to Hyderabad or somewhere else. I told the State Government that you are going to lose this centre and so, you must do something. So, I got Rs. 2.5 crore from the State Government and put up the headquarter office. Otherwise, when I joined, I had moved into a thatched shed. It is a shame. It is the Government of India decision not to fund big buildings, but to hold it in small buildings. It is totally wrong. Subsequently, it is mentioned that somebody freaked out, but it does not mean that everybody would freak out. You should put a limit of Rs. 2 crore or Rs. 3 crore and have a building where you have an office complex and a cultural complex. What had I done? I have an office complex, I have an art gallery, I have a documentation centre, I have an AC auditorium and a huge complex. Only Tamil Nadu Government gave me money and with that, I had done that. What I am trying to say is that the Centre is established. Of course, it is not doing well. I would suggest that the Director should be given quarter which can be constructed well within the campus. He should not be allowed to draw HRA from anywhere even if he operates from Chennai or wherever. You put that every guy will try and operate from Thanjavore. That is absolutely essential. Otherwise, indiscipline the lesser the better for the Centre.

Then, having prominent cultural administrators is an ideal thing, but the note says that '.. a person with a flair for promotion of art and culture'. I am saying this not because I am a civil servant, but because there are people who have interest in it. I am a poet, I am a writer, film-maker and an actor. I may not be of the standard and stature of Mr. Amol Palekar. There are people. So, it is ideal that civil servant with a flair for the task may be chosen.

I come to (f) - salary scales and remuneration rates for artistes. When I was there it was Rs. 50. I raised it to Rs. 150. Those days, it was a big money. Now it is about Rs. 300. Even that amount is not adequate. Even ordinary laborer, unskilled labourer, get that much of

money and here, a professional artiste is being paid Rs. 300. I think, it is time we double it, if not triple, to begin with, but we should also put a condition that every five years, we should revisit the need to fix the remuneration.

Then, Vice-Chancellor of University of Kerala mentioned about insurance policies. It was I who introduced insurance policies for artistes when I was Director. After that, it has gone with the wind. What I did was that when an artiste is booked, he is available for a month. He goes from part 'a' to part 'b'. For example, if he goes to Kashmir, by the time he comes back home almost a month is lost. If something happens to him, what do I do? I talked to Oriental Insurance Company. By paying Rs. 5,000 or Rs. 6,000, I got all my 2,000 artistes insured. A bigger scheme can definitely be drawn up because I saw one of my own artistes knocked down by a scooterist in Hyderabad when we were performing in Shilpa Gram of Hyderabad. He died on the spot. We gave the money, but paying Rs. 10,000 is nothing. Why can't we insure them? It does not cost much. It is essential to ensure all the artistes.

I am going to point (h) - performance in cities and towns and overseas. That has become a trend. Now, we are not going to villages, moffusil and they are thirsting for this kind of programmes. When we perform in Delhi, Chennai or any metropolitan city, there will be hardly any audience. If you take it to the remote areas, then the attendance will be very good. I organize annually a programme which is called Salanganatham. The first programme was run on Thanjavore Palace ground. The next year, I think I should take it to interiors. I took it to Manora. So, I think, people from 20 or 30 villages came by bullock and in carts to see the 3-day programme. More than that, in the ceremony that we had, there was enormous turn out. I could not even reach the stage to welcome the gathering. I think, we should fix up what should be the percentage of programmes to be held at the metropolitan cities and it should be the barest minimum. The Government of India should fix percentage for even what should be the percentage of funds to be spent on folk and tribal art forms, how much on classical art forms, how much on document and how much on training.

We are only trying to preserve the tradition. How are we going to propagate the traditions that we have been bequeathed with? We have got to train more youngsters. School children are willing to come in. Unfortunately, the guru-shishya parampara, that I started during my time, has been stopped. Wherever this is effectively run, certain institution should support it. This will go a long way because this tradition will have to be passed on from generation to generation. Otherwise, the very purpose of these ZCCs will be defeated. It should not die with our own generation. The baton should be passed on to the next generation. So, training of the younger generation is absolutely essential.

Then, a generous corpus and subsequent replenishment of the corpus should be there. The Government of India has failed in this regard miserably. It is giving funds. Initially, Rs. 10 crore of funds was given and the allocation of the Government of India at that time was Rs. 2.5 crore. After that, they did refuse to budge. Why? When so much of money is spent on other academis, why are we not giving additional funds, as it has been rightly said generous

corpus and replenishment? Today one can manage one day with Rs. 100. Tomorrow, it will not be possible and you may need Rs. 150 or Rs. 200. We have got to periodically raise the corpus fund. We should also insist that the State Governments should give matching contribution. The Director should not go begging around. I was begging around and being a civil servant, I was able to get around successfully.

Then, next point is domestic propagation of culture but on an international dimension. Domestically we ourselves do not know our cultural heritage, but at the same time, Indians overseas are thirsting for this kind of programmes. If we go to the Gulf, if we go to Reunion Island, if we go to Mauritius, if we go to Fiji and if we go to Sri Lanka, there is South Indian population, there is Tamil population. They look forward to have this programme. We may go in a year to one place in a limited amount, where we should stop. It should not be kind of jamboree, but this is essential because people from Reunion Island made a request to us that you send make-up artistes who could help their women to put on bridal costumes. They would like to preserve the tradition of how to put your rangoli on Diwali, how to deck up your house and Pooja Room. They want people to help them. I did send. Of course, I was also asked to go, but I could not go because I was busy constructing my building of the SZCC at that time. So, we should not put a full stop totally to international tours.

Then, the States put a lot of pressure on the ZCC to set up Shilpa Gram all over. I think, one Shilpa Gram at the headquarter should be adequate enough because we do not have money. Rather you can have various programmers all across. Then, there should be no overlapping among the three Akademis. I think, ZCC could have some water place. The ZCCs have failed to tap the existing Akademis. They are wonderful Akademis. I have taken the help of Lalit Kala Akademi, Sangeet Natak Akademi. For various programmes, they used to send large contingents. In fact, I think, Mr. Rajaram was the Director of Kala Kshetra. At that time, I asked him to kindly send me a large contingent of Bharatnatyam dancers. All these girls had performed so well in national level programme. They are doing well, but of course, we have got to really monitor what is the level of their participation, how far they are of help to ZCCs.

MR. CHAIRMAN: May I request you to conclude now because there are lot of others also.

SHRI K. RAAMAMOORTHY: Sir, I feel emotional about it because I will not be able to come tomorrow and day after. I would finish it now.

I have heard about the Apna Utsav of 1987 held in Mumbai. It was wonderful. One national programme once a year should showcase Indian cultural heritage and we should not mind spending on that.

Then, I come to archiving, especially of dying art forms. Attention given, at least by SZCC, to archiving is pathetic. Even though they have mentioned that they record - I had left in 2003 - I leave this brochure which they brought out in 2003 wherein they have mentioned that they have documented, but the format in which they have documented is awfully bad

and they had not consulted experts - vitinatakam chaura pottery, martial arts of Nicobaris, Beezu Kamsale, kindarijogger, puppetry, kalameltu, terikutu, Bharatnatyan and so on and so forth. I would say that adequate money is not being spent and then it is not in the proper format also. This job is not given to a professional. At least they should have an expert as a consultant before story-board is written about what is to be covered and what is not to be covered, but I think, clear-cut instructions may have to go from the Ministry.

It is absolutely essential to encourage new and upcoming artistes. There are lot of colleges in which these programmes are held and they are given in a very professional way. They have to be picked up. If we do not provide platform to them in our festivals, we cannot encourage them. We should give them something. Out of 100 per cent, at least 25 per cent should be earmarked for the upcoming artistes, then for training of youngsters and guru-shishya parampara. There is enormous interest and we should tap on that. Then, there should be encouragement of innovation. Instead of going on the trodden path, there are people who innovate programmes. Even out of Bharatnatyam, I think you rightly remembered Ms. Daksha Seth of Trivandrum, she had done a wonderful programme for us. It was a very innovative programme.

Regarding photography, cinematography and graphic arts, I totally agree with it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I think, we have come to the end of that. May I request you, Mr. Raamamoorthy, to just put down your thoughts with respect to this as also the recommendations that follow. Sir, you made a running commentary on the first part of it. If you were to go on the second part, we would have to give you another half an hour, which would perhaps be to the disadvantage of other participants. So, please put down your thoughts to the extent possible in writing.

Shri Mahapatra wants to ask you something.

SHRI SITAKANT MAHAPATRA: As you know, the jurisdiction of ZCCs was drawn up cutting across State boundaries. It was with a very laudable objective that in a multi-cultural society like ours, there is so much of overlapping. The system has operated for twenty five years now with plus and minus things in terms of actual performance, in terms of the concerned State's contribution to the required fund. So, keeping all that in view and not to stress the point further, for example, if you stretch this point further that unless it is overlapping, that the particular ZCC may neglect, and what is the jurisdiction what should be the jurisdiction of a neighboring ZCC, pushing that argument very far, you can say that if it is Dimapur headquarter, there is so much of concentration of Nagaland culture and nothing much is happening.. So, we should not press it too far. Therefore, keeping that in view, would you consider that a time has come to reconsider whether jurisdiction of ZCCs should also not be drawn State-wise, not cutting across State boundaries, with an arrangement or stipulation that borders where there are such multi-cultural overlappings that they are given due consideration to both forms?

SHRI K. RAAMAMOORTHY: Sir, overlapping is fine, but all that I was trying to hit at was that they were drawing funds from both the centres - SZCC and NCZCC - but their contribution remains the same. There is no harm if you draw from both the centre, but you jack up your contribution also. That is all I said. In one pocket you may have Tamils, Malyalis or whatever, there is no problem, but jack up the contribution, the percentage of it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: So, we will expect from you in your written contribution taking the shape of specific amendments or additions or deletions to the existing text, both with respect to the Introductory Chapter as well as recommendations. You can send it to us in track form and then we will decide as a committee what all that you suggested we should accept or what not, but your extremely detailed examination of these suggestions has been most welcome and we thank you for sharing your experiences with us. I would very well like to go to other zones, but if there is somebody from the southern zone, who would like to intervene - from Tamil Nadu or Andhra Pradesh - we may complete that round now.

MS.LEELA SAMSON : In regard to contribution to the corpus that the States have to do, there are States still after 25 years who have not paid the initial promissory amount of Rs. 2 crore. In fact, Karnataka just paid Rs. 50 lakh more, but still have not reached this amount. There are problems with this. May I say that one of the advantages of overlap which could be taken as an advantage but is not being addressed is this? For instance, an octave just plays in Andhra Pradesh, but the information about that octave of North-East artistes coming to Andhra Pradesh was not shared with the others. It is a waste of resources that groups from North-East came all the way to Andhra Pradesh, but even Karnataka, Kerala and Tamil Nadu did not benefit from it. This wastage is paramount. It is happening all the time. They bring one group all the way down and they send it all the way back. It is approached back by the other State. There is no coordination between the States.

SHRI JYOTINDRA JAIN: I would like to talk a little bit about general cultural situation and then come down to ZCCs. I was Director of Crafts Museum in Pragati Maidan for 18 years. For eight years, I was in JNU where I established a School of Art. Presently, I am member-secretary of IGNCA.

I think, we are talking about administrative reforms and things like that. The major problem, if you were to put the ZCCs in the broader context of cultural situation in the country, is single problem that is really causing harm to all the institutions and that is a great lack of trained personnel. So, it is not that we are going to solve it this year, but I think it boils down to that. Looking at any institution in the country, you will find how many positions are vacant not only at the highest level but also at the middle rung there. I think, we will have to do something, but that is not the agenda for today.

Now you have talked about administrative reforms and things like that, but I would like to concentrate on academic and fundamental issues regarding quality of performances, quality of activity that we do. I have gone through, both the draft chapter and the recommendations. I have a few comments in writing. I will give it to you after I finish my presentation.

There is far too much emphasis on preservation of an imaginary tradition. This whole notion of tradition, we have to preserve tradition, but what tradition, which tradition are we talking about? Is it to be frozen in the past? A tradition is not a static entity, but it is always moving forward. Storage for pristine tradition and its preservation in pure form will lead to museumise tribals frozen in the past. This is what often we do in the name of tradition. The best example is Republic Day Parade dancers and Republic Day Folk Dance Festivals and all that.

What is that tradition? It comes out of Delhi. I know that in SNA journal they had published in 1964 how college girls were dressed up like tribals and many things. Then, it goes on from 1964 onwards. Which tradition are we talking about? Should we not look at really the notion of tradition and then be realistic about what we are doing? All urban populations of India too belong to certain traditions of language, religion or culture, but we do not insist on their confining to these traditions. They go forward. The entire burden of preserving traditions cannot be on the rural and tribal communities. They too have modern inspirations. Therefore, the change in their music, dance, theatre as well as costume and make-up that occurs due to urban influences, like cinema, should not be denounced. We may not be looking for an aquarium type of art, after all. Instead of denouncing nylon and plastic, one should make available various choices and create awareness about alternative materials. Storage for the pristine and original cultural has political meaning and ideological pitfalls.

Origin theory can lead to the question of autogeny and then to the idea of Hindu nation or Dravidian nation. If we try to go to what is original, then we have to really go to this point. We cannot go to original in 19th century. Then, we keep going to the original and then we arrive at the idea of Hindu nation. So, I think, we have to be careful about the changing traditions rather than only thinking of origin as such. Plurality and originality are better than single cultural origin. There is difference between performing dance and dance for one's joy. Most of the folk and tribal dance practices were participatory rather than performative. They were not audience oriented always in villages. The main fora for folk and tribal dance, theatre music and crafts were the fairs and festivals where these people participated spontaneously as practitioners as well as audiences. With the expansion of urbanism and rise of new media communication technologies, TV for example, the lifestyles of rural and tribal communities have drastically changed. The traditional fairs and festivals are vanishing. There is a need for providing infrastructural help in sustaining and reviving village fairs which have always been the platforms for the local performative practices. ZCCs should provide help in sustaining and reviving the fairs rather than organizing events in Shilpa Grams. If an overall change has occurred in the rural tribal lifestyle, such as their using cloth, medical treatment, food entertainment, mode of governance, travel etc., one cannot expect dance, music and theatre to remain unchanged and constant. These have to be seen both as part of the overall lifestyle mobility. So, inculcation and support would be more desirable than imposition of aesthetic values from outside. That is what aesthetic value from outside relates to, what happened in Republic Day Parade and Republic Day Dance Festivals.

Regarding creation of a separate Folk and Tribal Art Akademi, it has both advantages and disadvantages. The advantage would be that these art forms will receive more attention and encouragement if there is a separate forum, but the disadvantage would be that the folk and tribal arts will be segregated from other arts and thereby be marginalized. Presently, all the three Akademis have amended their constitutions for support to folk and tribal arts and oral traditions. Here, there is no segregation of the folk and tribal arts.

MR. CHAIRMAN: May I just intervene? Are you satisfied that, notwithstanding the inclusion of this aspect in their mandate, they are actually devoting adequate attention to it? I know nothing about it, but it has been mentioned to us that the Akademis are not, in fact, devoting adequate attention to this. That is why, somebody suggested that we should have a separate Folk and Tribal Art Akademi.

SHRI JYOTINDRA JAIN: The intention was very good because it was a comprehensive institute because folk and tribal art, classical and modern, they were all in one. Just because the Akademis have not followed that line, it does not mean that we should take it out and put it separately because this would marginalize people, this would segregate people. It is like reservation category which in a way marginalized people. So, I think, instead of creating a separate Akademi, if the Akademis are told to fulfil their objectives which are spelled out in their original objectives, it would serve the purpose. I would rather insist that the Akademis give enough attention to those things so that they remain a part of the composite culture rather than creating separate tribal and folk culture.

The idea of having an apex body for the ZCCs is valuable. This office will not only protect the objectives but also supervise the work and give guidance from time to time. This office can also sensitise Directors and staff in terms of creating refined programmes and activities. I do not mean that apex body Director would do that. The apex body Director would then invite people from various fields and have discussion from time to time. I do not mean supervising in terms of holding a danda, but I am talking about having that kind of views and then going and seeing what is happening in those places. I think, it is good to have an apex body.

The idea of chain programmes is equally important. For such chain programmes, each ZCC could have a large bus or buses to mobilize troupes for performances from one place to another. Already there are Surbhi Theatre in Andhra Pradesh and Mobile Theatres in Assam and things like that. They are self-sufficient. They do not depend on any funds. They go and perform from villages to villages and the audiences also come in hundreds. So, I think, there should be some idea of such mobility which should be brought into practice.

Then, it is mentioned that there are repeated opportunities only to some. I think, it is a very important point. It is absolutely true that benefit goes only to a select few music or theatre groups or crafts persons. I had solved this problem at Crafts Museum by making a policy of not repeating the same group or crafts persons for three years. It was broken only in special

cases. I feel that we have award winners like national awards given to crafts people. Believe me, I have been 18 years in that field. We have about 10 million crafts people, but the benefit is not going to more than 300 families of crafts people. So, there is a big gap because these 300 are award winners and the policy of the Government of India is that if they are award winners, they are sent to Germany, they are sent to Delhi and they are sent to Craft Bazar. The entire 10 million are not reaching out Delhi because of that award. Award cannot be such a sacrosanct thing. I feel that there is a repetition and therefore, some mechanism has to be established whereby more people and groups can participate. I think this paper with me and I give it to you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much for constructive suggestions.

DR. (MS.) ANURADHA KAPUR: I am presently Director of NSD. I have had a long association with teaching as well as practice of theatre. Let me begin by saying that the ZCCs will in the future have an important role to play, if they are reconstructed in different ways. Let me begin by saying that through the lens of the fact that there is a very important outreach area that the ZCCs could reach, those would be through training, documentation and interactions. I will come to that in a while.

I think, there would be one thing of importance that they should become hubs of activities rather than having one official sort of house. That hub of activities could be seen in three ways. One would be performing spaces. The other would be rehearsal spaces, which is an absolutely dire need for performance. I think, it could be one of the main reasons for urban and semi-urban and peri-urban theatre to collapse today that it has no space to rehearse. So, small spaces for rehearsal and non-formal spaces for performances could be one part of the hub and library could be one part of the hub and perhaps documentation centre that is interactive where things could be accessed from music to video. The other aspects of performance could be there. I was reading the idea that ZCC should have more mobile aspect to it. I think, it could perhaps have a transformation into a sort of cultural hub.

The second point would be focus on documentation. As Leela has already pointed out, that needs a very major hand of experts in documenting and digitizing and perhaps making available in very different ways the possibilities of viewing theatre forms.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Can I interrupt you here? Whether this documentation should not be done by the academies and the NSD? I do not see that the ZCCs will ever have expertise. I can understand their bringing to your attention artistes or any form of arts which pertains to their zone and enquiring whether experts would be able to do the documentation. But if the ZCCs themselves were to become major archivists, then perhaps the kind of problems that Shri Mahapatra mentioned at an earlier meeting of ours, where there are various highly complicated and highly technical conventions and so forth that relate to this, which we could hardly expect an itinerant IAS officer moving from fertilizers to chemical through arts, to be able to do.

DR. (MS.) ANURADHA KAPUR: I think, you are right that it requires a particular expertise, but I also do believe that even organizations like Indira Gandhi Centre have also documentation. I am not sure all together would be able to still answer the fact that there are completely quickly, rapidly changing forms and that we would not be able to answer the way that the rapidity is altering things. Now perhaps it is not a question of making a large archive but chosen archives in discussion with people, with artistes and with practitioners. For instance, there are lot of things that are just uploaded very directly on the YouTube.com and become a notion that this is an archived performance. With this kind of rapidity of dissemination, I am not sure that one should think of archive, of a vault over here. It could be thought of as the way of promoting practice and change. So, I think, a dialogue between the institutions that actually do archiving could be helpful. Therefore, it is not being primary but certainly an activity that is incidentally done.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Before you continue, Prof. Jain wanted to say something. Then, I will get back to you.

PROF. JAIN: I think, in this regard, Secretary (Culture) had a very valuable idea that documentation is very technical thing and in the ZCC also, there is documentation lying from cassette days to CDs and DVDs. The Secretary (Culture) had an idea that we need to have a central agency where all documentations with regard to folk and tribal cultures could be centralized, including what is with the Akademis and IGNCA. If such a body is not established, I do not think that regional centres would be able to do documentation at professional level and disseminate that. So, I think, there is a need for such a centralized body which could then cater to ZCCs and help them to document, but also centrally see what resources are required, list them out and preserve them. If this can happen, either as a separate body or coming from the Akademis, it would help because lot of work is happening in ZCC and it is not all being documented. We cannot document it again afterwards. Whenever an event takes place, it should be documented at that time. Then, it should be technically preserved and centralized.

MR. CHAIRMAN: As I understand it, what we are now coming to agree upon is that the ZCCs can never perform the technical task of archiving. At best they can keep records of what it is that they do and make it available to the experts and perhaps in terms of what Mrs. Kapur was saying, bring to the attention of the archiving authorities any changes or innovations that they happen to notice or particular artistes who they believe should be used for archival purposes. In that sense, it becomes a facilitating centre, a documenting centre but only secondarily an archiving centre.

SHRI K. RAAMAMOORTHY: I am one who does not believe in this centralized mechanism for documentation and archiving. The cultural canvas of this country is so vast and so varied that any of these centers would be able to do justice to that.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am sorry, Mr. Raamamoorthy. I do not think that it falls within the remit of this committee to decide how the archiving should be done. It only falls within the remit of this committee to see what the ZCCs could do and there have been attempts unsuccessful in the past to impose the duty of archiving upon the ZCCs, to which they are patently not suited. So, we were trying to refine that concept by saying that with respect to facilitating the centre or centres that may exist for archiving as well as for providing documentation of their own activities, from which the archiving centre or centres might derive inspiration and thirdly, in terms of being secondary archiving area, they may be of some use. I think, Leela wanted to say something.

MS. LEELA SAMSON: I believe that West Bengal Government made very good use of a train recently that travelled across the country with an exhibition. It was outstanding. There were lines of people on platform no. 11 in Chennai station, wanting to see that exhibition. I do not know how it happened because it was very minimally advertised. May I suggest that we must use a train or a part of a train as a kind of a moving exhibition where not only some documentation but also some live artistes can be transported, creating awareness through States across the country?

MR. CHAIRMAN: So, we can have intra-zonal train yatras and very possibly inter-zonal train yatras subsequently. It is certainly a new idea. I think, we would want to recommend something like that.

DR. (MS.) ANURADHA KAPUR: My next point is in some senses related to what Leela is saying. This is who should be to look at generic forms, not only forms that are particular to particular States and leak into other States but actually generic forms that could then be added to this kind of mobility so that if you are looking at operative form, if you are looking at company natak, if you are looking at particular kinds of crafts, this will also come across in some senses meeting we had together some days ago so that dialogue between forms is visible. Sometimes, what happens is that because of our understanding and because of the way we documented forms, they remain boxed. In some ways, the documentation itself could keep this in mind that there are forms that travel across borders and actually can be seen in various parts and various modifications through various States. So, that could be one part. I think, there is a very important distinction made here, which is distinction between documentation and archiving. I think if that distinction is understood, the ZCCs could play an important role.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have to consult with the Joint Secretary before attending any meeting. There might perhaps be somebody looking.

DR. (MS) ANURADHA KAPUR: the performances with young people of the area so that they are attracted to looking at what is happening rather than being invited to a full performance. So, there are more interactive aspects.

I would say the possibility of giving small short-term or long-term, depending on the nature of work, scholarships to young people to attach themselves to the gurus and practitioners of that form so that they can actually see that as not something that has nothing to do with their lives, not applying only to a Central Fund or scholarship, but scholarships and opportunities to study with people of that area.

Lastly, forming more connections with theatre and educational aspects of culture into the schools, and the ZCC could somehow in dialogue with other institutions find ways of how to incorporate it in the daily lives and daily functioning of schools. We have had some success in that with some of our outreach programmes of the NSD where we are able to take teacher-actors and actor-teachers into performing in schools and colleges. Maybe this could be an activation of the outreach that the ZCC might think to do.

MR. CHARMAN: I would also like to request Dr. Kapur to give to us in writing what you said.

SHRI JAYANT KASTUAR: I am presently Secretary of Sangeet Natak Akademi since 1999. Prior to that, I was heading its Dance Department as Deputy-Secretary (Dance) since 1984. I have also been the director of Kathak Kendra briefly. My one background is that of Kathak Dance, which I first presented on stage way back in 1957. So, I have also been a performer since then.

Sir, I would first submit that the formation of the ZCCs was a boon to Indian culture and Indian society and definitely to people like us who have been cultural workers for a long time and also so far as from my perspective as from the Sangeet Natak Akademi, I looked upon it as a development of a larger infrastructural support that we could jointly provide to the country. Definitely, we should expunge any discussions, any thoughts from our minds of doing away with this wonderful baby or babies. What went wrong, if at all - partly something went wrong with the work of the ZCCs - needs to be analysed, firstly in terms of the organizational structure.

For that, first I would like to submit to look at the scenario in mid-80s, as a context which will give us an idea about the decline of the State bodies and State Akademis which were functioning under the given political context and bureaucratic context of the States, including financial situation of the States at that time. This will give us some clue. Our ZCCs, which are removed from Centre, from New Delhi, unlike the Akademis, are sufficiently insulated from such interventions of the political class and of the bureaucratic class at the lower level. These akademis were not adequately insulated from such pressures, I would submit.

Secondly, ZCCs were thought of as a very unique structure where the States participate. States do participate in our bodies also with their State representatives, but here the States are also participating with their financial contribution as well. Here, you have financial contribution from the State Governments as well as from the Centre, which jeopardizes the objectives and goals of the ZCCs. I would submit that, this may sound too drastic, States

need not contribute to the ZCCs. They have been conceived and given birth to by the Central Government and the Central Government should own the entire financial responsibility. Of course, we can explore whether through other means, the corporates and National Culture Fund, we can provide funding to them because the moment the States come in with their funds, they place their own demands, demands which are not necessarily culturally informed. Most often than not, they are actually politically influenced. We have also faced these demands and we have successfully thwarted such pressures with the help of our Ministry and being adequately insulated from such pressures, but you can imagine the kind of pressure the local representatives of the people must be bringing on our Directors in the ZCCs and how Directors have to bear them.

It is amazing when I received the report of activities, how many activities all ZCCs manage to do in a month? That easily gives away the whole context in which they are functioning and the quality also. Therefore, the organizational pattern restructuring needs to be looked at, both in terms of whether the Governor has to play the role of the Chairman of ZCC or not and all these things. All these things will come into consideration and also financial re-organisation. In this context, I would like to submit something. My experience about ten years ago, when we have had a very elaboration discussion on the same issue, when Dr. Vaidyanath Iyer was Secretary and ZCCs at that time were in financial doldrums because they only had the corpus fund and the Government had not begun Plan funding, I had strongly argued for this kind of support that when Sangeet Natak Akademi and all other Akademis can have Plan schemes and receive funds under Plan funds, then why not ZCCs? Why should they have to run their activities only out of the interest earned on their corpus funds and why should they be at the mercy of the State support? That is when many of these schemes started.

In fact, at that time, I had also given very strong argument for this training programme under guru-shishya parampara which actually is a very old scheme of Sangeet Natak Akademi, though many of my colleagues in ZCCs and in the Government thought that it was their scheme, but it was actually existing in the Akademi for a very long time. I think that must remain as an important programme. But I am not touching the programme part of it here. It is only the organizational pattern and financial pattern.

Please insulate these ZCCs which are really strong arms and can function as strong arms of the Ministry of culture and as strong collaborators of the national Akademis and the Central bodies. I think, from this point of view, their health needs to be taken care of. At the same time, I feel that the Ministry has also to ensure that the Ministry in the Central Government does not expect the ZCCs to perform all kinds of functions and prevent temptation of reducing the ZCCs to Song and Drama Divisions because several instances have been there when at a short notice, ZCCs were asked to send 100 artistes of this kind or that form. Such temptations have to be prevented. Therefore, both, from the State point of view as well as from the Central Ministry's point of view, it is necessary to strengthen ZCCs in this sense.

Therefore, in this context, from the point of view of Akademis and from the point of view of Government, I would never recommend ZCCs to directly have to undertake programmes outside the country. They have a much larger responsibility. They have a much more fundamental and significant responsibility than mounting a show abroad, for which I shall recommend the Ministry to revive Office of Festival of India, which was very much there in Shastri Bhawan, then it was there in Vigyan Bhawan. The Ministry should have that kind of a provision for its programmes outside because for the ZCCs it has lot of repercussions apart from taking away their valuable time and funding.

I have spoken about this organizational structure. In that context, I would definitely recommend what has been recommended, that is, there should be an apex body, the Council of ZCCs or whatever and it should be suitably staffed with a suitable person to head it, where, of course, Akademis can participate and Akademis should participate. In this context, since I am talking about Akademis' participation, I would recount my experience because Sangeet Natak Akademi's Chairmen are members of the Governing Body and Secretaries and officers are nominated or any other nominee is sent to its Programme Committees. My own experience way back in 1980s in one of the ZCC Programme Committees was quite a shock. What was discussed in that programme committee, five per cent or less of that was reflected in the minutes. Most of my officers and colleagues, who went to other Programme Committees at that time, were equally disappointed. I would submit that when you say, whether in a committee of the Ministry or in the ZCC, that Akademi is represented, the Akademi's representative has a larger role than individual representatives in the field of performing arts. They cannot just be treated at par with 20 other members there, if you want official participation of Sangeet Natak Akademi. In this context, I would also like to inform that till mid-90s, most of the schemes of the Ministry of Culture, including fellowships in particular, all applications would be in original sent to the three Akademis to be examined in detail and then, our recommendations used to be put as Akademis' recommendations in Central Selection Committee. That practice has been done away with since 90s and now Akademis' officers would sit as one of the 20 or 25 odd members. So, there has been a dilution of the role of Akademis within the context of ZCCs or other similar bodies. We will have to think about that.

MR. CHAIRMAN: May I just interrupt to say that on the other hand, the point has been made to us that top flight artists and bodies like yours, which you represent here, tend to distort the programmes of the ZCCs by being insufficiently attentive to its outreach element and concentrate more upon what the major artistes or their particular shahgirds could play or benefit from. So, we do need a balance. I can easily see the Sangeet Natak Akademi fulfilling this role if it picked up very seriously that element of its mandate which relates to the folk and tribal arts, but I think it is that balance which we need to strike, that this should be 'outreach'. I was not using this term earlier till I had not heard it here. Earlier I was using this unfortunate expression 'marketing mechanism of our culture' whereas your Akademis are the production units. You are nurturing the artists and we are trying to take

you out. So, the expression 'outreach' seems a happier one. So, as long as SNA's representative or representatives are going to play a major role in suggesting what should be done for outreach purposes, I think you will be invaluable and we will require you to play a more weighted role, but that is the point that needs to be accepted by the Akademis.

So, what we are asking for really is that the Akademis own these ZCCs. This is not a body separate from yours. When I started out with this, the amount of objection from top artistes and critics, who are attached like lemmings to them, was that if you are going to put so much money into arts, why don't you give this to us rather than giving there. This kind of an objection was there. I take your point, but I would like to refract it through the prism of the ZCC's purposes. In this regard when I mention Akademis owning it, I would also hope that all the other cultural institutions functioning under the Ministry of culture and indeed those who are not even within their ambit would feel that here is the body through which whatever we are doing in Delhi, Kolkata or wherever, can be sent out to the bulk of the people of India through this marketing mechanism called the ZCC.

I think, Dr. Kapur wants to say something.

DR.(MS.) ANURADHA KAPUR: I think, we should be alert to one more thing that everything should not become centralized; otherwise once again the same kind of circulation of name as well as practices would be there. I would really think that a balance is very much required.

MR. CHAIRMAN: That was a very useful suggestion made by Prof. Jayant from his own experience that no one is repeated more than once in three years except in exceptional circumstances. Now I would imagine that as far as ZCCs are concerned, they do not have quite as large a canvas as the Crafts Institute would, but there should be some element of gaps between opportunities.

SHRI JAYANT KASTUAR: Sir, I would fully agree with you that there has to be a balance, but I would like to draw your attention and everyone's attention to this. Since particularly in the papers, it is mentioned that performing arts may remain the largest mandate of the ZCCs, how long for that matter is our experience of management of arts in independent India? Sangeet Natak Akademi was set up in the fifties. That was the time when we were initially conceiving all the national bodies and in 1952, 1953, all these pillars of Indian Republic came up and just about 30 years later the ZCCs.

I would like to inform, you may be aware for that matter, that it was the problem raised by Mr. Raamamoorthy. When the SNA was set up, what type of administrative support and organizational structure was provided to its first Secretary? Many of the great initiatives and tensions are actually nullified when the Government does not provide complete support and complete structure for carrying out those objectives of the organization. The first Secretary had to borrow staff to run the Akademi from her father's hospital - Dr. Joshi's Hospital.

Similarly, if the ZCCs, when they were setup and not provided properly with staff, then they would also be going in different ways and they will find it very difficult to achieve their objectives. What I was trying to say is that Akademi's own experience of management, of handling this huge task of preservation and promotion of the performing art traditions of this great country, was not easy and resources provided to the Akademi have been far from adequate till date, I would say.

Then, within the SNA the great seminars of 50s were the first attempt to define and classify our artistic traditions which were in any case were not adequately understood in the terms of these classifications. So, we have a fascinating document in terms of classifications. You will find how chakyarkoot was mentioned but no kudiattam; how odyssey or kuchipudi is mentioned; how yakshgaan is mentioned. So, what is classical, what is folk, what is traditional, just this kind of definition or classification took quite a lot of time. Definitely, SNA or Central bodies should have achieved far more, but at the same time the Akademi itself was burdened with other demands - I would not like to elaborate it here - and lot of resources and time was given towards that. But you are aware that SNA was the first to settle the folk dance festival during the Republic Day, set up a huge camp here and so on and so forth. The Akademi was called upon to present specially designed programmes for the visiting Heads of States. So, its own mandate went on expanding.

Therefore, for the ZCCs, it would be very necessary that we have a very clear focus regarding their mandate, their role and their functions. Sometimes, it is also required to say that you shall not do this rather than leaving it entirely open to them and to the organization. So, our own activities in this field have expanded and we have from time to time collaborated with ZCCs also. Therefore, in terms of the charter of the ZCCs, their overall functions, there has to be more clear definition. We should clearly set certain goals for them and say what they shall not do.

Here, I would say that the primary concern should be maintaining and keeping alive the performance culture within the regions. We all know that the task in front of us has always been sustaining our traditions in the changing socio-economic context and therefore, the whole process of re-locating, re-contextualising our artistes and practices would remain a challenge for the decades to come. This has been for the SNA and of course for the ZCCs. We also know that performing arts remain alive only in performance and all the associated rituals performed. So, the ZCCs' primary responsibility should remain making possible a very healthy performance activity within the own regions and within the own locales where these local traditions are performed.

MR. CHAIRMAN: But I may add with a certain distinction that they should keep them alive in the rural and mofussil areas or in metropolitan slums, but in this business of trying to compete with the SNA or with all these other bodies, we do not want it to be Bharat Bhawan performance. It has to be outside. Unfortunately, this combination of those who dominate the Programme Committee and the Governors and the civil servants and what you called so

appropriately 'the culturally uninformed elements.' All this has resulted in their being fosterships to Andhra Bhawan here or the Governor's house in Mumbai or elsewhere.

SHRI JAYANT KASTUAR: Sir, in fact, this is fully what I am proposing. I would like to inform you and submit that this could be done, if we agree. We have proposed under Tagore's 150th birth anniversary celebrations to the National Committee, it has gone from the Sangeet Natak Akademi, that we should think of a Tagore Performance Guarantee Scheme at the rural levels, at the local levels for these performing arts - call them arts, practices or rituals - on the lines of NREGA Scheme. It may sound very ambitious and impracticable. At the local level, there should be regular performances of the local traditions in the front village courtyard or temple or places like that. It may sound very ambitious.

MR. CHAIRMAN: For all this to happen, it is very necessary that the Sangeet Natak Akademi take a much more active interest in the activities of the ZCC. They should take very pro-active interest. Once that happens, I am sure this can be worked out. So, in some ways, I think, the big gap that has arisen between the Sangeet Natak Akademi and the ZCCs over time, is very unfortunate one. Perhaps one answer to that would be that the apex body for the ZCCs be located within the bosom of the SNA itself so that you can only criticise yourself instead of criticizing someone else.

SHRIMATI RITA SINHA: I have been Secretary (Culture) in UP for a long time. I have spent nine years of my career in culture. I was also a Director of the ZCC, Allahabad when Anuradhaji had seen this multi-lingual drama festival. What the ZCCs and Akademis should do is this. The role is like this that the Akademi within a span of one year cannot reach out to all villages in India. So, they are documenting at a very high level in Delhi. All the people who have reached the apex of their careers, they get documented by the akademis here. The ZCCs, while doing their outreach programmes and chain programmes, come across the artistes in the rural areas which are unknown to the akademis. They have not made it, but they are very good. They do not have the resources to make it. I think, there, matching is required. ZCCs always look to the Akademis for advice in technical matters for which they are really highly qualified in the techniques, like how to use mike for which instrument and things like that. The ZCCs are pretty ignorant about these things. Every instrument requires a different kind of a mike. That kind of technical guidance is given by the Akademis. Then, the Akademis put together programmes of very high stature. The SNA had that puppetry programme which was really world-class. ZCCs really look forward to these kinds of things. If they can send them over there, then a kind of standard comes up in zonal areas also. The people who are doing puppetry at the local level would like to see programmes like that and learn things and interact. The Akademis also need to pay attention to the kinds of art forms and artistes that get discovered and have not been documented already. Those areas may not even have been heard of by the Akademis. They may be very remote areas. They may be "new art forms" not hitherto exposed on national level. There has to be a 2-way interaction. It cannot be that the Akademis are dominating the ZCCs. You cannot make them into zonal

akademis. Their role is totally different. They are also doing plastic arts. They are also doing literary activities. They also do handicrafts which SNA does not do. So, they have a much more complex and broader outlook to culture than each Akademi has got by itself. So, the technical standardization and evaluation of programmes and suggestions to improve are the areas in which ZCCs can always look to the Akademis and Akademis also need to look at what the ZCCs are discovering, which they do not have.

I know that from Allahabad, we had sent a request to SNA for documentation, but the SNA could never find time to come and do it. I think, basically they did not think that it was important enough. They did not think that what we had discovered in Mirzapur art forms, was important enough to document it. So, I think, there has to be a 2-way interaction between the two and not one dominating the other and other becoming an adjunct of the other. That can never happen.

MR. CHIARMAN: I think, it is a point that we can take as agreed upon.

SHRI AMOL PALEKAR: I just wanted to ask a very small but pertinent question that SNA and you yourself being a performer and now Leela herself having been a performer of a stature, would you say that similarly at similar level, payments to folk artists should also be recommended or fought for because it has been raised to Rs. 450 per day for a folk artist of a stature of a national award winner. If you compare that to a classical performer, you will see a mind-blowing gap between these two. Would the SNA in principle recommend it? Would it help to find out as in olden days, we had the classical structure from AIR - 'A1' class, 'A' grade, 'B' grade and 'C' grade -and then accordingly have the payments. Has SNA thought of this or recommend this or will be inclined to do this?

MS. LEELA SAMSON : May I clarify? In fact, there is a little discrepancy in what we are discussing. Normally a group in the ZCC consist of 15 people. There is a leader who gets a different payment and then dancers or musicians who get different payment, which has been increased by the Ministry recently. The total amount ultimately at the end of the day, it takes so long in their travel, they end up getting roughly what an artiste might get, where her musicians are not paid separately. If I were to be invited somewhere and paid Rs. 40,000, it is just the same as this group is getting, I still have to pay very high rate to my musicians which is included and for my travel and everything. So, in a sense the discrepancy is not so high as Rs. 450 and Rs. 4 lakh except in cases of, let us say, Shiv Kumar Sharma and one of these artistes. You cannot include Shiv Kumar Sharma in this because that is completely different.

SHRI AMOL PALEKAR: No. If you cannot include Shiv Kumar Sharma, then by the same logic Tejan Bai should also not be included. What I am trying to point out is that this kind of disparity and the role played by SNA and all to nurture these things, whether Akademis have ever tried to look into this and sort this out.

SHRI JAYANT KASTUAR: Akademi's payment is much higher. In fact, I would like to inform that when we had the first octave of the North-East, which was worked out between me and the then Joint-Secretary and I designed the opening show, half the artists were directly invited by SNA and other half were sent by the NEZCC and EZCC and the payments proposed were so varied. I pleaded with the Government to let me pay to all the artists according to Akademi rates. I felt it to be very injustice that they are rehearsing together, they are performing together on the same stage and half of them are paid one-fourth of the other half, but Akademi rates are very high. They are further graded. We pay Rs. 1,000 per performance per artist in the folk group. The leader gets much more and the person like Tejan Bai would be taken as an Akademi awardee and as a soloist. Akademi has a lot of elasticity in terms of payment norms.

MR. CHAIRMAN: In such a case, I have a request to make. I recognize the difference between Akademi artists and ZCC artists. As a contribution to the work of the Committee, can you make recommendations to us on what the appropriate remuneration should be and what should be comprised within that. The point that Leela has made is that a major artiste is given lumpsum and has to manage everything else within that whereas here a lot of arrangement would be made by the ZCC and this would be a straight forward remuneration to the individual concerned. So, taking all that into account and based upon your experience and appropriately discounting for Akademi to ZCC, can you make suggestions that we could perhaps incorporate into our report. I do not think any of us here has any experience of this which can match yours. It should be, of course, on the upper side because we would be failing our artists if we were to recommend that it should be linked to NREGA wages and all that.

SHRI JAYANT KASTUAR: Sir, I will just finish and skip various other things, like Director's appointment, staff structure etc.

MR. CHAIRMAN: All of which, I hope, you will provide to us in writing.

SHRI JAYANT KASTUAR: I will only like to conclude with my objection to a fourth Akademi of Tribal and Folk Arts on two grounds. First, such an Akademi would compromise the ZCCs themselves. Second, it strikes at the basic premises, the fundamental issues involved in our classification and understanding of Indian artistic traditions - what is folk, what is tribal, what is traditional, what is classical, what is modern, what is pre-modern - and make the life of all of us, the ZCCs and SNA miserable.

We just concluded a week long festival of puppetry traditions of Karnataka where about 40 groups of puppeteers from Karnataka were invited, from morning till night, for demonstration and documentation of their performance. Two years ago, we had the same thing in Warangal with the puppetry traditions of Andhra Pradesh for nine days. 52 groups were invited. Puppetry experts were sent. Now what will happen to these, what will happen to many traditions? This whole idea of separating folk and tribal from traditional and classical will undermine the whole matrix of Indian performing arts.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Then, can I make a request to you? Can you provide us a note from the Akademi what you are doing with respect to not only folk and tribal arts but also their seamlessly merging into other forms of arts which are generally called classical. Through this report, let us persuade many skeptics that in fact, SNA is actively engaged in promoting and preserving these art forms because if it were, anybody would want to press for the idea of a separate Akademi, the proposal for the separate Akademi has come because of the perception, that may or may not be true, that you are not giving adequate attention to it. So, please send a note from you about what you have done and where you intend to take it and how you think you could actually become an owner of the ZCCs in respect of both what are clearly folk and tribal arts and in their process of modernization and their process of merging into classical forms etc. Can all be taken care of at an aesthetic level by people like you? Only if that becomes very consciously a part of the mandate that you actively implement, then, I do not think there will be a problem.

SHRI JAYANT KASTUAR: I will send that note.

I will just conclude by saying that I was surprised when ZCC Directors or our colleagues in the Ministry would say whether we are also taking care of folk and tribal arts. In fact, it was even more painful for us to be enquired whether we are not supposed to look into theatre and we are only taking care of music and dance because NSD is there. Now it is more painful because NSD was conceived and set up by the Akademi. People forgot that it was SNA's national Lok Utsav of 1984, 85, 86 which brought many of these artistes and Tejan Bai into national focus. The entire 84 Lok Utsav, half of it, was taken to Paris Mela for opening of the Festival of India in France.

I just want to share this anguish with you as a concluding note. I will provide the note on post, payment rate etc.

MR. CHAIRMAN: That will really help a lot.

MS. DEBJANI ROY: I am representing IGNOU. Recently, IGNOU has signed up an MoU with five ZCCs. In a way, it was the dialogue with the ZCC that we came up with a very important and relevant programme. Since I am stationed in Shillong, we started a dialogue with NEZCC and that is when we realized that there is such a huge amount of knowledge in this field which needed certification. In fact, the request came from the ZCC itself. I am just confining myself, at this moment, to the guru-shishya parampara scheme and this is where we started discussing. Now, we have discussed with all the ZCCs. We have signed up MOCs. This is a very innovative programme that we have launched with five Zones. The two other Zones have their own problems, I suppose, but we are giving academic certification to the indigenous art practices which have been practiced in these ZCCs and through them, we are certifying shishyas and the innovative programme is such that we realize that most of the shishyas, or even gurus, may not have had a formal education. They would have had a rural background and keeping that each ZCC has got lot of States representing in it, we just left

it to the Zone to suggest to us. In a certification, we need certain amount of very simple written text which can be in the original languages or language they prefer and the practical part is more practical oriented. There is no written examination. It is only practical examination. That is how the evaluation will be done and there is some amount of viva voce. This is what we have started and are going ahead with.

We are also felicitating gurus from the ZCCs. When we will develop the practical part, each set of gurus will have different background; we will have practical orientation and frame the syllabus. This was just in brief that I wanted to tell the other members present here.

There are two things, which we are really concerned about and are taking care of. One is academic certification and the second is livelihood options. Where I am, it is an institute which has come up in the IGNOU. It is on a national framework. We have to give them the livelihood options. Unless and until they make money in certain respects, how will they survive? I am talking mostly taking into account the rural and mofussil people. There are many artistes and gurus and how do we take care of them? In that sense, we did a pilot training where this was done in Garo Hills in the North-East. There, we know the mangala drums. In the festivals, we see the artists coming and playing. But what is after that? It is only the artists who come, play and go. What about the next generation? Are they taking it up? They do not even know how many types of drums are there. So, from IGNOU, we did a one-month residential training programmers and we were so happy that all the district commissioners, the people and the NGOs pooled in rice, potatoes for 30 youths which we had drawn up from the villages. They were being trained by the traditional gurus to select the wood for making drum, how to make the drum and how to play the drum. Then, they had formed certain groups and these groups were registered as SIG and with the Tourism Department. As a result of that - I am talking of small festivals which go around all over the country and not big ones - whenever we have to organize any programme, we go hunting for artists and groups. So, what we did here is that we registered these people with the financial institute who would help them by giving some seed money for making miniature drums for selling for tourism purpose. This gave them a good linkage with the Tourism Department so that whenever local festivals are happening, people have a data bank of it. They know where to go and where to get them. They can make these miniature instruments, the traditional ones. People know about them and they can play also. They get livelihood options as well as recognition. This is what we were discussing with the other Zones. If we can take up this sort of activities with the ZCC and bring up the art forms, which are present, it would be helpful. Similarly, we did a theatre workshop with the NEZCC where we had experts on folklore, folk tales of that particular State. We did this for Dimapur District and have theatre clubs in the schools, of course, where we had experts which the Director of ZCC then had got from IGNCA and NSD as well. We did this 15-day workshop and when the teachers went back to their schools, they had a mandate that they could build theatre clubs where local folk tales would be promoted. This is where we take up culture as an expression. So, these were the things we thought we could take up with the ZCCs because

IGNOU can go to places, but they need hand-holding partners and this is where we need organizations like ZCCs.

I would like to suggest another thing which we are doing with the other Ministries through my Centre where we are certifying the prior learning of the traditional practitioners. We have done in the field of local health tradition. I would suggest here that with the Ministry here with the ZCCs, we have built up a framework like this certification of indigenous art practices which is most targeted towards the shishyas. They will get certificate. What happens to the gurus who are already there in every village and moffusil towns? We do not know. They know such things, but we do not know where they are. We are not giving them direct recognition. So, if we can have a common operational framework where we can accredit the knowledge of these gurus, give them recognition and register them with the Ministry, that will help them promote not only their knowledge, but we can also have skill training programmes by them. Maybe all of them will not come to perform, but they have the knowledge and through them, we can have small training programmes, like the one we have done for indigenous music, and promote the culture and even give the livelihood options and also have the financial back up for the gurus who are there. These were my few suggestions.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Including the provision of distance learning. We have the IGNOU Training Centres which did not exist when the ZCCs were conceived. So, you have added a totally new dimension to this possibility. I feel that I cannot let you rest on your oral intervention. You have to give us a very detailed kind of thing about how you came into existence, what is the nature of your relationship with the NEZCC and what is the evolving relationship with the other ZCCs because I think, this has to become a very major part of what we are doing. I do not know whether there is a representative of the Centre for Cultural Resources and Training. Has anybody come from there? No. Can I request you, Rupa, to please ask either Mr. P C Sen or Surendra Kaul? Mr. Sen had apparently said that he would come and Mr. Kaul had said that he would be sending Mr. Banerjee. They are not here, but in the light of what Dr. Roy has just told us, I think, it is really crucial that we get them in the afternoon.

I am going to close this morning session with an intervention from Smt. Jayashree Mukherjee, who represents the Ministry for the Development of the North-Eastern Region partly because the North-Eastern Council is supposed to be handling the matters of culture in the North-East region. It has not done it very satisfactorily so far, but certainly it is an important source for programming as well as financing. Generally the Ministry of North-East Region is recognized through the North-East Region Vision 2020 Document and the cultural aspects of development have to be borne very closely in mind while promoting economic and social development. The ZCC network provides a completely unique opportunity of North-East artistes going all over India as also the opportunity of bringing artistes from the rest of India into the North-East. So, I think, this 2-way process of integration can be very effectively promoted. So, I regard your coming intervention as a very crucial input. We hope that you will follow it up with a detailed written statement.

MS. JAYASHREE MUKHERJEE: Sir, thank you very much. It was pleasure listening to the cultural luminaries. We will certainly take forward what you have suggested regarding the North-Eastern Council. If you remember, Sir, they had committed to spend one per cent of their budget, but even that one per cent is not really being spent because they are not getting enough proposals. So, if there were proposals, I am sure, the NEC would like to evaluate them and fund some of them in the field of culture or in association with IGNOU.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I would suggest that you contact Dr. Roy pro-actively and the representative of the NEZCC who is here with us and you send in the proposals which your State Governments are failing to do so that we can use this.

MS. JAYASHREE MUKHERJEE: In this regard, I just wanted to give you a piece of information that we have approached the NEC for the other fields, but for the culture, we have not as yet. Through IGNOU, we recently did a national workshop on martial art practices where we had taken 30 artistes from Manipur as the thantha practitioners and we did a comparative study with kalaripet of Kerala.

MR. CHAIRMAN: What I was saying is that you need to institutionalize this. It cannot be one off that in view of an agreement which I compelled on them as Minister of DONER that one per cent of their funds should be set aside for cultural activities. So, you please see that you can use that and perhaps you can push it in the desired direction so that a higher percentage will go down into it.

MS. JAYASHREE MUKHERJEE: Sir, there are two other points which I would like to make as an administrator. I have had interactions with two of my friends and batch-mates who had tried to become the Directors of ZCCs. It is basically whoever has got enough influence with the Governor, can become Director of a ZCC. One of them had an influence with the Governor. So, he became the Director, but the other one did not have it and therefore, she could not become the Director. So, I feel that the role of the Governor may be taken out because the Governor really does not do any value addition. The Governor of Tamil Nadu would not have any interest in promoting the culture of Kerala or Andhra Pradesh. It is similar for the eight States of the North-East. So, the role of the Governor need not be there. In any case, a Governor is a political creature and given a chance, he would politick. Maybe we should take him out.

Secondly, nothing can succeed, be it sports, science or culture, unless the systems are in place. So, as Mr. Ramamurthy rightly said, there should be a central body at the top to lay down the rules, service rules, bye-laws and all these things that have to be decided. The ZCCs appear to be amoeba like creatures with everybody making his own little storey up on little systems of rules and therefore, they are not working. There should be something like NIFT. It has got a central structure at the top. There is a DG, NIFT and there are NIFTs in different parts of the country. So, that sort of structure with a central rule and clearly defined entitlements of the employees should be done. There would be employees who would

be coming from the States because ZCCs are located in different States. You perhaps cannot avoid that at a lower level or even at the mid-level, but at the top level, if you give five-year tenure to the persons, to the administrator, not the chairperson, maybe you will get people who would be interested in doing it. Then, he will not stay in Chennai and try to operate from there. As Mr. Ramamurthy himself said that he is from Thanjavore and he went to Thanjavore and he has interest in arts, but it is difficult to get such people. It was only in good circumstances that it so happened. It is not going to happen elsewhere.

SHRI JAIN: There is North-East Cultural Fund. We get Rs. 5 crore annually. He gets Rs. 9 crore. Anuradha gets Rs. 7 crore. I have noticed that it is more or less the same groups because we have to spend the money before the end of the financial year. So, I find that it is actually very few people who are benefiting from that. At the end of the year, we try to get the same groups, giving either to them or to us. From Sikkim, there are only two groups and they are too much in demand. If this kind of funding is given, there has to be some kind of guidelines because otherwise, everybody is doing performances from the same group.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Can I ask the NEZCC Director to please speak now? We will bring you later also in the intervention. But in response to this point that there is a huge amount of funding for the North-East and it is not being used or it is being used in a somewhat unsatisfactory manner because they do not even know the existence of addition groups, would you like to say something? Of course, Sikkim comes under the EZCC, but that is a minor point. There is overlapping.

SHRI SOM KAMAEI: Sir, I have just taken over one and a half month ago. In response to that, I am aware of the funds that are given to other ZCCs as part of the North-East Fund. We are interacting with other ZCCs to organize exchange programmes under NCEP and also octave festival. To tell you very frankly, there has been no interaction of any kind for the last five years with other Akademis. Now, with the suggestions of the committee and all the Akademis here, I think, we have to actively think of starting afresh the relationship with the Akademis and specially the NEZCC has to be somehow given some corporate form and lot of suggestions have to come in and lot of programmes and all these things have to be taken care of, with the advice of the Akademis and also what experience we have in the field.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now I have a request to make to you. Over the course of the next week or two, perhaps even less, please get in touch with Dr. Debjani Roy, which you can easily do at the other end while you are here, with her and through her, through Mrs. Mukherjee, with the NEC in Shillong. And while you are in Delhi, please go across to the Sangeet Natak Akademi as well as to the National School of Drama and any other institutions that they recommend you to and put together a detailed proposal as to how with respect to the North-East, you will be involved in drawing upon this rather large body of funds that is being made available. From the quick calculation of what you have said, it is about Rs. 20 crore per year there. So, just be in touch with particularly Prof. Jain at IGNCA and with Shri Kashtwar

in the Sangeet Natak Akademi and come back to us with something we can push through the committee as something special for the North-East area.

MS. DEBJANI ROY: Sir, if it is one per cent of their budget, there would come Rs. 6-7 crore from NEC.

MR. CHAIRMAN: We are talking really big money for you which, instead of wasting on your Shilpa Gram, which nobody visits but you, if we could get some activity going around the place, that will be better. We will have to spend a lot of time with you in the afternoon. So, we will restrict ourselves to this.

MS. LEELEA SAMSON: I would like to make one comment about this. Unlike the other organizations which are really performance-based interactions with North-East Zone, Anuradha and my institution, Kala Kshetra, which has a very miniscule but significant amount for the North-East, in Kala Kshetra we are bringing children down and educating them in both, the normal education as well as in arts. We have given back to Manipur two Ph.D. level students of Bharatnatyam, but they have no occupation there because Bharatnatyam does not exist in Manipur. So, if in some way, our own Sangeet Natak Akademi can then house a Bharatnatyam Department in the Jawaharlal Nehru Akademi, that will be a start, but we are also talking about boys coming for mridangam training programmes in theatre. It should also be in the education. Exchange cannot only be at the level of performance.

MR. CHAIRMAN: But I would tell that as far as this committee is concerned, we will have to particularly focus on the ZCCs and in so far as the ZCCs, I draw your attention to subparagraph (r) on page 4 of my note which is, where we felt at an earlier stage of the consideration of these issues by the committee, that the single biggest best hope we have for linking young talent with old experience, to provide training on the one hand and livelihood on the other, was to build up the guru-shishya parampara programme under the ZCCs to being perhaps the single largest component of what their activities were for then the training part of it will become integral to the performance part and you talent today can be encouraged to be in art rather than computers or something because we would be indicating a livelihood path to them. So, what you are saying is of high importance, but I would request all of you, who have more experience of this, to help ZCCs. You were saying that guru-shishya parampara was actually the intervention of the SNA. Let us have not the Sangeet Natak Akademi's experience as such, but how on the basis of the SNA experience, you would suggest that this becomes a major activity of the ZCCs.

SHRIMATI DEBJANI ROY: This is where IGNOU's intervention is absolutely critical.

MR. CHAIRMAN: If you start using your distance training mechanism, then all this can spread with the greatest of ease into not only the rural parts of your own zone, but perhaps even more excitingly into the rural parts and mofussil parts of other zones as well so that they do not have to wait for Ratan Thiyam to fetch up in Thanjavore, but they can actually just switch on your channel and get to see what it is.

MS.DEBJANI ROY : What we are now doing is what we call blended learning. We prepare materials and then we blend it according to the needs and availability of the guru there.

MS. .. : Even your are giving certification to the guru-shishyas, but nobody wants to even learn mridangmani now because there is no certification and a parent wants certification. That is critical.

MR. CHAIRMAN: So, a combination of certification along with livelihood, you get the two meshed in together by the guru-shishya parampara programme of the ZCCs becoming a major component in whatever it is that they do and you would have to establish a link between the cradle and the grave and that is what I think we should be working towards. Let us have lunch now.

### 13th December 2010, Post Lunch

MR. CHAIRMAN: In the morning, we have heard from the Sangeet Natak Akademi, National School of Drama, IGNC, IGNOU Institute of Vocational Education and Training, Kerala Mandalam as also from the former Director, K. Ramamurthy of the SZCC.

Can I now request the representative of the Lalit Kala Akademi, who is here, to intervene?

MS. .... : Sir, he had to go back for something.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay. Is somebody here from Sahitya Akademi?

SHRI A. KRISHNAMURTHY: Sir, I do not think there is any need for my presentation as all the three Akademis and you are fully aware that literary component is very important for culture. Culture becomes incomplete without literary programmes as I have seen in the last so many years. So, that aspect can be seriously thought of so that Akademi can always be coordinating with the centres and centres have been located in very important places other than the capital cities. They are all culturally important places where we can definitely have more accessibility and also reach out to the common man with literary programmes. As literary programmes do not require much of the infrastructure, unlike other forms of arts, it is very easy to organize literary programmes so that ZCCs can reach out to much larger cultural areas. One thing is that these ZCCs have got very good infrastructure in terms of their buildings. Those buildings can also accommodate the books produced by the Sahitya Akademi and NBT Publication Division. Various other State Akademis have been publishing books related to literature, art and culture. These centres can always have their openings so that the books are easily available to people.

Also, there is a scope for the Centres to identify the birthplaces of writers all over the country and see that such houses and writers' homes are identified and they know that. There will be a sort of small write-up written either in the village or in that particular house. That kind of a mapping is possible with the help of the ZCCs. That is something which is very complementary to the National Akademi of Letters. Sahitya Akademi can always collaborate with it.

Sahitya Akademi is right now operating with 24 Indian languages by way of giving awards and making programmes and publications. Apart from that, we have been identifying so many other dialects and making programmes in those dialects also by way of organizing their conferences as well as by recognizing them by giving Bhasha Sammans which are not recognized by the Sahitya Akademi. For example, Kutchi, Magadhi, Awadhi, Bundeli, this kind of language conferences we are organizing. Still there are hundreds of languages which are very easily accessible to the centres so that they can have small language conference of that particular area, which would definitely help the Akademi also to know more and more about knowledge and literary traditions of those things.

Akademi is also doing a bit of oral and tribal literary programmes by way of documenting in print media. We have already published 50 books and those books are being translated into different Indian languages also. We have only one centre of that nature which is a moving centre. Earlier, it was started and established in Baroda. Then, it work for there for 4-5 years and collected about 25 books in terms of oral literature and then printed them. Then, the Centre has been moved to the North-East part of the country. It was established in Shillong. Then now, we have moved that Centre to Tripura's capital, Agartala. After three or four years, after having collected the oral literature, we are thinking of moving that centre again to another important tribal and folk area where we can collect materials. In this respect also, both these institutions can definitely be complementary to each other. Otherwise, the literary programmes are very less, looking at the programmes of the centre, which should be increased more and more. There are traditional forms, traditional rituals which are secular in nature. Such rituals can be reproduced by the centres. Some of the rituals are dying out or are not being given proper importance. For example, in Karnataka, there are some places where Hindus and Muslims join together for certain rituals and festivals. If they are not doing such things, Centres can always take up such issues and try to perform and inculcate an interest among the common masses.

These are some of the important points I wanted to share with you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have noted down here five points made by you, which I think is a completely innovative contribution to the work hitherto of the ZCCs. I thank you for the most constructive and pointed intervention. It is going to be of immense use to us. It would help if we could also have it in writing so that to the extent possible, we can reflect it in your own words. Thank you.

SHRI JAYANT KASTUAR: Sir, I just want to inform you, in view of Mr. Krishnamurthy mentioning about houses of literary persons to be preserved, that the Sangeet Natak Akademi has recently proposed to the Ministry of Culture in the context of a particular reference that was made to us regarding Rudrapatnam Village that such places of heritage associated with great makers of Indian music, Indian theatre and Indian traditions could be preserved as places of heritage.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please do so at Pandanalur in my constituency because Meenakshi Sundaram was from there.

SHRI JAYANT KASTUAR: We have suggested to the Ministry, since this requires independent authority because one has to intervene with the local State Governments, to have an independent authority to preserve these places of national heritage in terms of intangible music, dance and all.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let us listen to Shri Vinay Kumar of Lalit Kala Akademi now. How can you contribute to the ZCCs? Have you seen the notes we have circulated?

MR. CHAIRMAN: The point generally taken is that technologies for storage and preservation may please be made available by the Akademis to the ZCCs for such artifacts or for such documentations that they have. This is the key point.

Now, I like to turn to the cultural institutions represented here. May I begin with Mr. Chabin Rajkhowa of the Srimanta Shankerdeo Kala Kshetra, Guwahati?

SHRI CHABIN RAJKHOWA: Sir, I am Secretary of Shrimanto Shankardeo Kala Kshetra, one of the cultural hubs of North-East India. Assam is member of two ZCCs - the EZCC and the NEZCC. Our Shrimanto Shankardeo Kala Kshetra is just near to the Shilpa Gram established by NEZCC. We have observed that the activities of the Shilpa Gram are not so satisfactory because we have the pavilions of different States, but since beginning they have been lying without any function. All the pavilions are lying without any action.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Are these pavilions in Guwahati or Dimapur?

SHRI CHABIN RAJKHOWA: They are in Guwahati, just near Shrimanto Shankardeo Kala Kshetra, near to Dispur, the capital. The Government of Assam has allotted 20 bighas of land for Shilpa Gram. Each and every State has its own pavilion, but without any activity. Secondly, since all the Directors of NEZCC belong to Nagaland, that is another problem for rest of the States.

Assam has about 28 tribal communities who need documentation properly and we have identified one theatre group which has completed 207 years. It is Koihati Dhulia Bhawadia. We have heard about Surbhi Theatre of Andhra Pradesh which has completed 125 years, but in Assam, we have this theatre which was started in 1803. Still they are running, but it needs its documentation and preservation because they belong to very poor family and they do not have even proper costume to perform properly. They have three different styles of presentation. One is clown performance. Another is Dhulia Circus which they perform with big drums. The third one is theatre itself. This time, we are going to organize indigenous theatre festival of North-East India with the help of IGNCA. These things are very important for documentation.

Apart from these things, now the Naga extremist groups have threatened the non-Naga people to quit Nagaland. So, it is very difficult for other member-States to visit Nagaland because the problems are there.

MR. CHAIRMAN: What are the problems? In Nagaland, only Nagas kill other Nagas. They will never kill you. That is another characteristic of the situation in Nagaland. So, what is the difficulty in going to Nagaland?

SHRI CHABIN RAJKHOWA: Day before yesterday, they have threatened like this. It has come out in the newspapers. They have demanded that non-Nagas should quit Nagaland. There are some communication problems.

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Assam, Bodos are asking non-Bodos to quit Bodoland. You cannot make this an excuse. We have to get a sense of integration there. If everything becomes Assam-centric, as there is a tendency to do, then it does not promote other parts of the Zone. That is why, it was a very deliberate decision that we should not have it in Assam, although there would be overwhelming claims by Assam. We set up this Centre in Dimapur at a time when there were not regular floods, but now that Dimapur is connected effectively - if I am not mistaken - to all North-Eastern capitals, I think, this point should not be made.

SHRI CHABIN RAJKHOWA: Since we have to go to remote areas and villages for development and promotion of folk arts, it is important to have a Core Committee to discuss about the problems which are being faced by folk artistes in different places. The NEZCC is functioning from Dimapur and in Shilpa Gram, they have a Deputy-Director over there who belongs to Nagaland. This thing is required to be discussed as to how to develop the ZCC activities. We have surveyed through the State that we have 45,000 of manuscripts which are very important for conservation and documentation also. We are doing its conservation from our Shrimanto Shankardeo Kala Kshetra. Most of the manuscripts are on Ayurveda. So, it is very important for research and documentation. My suggestion is that if NEZCC works for it, like it works for folk art and traditional art forms, it will be very helpful for the ZCC.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have not quite understood this point.

You wanted to ask something.

SHRI. AMOL PALEKAR : Mr. Chabin, the point Chairman was trying to make is that in Assam, you have not only the problem of Bodo, but Assam has also faced the problem of Bengali culture not being taken care of at all because they are inside Assam. So, there are two phenomena that while enough is done by the ZCC there in the North-East, whether this is being taken care of and whether there is an attempt for national integration. One of the objectives of the ZCC is to bring together the cultural ethos of different communities. What is your perception in this regard?

SHRI CHABIN RAJKHOWA: Shrimanto Shankardeo Kala Kshetra is doing work for preservation, promotion and development of art and culture of the region. So, we are very open to work with the ZCC.

MR. CHAIRMAN: So, there is, at the moment, some interaction between yourselves and the NEZCC. Is it also there with the EZCC?

SHRI CHABIN RAJKHOWA: No. The thing is that it is far away from Guwahati and we are very close to NEZCC.

MR. CHAIRMAN: If I have your approval, I would like to recommend that on an annual basis, as was agreed with the Lalit Kala Akademi, at least the NEZCC, and if possible EZCC, should be in touch with you and you work out how exactly you are going to work together

to move matters forward. You heard from your neighbour of the Kerala Kala Mandalam as to how deeply they are involved or want to be involved with the SZCC. We would appreciate it greatly if you could have as deep an involvement with the NEZCC in particular as they have with SZCC and possibly, we will go down the line and find other cultural institutions than the ones that are represented here to be the counterpart that provides the expertise which several people have pointed to the need for, the expertise as to what these people should be doing, with whom they should be doing and how as an archiving centre, you can take advantage of that and see to it that things are done not merely in a transient form, as Mr. Vinay Kumar said, but as a result of documentation and subsequent archiving, they should become repository of cultural legacy in the country. We will bring that up as a major thing.

SHRI SHUBHASHISH BANERJEE: Basically, CCRT is working with ZCCs right from the beginning of the ZCCs. We work with NZCC and we do some work with EZCC. We have worked with WZCC also. Basically, we work in the field of linking education with culture. For that, we require students and teachers from all over India. We also provide scholarships to different students, those who are working in the field of any art form, whether it is classical or folk art form. In this regard, we have received lot of help from certain ZCCs, like NCZCC, WZCC, SZCC and sometimes EZCC. We organize different workshops with the help of renowned artistes, with students in different ZCCs and other places. whenever we organize the programme for the children and craftsmen.

Recently, at the time of Commonwealth Games, the NCZCC had helped us a lot to organize a programme with different folk dancers from different parts of the country. At that time, we had teachers from all over the country. They interacted with the folk artistes and then came to know their style, the names of their musical instruments and how they play them. For example, once we organized a programme at Thanjavore, with the help of SZCC, for painting. There, at least 500 students from all over Southern parts of the country came. Those who are getting scholarship from CCRT, the amount is Rs. 750 only per month per student. In that programme, we invited students along with their teachers and they worked with great teachers. Similarly, we conducted a workshop also. At Bangalore, we are going to conduct a programme and there also, we will interact with guru-shishya parampara. We will invite great artistes there. They will choreograph for the students.

We are also getting help from NSD and other institutions in conducting our programmes. We know that there are certain folk art forms which are available all over the country, but people do not know about them. If the ZCCs will do some work in this regard, people may get to know about them. For example, in Kerala itself, we have 85 art forms and we know about very few of them. If the SZCC will do some work for that, then we will be able to identify the art form, will be able to give scholarship to the students, will be able to disseminate the knowledge of that particular art form through our teachers and students. This is what I wanted to say.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Again, my solitary comment would be that since you have already with some, if not all, of the ZCCs established a relationship, we should have an arrangement for you to prepare annual programmes for each of the ZCCs and then act accordingly, remembering always a few things that what is to be centralized can best be done by the Centre and what is to be decentralized can best be done by the ZCC. So, instead of using them as your recruitment ground, if on the other hand, the kind of persons you have on your rosters, these famous artistes, were to go out and make themselves available in rural India to mofussil India to slum India, then the contribution would really be mutual and, of course, to the extent to which you need artistes or art forms or students who come from this kind of disadvantaged background, there the ZCCs can be of use to you. But I think you should also think in terms of your great resource in artistes being used by them to go through zones and across zones. Thank you very much.

We are privileged to have with us a man who has done for more for the objectives of the ZCCs than any ZCC itself. That is Dr. Kiran Seth of SPIC MACAY. I would particularly like to know from him how can SPIC MACAY and the ZCCs pool their resources together in order to better achieve the objectives of ZCCs. If there is some contribution that the ZCCs can make to SPIC MACAY, which is already doing yeoman work, then I am sure that they will be ready to do it. But it is really the other way round, what SPIC MACAY can do to help ZCCs move forward. We would like to know that from you.

DR. KIRAN SETH: Sir, you have actually done some very good recommendations - I have read them - out of the meetings which you have had earlier. There are few additions to that. ZCCs, as you have rightly mentioned, should be going to the rural areas and mofussil areas. In this regard, I am just telling the things we have tried out. You have to try to take these village schools and use these village schools as a platform to bringing the whole village to the particular programme that is organized in the village school because there, they have little facilities. It also brings in the fact that we are bringing in the young persons. It is mentioned here that we should try to bring in young persons. This will kill two birds with one stone. I think, we tried to do this in Bihar. We did a big project in Bihar and also in Andhra Pradesh - in Adamnagar, Betia, Badsui and Jayanagar. We took these artistes to perform and there were thousands of people who came for these performances. This fits in exactly within the idea of the ZCC. They could use our help or help of other people. There are also other people who can help in this. We may take it to the villages through chain programmes, which also save money. You can give a lump sum to the artistes and also per programme, you can reduce the amount. It can help the artistes as well as it can help us spread the message of the ZCCs.

There is one other thing which is very important. There has to be some quality control systems in the ZCCs. We have been trying to collaborate with some ZCCs. I would like to particularly mention NZCC. We had a programme in Patiala. I do not think that programme had anything to do with our heritage. You may mind my saying this, but the type of gidda

and other things they were doing, there was absolutely no quality control at all. I am going to many such programmes. I went to another programme done by another Centre. I do not want to take names. It was done more for tamasha part of it than for raising the understanding of that particular region's heritage. I think, this is a very important thing that must be controlled. We do not have to get thousands of people necessarily, but we must ensure that what we present is nearest to the culture of that area. We must ensure that what we present is not volupitised too much. These are the two main things which I had in mind.

Apna Utsavs, which we used to have, definitely should be revived and as he said, it can be taken to all States in rotation. Then, workshops are also very important. We can do a number of workshops. Even with programmes, sensitization can be very limited, but if you have workshops, especially in schools, it helps. All these navodaya schools can act as pivot points because they have facilities and we can ask all children in the neighbourhood of those navodaya schools, because they are anyway in rural areas, to come for these workshops.

You have mentioned here that on the lines of three Akademis, a recommendation should be made to the competent authority for creating a Folk and Tribal Akademi. I would like to request that we may think of having a National Heritage Mission. I have drawn up a small 2-page thing on it, which I will give to you and few others also. It is really high time that we just do not do it through ZCCs but through all Departments and through various Ministries. I have listed how we can bring them in. It is like a Centre where the Departments are taking little little help from all these Ministries how we can, maybe, spread this message in a much more meaningful way, which I think would be effective in the long run.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. That was very useful.

Now, I think we have arrived at a stage where we can turn to the Government representatives who are here. May I begin by asking Mr. Asit Gopal of Ministry of Tribal Affairs?

SHRI ASIT GOPAL: I am Director in the Ministry of Tribal Affairs. After such a long deliberation, not much is left to be said. Still coming to the point of interest of Ministry of Tribal Affairs, I think, as a representative of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs, I suppose the idea of creating Folk and Tribal Akademi is good because Sangeet Natak Akademi is confined only to sangeet and natak and Lalit Kala Akademi is confined to lalit kala, but if we have Folk and Tribal Akademi, it would cover the entire gamut, right from preserving the tribal dialect, craft, music, culture and everything. So, I think, it will be a good idea. My friend from Bharat Bhawan, MP has already said that in MP, the Adivasi Lok Kala Parishad is doing very well. So, I think, it can be given a thought to.

Another thing which I want to stress upon is the preservation of tribal dialects because we realize that in schools - it is slightly off the mark - one reason of drop-out is that the tribal boy or girl is not able to understand the medium of instruction. So, we should

encourage tribal dialects in the beginning for Class I, II and III and then they can switch over to the regional language. But this tribal dialect should be preserved and developed. I think, the ZCCs can make some contribution in this direction.

Another point is promotion of tribal crafts. It is directly linked with the livelihood of tribals. This will provide them sustained employment or livelihood. So, tribal craft should also be given its due importance.

As it was rightly pointed out, it should not be preserved in its old original form; it should change with time, with the market demand and they should adopt modern technology also so that they are in tune with time and are not outdated. The ZCCs can take help of the Tribal Research Institutes. I think many States have Tribal Research Institutes. So, these ZCCs can collaborate with these institutes to understand their culture in a better way so that they can work as a partner and contribute in a more fruitful manner.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you. That is useful, but I think it could be much more useful. This is because your Ministry has several schemes and programmes that are oriented towards tribal population and a lot of all this simply goes by the wayside because there is not enough propagation of what these schemes are among the tribal people who have a much higher level of illiteracy and are also scattered.

There is also this problem of tribal dialects which stands in the way of conveying this message. So, what I would like your Ministry to reflect on is how you can use the ZCCs as the medium for spreading your message because they are located in such places where they can use the tribal artistes to give the tribal message which could incorporate information about their livelihood and all these things. I think, at this juncture, it is particularly necessary because a lot of tribal India is in revolt against the State and the culture is one medium by which we can promote reintegration of these alienated tribal communities with the rest of the society. Therefore, I would suggest for you, as I have been doing for the Akademis, that there should be annual get together between yourselves and the ZCCs, without the exclusion of anyone of them. The NZCC is concerned with the tribes of Himachal Pradesh or Kashmir, even if there are not very many tribes in Punjab and Haryana. There is not a single Zone which does not, in some way or the other, interact with tribal people. If the ZCCs could loom larger on your horizon, then maybe you can orient them towards that kind of programmes as would enable message from your Ministry to be conveyed to these tribal populations or through tribal artistes. If you could please consider that, it will be better. We will put that in the recommendations of the Committee.

My next Government Servant would be Mr. Avtar Singh Sahota of Ministry of Panchayati Raj.

SHRI AVTAR SINGH SAHOTA: Sir, thank you very much for inviting me here to participate in this meeting. I think, ZCCs can help us disseminate information about the

various welfare schemes and also the message of panchayats, gram sabhas etc. through their various forms of arts - songs, dance, painting and culture. We will benefit much more in having relationship with the ZCCs. Panchayats will also be helpful to them, if it is taken to the panchayat level, in identifying some good talent as there are lot of rural people whose talent is unidentified. It will also help us in community preservation, innovation and in promotion of projects and disseminate culture within the community. It will be very helpful to us in the rural areas. They will really send the message of the rule of gram sabhas through arts and other things. I think, this may change a lot of things. Finally, I would say that this association will not only encourage folk and tribal arts, but also help Rural Committees to frame special programme for the preservation and conservation of vanishing art forms and such programmes would encourage and involve youth and rural communities themselves with rest of the country in the field of cultural communication.

Sir, I think, we will be very thankful if we really get associated with these people and get our message sent through the ZCCs.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you for that. I personally think that the single biggest innovation in India after the establishment of the ZCCs, relevant to their work, is the legislation with regard to panchayati raj for now in consequence of that, we have approximately 250,000 going on 300,000 units of local self-governments that comprise both the consumers of what the ZCC has to offer as well as, and it has been underlined by Shri Sahota, being able to identify talent, who not otherwise would have come to the notice of the ZCCs. Therefore, there is a very urgent need to work out an extremely close relationship between the ZCCs and the panchayats falling in their respective domain. The problem is that the numbers run into tens of thousands for each ZCC, but the number of zila parishads is much more manageable. Therefore, if in the first instance the ZCCs were to establish an organic relationship with the zila parishads and through the zila parishads with the institutions under each of these, then perhaps all these things could be served.

With regard to the work of the Programme Committee, I think the single biggest deficiency in the constitution of the Programme Committees is that they do not have local government representatives and if these local government representatives were to be present in the Programme Committees or were to be enabled to send their suggestions to the Programme Committees, then this form of cultural propagation would be demand-driven and not supply-drive, which I think is very important to secure a sense of participation. Secondly, there would really be no one better placed than village and block panchayats to push to the attention of the ZCCs and through ZCCs to the Departments of Culture at the State level and the Akademis and so forth a talent that has otherwise escaped their attention. The thing is that in the country of a billion people, we should be having several hundreds of millions of artistes. I will be lucky if we can identify hundreds of them and say that we have established them here and the ZCCs say that we have found them, we have discovered them. So, the scope is something staggering and now that we have succeeded during the course of

this day in bringing all the three Akademis and these cultural institutions to all try a network with the ZCCs, we are hugely increasing the quality of work that could be done by them. So, I would suggest in the first instance that the Ministry of Panchayati Raj and the Ministry of Culture just put their heads together and if between the two of you, you could produce a page or two of suggestions as to how the panchayats could be used as both the receiving point of the propagation of culture as well as the generating point of untapped talent, it could really blossom into a people's movement. And the ZCCs in turn might encourage these groupings of panchayats to hold their own festivals. If you look at the Schedule 11 to the Constitution, it says among the 29 subject that cultural activities, fairs and melas are to be among the rest of the domain of the panchayati raj system. So, here this provides us with an opportunity of going towards that, but it will require a fairly high level of contact between two Ministries and a joint input for us to operationalise this because this essentially involves only Government Departments devolving this kind of cultural propagation work to their institutions of local self government.

The nagar palikas would be exceptionally useful for this work to be done in the urban slums and mofussil areas. So, in a sense, we also need the Ministry of Urban Development. The Ministry of Urban Development is not much interested in all this, but there is one Joint Secretary who vaguely looks after part 9(a) as a part-time activity for himself, but if you were able to trace him somewhere, where he is not doing CWG-related work, perhaps you can get him for half-an-hour to also bring nagar palikas into it.

Sahota saheb, you and Rupaji here and others just get together and have things approved at a higher level because without that, I do not want to get tripped up. So, you see what you can do and let us have it and bring in the Joint-Secretary of Urban Development Ministry who deals with it and sit together with Mr. Srinivasan here and Mr. Goel, who is not here but was sitting here, and let us have something from you, a couple of pages as quickly as possible, which we can then incorporate into our report.

We are through with DONER and Panchayati Raj. Is Nehru Yuva Kendra Sangathan represented? Okay, the Joint-Secretary, Mr. Mukul Chatterjee, has left. Is there anybody else from NYK?

Okay, you want to say something.

SHRI.....: In the context of the Panchayati Raj Ministry, I would just like to add for information that some of the States have District Cultural Officers who work under the supervision of the DM. Orissa, West Bengal and Assam have that. I do not know about all the States. Their involvement in the ZCC programmes and activities should also be kept in mind.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Sure. I think, that is a good suggestion.

SHRI SITAKANT MAHAPATRA: You have rightly mentioned about the possibility of

panchayati raj bodies at the district level. Among the districts of India, there are a few which are called Scheduled Districts. They are those districts where the population of tribals exceeds 50 per cent of the total population. In these districts, there are agencies called Integrated Tribal Development Agency to take up development programmes. To the extent my knowledge goes, because I had worked in these tribal areas, in the States like Bihar, Jharkhand, Orissa, Andhra Pradesh and to an extent also Madhya Pradesh, there would be about 40 such Integrated Tribal Development Agencies with huge unspent balances meant for their development. Now when it comes to districts, these 40 districts have so much money at their disposal and they are mostly inhabited by the tribals. Why should they not do something specifically on tribal culture and to what extent, can they be brought into the arena of the concerned ZCCs and Akademis? There, some kind of liaison needs to be established.

MR. CHAIRMAN: What he is effectively saying is that your Tribal Sub-Plan should have a cultural component which you work out with the ZCCs and the ZCCs then collaborate with tribal agencies in trying to get that component of the Tribal Sub-Plan implemented.

SHRI ASIT GOPAL: Certainly, Sir. As you have said, the Planning Commission has also come up with one Integrated Action Plan for Left-wing affected areas and districts which are likely to get affected. There are 60 such districts earmarked. So, the problem in these areas we are facing is the problem of execution. They have money, but they are unable to spend it because there is resistance of Maoists and the presence of the Government machinery is very poor.

I think that if we take up such cultural activities, there will not be any resistance from the Left-wing extremists. That will be a good idea and that can also be used as a tool for re-integration of people who are now alienated. It can certainly be done.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Then, please think us through. Certainly, we - the three-member committee - attach very high importance to this and would like tribal communities of India to also have a sense of ownership that the ZCCs are very specially for us and for our artistes.

We do not have the Ministry of Youth Affairs representative at this moment. Then, Song and Drama Division is really critical to us. What you do is really what the ZCCs are attempting to do. We would like to hear from you.

Now, I think, everybody is ready for a cup of tea, but we need to conclude by 5 o'clock, which is the scheduled time.

(TEA-BREAK)

(AFTER TEA BREAK)

MR. CHAIRMAN: As far as my record shows, we have now succeeded in having interventions from everyone except the Directors of the ZCCs.

SHRI HAR SAHAY MEENA: Sir, I am Director-General, Jawahar Kala Kendra, Government of Rajasthan, Jaipur. I belong to Tamil Nadu Cadre and am presently working with the Rajasthan Government on deputation. I joined Jawahar Kala Kendra recently, only three months back.

I have seen from my personal experience that the rural folk and arts culture in Rajasthan and surrounding areas is very rich. Despite the fact that so much effort is being made by the Government of India, State Governments and NGOs, we are still not able to reach the roots of the people who are really charismatic in the field of art and culture. For example, in Rajasthan, I have seen that there are so many groups or societies who are still not having a platform to perform their art and culture. Especially in eastern Rajasthan, we have seen that there are so many communities who do so many programmes, but still no platform has been provided to them. We have a ZCC in Udaipur. They are doing so many activities. This month, I think, we are doing it at Shilpa Gram where I am also hosting an event from Jawahar Kala Kendra.

I would like to bring to your kind notice that documentation of the dying arts has still not been done properly. I have seen in Tamil Nadu that there is no folk song there where hundred people sing together at a time. In Rajasthan, we can say that there are so many folks in the tribe, especially the belt I belong to, where there are Gurjar and Meena communities where around 200 to 300 people sing together in the same language, same rhythm and same music. That kind of art is dying and new generation even does not understand what they sing. The documentation and the presentation of that art and folk dance and songs are still awaiting a platform in eastern parts of Rajasthan. So, the ZCC in Udaipur has to spread their area in that part of Rajasthan also. We see that most of the artistes in Rajasthan are repeated. On joining Jawahar Kala Kendra, I found that only 13 districts are represented in it. No other artist comes from other parts of the districts. So, the same artistes are repeated. If we hold any event, we call Gulabo for Kalvelia dance. There are so many other artistes who never get any platform to come and do Kalvelia. Except Gulabo, no other name is known in Rajasthan. But artistes are there in all communities and all groups. They sing well and dance well, and they have their own culture while the whole new generation is going to school.

There is nobody to protect that art, that culture, that singing art because remuneration to the artistes is not adequate, as has been discussed in the agenda of the committee. So, when people do not get financial assistance from the Government or any other source, they divert to other professions and leave the traditional dance. At most of the places, in Jawahar Kala Kendra and Rabindra Manch and other parts of Rajasthan, we have seen that only certain groups are performing. We appreciate them, but still they do not have future platform. I have seen in the case of Gulabo that all her daughters are studying in MGD school and college also. I do not think that after Gulabo, her daughters will perform Kalvelia dance. So, I request that the Committee should take such a view from the Central Government that we

can protect the artistes and their arts as much as in the old form and some platform should be provided to them all over the country. Thank you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: It is a useful suggestion and the one which is in accord with what we have been talking about. More specifically, we have to see how Jawahar Kala Kendra can work with the WZCC in particular, to improve the quality of its programmes, to extend the range of its artistes and take 13 districts of Rajasthan first into other districts of Rajasthan and then into whole of the West Zone.

My general comment on the folk institutions we have heard - the Kerala Kala Mandalam, Shankar Deo Kala Kshetra, Bharat Bhawan, Jawahar Kala Kendra and if I may say so, Kala Kshetra Foundation - is that we need at least one such institution, if not more, to mentor in terms of quality and in terms of the range of the culture that is available in each of the seven ZCCs. This is a new suggestion which I am making. It is self-evident to me that the Kerala Kala Mandalam and Kala Kshetra Foundation would be obvious ones for South Zone. Equally Bharat Bhawan would be the obvious institution for perhaps both the NZCC and SCZCC. The Guwahati one is clearly, as already discussed, appropriate one for the NEZCC and Jawahar Kala Kendra could perhaps service both the West and North, although I am sure that others could be found for the North. There is no reason why there should be only a single mentor, but we should have at least one mentor per Centre and if in the course of next few days or weeks, the Culture Ministry could identify for us which could be the mentoring institutions for each of these Centres, I think, we may be able to be way ahead of where we have been so far and thus address also the question of quality of performance, to which anxious attention has been drawn.

I think, with that we come to the conclusion of today's meeting. I would have liked to bring Directors of the ZCCs into this already at this stage, but I understand from our Director, Mr. Srinivasan, that all of you are going to be kindly available with us for the next two days as well. So, perhaps we can hold your comments in abeyance until we have been through with this full exercise and perhaps after all the meetings are over.

Ms. Rupa, there could be a special session on the 16th between Mrs. Sinha and all the ZCC Directors to secure from them their comments on what they think of what has been said over here.

SHRI .. : Sir, tomorrow we are having very few people, just about seven or eight. So, I think, tomorrow half day would be available.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay. In that case, we do not have to hold them. If there are not going to be many people tomorrow, then we could have an interaction with you. Although I would still ask that on the 16th, you remain back because we have an army of artistes coming in on the 15th and what they have to say would also have to be commented on by all of you because at the end of the day, you are the persons who are handling this.

I was told that the Secretary to the Governor of Nagaland, Mr. Ramakrishnan, is here. Is he here?

SHRI ..... : He has left, I think.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Anyway, he is not here now. Can I ask that for tomorrow, in addition to all those whom you have already called, if you get in touch kindly with the Nehru Yuva Kendra Sangathan or their Director who was here or perhaps even their Joint-Secretary, Shri Shailesh, who once used to work for me and Ms. Kiran Chandra of Navodaya Vidyalaya because that came up in a major way, especially when Mr. Kiran Seth was speaking.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you all very much for having spent an entire day with us. It has been quite exceptionally useful. I certainly have benefited a great deal and a lot of what you have said, I hope, will find reflection in the report.

My final request to all of you is, whoever has not sent in their suggestions in writing, to do so as early as possible because that makes it that much easier for us to incorporate what you have to say into the report.

I am really most grateful to all of you. I am also glad to have made contacts with people whom I wanted to meet. So, I hope that even at a personal level, we will be able to carry all this further forward.

Thank you.

-----

## 14th December 2010 Pre Lunch

MR. CHAIRMAN: While extending a very warm welcome to all of you for having taken the trouble to join us today, we would expect interventions from each one of you in about 10-15 minutes because if it were to be very much longer than that, then we might have to extend till the night. So, just please bear that in mind. Some of you have already sent us the most valuable written comments on the subject before us. Others, I hope, will do so after making their interventions because although all your interventions or comments are going to be fully recorded and transcribed and are going to be part of this Committee and my colleagues here are taking notes of the points that you will be making, still to accurately reflect what it is that you wish to say, it would be helpful if you were to follow up - this is addressed only to those who have already not sent us their written comments - whatever it is that you state here with a very brief written record of what you would like to see reflected as your points of view in the report of this committee.

I have circulated to you in advance two sets of draft documents. One is an introductory chapter which attempts to explain what was the original rationale behind these Zonal Cultural Committees (ZCC) and where we think there have been departures from the original concept. Secondly, based upon that, we have a set of about 28 or so draft recommendations. What I would hope is that your comments will be addressed to amending in terms of either deleting or adding to or expanding upon the recommendations already made or introducing completely new thoughts and ideas into this. Beginning with the total concept of whether or not we need the ZCCs to perform the function they were initially designed for and in going down to matters and details as to how the ZCCs might be restructured, how they may be staffed, what kind of programmes they should be undertaking and how they should be undertaking them and their relationship to other institutions - public or private - for the preservation and promotion of our culture.

So, let me begin by asking Shri S.K. Mishra, who has taken a lot of trouble in sending a very detailed note to us, to initiate the discussion.

SHRI S.K. MISHRA: Thank you, Sir. As I have mentioned in my letter, I entirely agree with the formulation that has been written by you in the notes circulated. By and large, these ZCCs have not lived up to the expectations or achieved the objectives with which they were set up and there is a need for streamlining, overhauling and having a fresh look at that. I think, it is necessary to have a proper focus and the focus should be on the rural areas because we tend to be too urban oriented. So, to give rural population a sense of pride in their cultural traditions, a motivation to preserve and maintain this thing, to also try to discover new talent and to make Rural Centres of activity that instead of artists coming to the town, let people go to those Centres in the villages or rural areas to see their performances.

Apart from nurturing talents, I feel that in certain areas these ZCCs should try to develop rural museums where there could be centres for arts and crafts and their focus should not be on performing arts only but also on the development and other things. One of the important things that we have to bear in mind is : how do we make these Centres effective? One thing I feel for is that they cover too large an area. I think, it is impossible for these Centres to do full justice to the objective. So, either we have more ZCCs or we should have sub-zonal centres. One Centre to cover a number of States is just at the periphery and they are not able to do that. What I would suggest is that every year, to really make them effective, we should have ZCC Council at the Centre and an annual meeting should be held where the heads of three Akademis should be here and all the ZCC Heads should be here and it should be open to the public, those who are interested. It may be a two-day conference. Let each one make a presentation so that others see. Even people from the public can react to them so that you get a proper feedback. Based on what they have done, they should also have a programme for the following year. Based on that, you can have a realistic budget that should go into their performance. That is what I had introduced in tourism when I was there. I think, it would be very effective. I think, this should be the approach in order to make them effective.

These are some of the points I wanted to raise.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much for those very constructive suggestions and particularly for having given us in writing. I think, we will be able to act on all the three suggestions that you have made.

USTAD AMJAD ALI KHAN: Being a performing artist, I think, I was involved right in the beginning of that Apna Utsav at Purana Qila. After that, I am not aware of what the ZCCs are doing. I do not know how many years it has taken, nearly 20 or 25 years, but no ZCC ever approached me for any help. I would like to be associated and I would like to know what are the functions of ZCCs, how can I serve for them and how can I be connected with them. But nobody has approached me till today. This is the most unfortunate part of our Culture Ministry and the Ministry's people involved in this that they do not consider me worth anything. That is all. Thank you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Well, I would like to take you as Chairman of this ZCC Council if it were in my hands. Thank you very much for having participated right in the start and most importantly for having expressed regret that ZCC Directors have not approached you and to have asserted that you would like to be involved because one of the sad things about these ZCCs right from the beginning has been that it is focused on folk and tribal culture and has often been to the total exclusion of the classical cultural artists of the standing that you have. There has been a feeling that the senior artists would not wish to be involved with the work of these ZCCs. So, it is extremely encouraging to hear from you that far from not wanting to be involved, you regret that you were not involved, more so by the Directors themselves and would like to do so. Because we certainly do not wish to see a kind of empty

compartmentalization between folk and tribal culture and we would like to see these seamlessly flowing from one to the other, that is why, yesterday we were talking about the possibility of establishing a separate Folk and Tribal Art Akademi, the Sangeet Natak Akademi in particular. We were very keen on ensuring that this does not happen and that it remains within them to be able to cultivate all the performing arts together. So, since it is really very encouraging what we have heard from you, we will certainly take matters further forward to them.

SHRI S.K. MISHRA: I think, we should try to involve students also and build up a Student Volunteer Corps. They could be given stipend apart from good training. They may work in the villages and help in this thing. So, we should try to build up Student Volunteer Cultural Corps.

MR. CHAIRMAN: It is an excellent idea and it will increase the outreach of the ZCCs. At the moment, the ZCCs personnel themselves are either running everywhere and not succeeding in making an impact anywhere or sticking at their headquarters because it is so much more convenient to do so, whereas your suggestion would indicate that all over a particular zone, if they were to enthuse the kids themselves to be the organizers of these events, then they would simply have an army of thousands of young people working for them, instead of five or six rather reluctant people they have at the moment. So, it is a very good suggestion and I am sure we can take it on board.

SHRIMATI AJIT KAUR: I am personally involved in it and folklore has been one of the major concerns of my activities for the last 20 years at least because in 1988 I was invited to Pakistan by Benazir when she came for the first time and then on one pretext or the other. I was astounded by a shop on the mall, a very huge shop, which was full of recorded music from the villages and reprinting in very aesthetic way the old kisas, like Heer and Waris Shah and all that. I was so amazed that I wanted to know who had done it. There was one mad person like me, Abdul Gaffur Darshan, who had given this idea to the gunmen and the gunmen there have always been military gunmen, but somebody heard him and founded Lok Virsa. This fellow worked there for 23 years, but he never sat in his AC room even for one day. He took his tape-recorder and went around the villages recording every song that he could hear. In the SAARC region, particularly in our Sub-Continent, we start singing right from pregnancy's third month to fifth month to seventh month and in marriages. While playing, the children also sing. While harvesting, everybody sings. In the marriages also, everybody sings. We are the only region in the world, I realize, which sings while sitting with the dead body. They cry and sing. It does not happen anywhere else in the world. So, this is celebrating death in a way. So, I went on buying steel trunks and loading them with this. There were four heavy steel trunks loaded with this music, exquisite music. Some of these musicians became world famous, like Alam Lohar and Mehndi Hasan and Reshma. They were just folk musicians in the beginning. So, I came back and gave this suggestion to the Ministry several times to make something like that with committed people who roam around in the villages. What is happening is that everyday the languages are dying. What is

folk? It is oral. If the language dies, the oral tradition dies. If a language dies, the folks songs and folk tales, which have been transferred from generation to generation, also die. If we do not record and document it now, then we will lose this forever.

Then, there are traditional musical instruments also. Only Sharan Rani Bakliwal used to collect them. Before her death, she donated everything to the National Museum, but one person's effort is not enough.

Thirdly, the ZCCs' performances have become amazingly a showcase event like to send a troupe somewhere. They just dance and sing and come back. There is no academic seminar going side by side with the performance to think about what should be done about that. I have been doing it now since 2007. We have an academic seminar. We have got folklore scholars from all over the region and they watch these performances and come out with concrete proposals about what to do about them and how to improve them. For example, this time I was knocking at the door of every ZCC to send me nirgum bhajan gayaks from the streets of Varanasi. They are exquisite singers, but they had been reduced to the status of beggars almost because they sing and people donate money into their katoras. Why? They are exquisite singers. So, we got 25 of them on our own. They traveled and enthralled the whole of Chandigarh and they were in great demand in schools, colleges and everywhere. It is not essential that the folk performers should be clad in beautiful and shining clothes. It is not necessary. They had come in their dhoti-kurta. They won the heart of everybody and went back. So, ZCCs do not think them worthwhile.

Now Tejan Bai charges two lakh rupees per performance and Chhaya Maya Lavani charges two lakh rupees per performance. Why? From the remotest of remote villages, I found Goti Pua and Raghuraj Pur. They are small, little men painted like women. Srikantji knows about them. They start by saying Hare Krishnaji. They are paid Rs. 250 for their boarding and lodging and also train fare. It is amazing. All these discrepancies just hurt me very deeply.

Anyway, I found literature tugged along with the performing arts. I do not know what is happening to literature. I have acquired a list of Punjab from the libraries because ZCC of Patiala is just near. Where do you get those 12,600 or 12,800 panchayats? It is there in Punjab and same thing should be there in all the regions. Do you get any books, periodicals, or newspapers? They do not. I mean to say that the literature has been wiped off from their programme. Or, what has gone wrong with the literature?

Now, there are certain thing which are coming as new fashion, like Dastaan Gois. Their pictures are, along with other pictures, all over the newspapers. This is something new. We have Dastaan Gois all over India. What is Kathakalli after all? The whole night people sit around and dance and it is around a dastaan. Now, what is Pattachitra? It is folk painting. They keep unrolling it and it goes on for hours.

Now, we should be aware of commercialization of our old art forms. For example, the ICCR,

Director-General was there at our festival. He was going ga-ga over his recent visit to Dhaka. He said that he had seen balls from Lalan Faqir's mazar. I said 'yes, we rejected them'. I was also very fond of them. After all, Tagore went and lived in Kushtiya and collected their songs and translated them, but now there are certain groups which are playing the Lalan Faqir's songs. They stand up and loud electric and electronic music they play. Some such group was sent by ZCC in 2007 from West Bengal. They came to sing five songs. After one song, I stood up and said 'it is over' because let us not adulterate our old traditional forms with the fashionable modern music and call it very fashionably fusion. I think, we should guard against this.

Then there is another trend which has become very fashionable. The idea came from the UNO or the UNESCO or somewhere of 'culture industry'. I tell you that it is such a dangerous word. I was in the Advisory Committee of the Ministry of Culture. I do not know whether I am still there or not because I resented and put in my protest to Ambika Soni because Rajiv Sethi brought a huge document saying that I have approached the Planning Commission and they have sanctioned eight crore rupees also and you should also sanction some money. I asked : What is culture industry? Can you make my writing industry unless you make a film out of it? Can you make painting an industry? Can you make any creative thing an industry excepting handicrafts which should be packed nicely and marketed nicely? I agree that they can be put in the category of culture industry. I would say that to brand all the creative things as industry is wrong and we should guard ourselves against it. If the Planning Commission has done such things, we should put in our protests against that. All that these people do is that they sit down, make nice proposals on their computers. I am computer illiterate. I think Mr. Mani has started fiddling with it. He told me about a week back. He is lefty, but he is younger to me. He could, but I cannot.

Then, documentation of our folklore is a must.

MR. CHAIRMAN: May I just welcome our Secretary, Mr. Jawahar Sarkar?

SHRIMATI AJIT KAUR: Me too. We waited for him. He was chairing a session on the fifth. He said that he will be there on the 4th as then he was the Chief Guest in the performing Session. He did not come. etc.

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is what qualifies him to be a Secretary!

SHRIMATI AJIT KAUR: I know.

What are we doing about our miniatures? Our miniatures are there scattered in the villages. For example, we heard that there was one masterji whose forefathers were miniature painters in Mandi, Himachal Pradesh. We went all the way to Mandi to locate him. Eventually, a halwai (street sweet seller) told us that his house was in a small street. He himself was very ill. So, he sent his son with us. He said "What do I do? I do not have any place to keep the miniatures painted by my forefathers?" So, I have gifted them to the

gunman." Where has the gunman put them? They have put them in the fort. We went to the fort. They said that it is in the attics. First, we could not find the chowkidaar. Eventually, he came but could not locate the key. Eventually, when the key was located after four or five hours, he opened the attic. I do not know how many days it had not been opened for. There was fungus on these miniatures. These miniatures were lying everywhere. Wherever you find them, you will find them with lying in the trunks of the people or in old boxes, but there is a need to collect them, to preserve them, to restore them and to make a proper miniatures' museum. If possible, there should be a central museum in every region. We have tried to do something about whatever we had got in our possession in our Akademi, but it has to be done on a very serious way and large scale because they are going to mould.

Then, cultural organizations like SPIC MACAY get tonnes of money, but they restrict their activities to cities only. What they are doing is greater. They are taking culture at least to the schools, to the modern generation who would not have known what classical music is. They are doing great work. Why should it be done only in the cities? When money is given to them, it should be made mandatory for them to take these things to the villages also. In the villages, you do not need to create anything. Village chauupal is there in every village where people gather not because you call them, but they gather on their own. They tell stories, they dance and play some musical instruments also. Chaupals should be utilized as a focal point in every village. That is my humble submission.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. I am also glad to inform you that Shri Rajiv Sethi has regretted his inability to come, but he has given his proposals to us in writing.

I take note of the fact that you would not like the word 'culture industry' to be used or any such expression, and at best you can have crafts being regarded as an industry.

SHRI Amol Palekar: Ajitji, just for my clarity, I wanted to know this. You expressed your regret about Tejan Bai getting Rs. 2 lakh and less known artists getting Rs. 250. The resentment is towards Rs. 250 or Rs. 2 lakh.

SHRIMATI AJIT KAUR: Both. There should be some level.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay. We have with us Shri Shailesh who has come from the Ministry of Youth Affairs. We were not able to ask your representative to intervene yesterday. So, I am grateful to you for having taken time out to come to us on behalf of the Nehru Yuva Kendra Sangathan (NYKS) which came into existence after the ZCCs. In what manner do you see a possibility of the various Yuva Clubs of the NYKS working along with our ZCCs? For example, Mr. S.K. Mishra has suggested that students interested in culture might be recruited as workers for the work of these ZCCs. As we saw yesterday with the Ministry of Panchayati Raj that we can use the panchayat representatives as the persons who would indicate to our ZCCs that we would like to see something happen in our village or in our block or in our district. So, in that sense, I believe that the potential of the NYKS to be as useful to culture as they are for the Panchayat Yuva Khel or Krida Abhiyan, which as

Minister of Sports I had the opportunity of launching.

I hand over to you to explain to us what you think the NYKS could do in collaboration with the ZCCs to promote the objective of taking the best in our culture out to the people of India where they live.

SHRI SHAILESH: Sir, I would like to inform the august audience here that NYKS is an autonomous body which is fully funded by the Department of Youth Affairs in the Ministry of Youth Affairs and Sports. The organization came into existence as an autonomous body in 1987 and thereafter, one of the primary focus of NYKs is to involve the rural youth for the various activities which are either citizen-oriented or for the benefit of the young people in the villages, though essentially they work at the grass root level.

One of the important frameworks of NYK is that it is existing in 501 districts and the Government has taken a decision that NYKs will be also established in all other districts it was not existing so far. So, about 123 more districts are to be covered under the framework of NYKS. NYKS has established over the last 25 years about three lakh Youth Clubs. As we all know, we have about six lakh villages in the country. Three lakh Youth Clubs were formed by NYKS in 501 districts. As a Minister of Youth Affairs and Sports, Sir, you had keenly watched what the activities of NYKS have been, but we have taken very important steps over the last two years, which I would like to update everyone here about.

A new scheme was launched by the Government. It is called National Youth Corps. This scheme was announced by the Hon. President while addressing the Joint Session of Parliament on June 9. She had said "My Government will start a scheme whereby volunteers will be engaged between the age 18-25 years for the purpose of national development." We have formed this scheme whereby a volunteer is given an engagement for two years and between age bracket of 18 and 25 years from all the 501 districts through a committee, which is headed by the District Collector. Two volunteers per block in the country have been finally selected and placed. We have a database of 12,000 such volunteers. At the click of the mouse, the entire profile of these volunteers will be available and we can share it with everybody who wants to use these volunteers. This is a great resource and we are doing it with a very big technology intervention. Even the payment is going to their bank accounts. There is no human intervening in the entire process.

Let me tell the first task which we gave to these volunteers. A lot of them from amongst these 12,000 volunteers are very qualified people, but are devoted towards some social cause and want to add to their profile before either they want to go in for their jobs or they want to study further. We gave these 12,000 volunteers a task. We did a massive campaign for 45 days where these 12,000 volunteers went for a day to a village and three lakh such villages were covered by these volunteers in about 45 days. We have mapped the activities of three lakh youth clubs and captured in an electronic data form as to what these youth clubs have been doing over the last 3-4 years. Along with that, we have also captured the profile of the village including who all have the mobile numbers. We now even can access about the three

lakh villages who are the important decision-makers, who is the important woman or is there a women organization in the village. It is an extensive exercise which was done by NYKs in three lakh villages. Now the data has already come and fed into our computers. We have found that out of three lakh, about 1.25 lakh youth clubs are very active at grass root level. This data is now available and we can share it. You can see what is happening in a particular village and we can reach out to these 1.25 lakh clubs and their members by just passing on an SMS to them. This vehicle has been professionalized and we have been using it. As a result of this professionalisation, the Ministry of Rural Development, Government of India has started using this as a big instrument for creating awareness of their flagship programmes. NREGA is one of the programmes recently given to NYKs for creating awareness and for the purpose of social audit.

In addition to this, drinking water sanitation, Ministry of Home Affairs, for tribal and North-East and J&K, are using this vehicle for two purposes. One is to cause awareness and second, for even using them as a delivery mechanism for the programmes. With this prime focus, these clubs are active because many of them are centering around the cultural and social activities.

These 1.25 lakh youth clubs have profiled about 25,000 Mahila Mandals according to their activities. Many of the clubs are performing the role of cultural clubs or cultural artists. We also did one of the important exercises. As you may be knowing, Sir, we have an institute called Rajiv Gandhi National Institute for Youth Development in Sriperumbudur. We did an exercise on a selective basis with the Ministry of Labour for four States - Tamil Nadu, Andhra Pradesh, Punjab and Madhya Pradesh. We thought that in the rural areas, many people have traditional skills which remain unnoticed. People from their ancestors have imbibed these traditional skills and they are doing their professional activities based on the skills acquired from generation to generation. We did a survey of the four States as to how many people have a traditional skill. A phenomenal number of such people came in our database. Thereafter, we approached the Ministry of Labour under a scheme called NCVT, National Council for Vocational Training. We involved this Council. A certification for these people was done by the Ministry of Labour and this certificate has been given to those people who passed a test conducted by the professionals. After acquiring this certificate, these people, who possessed additional skills, got employable. For example, there is a carpenter who brings this certificate can be employed by anyone because this certification is valid world over.

I am just highlighting in the intervention what we are doing at the grass root level. A lot of activities of NYKS centre around doing campaigning activities for national integration and social causes. It was an important instrument for doing the Red Ribbon Express for HIV AIDS. We are also doing awareness campaigns for Election Commission. In the elections which were held in Bihar, Maharashtra, Haryana and Jharkhand, the Election Commission utilized this network of youth clubs for creating awareness campaign that people should come

and vote. We do not have an econometric analysis to see how only this factor contributed to increase in the percentage of voting, but certainly there is a substantial increase in the percentage of voting and an important contribution was played at the grass root level. At these clubs, we did an extensive exercise along with Panchayat Ministry, causing synergy between the clubs and the panchayats. It was quite useful when the activities of social campaign were to be launched. There were problems when the activities were more on the commercial aspects or construction of projects, but on the social platform, there was no contradiction between the panchayats and the youth clubs. That is how, I think, it is an important instrument and culture being one of the domain areas for the youth clubs, either we can use it as a vehicle for dissemination or we can use them to find the talent and scout the talent - the talent which is existing - and to create a database.

It is an instrument whereby we can reach the grass root level. This is perhaps the only Government of India institution which is working at the grass root level, other than the postman. Thank you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Well, that is the most important report. It seems to me quite clear that we need to have as much interaction, perhaps more, between the ZCCs and the NYKS's various clubs than we have ever had before. We should combine this with some of the other suggestions that have been made with respect to some of the other Ministries. The Ministry of Tribal Affairs was here yesterday, the Ministry of Panchayati Raj was here, your own Ministry, especially this Youth Affairs Department and the NYKS under it, was here. I think, the activities of these ZCCs would become extremely socially meaningful, quite apart from having a plenty of outreach instruments for them to get their message out.

I am particularly impressed by your suggestion that the youth clubs be used for talent scouting. You were talking about the certification. Under the IGNOU, there is a new body established in Shillong. Their representative, Mrs. Debjani Roy, was here yesterday. I think, we could mesh all this in and you may rest assured that the information you have given us will constitute a very important recommendation of ours in a completely uncharted area so far. Thank you very much for that.

I am going to request you to put down on a paper what you have said, but orient it less towards what the new initiatives have done than to talk about how you think those initiatives could be used for the purpose of ZCCs. I would suggest to you that your impression that culture is a domain area for youth clubs become the focus or platform from which you may like to launch yourselves into seeing how these interactions might be promoted. I do not know to what extent you are familiar with ZCCs - what they do and where they operate.

SHRIMATI AJIT KAUR: I find everything in the ZCCs excepting looking at indigenous knowledge systems. They are also vanishing. With our performances and folklore, indigenous knowledge systems, which should be of interest to everybody, should be made focus for

investigation and there should be a project for cultural mapping of tangible and intangible heritage of India. In this regard, ZCCs can help a lot. These suggestions have been lying with the Ministry for 4-5 years, but nobody has looked at them. I will request Jawahar to please help.

MR. CHAIRMAN: What we did underline yesterday in particular, when a number of cultural institutions were present here including the three academics, that the ZCCs are non-professional. They are not expert bodies. While they can facilitate and should facilitate the work of these expert bodies, we really need top class experts to do culturally mapping.

Between the ZCCs and cultural institutions, whether public or private, just as ensuring that these institutions can help, the ZCCs should also help these institutions, but to expect quality documentation or effective archives by these essentially bureaucratic bodies would be to impose an excessive thrust on them and whatever they have done on their own accord, not entirely to a very large extent, has been found to be professionally inadequate. So, your suggestions are accepted, but it will not be for the ZCCs to do this. It will be for the ZCCs to assist the professional bodies in getting it done. We cannot ask them.

SHRIMATI AJIT KAUR: In the initial speech of Rajiv Gandhi in which he had initiated the whole process, I find that he had said that these bodies should not be bureaucratic; they should be managed by the professionals and they should be run autonomously and bureaucratic orientation should be very limited. I do not know whether that is still going on.

MR. CHAIRMAN: That has not happened. It is in that direction that we are going to push it. Essentially, this is a vehicle for taking what has already been done, out to the people and bringing to the attention of major cultural institutions new talent as has otherwise not been found, but please let us not over-burden these organizations. I would certainly like them to get completely de-bureaucratic. That was the original concept and the only reason why the bureaucracy was brought in initially was to set up these institutions. There had to be coordination, not with just one Government but several Governments, but unfortunately the original vision of transferring this, as far as we could, to the cultural community has not taken place. We are going to propose that it should take place, but even then, these bodies until and unless they have proved that they are capable of moving into specialized sphere, should be insulated from the specialized sphere, but utilized by those who are specialized, for facilitation purposes.

Now, I think, we can move to the various State Governments that are represented here. I would like to go on it through the process of seniority perhaps. So, I will begin with Principal Secretary of Rajasthan, Shri Umrao Salodia.

SHRI UMRAO SALODIA: Thank you, Sir. I have been roped in at the last stage. So, I could not send my comments. I have carefully gone through the introductory chapter and the recommendations. I compliment the hard work taken by the Committee and you have

specifically involved all the stakeholders.

I would like to make only a few comments. There was a suggestion from the West Zone cultural Centre that local small open air theatres in Gram Panchayats could be constructed, like under PICA Scheme, we have Wool Stadia. Similarly, some small open theatres could be constructed by Gram Panchayat headquarters so that local artists can perform there. It could be done. It can be dovetailed with NREGA Scheme and also local funds.

As Ajitji said, once the folk or tribal artists become famous, they get more money. My suggestions is that I also agree with Mr. Mishra that talent searches should be the major focus for the ZCCs, specifically from the rural areas and slums. This should be made mandatory on them that they should provide the stage to the artists who are unknown and who are very good in their own right. They should be discovered and given a chance on priority basis by the ZCCs and once they are made popular, they are given performances. Then the State Akademis and the Central Akademis could take over them. My suggestion is that there should not be a repetition of artists. ZCCs are originally meant to find out such talent from the rural areas, remote areas and urban slums. Give them opportunities and provide them adequate chances.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am sorry, Mr. Salodia, but I must intervene here. This is the task which should have been done by the State Departments of Culture, who finding that they are not doing it are using the ZCCs for this purpose. I completely agree with you that the ZCCs, if they are in touch with the rural areas, would be able to identify new talent, but if you were to restrict them to merely providing a platform for new talent, where in fact established talent, old talent needs to be exposed to people, who cannot afford to come to auditoria in Jaipur. That is why, the ZCCs exist. So, while talent searching and providing platform for new talent could be one of the activities of the ZCCs, I do not think we can agree that it should be either the sole objective or principal objective. The principal objective would be to take the established talent, including absolutely high talent, like that of Ustad Saheb out to people, who would otherwise not be able to hear or see him. That is what the ZCCs are for. Even in that process, especially with what has been suggested by Mr. Shailesh Kumar just now, incidentally you acquire a second name. He had insisted on having only one name till recently, So, we will do this. I take on board your suggestion, but not as a principal or sole objective of the ZCCs.

SHRI UMRAO SALODIA: I am sorry. I will make myself very clear. The well-known classical artists are also coming. I have seen a programme of Pt. Hari Prasad Chaurasia a few months back in Udaipur, organized by the West Zone Cultural Centre.

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is the trouble. That is how you people are preventing these institutions. It is not supposed to be done in Udaipur. It is supposed to be done in villages around Udaipur. It is supposed to be done in Churu. It is supposed to be done down in the Mount Abu area. But instead of that, you have completely subverted and the WZCC is

providing an extension for the State Department in Udaipur and getting the artists to come to the Raj Bhawan in Jaipur or Raj Bhawan in Mount Abu. You please do not restrict Hari Prasad Chaurasia to Udaipur. He can get there without the ZCC, but he cannot get into tiny little village in Banswara without the ZCC. And the ZCC should be for that purpose.

I can see that the collapse of the ZCCs over a period of time has largely been on account of parent culture department of the host State utilizing them for their own purposes. It is precisely because neither the Ministry of Culture in Delhi and its institutions nor the Department of Culture in the State and institutions were doing enough about taking the message of Indian culture to the masses and the people in their neighbourhood where they live that we started the ZCCs and that is what needs to be promoted as the principal objective. In this connection, while I have absolutely no objection to your using NREGA or any other scheme to get open air theatres built in the villages, please remember what Ajit Kaurji said to us. In the villages, chaupal is already a 5,000 years old open air theatre. Your open air theatres through panchayats would be a massive opportunity for the sarpanches to enrich themselves and for the local bureaucrats to do the same. But nevertheless they may leave behind a message which the people can use. So, we can go ahead with that.

We must ensure that we get out of the auditorium or theatre mode into using open spaces wherever they are. For people to be able to conduct their activities, if a stage of some kind is necessary as it often is because an elevated platform gives a larger viewing to a larger number of people, those can be constructed even temporarily and can be removed as is happening all the time, but this kind of capital expenditure oriented attitude towards the ZCCs, where we have gone from Shilpa Grams to having massive new structures thinking the Shanti Niketan, is not relevant to the culture of East India, but Salt Lake city is and then making the Salt Lake Auditorum to focus on whatever the Culture Minister of West Bengal wishes to do by way of promoting himself as a cultural personality, it is this kind of bastardisation of the ZCCs that we have to really fight against through this Committee.

So, please continue your comments, but I do not wish to see talent searching becoming the sole or focal objective of the ZCCs. It should certainly be one of the objectives of the ZCCs and could perhaps be done by combination of youth clubs and the State Departments indicating which are the uncharted areas or potential areas where they think there is talent, but for some reason, we do not know that they exist. It would be very useful. There was a very close coordination between the State Cultural institutions and the ZCC located in your area. We would like to see that.

Just as we have suggested, Mr. Mishra has added a new twist. If you like to do that on an annual basis, we should have a meeting here in Delhi where the major cultural institutions - public and private - are and with a sort of open-ended invitation to anybody else so that they may also come and interact with the ZCCs to see what kind of lively programme they could build up for that year. So, in a similar way to supplement whatever may have been

done at the Central level, I think, doing a similar exercise at the host State level would be very useful provided you bring in the other States that belong to that ZCC and invite also private cultural institutions to participate in this exercise. Then, we can really make a movement. We need your cooperation, but we should ensure that the ZCCs fulfill their objectives while the State Department of Culture fulfils theirs. This is not happening. There is too much of the utilization of ZCCs for State Department purposes. They are the ones who are required to get artists, bring down the prices and because the artist came, danced and went back. This is what happens in most of these functions. I do not mind their becoming a well-known repository of information about artists, but they must have an independent existence where they are not extensions of the State Department of Culture or misused for doing the work which the State Department itself ought to be doing.

SHRI UMRAO SALODIA: Sir, this Pandit Hari Prasad Chaurasia programme was not done by the WZCC. A private NGO, Chatarlal Memorial had paid for it and we just provided the venue.

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is fine. I have no objection to your doing that too. I am not saying to remove Udaipur from the cultural map. In addition to whatever you do in Shilpa Gram, which is a beautiful establishment, we should also be working out where people have not a theatre or an auditorium.

SHRI UMRAO SALODIA: North Zone Cultural Centre also made special thrust in rural areas of Mahya Pradesh, which is getting good response. I had recently been to Madhya Pradesh and similarly, a very innovative programme has been taken up by the North Central Zone Cultural Centre in Seemanchal Yatra which is still going on in four border districts of Rajasthan. It is very innovative and for the first time, I had requested them to organize an octave, which is going to happen in Jaipur.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Why jaipur?

SHRI UMRAO SALODIA: Then, it will also be happening in Dausa and after that, in Alwar.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Why only Jaipur and Dausa? Dausa is close enough to Delhi and Jaipur is a metropolitan centre. It is not more a town. I am amazed at the development that has taken place. We need these octave performances to take place in the jungles of Banswara, desert regions of Barmer and up in the hills of Mount Abu. That is where it should take place. I do not mind your doing it in Dausa and Jaipur, but you have this huge cattle fair in Nagaur. All the ZCC activities started there first because Shri Ram Niwas Mirdha, who was the only person to hold President ship of two Akademis - Lalit Kala Akademi as well as Sangeet Natak Akademi - used both. He was so excited about the ZCC idea that he said that there is a cattle fair in Nagaur and you come along there and just take part there so that people can see it. You have Pushkar Festival going on.

SHRI UMRAO SALODIA: Sir, every year we go to Nagaur and Pushkar.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now this octave is a good idea. It is one way of bringing the North-East to the attention of everybody, but I am trying to push Mr. Salodia into not being Jaipur-centric, into saying that the State Department exists for Jaipur and you can do what you like. That is your business. It is your culture. Maybe you cannot take all the octave artists everywhere, but if you were to divide Rajasthan, for example, into eight zones, at least the artists from one of the States after having performed in the octave were to go into the deserts of Barmer or out towards different parts of your State, the deserts of Churu, if you like, and see what can be done. Then, it will all come alive. Please remember that this is the fundamental purpose.

SHRI UMRAO SALODIA: Sir, I will keep that in mind. This is the first octave. So, we had tried to do it in Jaipur, Dausa and Alwar.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Then, you use these units to go out to every area.

Then, the infrastructure at headquarters of ZCC was never the objective. I wanted to comment on that. Rajasthan Government came forward and donated Bagore ki Haveli free of cost. That is why, there was no infrastructure expenditure in West Zone Cultural Centre and Shilpa Gram was also constructed on a very unfertile land. Recently, the State Government has allowed that land also free of cost to the West Zone Cultural Centre.

Then, I had these NYKs with me. That point has been well covered. I agree with the Folk Tribal Akademi. It is a good suggestion.

Now in the light of the discussion that we have had, perhaps you would like to reformulate some of your suggestions and send them to us in writing because that would be useful.

Before we move on, I am going to ask the Secretary (Culture), who has other engagement, to intervene.

SECRETARY (CULTURE): Sir, I feel bad that I have not been able to take more active part in this, but I would like to describe myself as the authority of this mischief. I have had all on record. Two years back when I joined, I had the misfortune of having seen the earlier concept of Apna Utsav developing into ZCC. What I found was enthusiastic people from all different services manning the ZCCs and had a lot of discourse not necessarily on an even keel, not necessary contained within our officers, who often took all the prattling to be a bit cranky because everything was all settled, structured urbanized boxes and civilized. Now at the end of this thing because I have been in patches getting to know what is the committee's deliberations at every meeting, when I am around, I take a report on what has been said there.

I would like to state on record a couple of things. Firstly, there are two or three members of CABP here. They will bear me out. The proposal to introspect rather ruthlessly or moved suo moto by us from this feeling that things were not right, the glossy reports and the

coloured CDs were perhaps not reflective of the original spirit and yearning to get back to the original, if at all it is possible. Therefore, there is absolutely no contradiction in the rather firm opinion of most of the members of the Committee and the Government which is represented through the Ministry. The question is of directive. Nothing is left to open choices and debate. They do not like debating. There was no directive existing. If it was, then it is lost in some files and archives are collapse institutions in India.

The first thing is that you can start issue by issue. Since you are so sincere in getting to revamp the things, I take the boldness to tell things in my own language. Secondly, de-urbanisation being a fact of life and as we progress, we de-urbanise it, I went one month ago to see Shanti Niketan campus. My heart bleeds to see the elephant grass growing there. There was no activity there. The new Director of ZCC, Kolkata told me that he is trying to bring life to it. It is something like a Brahmanical attempt to put life into mitti ki murti. As you know, these pran pratishthas are time-bound and it was over with visarjan. There is no sustaining life there. You are absolutely right because I speak from the myopic experience of the Kolkata ZCC where the hall is assiduously used for urban cultural activities or for agglomerating culture from different parts and packing them and to present it before urban audience because that gets bored very easily.

Having said all that, we would have to disperse. How much dispersal can be done structurally? Madam Sinha is here with us. She knows how much is possible. Wherever you want me, I will come and intervene. There are some questions we cannot but confront.

First, the ZCCs are exercises in absolute tokenism in terms of budget, presence, penetration, ground effective activities. Even if you take blinders of urbanized packing from the eyes, they are absolute exercises in tokenism. They exist practically in seven cities or centres. They are in cities. Thanjavur is a city. Kolakata is a city. Udaipur is a city with a resource centre acquired over 20-30 years and the performing groups themselves have been so well choreographed that they are also now events rather than expressions. So, in this management of events, they have been structured which happens in any management structure. It has been routinised. If something is to be organized, call the pradhan, tell him to choreograph it and he will get seven of them. He knows what the timing is, who moves in first, who moves in last, how do we have fluidity of movement, packaging and it is all over. It is a matter of tokenism.

I was enthused when I heard that I would be speaking about NYK. A part of it can also be harnessed. That is another way of spreading the linkage, but only God knows how to manage two bureaucratic departments. So, first, the outreach has to go beyond the level of seven cities, whatever be the formative body. Secondly, you have to get it out of the Ministry. A Joint Secretary of the Ministry is not the perfect person. The present one is more sincere than is required by the Administrative Service to go up. Having said that, he is not genetically programmed for this stuff. So, I can see the genes clashing between the green files, blue files and the propensity of whatever he has been trained for. So, get him out.

Then, set in the bias as an order that cannot be violated. This is like the Rural Development Ministry would never choose to build fly-over in Delhi. They are not authorized to do so. Put it as a matter of authority, they will not do it. I have personally struck their bias towards classical. Amjad Saheb will kill me because I have said classical market is there for him. It is packaging of the folk and indigenous expressions that you have created. That has also not found favour. How long will a person keep sending D.O.? So, let it be an order. There should be networking at the bottom level.

The last is the question of funding. The funds that all the ZCCs put together get is less than the National School of Drama gets. We can catch the budget and tell you that NSD gets more budget than all the ZCCs put together. NSD is an extremely costly body, but it has done wonders for stimulating the soul of Indian theatre. If one body can be given so much and without any rancor, there are bodies to which we give money with rancor because we know that it goes in for taking delegations to countries - a delegation of 36 or 45 people - where nobody understands our language because they have to be led, but I have said as most others would say, that with NSD the dedication, involvement and everything is there. So, if they want Rs. 20 crore, they are given Rs. 20 crore. Then, you cannot expect all the ZCCs put together to get Rs. 20 crore. I thought that these things, if you take it in, and what is the relationship of the States, this is a very tricky question.

Frankly, the State in which they are located is the State that matters. Let us get this axiomatic truth clear because it is the Governor of that State who matters. I have personal complaints and I will not use the word 'complaints'. I have personal feelings being expressed by other Governors where seven States are involved that we are also there. I have report from seven other Secretaries of the seven States that we are also there as we also contribute. So, a round goes like an event. Once in a while groups and troupes are sourced from those States to make them feel that they have participated, but the bias clearly is in favour of the host State. How do you tackle this structural aspect? I will not call it a fault. That is also to be seen.

About the ZCCs, there is one small point which I thought could be useful. This Tagore thing is going to last us for the next two or three years. The last thing lasted about 10-15 years in building Rabindra Rangmanch, which became the first and started the Rabindra Rangmanch. There was Tagore Auditoria in 1961, when India was 11 years old as a republic. This was the first cultural space which was built and could be hired for Rs. 50 or Rs. 100. They created the first cultural space. The second round is starting. I do not know how much sincere the authorities are, but one of the ideas that is floating around there is to go in for something like Mukti Manch. Just a small cost platform is built under a tree with a few little arrangements for temporary sitting or on the floor. Practically, you can have that thousands, provided there is somebody who does not make money out of that cement and bricks and provided that there is somebody who used it. The chaupals, we have to structure it, we have to pat it on the back and get it heard into original than that you want.

SHRI MAHAPATRA: Arising out of what my learned friends have already spoken and Secretary(Culture), I would like to urge that we have been all talking about the synergy and the need for coordination and supervision and also the outreach. These are the two issues that are uppermost in the mind of this Committee. Now, coordination and synergy has to be there. For the ZCCs, I find a very useful suggestion has come from Mr. S.K. Mishra and that kind of problem which Secretary, Culture has raised. That is a fact that it depends upon the quality of the host State's Governor and it varies from person to person. There have been Governors who have taken a lot of interest and there have also been people on the other extreme. Now once you have a ZCC, as he has suggested and Secretary (Culture) also, if important cultural personalities are there, they can look at this situation. It will be there at all the ZCCs. They can see what exactly has been the spread. Not that it is all in Nagaland because it is in Dimapur, and also equally at Arunachal Pradesh that something has been done at the outreach of the borders and all these areas. I have seen that how it has been in some of the ZCCs and also based upon my earlier experience.

The same synergy also applies to the ZCCs. We have been telling them as some kind of a clearing house of information because for a ZCC, the jurisdiction cuts at States and cultures. So, naturally they are in a position, even they do not have the expertise, to go for archiving for this and that. At least, they can see what has been done so far in terms of documentation by expert bodies, in terms of the State Governments, in terms of so many other people. For example, excellent films are being made on the tribals. At least my idea has been that their archiving part of it, is to collect all this, whatever has been professionally done. Even those, the NGOs and others, who are doing it are also not very professional quite often because now technology has gone so much ahead and there are instructions for this by Smith Bonnier and others as to how it is being done. However, they can collect some of those CDs, cassettes and even those films.

The second thing is the outreach. We have discussed outreach so much. Yesterday I talked to Kiran personally because I used to know him for ages ago. They are doing so much. I said whether it is possible that we can take some of these major artists because classical culture and Sangeet Natak Akademi was discussed yesterday. The present Chairman had said that 'yes', to start with. It was obvious the emphasis was on classical culture, which has stabilized songs and so on. Now, I feel that it is time that we give little more attention to folk and tribal culture. In our country, we have never looked upon them as separate entities, whether it is tribal, folk or classical. It has continued, but then folk tribal culture is an area that is least attended to by now. I said to Kiran Seth that you are for so long only taking the artists who are very costly. You have taken major artists to universities or State level colleges or some very important colleges. What about taking some of them at least on trial basis to smaller cultures, not too small? He said that if there is some kind of assistance to SPIC MACAY, he will be very happy. I do not see any reason why they are not given it. To bring about the synergy, other institutions or even the panchayati raj bodies or, as we saw yesterday, the Tribal Sub-Plan can also be of help. I raised a point yesterday that in the

Tribal Sub-Plan, there are around 50 districts in the whole country and tribal development is economic development, not merely infrastructure development. Culturally, it is the most important infrastructure. Therefore, is it possible that Tejan Bai goes to a district in Koraput or in a district in Jharkhand? Why not? If something out of that fund can be mandated, it is possible. A mandate from that Department may be given. Yesterday, the Tribal Development Department was there. I said that I am aware that in these 50 districts, enormous amount of unspent balances are lying. It is granted that they should spend on development and it is also an important aspect and it deserves it. Just as Tejan Bai can go there, tomorrow whoever can go to a smaller college, I do not think, he would object to it. Then, the people would get an opportunity to feel that the best of our country, the best of our classical culture is also available to them and they are not the neglected fellows.

These were two things which were uppermost in my mind. As far as increasing the outreach is concerned, certainly we are going from a stage with increased emphasis on taking out the best. It is what is called top down where we hate when it comes to Administration, but then bottom up is also necessary in involving the panchayati raj bodies. Thank you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much, Mr. Mahapatra. Now, I may hand over to Dr. Venu, Principal Secretary, Kerala.

DR. VENU: Thank you, Sir. I come to this meeting with some experience of working with the ZCCs. For the last three years, I have represented my State in the Committee meetings and I have had the occasion to chair the Programme Committee meeting. I have also brought the octave into Kerala, unfortunately to Trivandrum. The time octave came to Kerala for the first time was in 2007-08.

Sir, I will not repeat the points which have been very strongly made by learned speakers earlier, but I would just like to reiterate the fact that my close interaction with Thanjavur Centre has even very strongly put into my mind that the Centre is not useful for anything. The functions that it is presently doing can be very easily done sitting in Delhi, using other avenues or perhaps through other Departments. All the points which have been mentioned here are very true for South Zone Cultural Centre also.

If you look at the budget, the corpus has not been subscribed by three of the five member States. So, the annual meeting where the experts from all the States and Union Territories come together to decide on a plan of action is reduced to a farce. The reason being that the scheduled programmes are supposed to be done through the interest generated by the corpus and when the corpus itself is so inadequate, the Committee sits down and looks at programming. The State of Kerala gets programming worth Rs. 14 lakh, Karnataka worth Rs. 7 lakh. Finally, at the end of ten minutes of discussion, what is finally decided is that let us apportion this to programmes brought in by the members of the Programme Committee. Most of them come with their own basket of programmes and the haggling that happens in the Committee is about whether we can give Rs. 5 lakh or Rs. 3 lakh.

The second point which I have noticed, because I worked closely with the Director there and am also the beneficiary because I pushed rural theatre. The ZCC has been very kind in terms of providing funds to take their troupes to villages and such promotion activities for theatre, but the point is that much of the activities of the SZCC have been because of Central funds. That are not really controlled or decided by the States. There are some schemes through which the Centre gets funds from the Ministry of Culture directly. It is sad to say that most of these programmes go for headquarter programming and the programming as dictated by His Excellency or programming at Chennai or Thanjavore. This does nothing for the exalted cause for which the Centres were supposed to have been started.

I am sorry to say this, but there is rampant corruption. I was astounded to find that the centre still believes in this very antique system of huge imprest. Advance is taken by the staff members who then proceed to various places carrying these bags of cash to disburse as and when the programmes are completed. This facilitates corruption. I have personally met many artists who have confided that they are forced to sign in receipts where the figures are far higher than what they eventually would get. The Thanjavur Centre is in a huge cross as we sit. It has gone into such cross earlier also because the staffing of the Centre is through the Tamil Nadu Government. It was never envisaged like that. I find that one Assistant Director who was getting into the job and grips of the problem, that is, the Centre, has been summarily kicked out. I find that the staff of the centre has ganged up to make sure that the committed officers do not enter that place. These are all symptoms of a huge disease there. If we shut down Thanjavur Centre and disburse the money to the State Government and say we tried to do a job, but we have not been able to do it right, I think, the model is failing. It is probably better than having a centre run on these lines.

I agree with what has been mentioned here, but my submission would be, probably this would not be shared by many others, to restrict the functioning of the ZCCs to performing art with emphasis on folk and tribal art only. I do not believe that it should be the mandate of the ZCC to popularize classical art forms. We have done that and we are doing it, but then, as pointed out by the Chairman himself, the State Departments of Culture and the Cultural Akademis could do a far better job in this. If the ZCCs restrict themselves to popularizing tribal and folk art forms and providing more platforms to performances, ensuring that such art forms are performed in other context and in other States, I think, that would go a long way for our villages to understand that we are not really so different from each other. I have seen that in the many programmes we have been doing. Since I also look after tourism, I have been able to bring in some funds from tourism also to popularize art forms.

The second suggestion which I would like to place before the Committee is that with today's technology, we can have a very transparent system of identifying the groups and artists and allocation of programming to them. I find that the ZCCs have a totally non-transparent and opaque way of allocating programming. We have enough technology and expertise available with us to make sure that there is a transparent system of programming that could be put

in place. I see the return to the original concept which has also been elaborated by Mr. Gandhi in his lecture on proliferation of programming across our villages as the primary mandate that should be done by ZCCs, without being cluttered by things like archiving, documentation, theatre rejuvenation or classical music and classical programming. If we can get to the old rails to push it to performing arts and folk culture across to the remote parts of the country, I think, ZCCs can still have a great canvas to perform.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. Venu, thank you. It was very useful. Can I now turn to Shri Ram Tiwari, who represents Madhya Pradesh?

SHRI RAM TIWARI: Out of 365 days' activities, we are having 1800 days activities in various parts of Mahdya Pradesh from village to capital and lot of various activities, like films, documentation, tribal folk etc. etc. We are getting full support from Allahabad Centre. In remote areas, fresh look for ZCC is necessary and mainly for melas and fairs at grass root level in the rural areas. There should also be something else done to support the dialects, tribal bolis and other bolis, and literary activities should also be encouraged. दोनों सेंटर्स की तरफ से एकेडेमिक लगभग शून्य हैं जो कि बढ़ना चाहिए क्योंकि यही चीज सांस्कृतिक गतिविधियों के लिए ताकत देगी। जो लासिकल डांस और म्यूजिक की एक्टिविटीज भी आपके यहां बहुत थिन हैं, वे भी बढ़ना चाहिए। जैसा कि आपने कहा हम लोग तमाम जगह चाहे वह सिरोंज हो या फिर कोई अन्य छोटी जगह, जहां पर 20,000 की आबादी है 25,000 की आबादी है, हम कर रहे हैं। केवल इतना ही कहना है कि जोनल सेंटर और स्टेट की जो रिलेशनशिप है उसमें डॉमिनेशन की बात न हो बल्कि एक दूसरे के सहयोगी के रूप में हों। स्टेट को जरूरत है जेडसीसी के सहयोग की अपनी एक्टिविटीज को और ज्यादा विस्तार देने की ठीक वैसे ही जेडसीसी को भी हमारी जरूरत है इस रिलेशनशिप की तरफ भी ध्यान देना चाहिए। इलाहाबाद जोन की तरफ से हम फुल सपोर्ट मिल रहा है, लेकिन हमें साउथ सेंट्रल जोन से सपोर्ट नहीं मिल रहा है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now Mr. Bhanu Bharati, Director, Bharati Lok Kala Mandal.

SHRI BHANU BHARATI: I am a Director there. Otherwise I am a theatre director and playwright. I am meeting you after a long time. So, you seem to have forgotten me. I was with you when first Apna Utsav was held.

MR. CHAIRMAN: An old man forgets!

SHRI BHANU BHARATI: I am also growing old.

Theatre in this country performs from peripheries and from grassroots. So, it is okay. I will be talking less because most of the things I wanted to say have already been said by Mr. Mishra and Ajitji and in your interventions. I am very happy that this intervention, this Committee has come at a very appropriate time and I have become hopeful that something concrete and meaningful will come out of this exercise, you being there.

At the outset, I totally support this idea of de-bureaucratisation of these centres. I have been associated with many ZCCs in various capacities, sometimes on their bodies also. Ritaji is sitting here. When she was the Director, she opted to go for a much lower rank job and they

have done a wonderful work. I agree with the recommendations being sent to me that we should find young, energetic Directors for these ZCCs who will be managers of culture. They should not be practicing artists.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Can I intervene to ask where to find them? I agree with you.

SHRI BHANU BHARATI: We need to organize trainings for such people. We can have a Central Committee where people like you and who are there on this Committee may be associated. You are asking them their suggestions. We can always chalk out a training programme for such people and I am sure, a lot of people will be interested in coming for these kinds of trainings, if the opportunities are there for their employment. I am sure, we can generate a lot of talent and attract them to this.

Then, independent Chairman for each ZCC is an excellent suggestion. We should take it out of Raj Bhawan. It will be very good.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You tell me one thing. आपका सुझाव बहुत अच्छा है और मैं चाहता हूँ कि इन गवर्नर्स की हम छुट्टी करवाएँ लेकिन किस तरीके से हम सक्षम और इमानदार चेयरमैन, जो अपने ही डिप्लोमा के लिए नहीं, लेकिन विस्तृत रूप में कल्चर को बढ़ाने के लिए हम कहां से और कैसे ढूँढेंगे? इसके बारे में आपका क्या सुझाव है?

Jh HkkuqHkkj rh %इसमें एक चीज यह हो सकती है, who have no axe to grind, who have reached a position, like Ustad Saheb. Such people have earned name. I know that problems are there. My friend was talking about corruption even in the culture where there is hardly any money. But then there are people who have received the awards, who have received the fellowships and who have got everything. They can be roped in as Chairmen of these bodies.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Like a wish from God, one of our greatest managers of culture has just arrived, Kamalakar Sontake. Please come.

SHRI BHANU BHARATI: I am sure that we should be able to find such people who will rise above it. In spite of all darkness, I still hope for the light somewhere out of the tunnel.

I have an observation that the work of ZCC should be confined to facilitate dissemination of culture at grass root level. They should not be in the making of culture. They should only be disseminating the culture. There comes the role of various Akademis and cultural institutions along with the professionals in the field to plan for these centres. The planning should not be left to these centres. Here, I see a far greater and active role of various Akademis, cultural institutions, like NSD etc. and the regional cultural institutions and experts in the various fields to chalk out a programme for this. The calendar of these programmes should just be made a year in advance. It should not be that what is to be done this year, we start planning now.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Sir, I need to know this clearly. Mr. Mishra suggested that and it is an excellent suggestion that we have a ZCC Council consisting of really ex officio, the heads of the Akademis and some other leading personalities who have interest in dissemination. He

suggested that they should meet in Chennai. We should also help them give inputs in the budget of the Ministry of Culture. You are suggesting a year earlier. Do you want the meeting in January 2011 to deal with 2012?

SHRI BHANU BHARATI: Yes.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Not to deal with calendar year 2011.

SHRI BHANU BHARATI: Yes. They are planning a small event at least two years in advance world over. This is the problem here because we do not plan in advance. Therefore, ad hocism is so much there and that paves the way for corruption and also de-focussing things and haphazard functioning of the institutions. I think, advance planning is a must.

You are talking of setting up these theatres and chaupals. If we want classical dance or classical music to go to the grass root level, we need certain equipment, staging facilities to carry that for its complete impact. For that, I suggest that we should have mobile units attached to all these ZCCs. At least four mobile units should there. In Japan, they have this Koro Tanta and Ako Tanta - Black Tent Theatre and Red Tent Theatre. They have travelled all over. They have two trucks. They open it up and it becomes a stage with all lights and sound equipment. Our folk theatre companies were travelling that way. I think, that can be done. That will be a better investment rather than creating so many theatres all over, which I do not think will be possible. We have to get money for that. The upkeep of those theatres is also an issue. Who will be looking after them?

Also, we are seeing that the focus should only be on tribal and folk culture. No, we should also include classical, but the thing is that we should be able to take the best in any performing field, which has come up, in the field of music, theatre and dance. Why should the good art be confined to the urban centres? As you rightly pointed out, it should go to the rural areas also.

I have performed in the rural areas and in small towns. I have seen that the response is far greater there than it is in Delhi or Mumbai. So, they are starving. They want to see good theatre and appreciation is also there, but the means are not there. These Centres can facilitate that. They can take the best of whatever has happened there. The Akademis and cultural institutions should be the recommendatory bodies. They should recommend and formulate these programmes and vice-versa. The best from the tribal and rural should come to urban centres to educate a person like me who lives in Delhi or Jaipur. That should be there. That end flow, the constant across inflow should be there. I have worked with Wheels in Rajasthan and have created plays. This is for the first time that for 20 years, a play has still been happening. That education was there because I got an opportunity to interact with tribal and rural culture.

The other suggestion of roping in schools and Nehru Yuva Kendras and panchayats is excellent. We should see to it that there should be active participation of these institutions and they should be there along with ZCC. Thank you

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. Those were very useful suggestions.

SHRI S.K. MISHRA: I forgot to mention one thing. We had in Haryana shown Habib Tanvir's Al Kazi to village audience. There were 5,000 people and right through 3 o'clock in the morning, there was pin drop silence to listen to it. It was one of the plays of Habib Tanvir. I was wondering how the audience will react. I had called rather suggestive dialogues and all that, but the rural audience had reacted very well. There is a need for giving them their share of exposure.

SHRIMATI AJIT KAUR: In Assam, the whole theatre groups travel in trucks along with lights, wires, tents, chairs and acoustics. Every time they go to a village, people from about 10 neighboring villages collect their for as long as 2,3, or 4 days and then, they operate everything. All these electricians, acoustic people, the people who pitch tents work for 24 hours a day. So much of enthusiasm is generated by the audience that they work for 12 months a year and go round the whole of State and the neighboring areas even.

If there is a vision like M.P. Vasudevan Nair has created, in every village, there is some poet, some theatre person or some writer who was born there. Shri Vasudevan Nair has selected a place called Thirussur where Thunchan was born. This is amazing how he has created the whole thing. It was thought about by the Kerala Government. They could not implement it for forty years. Then they thought that they must find a mad person like Ajit Kaur and they found Vasudevan Nair. He sold 16 of his own houses and built this centre. Also he says that he was the editor of Matri Bhoomi. He propagated it that a child who comes on the poornima day or night and writes the first alphabet of Malayalam on a takhti, he will be the best scholar Thousands of people have started coming. It has grown into a township. It is just amazing to see that. Such experiments can be done in every small place because some writers, some poets must have been born there once.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

SHRI Amol Palekar : I just wanted to have a little clarity about these mobile units which should be given to or are created by the ZCCs because we seem to be little bit confused on one issue. When we talk on folk formations and folk culture, the strength of folk forms and folk culture is the bare minimum expression. Its expression is extremely rich, but with no fanfare of settings and lights and all those things that we do. Folk form has the strength of only a single person. Mr. Kamalakar will be able to share that with me and express it probably better. If you take a folk form of tamasha in Marathi, the sutradhar comes and takes a round and say 'Oh! My God, what a magnificent palace'. While there is nothing, we start believing that it is a palace. That is the strength of a folk form. What we tend to do is that when we take the folk form to urban cities, we try to confine him into a proscenium arch theatre, give all the paraphernalia of lighting, music and electrical equipment etc. So, are we really enhancing that or are we taking it away? Similarly, when we take our theatre or our urban forms to the village chaupal, by taking all this paraphernalia, are we making

it that much more difficult for the common man there, who are simply used to having gathering at chaupal or any place which is available by taking all these heavy equipment and making it difficult, as you mentioned about having Japanese theatre and all that.

In Maharashtra, Marathi theatre is the only theatre in the world which by its concept and existence is a mobile theatre. Nowhere else in the world, theatre is so mobile as it is in Maharashtra. There is no concept of a house. The play does not open like Westend or anything. Then, it is performed only in one theatre. In Marathi theatre, the opening performance is in Mumbai, the next may be in Thane and the next one in Pune. It is a travelling theatre all throughout. It has been practiced over ages. How they do it in one small bus is to be seen and believed, but my point is that if a very nice synthesis between all these things is to be achieved, then are we trying to put emphasis on wrong things? If Amjad Bhai is to be taken to the rural areas, do you really need all the lighting and heavy equipment and everything, which is necessary in a city auditorium. Why I am saying this is because I just attended a very wonderful concert by T M Krishnan in Chennai in Kala Kshetra. Apart from the concert, which was fascinating, I was more fascinated by the fact that it was performed with absolutely traditional old style with only simple mikes in an open area where the sound quality was not amplified or magnified. It was so beautiful and so original that listening to the original sound of Amjad bhai's sarod is something which could be taken to all those places and not the paraphernalia and therefore, making it a grand event.

Similarly, when we bring them to the urban cities, tribal people and their art needs to be projected to us because we are ignorant in cities about it, but when we bring them, is it necessary to package it like this and make it into an event where under the glamour and glitter, the original soul is lost? What I would like to say is how to keep the balance.

SHRI Bhanu Bharti : I am glad that you brought it up and it gives me an idea of it. Amol, I am the person who has been working with tribal and folk artists for thirty years now. I am well familiar of the mobility of the Marathi theatre, which you rightly pointed out here. Kamalakar bhai and you will agree that they need some kind of an infrastructural support and they do carry that along with them. They need certain things. While travelling with the kind of sound system and mike, I have seen those plays performed in Mumbai and also in smaller towns, what transformation takes place.

Another thing is that the point is well taken that our tribal or folk culture has that kind of flexibility where time and space is treated the way as you said that he goes round the stage and says how beautiful is this palace. I went to perform a play in a very small town in Rajasthan. You believe that there were 5,000 people all around. They were even on the tree tops. These people listened to it without amplification of my sound. We did not get any such support. The organizers had promised that we will get the mikes and all that, but that support was not there. We were stormed. I know how I came out of that. I had 16-17 people with me, which included girls also. I know how I brought them out of that situation. So, let us be practical. Let us not idealise that kind of situation. When Amjad bhai goes there to

perform, do you not think that there will be 20-30 people sitting there; there will be 5,000 people sitting there.

SHRI Amol Palekar : I have absolutely no quarrel with amplification and all that. What I am trying to say is that my fear is that like the original mandate to the ZCCs was not to have their own structures and we have seen that South Zone Cultural Centre has one of the most beautiful space and they still complain that there is no space to store 2,500 paintings. Similarly, if you create these kinds of assets and give them light and sound equipment, instead of being utilized properly, the corruption being the base for all these areas, we will have to see whether it would not be mis-utilised and misused. That is my apprehension.

SHRI Bhanu Bharti. : We can go in greater details. Some experts can be there to design these units to see how much is needed.

MR. CHAIRMAN: In short, the point is that these mobile units might have some uses, but they should be used judiciously and should not constitute an excessive capital expenditure, and where possible, we utilize modern technology.

SHRI MAHAPATRA: Here, chaupals have been mentioned. I have also witnessed quite a lot of performances, which is equivalent of what is called akaras in tribal areas. Now all this attention and other things should not be on what should not be considered travelling tents and other things. Only those forms which can still be held in open air can be taken. For example, they are now doing street theatre of 3-4 people. It is in the urban centre that they are performing. They are performing it in Bhubaneswar. I have tried out in rural areas also chau, which is the same form and at Baripada only in Mayurbhanj district. Like other two forms of chau, it has been taken even outside India, but they have also performed in tribal areas because it is in the open air because they do not need any proscenium theatre. What you need at the most is a screen and behind it, they dress up on their own. They wear on their own. They are not costly things. They change their costumes also when they go abroad. In fact, when they first went abroad, they fumbled. I know about it because I am speaking from my experience as I have done the maximum possible for taking chhao not only to all India audience but also abroad. They have also performed in tribal areas and also in akaras which are suitable, without too much of sophistication of dress or space or screen. Only those things can be thought of.

Amol is very right in saying that you cannot take all those sophistications into rural areas because folk form of culture is best performed in in situ wherever they are. I know that having worked for at least 30 years now in tribal areas because in each folk form, sometimes a song, a dance and a ritual function are there. It is a triad. Jawahar talked about only those forms, which can be taken to chaupals in rural areas and with small bricks, it can be done in a chaupal in the rural areas. That is a very nice idea because panchayats and others can help there. There are a lot of villagers who still come and watch. When chhao was performed in a village akara in tribal areas, there were 5,000 tribal people who came from other villages

because they also perform. They are used to singing and dancing and they took different themes and performed. This is what I wanted to share.

SHRIMATI Rita Sinha. : Amjad saheb, when we perform a programme, we have to see what is the audience that we are attracting. You cannot say that you should have light or you should not have lights. If you want to rouse interest in urban audience, then very primitive kind of thing does not attract them. They will just start walking out of the hall. You will have to make interesting what you want to show. It is not an educational class. What you are basically putting up is something which must interest your audience. This is something where you require people to pay attention. You have to then see how that attention is going to be grabbed. If you are going to rural areas where people are not expecting all that, you can take a programme without all that. But where there is expectancy, you have to give it. Otherwise, your audience will walk out at the time of performance. When Republic Day Parade used to take place in Lucknow, they used to ask for two tribal dances. Now, those people went without mikes. After two parades, they were eliminated. They were doing their rituals as they do in their villages. Everybody said what is all this. After all this dum, dum, dum, suddenly there were two silent kind of processions going on. They just got eliminated from that. From next time, we started giving them mike and everything, and everybody started appreciating them. You have to also see what the audience is.

SHRI Bhanu Bharti: Exactly, Aah! Gram Jeevan Bhi Kya Jeevan Hai. We are having all facilities of sitting in towns like Delhi and we want to deny them to those people. If this kind of work ever is there, I am not trying to impose anything. I am sorry Amol, from a person like you, I cannot expect that I am asking to impose something which goes against the very aesthetic of a form. I am not trying to say that you impose something from outside. So, why can't we provide them certain facilities when we are performing? When we are doing our work, we need it. Why should not they have access to light? They may reject it and they may not want to use it, but I am not asking you to impose anything from outside. That access should be there. Let them decide not to use that.

SHRI Amol Palekar : If I have given the impression that no light or mike should be there, that is not the idea. The idea is whether you are going to create an asset which is not required. The basic minimum light and mike and sound equipment is, of course, required. But by creating a mobile unit, it will have to be decided which light should be there, how much should it cost, what should be the mike, what should be its price, whether it should be cordless or not and all that. We are getting into a dangerous area with all these things. Therefore, I just wanted all of us to be clear about that. That is the intention and not to deprive them of anything.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I think, we have not created adequate appetite for lunch. Let us proceed for lunch.

(LUNCH BREAK)

## 14th December 2010 Post Lunch

### (AFTER LUNCH BREAK)

MR. CHAIRMAN: We will start with Shri Hukam Singh of NCERT.

SHRI HUKAM SINGH: Sir, NCERT is looking after different subject areas like mathematics, social science etc. and we have been developing national curriculum framework and also syllabus in different subject areas. For popularizing science, we have organized science exhibitions at State level and national level. Recently, we organized 37th Jawaharlal Nehru Science Exhibition in Jaipur. Wherever we have been organizing these science exhibitions, art and culture has been reflected by the students of respective State. Since students and teachers have been participating in these exhibitions, they have been reflecting art and culture of the respective State. Since I am looking after science and mathematics in NCERT Extension Programmes, in my opinion, if we want to go to grass root level, as per your opening remarks, for reflection and dissemination of art and culture, the orientation programme is very essential. India has been the world capital of spiritualism, art and culture, and knowledge. Still we are world capital of spiritualism, art and culture, but due to some reasons or the other, we are not going at the grass root level, which is your concern.

When you were even looking after the North-East region, you were very serious and took a decision and asked NCERT to organize different training programmes in the North-Eastern States. As Head of mathematics and science, we organized nine training programmes and we reached at the grass root levels. Therefore, if you want to create awareness about art and culture, the orientation programme is very essential. We have all over the country specialists in art and culture and folk. The only thing is that we have to identify them from different parts of the country. If we could identify all these resource persons, then from each State we can identify some trainers to become master trainers. I think, we can reach at grass root level. For that purpose, when we are organizing all these programmes for developing master trainers, we should develop some material in different areas, whether it is art, aesthetics or any other area. Then definitely, we can reach the grass root level with our Indian heritage

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much for your contribution. Shri Jaipal represents the Government of Tamil Nadu. You have been heavily criticized along with South Zone Cultural Centre.

SHRI JAIPAL: Sir, as far as Tamil Nadu is concerned, we are very happy at this juncture. The Minister of Culture is setting up a Committee. In the letter to the Government, it has been pointed out that the Committee has already done some amount of work and held consultations with the persons for other items also. In this respect, I would like to say that the Committee has done a lot of work by giving 22 recommendations. As far as the Government of Tamil Nadu is concerned, we agree to most of the recommendations, except a few. The number one is the need to restore the original idea behind the South Zone cultural Centre. We agree with the recommendation, but more emphasis has to be given to

the rural programmes, but at the same time, by conducting the programmes in major towns, the urban dwellers will also get an opportunity to know about various art forms practiced in rural areas. Now-a-days, the younger generation in the urban areas does not know their own traditional art forms. One Action Plan has to be worked out by the SZCC.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Why can this work of giving exposure to urban audiences of rural art form not be undertaken by the Department of culture in Tamil Nadu? I know that you are doing it, but don't burden the ZCCs with what you are already doing. If you change your statement that let urban slum audience or mofussil towns, then we can say 'yes', but otherwise to go to TTK Auditorium and produce all these people for the benefit of that body, I do not think is the job of the ZCC. But if you can set up an artificial stage or temporary stages, then people can come and see.

SHRI JAIPAL: By urban areas, I mean headquarters because we have conducted a number of programmes in Coimbatore two or three months ago.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I really want Mr. Jaipal to convey this message to your Government that ZCCs should be sent in villages, small towns and urban slums. That is where they should be performing. They should never be sent in the Raj Bhawan nor should they be sent in Tamil Nadu House. Yet that is where they are doing most of their work. There is also a strong complaint that SZCC is excessively dominated by the Government of Tamil Nadu and that we should have people who are brought in from the other States and that your programmes should involve these people going out to other States. They should be present in Karnataka, Andhra Pradesh and Kerala.

Kerala is up to a point getting them, as we were told by the Kerala Kala Mandalam man yesterday and Mr. Venu today. There is some involvement of Kerala and not enough of other States. When I knew your Centre first under Sheela Priya, then there was a deep involvement in Pudicherry. I have gone to Waynad for a function that she did, which was a massive thing, up in the tribal hills of North-East Kerala, to get absolutely top flight artists. I am talking about the painters sitting there and painting. All these children around were watching how they were doing it. Then there were stage performances from all over India and the local audiences were there. It went on for three or four days with different type of activities for each day. That sort of an atmosphere is required to be recreated in the SZCC. We have given you an absolutely magnificent place. The cultural capital of Tamil Nadu is Thanjavur. Even I am myself from that place. I think it is true that we thought at one stage of doing it at Thiruvayar. Then, there was some objection. So, we brought it to Sangeeta Mehal. There itself, you have spent a huge amount of money on further building up things over there. But in the performance of the SZCC, even according to Mrs. Leela Samson who were here and the visit that Mr. Amol Palekar has made, there is much to be desired. So, I do not think that you should allow the SZCC to be treated as an extension of the Department of Culture or of Raj Bhawan. It must have its own life. I am told - I do not know whether it is true - that the State Government does not really have a major budget

for culture and therefore, the SZCC budget is being diverted to State Government programme.

SHRI JAIPAL: No, Sir. This year, they have allotted only Rs. 14 lakh. We have given a corpus of Rs. 2 core. Out of that, they have given Rs. 14 lakh only.

Further, I want to express my views. For the past three years, I have been seeing the activities of SZCC. There is no relationship between the SZCC and the Department of Art and Culture. Secondly, there is no interaction between the SZCC and the Department of Art and Culture. A number of points are discussed in the Programme Committee. I think, Mr. Venu attended the meeting of the Programme Committee where we had given a number of views. You please conduct periodical meetings. You please conduct Programme Committee meeting once in three months or once in six months and the review should also be undertaken. Then, all the points, which were discussed in the meeting, will not be there in the minutes of the meeting. How did they ignore that? I could not understand it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is your explanation for the poor performance? We had one Mr. Ramamurthy yesterday. He has done very good work.

SHRI JAIPAL: Shri Ramamurthy is a gem. Mr. Paninda Reddy and Mr. A C Mohan when they came to Chennai, they met the Secretary of Art and Culture and interacted with the Department of Art and Culture. The SZCC should interact with the Department of Art and Culture of the States concerned and not with that of the Tamil Nadu Government only. For the past three years, this has not been done.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Why was that so? Who has chosen the Head of SZCC? How is the appointment of him made?

SHRI JAIPAL: I do not know about appointment.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Rupa is not here.

SHRIMATI Rita Sinha: Leela Samson is a gem, but she has been teaching in our academy. She has her own interest and there is hardly any time with her.

MR. CHAIRMAN: She has only very recently temporarily being asked to head it. There are other people who are being transferred very frequently.

SHRI JAIPAL: Today, there has come a team of Tamil people from Malaysia. They have borne the air flight charges. We just met Mrs. Leela Samson. Regarding activities and other things, we wanted some funds. She just said 'no'. But we could not understand why she said like this.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Anyway, we have just had a visit to SZCC. Mr. Palekar is here. I would request him to say a few words about the SZCC.

SHRI AMOL PALEKAR: I have submitted my observation in writing to the Committee, but

I would like to share a few points. There is absolutely no harmony in SZCC between Additional Director or Associate Director and the remaining staff. Now I come to the appointment of the Director and Associate Director.

SHRI JAIPAL: I think, it is not Associate Director, but Asstt. Director.

SHRI AMOL PALEKAR: Okay. I am not very conversant with the bureaucratic hierarchy. So, pardon me.

SHRI JAIPAL: They are having Assistant Director from the revenue side, but I do not know why.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Who is 'they'? Is SZCC represented here?

Okay, that is fine that you have given it in writing, but just listen to what Mr. Palekar has to say, and convey this to Raj Bhawan so that we can get some corrective action even now.

SHRI AMOL PALEKAR: One does not know how and who does the appointment of Asstt. Director. I was told that the Asst. Director had come to Thanjavur only four times in his entire tenure. Secondly, on the operative level, the staff, programme officers and all that were there. I was really shocked to know that if a troupe is invited, say to Karnataka, the SZCC sends a troupe to Karnataka for performance. It is a normal practice world over that if I am invited by Kamlakar Sontake to come to make a performance, he pays for my expenses. It is a simple rule. I was shocked to know that I am paying money to Kamlakar Sontake or Karnataka Government or whosoever has invited. I very naively asked a question why this is being done. I was also told that there are no accounts for this money which is given for more than two years.

SHRI JAIPAL: One Accounts Officer is there.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is an Accounts Officer, but there are no accounts.

SHRI AMOL PALEKAR: I was specifically told that actually Karnataka Government has directly paid to the entire troupe artists. So, there is obviously a double payment. Now why this is happening is very obvious on the one hand, and on the other, it has come to such a low level and such kind of an affair. We really cannot understand how this can be rectified.

I want to give another example which I shared with people who were here yesterday. The Cultural Centre was holding some wonderful camps with artists, with painters and all that. They had created some wonderful art work. They have exhibited it in one or two rooms there. It is an excellent work. I was pleasantly surprised to find a Laxman Pai painting in that. So, I asked them how they could manage to have Laxman Pai collection with them. They did not know who Laxman Pai was nor did they know the importance of having Laxman Pai collection. But Laxman Pai had visited one of the workshops in the earlier days and all this had happened. Then, they also told me that there are many such works. In fact, they

said that they have about 2,500 works. I asked them what they were planning to do with such work. If there is such an excellent response, why have you stopped those workshops? They said that they were to stop it because they did not have a place to keep those paintings. On the one hand, you have one of the most beautiful space and your Centre, and on the other hand, you do not have space you claim and because you do not have space, you also stopped the activity which was going on nicely. I could not understand the logic behind all this. I do not know what the remedy is for this.

SHRI JAIPAL: As Far as I am concerned, there is no technical staff. By technical staff, I mean the one knowing about the performing art and the concerned field. Only the ministerial staff is there.

SHRIMATI Rita Sinha : Actually, how an art gallery is supposed to operate is like a tape gallery. You keep a painting over a period of time and then when its value rises, you are supposed to auction it. From that money, the gallery is maintained. The problem what we had also faced in Allahabad is that there is no system within the Government for a Government Gallery to auction and without a proper system, we are all afraid to do it. If I do any auction, tomorrow there will be an inquiry against me for sure and they may say that it could fetch this much or that much. With the result, on one wants to touch that area without clear-cut guidelines as to how that auction is supposed to be done. So, you cannot go on collecting paintings for ever.

SHRI AMOL PALEKAR: I fully understand that.

SHRI JAIPAL: You can give exhibits to the concerned museum also.

SHRI AMOL PALEKAR: Or you can take help of Lalit Kala Academy. They are the best qualified about how to deal with this and to take these exhibits or works of art to exhibitions or other parts. Share it with other people etc. etc. Instead of doing that, we stopped that activity completely. I do not know whether those paintings are listed and recorded properly and what is happening to them.

SHRI JAIPAL: That is due to lack of interaction between the Department of Art and Culture and ZCC. The Director of ZCC should interact with the Department of Art and Culture Directors of the Zone itself at least.

SHRIMATI Rita Sinha : How will they help in the storage of paintings?

SHRI JAIPAL: We can give the paintings to the museum.

SHRI AMOL PALEKAR: The Asst. Director is from Tamil Nadu and from Tamil Nadu Cadre.

SHRI JAIPAL: He is from the Revenue Department.

SHRI AMOL PALEKAR: And your Government is responsible for appointment and also

taking him away. So, whether he is from the Revenue Department or Forest Department, I am not equipped to understand that. What I am trying to point out is whether Tamil Nadu Government and Department of Culture are in touch with all this what is happening or not and what the remedy or solution is. This is my concern.

SHRI JAIPAL: They never consult us.

MR. CHAIRMAN: 'Us' means who?

SHRI JAIPAL: The Department of Art and Culture.

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is an anarchic situation where the SZCC is really responsible to move on and their own internal organization system starting from Raj Bhawan is not able to interact with them and since the sums of money made available are so petty compared to the demand, there is total neglect of the place. If the Director, as in the case of Ramamurthy and other gentlemen you have mentioned, had been interested, then they could have seen to it that life was imparted to the organization, but some system must be there. He does not know, but we can check out and find out because if the Department of Revenue in Tamil Nadu decides who is going to be the Asst. Director, it is an absolutely bizarre system of appointing him. I suppose this is being done in the absence of a decision by the Governor as to who is the person they should recruit properly as the Director of the Centre. I think, they are having difficulty in finding people who are ready to go to Thanjavore. Even Thanjavur people who were shifted to Madras do not want to go back to Thanjavur. That is the difficulty. We were lucky that Mr. Ramamurthy and his family is originally from Thanjavur. So, he is happy to go back to a place where he had studied and had his friends; otherwise, they are not able to find them. There is not a scientific system in the Ministry to be able to assist or undertake this.

Anyway, thank you for your written comments. We will take that into account. We may not always agree with them.

SHRI Mahapatra : Now, just to let our honoured colleagues here not get away with the impression that Thanjavore seems to be a really worrisome thing, but that is what Amol had visited. I had visited three others, like North-East Centre at Dimapur, Allahabad and Kolkata. The picture is so different. They have been performing so well. I had got a very good impression.

The point is that there is no connection between the headquarters State and the ZCC. Earlier, it was said that headquarters State was sometimes getting bulk of the utilization as everything is being concentrated there. Then, what is the relationship of the State Department of Culture at Chennai and Thanjavore? This should not be the kind of performance. Is there no meeting of ZCC, whatsoever? You are representing the Department of Culture. You know that this is a major State and we, this Committee, are interested in knowing what kind of gloomy picture is this. I have seen the note of Amol's visit and seen how bad it is, both in

terms of performance and finance. How long is there no permanent Director? Are you aware of the SZCC?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Can we ask you, Rupa, why is it that things are so poor in the South, while they are better elsewhere? Can you give us an explanation?

MS. RUPA: Sir, I would imagine one of the reasons is that over the years, they do not have a Director who belongs to that place. The Director stays in Chennai and visits Thanjavur occasionally, which means that there is no real system of control.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Who is recruiting the Director and what is the procedure?

MS. RUPA: It is the Governor who is recruiting him. They are supposed to send a panel of three names. It is put up to the Minister. Invariably it is the person who is put at the top in the panel who gets selected. But they have not been able to find anyone at all because in this particular time, they have had no applications at all, which is why they were compelled to place an advertisement so that more people could apply. I think, finally some names have appeared this time, but that process is not yet complete. I feel that is the reason and background why there has been a specific problem in Thanjavur in the SZCC, which perhaps is not the case with other units because there has always been someone who belongs to that place and wants to improve on it. I think, this non-resident Director has made a lot of difference to the way it operates.

SHRI AMOL PALEKAR: Ms. Rupa, I also wanted to know why the Ministry of Culture has over-looked these lapses or they have not been able to question that accounts of over Rs. 2 crore have not been submitted for more than two years or so. Nobody seems to be bothered about that. Nobody seems to be asking questions why this is so. At my level, I am totally inadequate to deal with this, but when I asked them, they said that that particular Government did not give us any accounts. There were no receipts and nothing else. So, I asked whether any reminder was sent. They said 'no'. So, it is very obvious that nobody is really bothered and interested.

MS. RUPA: I would imagine that these ZCCs are autonomous institutions and have their own committees. They have a Finance Committee also. Since it is an autonomous institution, it is supposed to take its own decisions. As far as its annual accounts etc. go, I would not know exactly, since I have been looking after the ZCCs for only less than a year now. But the issues regarding SZCC have been coming.

The complaints which have been coming to the Ministry have been addressed to the concerned Director and they have been asked to follow up. Perhaps they have not got back now. I think, this is something which we will now very carefully follow up. But I think it is because of the very autonomous nature of the institution that they can take these decisions on their own. They are supposed to follow up and say that proper systems are followed when advances are disbursed and also accounting for it. I think, we need to find out actually what

had transpired. We will find out.

SHRI AMOL PALEKAR: I was even told that nobody from the Ministry of Culture has ever come for any meetings. They considered it as apathy. They said that Delhi is not interested in us.

SHRI ANAND SHUKLA: No, Sir. There is a different kind of problem. I have just studied what is happening in SZCC. Some ten or fifteen years ago there was one Governor. I had gone there once, not in capacity of Director but otherwise. What I saw there was that all the four or five States send a list of programmes to the Director and he is not supposed to apply his mind and has to attend to those programmes by just sending the troupes and money will be paid to the State Government and they will disburse the amount. The SZCC is not contributing to anything. They are just working as a post office, sending the money and giving back the receipt and all that. This work can be done even by an LDC, and the Director or the Centre is not required. This has been happening for the last ten years in the SZCC. They are just following the orders coming from the Ministry of Culture of the State. It is on need basis that they send the groups and that is it.

Those State Governments have been paid money from the Centre and they have not sent the receipts back. This is happening in SZCC. This started from Raj Bhawan. It was decided that you will not apply your mind and the Ministry of Culture will send a list, you requisition it and send the troupe and forget about it. So, actually it is only disbursement of the money through the Culture Department of the various States that is done by the cultural Centre. There is no initiative.

MS. RUPA: Whatever corpus is there, that is put in the bank account. When the interest comes, in proportion to how much the States have given in the corpus, the interest is distributed among them. That much programme is compulsory for the ZCC to perform in that State. It appears that only Tamil Nadu has paid up. So, they must have calculated the interest in the year and they have given that much amount to them saying that this is your due and you tell us what you want to do and they did not give them the receipt. This is what must have happened.

SHRI Mahapatra: That is the problem. I have been a member of the Programme Committee. I have seen how these people from various Governments, representative of Culture Department of various States talk. They say that our share is so much and we must get so much back and that defeats the very purpose of having a zonal concept of not confining it to a particular State, but that is how the things are happening.

MR. CHAIRMAN: But then at the time of reviewing their work, they are submitting annual reports etc. So, there should be some authority somewhere to check whether the programming that is done is in accordance with the objectives that exist. Mr. Sarkar's explanation is that nowhere and never was it stated in black and white - in paras and sub-paras - as to what

these ZCCs should do and because it was never stated in black and white as to what they should do, after initial period when we did not need to say what they should do because they were all being told by the Prime Minister as to what they should be doing and were doing this, and after that, things went into a sort of limbo. Then, Ananthmurthy Committee Report came and they held on to the Ananthmurthy Committee Report for three or four years. Then, the Congress Government returned and they said that take it out and dust it out. From that, they created a set of mandatory programmes as recommended by the Ananthmurthy Committee, which they then sent out as the required activities of the Centre. To some extent, they are observing this and to some extent, those are not being done.

Finance is a major constraint. So, we will look into all this. I think, as we come towards the end of what we are doing, we also want to interact with our Zonal Cultural Centre's Directors, but we will do that separately, after this meeting is over. So, I will first ask Shri Kamlakar Sontake. Then, I will ask Ustad saheb to do the summing up.

SHRI KAMLAKAR SONTAKE: Thank you, Chairman Sir. I missed your opening remarks, but whatever I gathered listening to all my colleagues and dignitaries around, I think I should go back to the initial stage when the ZCCs were established and found. There was no mandate as such, but we had a sense that there is a passion which is directed and motivated directly by no less than the Prime Minister of India. That message was carried through till the last person working in the ZCC and that made things work. I should also thank the then Prime Minister and Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar for almost every month we used to meet personally the Prime Minister. The occasions were absolutely insignificant, but we were probably the people who mattered in the administration of culture during that era. Then, for the first time, there was an attempt to invite the Ministers of Culture at Vigyan Bhawan to take the review of whole thing about where and how the ZCCs were operating, whether they are beneficial, whether there are any lacunae, whether anything needed to be supported, both on administrative as well as artistic front.

At that time since it was a learning period for the ZCCs literally, most of us were ignorant about art forms of our zonal States. We were trying to get ourselves educated. As a result, in the brochures, publications, there were really major flaws in respect of some of the forms of art, the photograph says one thing and the form is different. States felt very insulted and said that if this goes on as a record and is treated nationally and internationally, it will bring a great deal of defame. So, let us be very cautious. The issues which are being discussed here that the States are not responding or we are not either provoking them to come and join hands. They were there then but not to this extent. At that time, fortunately, the South Central Zone Centre was the only Centre which was overwhelmingly praised by all participating States. I think, I should go back because one of my colleagues was also appointed, leave aside from which cadre he was - Revenue, IAS, UPSC, theatre or arts - but I was following the ZCC mandate religiously.

First and foremost, so far as the programmes are concerned, we decided as to who is my

audience. We decided as to what we are supposed to do and it was not only the folk, performing arts and tribal arts, but even the classical arts, right from the music era, to the dance, to the vocal and even classical paintings. As a result, we were humble enough in our approach. Every third day South-Central Zone was in action in one State or the other. We went modestly to people like Amjad Ali sahib and Raja Radha Reddy. You name one and we went to them with the same attitude and humility. We went to the folk artists also. We never distinguished between folk and classical. Amjad Saheb is here. I was fortunate to utilize his blessings and services for the cause of the ZCC. Every year Amjad sahib gave us, along with two of his colleagues, time to come and conduct Bharatiya Vaadya Mela for 15 days. He used to come for three days, they were basically workshops, guide the people and then come at the concluding time for another three days. During the remaining time, Mukesh and other people used to take over. Can you imagine Duraiswamy Aiyangar, who came to inaugurate the workshop, kept on sitting and told me not to disturb Khan sahib. He said, let him continue, formal inauguration is not at all importance. Let me enjoy. He literally kept out of sight.

There was a child whose hands were not reaching the either side of mridang, but he was very mischievous. Khan sahib was saying that I will have to give him something. Mahapatra sahib, he composed a whole thing and gave lead to the young child who was not even able to reach the two sides of pakhawaj. Now tell me, is this not an event? Will this not become a news item? All the gurus used to come to the workshop to see what came out of the workshop? I made it a point that I had no problem with the States. This workshop was held in rotation, first in Andhra Pradesh, then Karnataka, Madhya Pradesh and Maharashtra. We had a galaxy of people who joined this workshop. Some of them were padma award winners. Some of them were vidvaans. Some of them were literally children who had laid their hands on some instrument for two or three years.

Then, we did a workshop of string instruments. Again, he obliged us. I never had any problem. He never discussed with me and I never ventured to say what we will pay to him. I knew that I should put him in the best guest house or at a star hotel and pay for the air fare. Literally whatever envelope I gave, he accepted it. He also directed our Republic Day Parade programme for the first time - Drums of India, String Instruments of India. It was a miracle to be seen where 300 string instrument players from all over were assembled. There were tribal instruments in one year and only sarangis another year. How will the sarangis be included in the Republic Day Parade because the people have to sit squatting and then play it? I told that Khan sahib is Director and he knows, you talk to him. Literally Khan sahib and his colleagues used to sit in Rabindra Rangshala under the sun and they innovated things. Should we tie it around the waist? I said that if it is not accepted there, we will leave it.

Regarding amplification, I got it cleared from security. Along with four of my boys, I was also dressed up like the artists and we carried the cordless mike. At that time, I was challenged because Kanishka's accident had happened with that cell only. I said that Khan sahib is with

us, nothing will go wrong and we take the responsibility. Dr. Manmohan Singh was there. He said that 'on my risk, I am allowing them. Please allow them to carry it.' Such wonderful programmes have happened.

I will tell you another thing. My objective was not there to take the urban artists to urban centres ever. So, I persuaded the artists that instead of one show, I will give you chain shows. You will do one programme at one place and another at 300-350 kilometers away and the third and fourth programmes elsewhere. Then, you will go back to your original place. I used to pay them honorarium. It used to be only for one show, the first one. For the remaining shows, they never bothered about the honorarium.

Mr. Sontake - contd.

हमें यदि आप अच्छे दर्शकों के पास ले जा रहे हैं जहां अमजद भाई का किसी ने साज देखा नहीं है, they are thrilled. उनके यहां कला प्रकार्य के लिए हम सर्वोत्तम सुविधाएं देते हैं क्योंकि वहां की आम जनता का वह हम बनता है कि हम जो रिकॉर्ड्स सुनते हैं या खान साहब की सीडीज सुनते हैं वे लगते कैसे हैं। Right from the Droger Rego, there were the technicians brought in all the while and they never charged me exuberantly like events or commercial things. They said that when you are going to smaller places, we are with you. Just pay for whatever expenses are due.

इसको हमने पारंगत महोत्सव नाम दिया था एक्सपर्ट्स का महोत्सव। यह भी हम हर साल हर स्टेट में छोटें शहरों में तीन-तीन शहर लेकर करते थे। हमारा उद्देश्य स्पष्ट था कि जहां ये लोग पहुंच नहीं सकते हैं अमरावती कहां जाएंगे, we literally hunted for the art forms. We were restless. अमोल जी प्रोग्राम करना मेरे लिए बहुत आसान बात थी। प्रोग्राम करने के लिए प्री-होम वर्क मेरा सबसे बड़ा काम हुआ करता था। स्टेट द्वारा नॉमिनेटेड प्रोग्राम कमेटी मेंबर्स को इतनी ज्यादा रेसपेक्ट दी जाती थी कि शायद जिन्दगी में उनको किसी ने उतना रेसपेक्ट नहीं दिया होगा। What I used to do was that I used to go to headquarter of my each participating State, call on the Governor with advance request and requirement of mine and then sit in the office of the Director (Culture) and get all the Programme Committee Members invited there. We used to have two sessions there running into six hours. तीन दिन तक मेरे प्रोग्राम कमेटी की मीटिंग चलती थी। I used to draw 26 to 27 events or festivals. उसके लिए अलग-अलग ग्रुप्स आर्टिस्ट वहां रिकमेंड किए जाते थे। In addition, I used to have filler of one or two, in case somebody absents or not in a position to perform, so that I do not have to go back. All the terms and conditions of the artists used to be revealed in that particular meeting so that the Programme Committee, which is recommending, is aware whether such and such artist will accept that or will create a problem. No artist recommended was in a position to deny our programme during 7-8 years.

उनको फिर हम छोटे शहरों में ले जाते थे, जैसा आपने अभी बताया कि पर्ई की पेंटिंग कहां से शुरू करें, I do not know where to start, लेकिन हम मॉडेस्ट थे और हम स्टेट के सम्मान को बनाए रखते थे। आर्टिस्ट्स की पार्टिसिपेशन के बारे में कंप्लेंट नहीं आई। क्लासिकल डांस का जोड़ महाराष्ट्र में उतना नहीं है इसलिए वहां से कम पार्टिसिपेशन हमने किया नहीं। When it used to be for youth, it was based on youths and when it used to be for parangats, it used to be the best of available at that time. Then, I never

repeated artists, barring a few like a workshop cannot be done by anybody else. So, I have to give the share. उस वजह से यह हुआ कि किसी मेजर आर्टिस्ट ने कभी कंप्लेंट नहीं की क्योंकि आज नहीं तो कल हमारी बारी आने वाली है। I used to invite them to the festivals. It used to be just paying them TA/DA, paying their air fare and they used to stay for 3-4 days. I must compliment the situation at that time. I had rapport with the Chief Minister, Minister of Culture. Believe me that

कोई फेस्टिवल हो या इनगुरेशन हो उसके बाद मैं दूसरे शहर के लिए निकल जाता था and the Minister of Culture used to host the remaining festival on my behalf. It was a great honour. I never had a programme where the gallery was not full.

Secondly, not only the Governor of the host State, who used to be the Chairman, but all my participating States' Governors were also involved in the Programme Committee and Executive Committee meetings. आप कहेंगे कि उसका प्रोटोकॉल होता है। I used to convince Dr. Shankar Dayal Sharma why don't you get Karnataka Governor. Yes, then why Karnataka Governor only, I will also get Madhya Pradesh Governor. There used to be four Governors present in one meeting. Somebody suggested that next time Dr. Shankar Dayal Sharma will not come to Karnataka. So, Professor, you organize your next Governing Body in Vidhan Sabha, Karnataka and then, we will invite everybody. Don't you think that if so many Governors are present on one State, the level and status of your Centre would be elevated automatically without consideration of your funds, corpus or anything? I think, whoever is chosen as the leader of the Centre, he has to be a passionate person. He has to be a person who should be very modest and at the same time, he should be very competent and even assertive to take decisions and execute them properly. He should have the capacity to enroll the goodwill of people around and even the goodwill of bureaucracy.

When we used to plan our programmes, it was exactly one year in advance along with dates. Our Centre used to cover only four to six districts in one State. I was not ambitious to go to all States so that my total State is covered within four years. Then, wherever we used to go, I used to allow my Programme Officer, my Project Officer and Programme Assistant to work independently and collectively. They used to inspect the venues and they used to inspect and finalize, along with the State bodies, the residential areas, other media etc. Everywhere we used to issue 1,500 to 2,000 invitations by name for every programme तो जो आर्टिस्ट वहां बैठा है उसे इसमें सम्मान नहीं लगेगा कि I have invited so many people to attend his programme. Then, nobody bothered about the artists and the form and the content, but we used to be cautious enough to give to them the best available in that particular category. As a result, the credibility of the ZCC, through us and also other Centres, increased because we used to invite their programmes also. There was Sheila and Aditi and we used to have great interaction. Blindly, she used to invite groups from my Centre and we had a reciprocal arrangement. At that time, inter-zonal festivals were not existing. It gave word by that programme that we should have inter-zonal interaction also.

This pre-home work placed us very comfortably कि हम जिस तालुका प्लेस में हम जा रहा है सतारा में जा रहे हैं गुलबर्गा में जा रहे हैं it used to be second home for my administrative staff. वहां जा रहे हैं तो कम से कम 25 लोग उनको पहले से जानते थे वहां जाने के बाद किसी ने भी हमें एडवांस नहीं पूछा है because we had a reputation. Then, it used to reduce my expenditure because of this pre home work. We never allowed a vested interest of anybody to prevail. I used to be awfully strict person. There was not a single stricture of audit on my Centre for seven years. I used to invite them in my absence to conduct the audit. I used to have great persons like L S Narayan as my Finance Committee Chairman, whom others treated at that time as the most difficult person. He laid down the rules and principles and we were completely safe in his hands.

Now, apart from administration, I will try to go back rather again to almost twenty years. What should be the objective? I think, it must be definite. What we want to do should be pre-decided. What are our objectives? Folk arts now-a-days are no more folk arts, which we used to dream or which we might have seen in our heydays. There has been coming a great change. The films and TV has widely influenced the folk forms and in order to exist in the modern society, they have to compete with these forms and media. As a result, लावनी मंगनियार कालबेलिया के नृत्य और नौटंकी के अंदाज बदल गए हैं they have adapted to modern days, लेकिन हमें उससे कोई शिकायत नहीं होनी चाहिए। जैसे पयूजन के लिए भी क्लासिकल में कोई आपत्ति नहीं मानता है यह परिवर्तन आएगा। If the art forms have to survive, this change will come and they have to allow changes within themselves, but by retaining the vitality by retaining the values which were there when the forms came into existence. मुझे लगता है कि यह परिवर्तन अच्छे हाथों के द्वारा हो रहा है इतना ही हमें गार्ड करना चाहिए।

अब रह गयी बात कि प्रजेंट हम कहां करते हैं और कैसे करते हैं। Let us not take all the festivals, events or exhibitions to the capital cities in the country. वहां बहुत कुछ अपने आप चल रहा है वह बुलाया जाएगा खान साहब को कोई भी मुंबई में बुलाएगा बंगलौर में बुलाएगा लेकिन गुलबर्गा में उनको कोई नहीं बुलाएगा। गुलबर्गा ले जाना मेरा धर्म है। नॉर्थ-ईस्ट में शायद उनके प्रोग्राम्स नहीं होंगे मुझे लगता है कि उसे कराना हमारे जोनल सेंटर का धर्म है।

, d ekuuh; I nL; %हमने हजारों बार उसके लिए निवेदन भेजा है लेकिन अभी तक कोई काम नहीं हुआ है।

SHRI KAMLAKAR SONTAKE: =उसके लिए आपने एक मीटिंग रखी थी राजीव जी के साथ 26 जनवरी के बाद, wherein he at that time had an initiative and it was almost written down that we identify 150 classical artists of A grade and A+ grade, give them every year 15 programmes and there should be an agency who should host these programmes and ZCCs lost that opportunity. यदि वह हो जाता तो हमारा सर अपने आप बढ़ जाता ये लोग केवल लोक कलाकार नचाने वाले नहीं हैं। इनके साथ बहुत बड़े मादे के लोग भी हैं। मुझे लगता है कि हमें इस पर फिर से विचार करना चाहिए कुछ गिने-चुने लोग है जिनको जरूरत नहीं बड़े मेंटिनेंस की लेकिन कई सारे माहिर आर्टिस्ट्स हैं जिनको साल में 15 शोज भी नहीं मिलते हैं। अगर 15 शोज, at the cost of welfare state, मिलते हैं, तो मुझे लगता है कि वे अपने शिष्यों के प्रति और ज्यादा ध्यान दे पाएंगे। They will not discourage their students and disciples and own children to go to that form of art or faculty.

Secondly, I think that circumstances have changed. I think, we are thinking a bit in the air about what is happening in the States. There were no cultural policies at the State level. States are becoming extremely conscious now. Sports Policy is taking shape. In smaller States also, a budget up to Rs. 100 crore is being given for sports facilities in every State. If it can be made for sports, why should they not make it for culture also? I think, our next round should be with the States. We should strengthen the States' facilities so that what Amolji has feared, and rightly so, does not happen. We should not make infrastructure our responsibility. Let the States make these facilities because facilities will remain with the State. It is not the responsibility of the ZCC. They are there to identify the best from each art form, groom them, if necessary, and promote and propagate them at all levels. मुझे लगता है कि ऐसा करने के लिए एडमिनिस्ट्रेशन को सेंसिटाइज करना बहुत जरूरी है। यहां तो मैं बहुत परेशान हू कि डायरेक्टर कौन एप्वाइंट करता है कैसे वह रहता है? यदि वह ओकेजनली हेडक्वार्टर जाता है, then I think, culture is not a thing which can be administered by foreign bodies like that. You have to be involved into culture, like what Mr. Bhanu, Amol bhai and most of the artists have been doing. दिन-राज आपको उसके बारे में सोचना चाहिए उसमें जीना चाहिए तभी आप कल्चर के लिए कुछ कर सकते हैं वरना वह केवल लिप सर्विस होगी उससे कोई भी लाभ नहीं होगा। रिपोर्ट शायद आप अच्छी लैंग्वेज में लिख सकेंगे लेकिन आपका उद्देश्य सफल होगा ऐसा मैं नहीं मानता हूँ।

महोदय ट्रेनिंग की जो बात है स्टाफ को ट्रेनिंग की जरूरत है। स्टेट्स से लोग आते नहीं हैं, it's a fact, जैसे रिकॉर्ड के लिए कोई आईएएस डाल दिया जाता है स्टेट का रिकॉर्ड देखने के लिए पनिशमेंट के तौर पर, वैसे ही यह एप्वाइंटमेंट आईएएस कैडर के लोगों के लिए मानी जाती है कि जो 500-700 करोड़ रुपये का बजट हैंडल करता है यहां आकर तीन या चार करोड़ के बजट के लिए कोई सिरदर्दी नहीं लेना चाहता है क्योंकि यह जोनल सेंटर लाइमलाइट वाला है, अच्छाई आपकी कोई करेगा नहीं बुराई आपकी बहुत ज्यादा होने की संभावना होती है।

So, we will have to probably sit quietly and give a very serious thought as to what sort of manning we look forward to. They should be competent people. If it is an IAS and interested in art, there is nothing like that because they are the people, whether we believe it or not, who put things together.

Then, accountability is a matter of great concern. आज वे गुप्स में भी नहीं हैं, कला करने में भी नहीं हैं। कुछ स्टेट्स में प्रोड्यूस की जाती हैं, स्टेट से आपकी 30 लाख या 40 लाख का अनुदान मिलता है उसके लिए काम किया जाता है। एडवांस में उसे लेटर आते हैं, and you start doing the film. How are you going to create great or good films? महाराष्ट्र में थियटर के लिए भी 15-15 या 18-18 लाख का अनुदान एक-एक प्रोडक्शन के लिए मिल रहा है। Centre is another thing. वहां वे अस्तित्व के लिए झगड़ते हैं सीएम के साथ भिड़ते हैं, They have influence over the electorate. महाराष्ट्र सरकार को हमने रिक्वेस्ट की है कि कम से कम डिस्ट्रिक्ट लेवल के लिए ओपन इयर थियटर एंड क्लोज्ड ऑडिटोरियम बनना चाहिए और 350 का एक एक्सपेरिमेंटल ऑडिटोरियल बनना चाहिए। I think, ZCC should not be the objective of this body; we should also try and reach out to the State. It can be formulated by the Chairperson. I would request him to sensitise the State Governments also to equip themselves.

दूसरी बात मैडम ने और भानू भाई ने अभी यहां यह कही है कि फोक आर्ट्स के चाहे वह दशावतार हो नौटंकी हो या मुराकथा हो दायरे में रहने वाली बात आजकल, यहां तक कि रूरल एरियाज में भी, उतनी सत्य नहीं है। अगर आप मॉडेस्टली दायरे में करेंगे तो शायद वहां का दर्शक भी उसे देखेगा नहीं। **You will to rather market it properly and marketing of arts is a bad word, but there is no harm in marketing your own thing.** यदि आपकी अच्छाइयां लोगों तक पहुंचनी है, तो वह करना मुझे लगता है कि अग्रक्रम होना चाहिए क्योंकि जोनल सेंटर का प्रोग्राम करने का तरीका उनकी विधा एप्रोच रोल मॉडल होना चाहिए बाकी सारे लोगों के लिए।

**I think, octave is a great thing that the Government of India has done. There is no parallel to it.** उस तरह का हर जोनल सेंटर का प्रतिवर्ष एक प्रोग्राम बने अपने अंचल की कलाओं को लेकर, जैसे नॉर्थ-ईस्ट के लिए किया है, **that programme should be showcased with 150 artists all over India so that the specialties, the best things, of all the arts including classical and modern theatre should be taken to places.** जो मैडम ने बात की, असम का कॉमिश्नियल थिएटर प्रोफेशनल के आगे गया है, **They travel self-sufficiently. They go the places three days in advance.** वे सात-सात शोज करते हैं उनके टिकट नहीं मिलते हैं और कलकत्ता थिएटर का जो रिवाल्विंग स्टेज वाला मसला था, रिवाल्विंग स्टेज की तरह दृश्य बदल, एक के बाद दूसरे में, नौ-नौ दृश्य एक ही समय में दिखाए जाते थे।

**SHRI AMOL PALEKAR: I am just supporting what you are saying by giving an example. The Assam Theatre had shown Titanic.**

**SHRI KAMLAKAR SONTAKE: The first and foremost thing is that they are committed people, motivated people. They are not employees of the people. Not only that, they earn their livelihood with respect, with the help of that theatre. They earn money, but at the same time, one-fourth of the earnings of these theatre companies go to the establishment of school buildings and running charities.** यह किसी को पता नहीं है लेकिन यदि असम जैसा स्टेट इतना कर सकता है तो बाकी लोगों को करने में मुझे लगता है कि कोई आपत्ति नहीं होनी चाहिए। मुझे लगता है कि कलाकारों को खासकर हमारे लोक कलाकारों उनको जैसा है वैसा रखो, ताकि वे म्युजियम पीस की तरह रहें, दरिद्र रहें हम लोगों को दिखाएं कि **look, this is our heritage.** यह बात बहुत गलत है और सोशियोलॉजी और डेमोक्रेसी के लिहाज से भी बहुत गलत है। मुझे लगता है कि उनका स्तर और उनकी जीवना बढ़ाना होगा।

**For doing that, I have certain ideas. Please see to it that these people are involved in local panchayats in one capacity or the other.** उनको भी सरपंच की जरूरत पड़ती है, अगर कलाकारों को इंप्लॉय करते हैं, खानदानी कलाकारों को, तो उनकी जीवनी भी चलेगी और उनका आर्ट फार्म भी। अभी यहां पर एनसीईआरटी की ओर से पेश किया गया, **I think, this is high time that art education and personality development should be part and parcel of our schooling and school education and the moment we take this decision and start the training at their level, many of the things will be solved.**

**Secondly, education of art is not an easy thing.** गुरु-शिष्य परंपरा, यह नाम बहुत बड़ा और लचीला लगता है बड़ा ग्लोरियस लगता है, सभी गुरु लोग क्षमा करें, **all gurus are not great teachers.** हमारे लिए जो टीचर्स थे नेशनल स्कूल ड्रामा में, सिवाय एक-दो को छोड़कर, **they were never trained to train theatre students.** उसी रास्ते पर हम आगे चल रहे हैं, हमने कभी टीचिंग नहीं सीखा है, हम अंदाज से कर रहे हैं लेकिन अनाड़ी से थोड़ी सी ज्यादा जानकारी के साथ कर रहे हैं, इसलिए मुझे लगता है कि यूपीएससी और आईएएस के स्तर का प्रशिक्षण

की व्यवस्थापना अगर भारत में आर्ट्स के क्षेत्र में आता है तो कई सारे मसले हल होंगे। मैं अपना उदाहरण देता हूँ मराठवाड़ा यूनिवर्सिटी अत्यंत पिछड़ा हुआ क्षेत्र, वहां मैंने लंदन से आने के बाद थिएटर्स डिपार्टमेंट शुरू किया। The boys were not even considered for Class IV employment in the State क्योंकि ओल्ड हैदराबाद कल्चर लेकर वे हैदराबाद स्टेट से आए थे, उनकी भाषा अच्छी नहीं थी, बोली अच्छी नहीं थी, उनका अवेयरनेस अच्छा नहीं था लेकिन after the establishment of Theatre Department at the university, there was completely a total awareness about how to present yourself, how to put up yourself and how to rather place yourself. It was only because of the theatre that it came in their lives. Today, I am proud to say that people coming from village and far-flung areas are dictating the film industry and theatre industry and TV industry of Marathi, Maharashtra and Mumbai. That pocket is much enriched because of them.

Then, I introduced theatre at college level also and it is drawing great talent, even by paying the fees. They are not totally supported by the UGC or the Government. I think, we should think in totality. We will have to fix our objectives as to which art we want to take where. What would be its dayra and in what background we want to present it. Language is the problem with most of the folk forms. We try to attempt that also by appointing right people to write good synopsis of each form. उनका ओरिजन किया है, उसका कला पक्ष क्या है, उसका प्रदर्शन पक्ष क्या है? इसके परिणामस्वरूप दक्षिण के किसी भी फार्म के बारे में मुझे उत्तर या मध्य भारत में कोई प्रॉब्लम नहीं आई क्योंकि लोग अवेयर हो जाते हैं। एकाउण्टेबिल्टी वाली बात एडमिनिस्ट्रेशन में आनी चाहिए और जोनल सेंटर में हम केवल डायरेक्टर की बात कर रहे हैं। It will not only be the Director who will be in a position to give right direction to the Centre; it will have to go to the last person, last employee there that he is a person of art and culture, though he is entrusted the work of a clerk or an accountant.

Thank you very much.

**SHRIMATI AJIT KAUR:** सारा फोक ओरल है, ज्यों-ज्यों भाषाएं मरती हैं यह भी मरता जाएगा। महापात्रा जी कैसा कोई बिरला होगा जो ट्राइबल एरिया में जाकर उन सांग्स को इकट्ठा करे, उनको लिखे या अब्दुल गफूर दर्शन जैसा हो जो गांव-गांव घूमकर लिखे। अगर हम इनको नहीं लिखते, तो साहित्य का मतलब यह भी है कि जो फोक सांग्स हैं, उनकी रिकॉर्डिंग कर लेना चाहिए, उनको लिख लेना चाहिए, वे मर जाएंगे, अगली जेनरेशन को नहीं मिलेंगे।

**SHRI HUKUM SINGH:** For promoting art education, the NCERT has recently started Art Department and materials are being developed and they are being used at school level.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Now, Ustad Amjad Ali Khan may please offer the concluding remarks.

**USTAD AMJAD ALI KHAN:** I am grateful to Mr. Mani Shankar Aiyar that he gave me an opportunity to be here. I had forgotten that I have been so much involved with ZCC. Thanks to Sontakke sahib, who has refreshed the old memories. वह इनका पैशन और जोश था कि हम लोगों ने बंगलौर, हैदराबाद, पुणे आदि जगहों पर कार्यक्रम किए। हर जगह दो-दो सौ यंगस्टर्स अपने-अपने इंस्ट्रूमेंट्स लेकर आ जाते थे कि कैसे कराएं, क्या कराएं। अभी यह भी बात उठी थी कि डायरेक्टर्स को कैसे ट्रेनिंग दें। मेरे ख्याल से सोनटके साहब के पास कुछ यंगस्टर्स पहुंचाने चाहिए जिनको वह यह सिखा सकें कि डायरेक्टर कैसे बनना है, डायरेक्टर के पीछे कैसी फीलिंग्स होनी चाहिए। वह बहुत ज्यादा जरूरी है।

मैं भानु भारती जी का आभारी हूँ इन्होंने मुझे इस लायक समझा कि मुझे भी कोई सेवा देनी चाहिए। कल्चरल मिनिस्ट्री से मुझे आज तक कोई सेवा नहीं मिली है। अजती कौर जी फ्यूजन म्यूजिक को पर्सनली पसंद करती हैं और फ्यूजन म्यूजिक आज के दौर में बहुत महत्वपूर्ण बन गया है। मैं समझता हूँ मुझे सभी तरह की आर्ट्स को एनकरेज करना चाहिए, चाहे वह फोक हो क्लासिकल हो, फ्यूजन हो, जो कुछ भी हो सुर और लय में होना चाहिए। जहां तक आप फोक म्यूजिक की बात कह रही है, लिट्रेचर खत्म हो सकता है, लेकिन मेलोडी खत्म नहीं हो पाती। मैं बहुत सारे गाने ऐसे गाता हूँ जो सुने हुए हैं, लेकिन शब्द मुझे नहीं पता है। मैं एक ऐसी धुन गाता हूँ जिससे राजस्थान का स्वरूप नजर आ जाता है, लेकिन शब्द नहीं पता है क्योंकि हमारी दुनिया बिना शब्दों की है, राग का काम है। जोनल कल्चरल सेंटर्स कैसे तरक्की करें, जिन-जिन लोगों ने पहले अच्छा काम किया है, उन पर एक रिसर्च होनी चाहिए। बंद करना तो बहुत आसान बात होती है इसे बंद कर दीजिए, उसे बंद कर दीजिए, लेकिन जो चालू हुआ है, उसे अच्छी तरह से कैसे चलाएं। हमारे इस तरह के वर्कशॉप्स क्लासिकल, फोक फ्यूजन आदि मिलकर बहुत कुछ हो सकता है। मुझे ऐसा लगता है कि स्पोर्ट्स इतना ज्यादा पापुलर है कि सारा वर्ल्ड उसमें ज्यादा इंट्रेस्टेड है शायद उसकी वजह यही है कि वहां हार रहा है, कोई जीत रका है। आज दुनिया हार-जीत, गैबल में ज्यादा इंट्रेस्टेड है। हमारी क्रिएटिव फील्ड में भी एक हार-जीत क्रिएट करनी पड़ेगी जैसे आजकल रियल्टी शोज हो रहे हैं। यंगस्टर्स का हमें कंपटीशन डेवलप करना चाहिए और उसमें जो बच्चे जीतते हैं उनको कुछ पैसा मिलना चाहिए कि यह जीत गया और वह हार गया। आज शायद दुनिया इसी में इंट्रेस्टेड है लोगों को इससे वाइकेरियल प्लेजर मिलता है कि उसने उसको मार,, उसने उसको हरा दिया है। हम सब मिलकर इस पर सोचें। राजीव जी का जो सपना था, हम लोग उनके सामने भी ले गए थे, उन्होंने देखा था, सुना था। हम सबके आपके साथ हैं, इस प्रोजेक्ट के साथ हैं।

I shall be very happy and honoured to do anything for this cause.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

May I say a big 'thank you' to all of you for having participated in today's meeting? All that you have suggested will be reflected upon and incorporated to the extent possible in our recommendations. Thank you.

I would request the ZCC Directors to please stay on. We will have a discussion after the tea.

## 14th December, 2010 Post Tea

### (AFTER TEA BREAK)

MR. CHAIRMAN: What I would request all of you to do is in the light of the discussions that you have heard here and in light of the recommendations, we have already formulated recommendations - this means additional recommendations that have been made here - I would like you to give us your written comments as to whether you agree with the recommendation, whether you think that the recommendation should be differently worded or whether you think that the recommendation should be totally deleted. In addition, any other recommendations out of your own experience you would like to see reflected in the Committee's Report.

Now, I am going to ask Mrs. Sinha to try and consolidate with the help of her other advisors within the next 8-10 days because they have got programmes of visiting some of these Centres, but let us say, by the end of the month, you should be having in your hands a consolidated list of additional recommendations that have emerged in the course of not just last two days but also the discussions that will take place tomorrow. So, a consolidated list of additional recommendations which will be appropriately drafted by you to fill into the format of our existing 22 recommendations, if you could send that out to them also, it will be better.

You can feel that the purpose of this Committee is not to target you, but the purpose of this Committee is to see how your own activities can be enhanced in a constructive sense. So, I would be at least as interested in what you as practitioners in the ZCC have to say as to what any aira gaira coming in here making his comments and disappearing for the next 25 years has to say in this matter. So, I am taking it all seriously. Even if we have been very disappointed with some of the work of all of the ZCCs, we are not disappointed with all of the work of all of the ZCCs or even all of the work of some of the ZCCs. There are good elements and there are bad elements. There are departures from the original concept which in themselves are not bad because they are departures. What we want to know is what is the rationale for your departure and how can you make that departure consistent with the original objectives of the ZCC. Although nobody has commented really on the introductory part, that is effectively the charter we are giving to you. Therefore, you have the freedom to suggest changes in that charter as well.

I would expect you to comment in some detail on the recommendation. You do not have to send me saying you agree with recommendation no. 1 and you disagree with recommendation no. 2. Where you agree, you forget it because that is the recommendation. The way you want to make an amendment to the language or you wish to see deleted, then you give the reason for that also. Where you wish to add something of your own, just feel free to say that this is a supplementary recommendation which you hope will emerge from the discussions over here.

Having said that, just in the order you are sitting, we could have some quick comments from

each of you. You are going to have your real day in the sun when you write down all these things, even as it is now, you would just run through what you have to say briefly. Then, we will take some note of that straightaway. It will help us orient our minds, but the sooner you are able to send it out to Rita the better. I do not want you to waste so much of time on the existing recommendations. The existing recommendations are already with you. You have been sitting over here. I presume that some of you have taken some notes. So, if there is any suggestion that you anyone has made, which you found noteworthy and therefore noted, you can even now start responding to that. You do not have to wait for the consolidated list to come. I would hope that with respect to the existing 22 recommendations as also the Introductory Chapter, whatever you have to say on that will be with us within a week. We aim that you will be giving us your comments by 21st. All of you are computer literate. You can easily send in your comments to Amit Goyal's e-mail address.

SHRI S.K. MMAHAPATRA: In addition to what the Chairman said, it will be very helpful if you can send information for the last five financial years, ending with financial year 2009-10 regarding the financial position - the corpus fund, how much is going into development, how much is going into establishment, the effect of new pay structures etc. and what kind of imbalance is emerging. You may also tell how are the finances working, audited accounts and everything including financial audit and if you have an internal audit and all that. In other words, we want a five-year picture of individual ZCC. I am not sure whether Department can really provide that. What I got in the morning session when Chairman asked, there was no ready answer. That way, for the same period, or maybe six-year period, you may tell how long has been the tenure of a regular ZCC Director because we are feeling that being the key person, dynamism has to come from him. Kamlakar Sontake said so much about how we are going to get in future. I am not one of those people who believe that the golden age only existed in the past. It has to be the mandate of this Committee to also create a golden age for the ZCCs now and also for the future. We know this vacancy position. I am thinking of a situation where we not only get the right kind of Director who has his way of casting net wide, appointing perhaps such committees as they are doing for the Central Universities. That is a matter of detail and we will be deliberating more on that. Like, there should be zero tolerance of vacancies. If the tenure of a particular ZCC Director is ending on X date, it should be decided well before that who the new person in his place would be so that he is able to take position in time.

These are the two points which I wanted to raise. You may also add how you find your Governors etc. If you have anything to say on this, you may.

?

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one more point which I should have made earlier. Before inviting your comments, I want to acquaint you with the structure of the Report as it is proposed to be. We have Chapter I - Introductory Chapter. There will be a last chapter

which contains recommendations. In-between we will have 8 chapters, one chapter each devoted to each ZCC and one Overview Chapter that Mrs. Rita Sinha will be writing. We will subsequently decide whether we begin with the Overview Chapter and then put down your individual ZCC chapters or the other way round. Mrs. Sinha and her colleagues are engaged in preparing a format as to what is the information we should put into each of these chapters to make them comparable so that the Overview Chapter is also structured in the same way and what it says generally derives from what has been stated about your respective ZCCs.

Now, all of you have received a questionnaire from us to which you have sent, I understand, detailed replies and your detailed replies as also the information provided by you will figure with each chapter as an annex to that chapter. It will not be at the end of the book; it will be part and parcel of that chapter itself. So, you are free to also contribute yourself to profiling yourself, but we are free to modify your empty boasts and to criticize what you have failed to criticize. So, rather than having us do this, I think it is in your own interest that in a critical manner and in a non-laudatory manner and constructively you tell the truths about yourself. You were to yourself provide us with you think should go into the chapter about it. One exception to this would be the South Zone Centre because I do not see anybody there who is capable of providing this. But we could opt to appoint and ask for Ramamurthy to undertake this task, after perhaps even requesting him to go down to the South and collect whatever he did, and he can, over the last nine years or interact with you even in Delhi on that. If there has been a good Director since Mr. Ramamurthy, I think we should also bring him into the exercise if we can, but that should facilitate the work that is being done here.

Now, I may tell you that the overall in-charge of doing all the drafting is Mrs. Rita Sinha, but she is also undertaking to do the Overview Chapter. So, ultimately she will be drawing from it. I am not talking about initial drafting and approval because that is what the three members exist for. We will be reading through these chapters word by word over a period of two days on 16th and 17th. So, we will be going through that in very great detail. So, yours is only a draft, but I am co-opting you as draftees in evaluation of your own respective Centres. The four of the chapters are being drafted by Mr. Amit Goyal. These are the North Zone, the West Zone, the South Zone and the South-Central Zone. Ms. Seema Nayyar will be doing it for three of the Centres which are the ones she has visited with Mr. Mahaptra - North-Central Zone, Eastern Zone and North-East Zone. When your inputs have come in and their inputs have been generated, the chapter that relates to a particular member of the committee will be sent in advance to that member so that you can work on it yourselves to see what you want to add, delete or subtract. Then, that will make our task when we meet on 16th and 17th that much easier, but that is how I want you all to really be our collaborators and not our targets in the writing of this report.

That said, we would like you also to review the material you send us to see whether there is additional statistical or other information that you can give and the conclusions that

you are coming to, but I would like you to substantiate it with respect to the information that you have supplied, which would be in the annex. If you want to say, for instance, that most of our programming is actually directed to rural areas, mofussil areas and metropolitan slums and we have done a good job of it, you are welcome to say that you have done a good job, but you will have to substantiate it and also indicate whether there have been variations in this, was it higher when it started, did it have a dip or was it on a low plateau when we started in the eighties and then had a rise and fall and another rise and what, therefore, would be your analysis for all this variation over time. As the only person really who can give us a proper insight into staffing patterns is yourself as also you are the only ones who can give us a proper idea about pay-scale on the one hand and remuneration of the artists on the other hand. It is only you who can make suggestions regarding recruiting procedure relating to Directors and other staff. Somebody here mentioned that Director should be selected from outside, but the Director himself would choose his own staff. Is that a good idea? Is it a feasible idea? We have to think about all this because I understand that as a result of court decrees, some of you have got trade unions functioning within your organization. So, this may not be feasible, but I am only drawing you attention to such a suggestion have been made before us.

We would also like to have your objective thinking on the question of background of the Director. It is a question of personality, inclination and aptitude. Rather than necessarily the background as I have discovered to my startle surprise from some of you that you can even belong to so uncultural a service as police and you are very good ZCC Directors. In itself, the background would not either qualify or disqualify you, but how do we have a recruiting procedure that would enable us to throw the net as wide as possible. There is the practice in commercial formations, public sector undertakings to set up a Search Committee. Then, they discover from all over the world their own nephew as the most ideal person to recruit! This danger is always there, but nonetheless whether we could devise the Search Committee method to keep some element of objectivity in this. These are the kind of organizational, structural personnel finance issues so crucial to effective running of these bodies.

Does it make sense to have registered societies which are 100 per cent financially dependent on the Government? What was the purpose of making it a registered society unless it becomes, to some extent at any rate, self-finance? If you were self-financing, then you can make your own rules, including how you are going to auction your paintings, but if you are an IAS officer saying how do I become ZCC Director, then maybe you have to be a little careful about how you organize your spectrum auction! Otherwise, if you are a cultural personality running a ZCC and find yourself in possession of a Laxman Pai cartoon because that is effectively what it must have been and you sell it for Rs. 30-40 lakh, so long as you do not take the money yourself home and put it into the kitty, it should be acceptable. Again, one does not know what the rules and regulations should be.

In the light of my introduction, I will have to confess that I am a Rajiv Gandhian. I have

no embarrassment in saying so. I do not think that these ZCCs require any mandate other than what was given to us at the start. If you do not want this mandate, then you find another mandate and another institution, but I think that mandate is valid and so has been said by most of those who had come here. But that mandate was never explicitly stated; it implicitly came in that Zakir Hussain Memorial Lecture, which I have very extensively quoted from. Can you derive yourselves a mandate for yourselves based upon that language? It does not necessarily have to be bureaucratically written; it can have the flow of rhetoric that is there in that speech, but at the same time, there are very practical elements that need to come into it. Can we provide as it were a charter for the ZCCs against which they measure their achievements and they plan their programmes? Try your hand at it. Each of you can try it separately. Send us in your particular chapters and then we can marry the different wordings together. Since it is ultimately you and your successor who are going to use that mandate, we can creatively write anything that we want over here, but ultimately it is you who are going to use it. So, if it were a user-friendly mandate that does not depart from the original concept but was aimed at clarifying that concept and putting down, how is it that you would be implementing it year after year? That would be a very good thing.

I think into your own programmes, you should work in the recommendations of the Ananthamurthy Committee as eventually sent to you. I think, Rita, our own recommendation will have to take into account the Ananthamurthy recommendations and very possibly, we may even have to have a chapter on that because it was a necessary intermediate step in this 25-year journey. I think, it will be very insulting to Mr. Ananthamurthy and his colleagues if we were to bury it altogether, but Seema Nayyar worked with this Committee. I have never read its report. I think, you should read this report to see whether they went off at a tangent of their own or whether they had any concept and what the original thinking was.

I was very flattered to learn after the report was published that the entire testimony which I had placed before that committee was recorded, transcribed and then annexed. Or, was it annexed to bury it? Or, was it annexed to rejuvenate it? I have a suspicion that it was annexed in order to bury it. I have not heard of any Ananthamurthy recommendation that derives from the testimony I had given. So, I am not at all sure that I will be happy about what the Ananthamurthy Committee has said, but I am sure that some of what he has said still remains valid. If other things appear to be a departure from the mandate, you can look at that. We need not critique it and I do not think anyone of our readers is going to take the trouble of reading the Ananthamurthy Committee Report. So, it is for us to do some cherry-picking from Ananthamurthy Committee Report and that cherry-picking has already been done because Ministry, some four or five years ago after the report was prepared, did the cherry-picking and put down what you are supposed to do and you have actually been acting on that mandate. You are more of a Ananthamurthy ZCC than you are a Rajiv Gandhi ZCC, but that is the only thing that has ever been written and sent to you.

So, you can refer to that in Ananthamurthy Committee Chapter or you could bring it into

your Overview Chapter that there was this Ananthamurthy Committee Report. So, we have a reference to the committee report having existed in the original introduction and perhaps into that original introduction, we may describe that it remained buried for a few years and then it was dusted off and then it became the mandate for the ZCCs and we leave it at that until their own assessments of how we have been acting on those cherry-picked recommendations come and then you can make your assessment in your Overview Chapter of what has Ananthamurthy meant to the ZCCs. These are the kind of things which I need your assistance about.

Now, you may speak one by one for five or six minutes during which each of you can share your immediate reaction. If you want a little more time, you feel free to continue.

SHRI Mahapatra: I would like you to give a background. I have seen the three Centres and I know them. Shri Matilal was the Director (Culture) of West Bengal.

SHRI MATILAL: Sir, immediately before, I was the Director (Culture) of West Bengal Government. Basically I am a State Civil Service officer. I was the Special Secretary to the Government. Through a circular when applications were asked for, I applied for the post. The Governor of West Bengal, through the process of interview, has selected me. I have joined as Director of ZCC on 1st July this year.

Sir, what you said just now regarding the last five years' financial thing, I would submit that we have already provided that for the last five years. We have already provided all the accounts in the format.

MR. CHAIRMAN: But what we want you to do is to make your own comment on that. You have provided objectively the information. What are the conclusions you derive from the information you have supplied?

Then, please do not go through the recommendations. That you are going to do anyway. If you want to react to the comments which have been made here, you may do so.

SHRI MATILAL: Sir, I want to make comments on two or three recommendations made here.

The first thing is that core areas of ZCC should be the performing arts. As far as I have seen through the records of ZCC, they have not deviated from it for the last ten years at least. The expenditure also shows that, since theatre rejuvenation and documentation were also there, nearly 65-70 per cent has been spent on folk art forms. These folk art forms have been shown and showcased in the remotest areas also.

MR. CHAIRMAN: One of the more interesting things you could do is to provide a map of your zone and in that map if you can put blobs or squares to indicate how many different parts of your zone you have been present at and the ZCC has performed. You give as much information as you have got. For example, if you have been in Purulia six times, you put it

in red, but if you have been to Bolpur only three times, you can put it in some other colour. So, you make your own categorization and say that this has been very intensive, this has been medium intensive and this has been low intensive and where we do not find your blob, it means that you are still to make your presence over there. For Kolkata and your own auditorium, maybe you should have a separate colour coding but that information should also be made available to us. Do give us, if you can, a largish map of your zone with all this indicated. It may have to be a pretty large one, which we may have to fold to put in our report, but it will give us a clear idea of what is happening in the Zone and the extent to which you have been out in the country as it were.

Then, with regard to cultural yatras you have undertaken or are undertaking, put them in dots so that we know the route that you have been following within your Zone or interzonally. In the old days, all of them were doing it. There was a Narmada Yatra, Desert to Sea Yatra, M to M yatra etc. Where you have these chain programmes, you indicate when you undertook them.

SHRI MATILAL: The structure of ZCC is also a very difficult area. As a Director in the State culture Department, I had seen that it is left to the State Governments to select the members. The State Governments recommend the names of each member. The State Government normally recommends the names of the famous persons in the State. The situation is like that they never attend the meeting. They take little interest in their ZCC. I have seen that at least in the Eastern Zone. They take very little interest in participating in our programmes or involving themselves in our activities.

Regarding the infrastructure at the ZCC headquarters at Kolkata, I will send my recommendations in writing.

SHRIMATI Rita Sinha :Sir, he should also tell us his recommendations.

SHRI MATILAL: Madam, I will send it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: He will be sending the recommendations in writing. We are not taking any note of what you people are saying because this will be a way of disciplining you into sending it to us in writing.

SHRI MATILAL: Sir, I will just elaborate something which you are not in the know of. Regarding infrastructure of the headquarters, I entirely agree with you that it should not have been done. It should have been done at Shanti Niketan. The utility cannot be overruled. We hold only two or three programmes in a month in headquarter auditorium. They are very low cost programmes, just to make it vibrant.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The cost of these programmes is the Director's time because each of your 48 performance in the auditorium during the year is with some dignitary. You have to receive them and offer a bouquet. You have to present to him a shawl and all that.

SHRI MATILAL: Not necessarily. This is just an ordinary programme. Previously there was no advertisement. Now I put some advertisement in the newspapers that such and such programme is being organized. People come and go. Only at the end of the programme, we present a bouquet to the Chief Organiser - the Director of the theatre or the main actor of the theatre. If I am not there, it is presented by my Deputy Director or Programme Officer. Whoever is present, he gives the bouquet.

For the rest of period, we give it on rent. Previously, we were getting less, but I have the target of earning nearly Rs. 50-55 lakh because we are not given any non-Plan allocation by the Government of India. In fact, the salary is given from the interest of the corpus. When the corpus was originally made in the nineties, interest rate was 13-14 per cent and it is 7-8 per cent now. So, salary component has gone up. Salary-wise the recommendations of VI Pay Commission were introduced by my predecessor. So, we have to generate revenue from elsewhere. That is a major thing. So, from the auditorium, we can generate revenue. Sometimes, the corporate companies also take it on rent. Sometimes, they give us Rs. 2-3 lakh for the entire day. In this manner, we generate revenue from the auditorium.

MR CHAIRMAN: Shri Matilal, I was aware of this. You have inherited it and to that extent, you have become an Estate Manager. Anyway, you are putting it to the best possible use.

How much is the municipal corporate tax, which you must be paying? Your auditorium is just like any other government building. Is it liable to corporation tax or not? How much is it annually? It will be quite huge.

SHRI MATILAL: The tax is not too much as of now. It is liable to corporation tax. I will have to see how much it is. We also pay it regularly, but I cannot say the amount right now.

Regarding Shanti Niketan, where the Centre should have been, when I joined, I found, as our Secretary (Culture) mentioned this morning, it thoroughly neglected. Nobody has looked into it for the last five years. Immediately after my joining, I have started everything there and it has become a vibrant place. You can cross-check it with the Vice-Chancellor of Vishwa Bharati University who is also collaborating with me. It is very near to the Vishwa Bharati University campus. So, it has become very vibrant.

Everyday, there is a folk programme. I am holding Crafts Mela over there. There is Shri Niketan village which Rabindra Nath Tagore had reconstructed. The women of self-help groups from the village are coming to sell their food products during the mela. A kind of food outlet has been given. I have already done a crafts outlet also. From 20th December, there will be a series of programmes during Posh Utsav which will be held and lakhs of people come to Shanti Niketan. They will all visit our Centre.

After joining, I found that there was no publicity at all. Even in Kolkata as Director (Culture) or being an old resident of Kolkata, I knew very little about the existence of the EZCC in Salt Lake. It is located at such a conspicuous area, how they are functioning, what

they are doing, I myself never knew. There was no advertisement. There was no invitation card to go to the audience. Salt Lake area is a very good area. They could send invitation card to all the cultural people of Kolkata as such, but that was not being done. I have started all these things. I have also started the same thing in Shanti Niketan. The entire Shanti Niketan community is being invited to each of our programmes.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Are you an IAS?

SHRI MATILAL: No, Sir. I am a Civil Servant. I have done everything from DM level.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You are a civil servant interested in culture. That is very good.

SHRI MATILAL: You have mentioned time and again about management of staff of ZCC. There was no organizational structure. It was being run for the last 25 years with lot of adhocism and individual Directors were like feudal lords. Whatever they wished, they used to get it approved by the Finance Committee and then Executive Board etc. This was going on. When I joined, I found that my officers are getting promoted every three year which even in the highest service in the country they are not entitled to. In the last ten years, people have got three promotions in respect of their designation but not scales. From the Clerk, one has become Programme Assistant and Programme Coordinator. One Director had introduced that every three-year there will be promotion for all the staff. This organizational structure has complicated things like anything. Sir, as you told, I may give what the organizational structure should be. I have already prepared the Recruitment Rules for all the staff, how they will be recruited, what will be their qualifications and how many people will be promoted from below, how many will be recruited directly, whether they will be on contract etc. Madam, I will send you everything.

These are my views. Thank you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you. This is very constructive and useful. It helps clarify a number of things and certainly enables our report to be more objective than it otherwise would have been.

SHRI ANAND SHUKLA: Sir, two core issues were discussed most of the time. The first was the procedure of appointment of Directors and the Directors deciding the future and working of the ZCC. Most of the ZCCs work is supervised or directed by one IAS officer from either the one who is posted in the North-East or Southern area and he belongs to a particular area and wants to come and was taken with the consent of the Governor, where most of the time Secretaries have no say. The Governor recommends the name and he is appointed, whether he is inclined or interested in cultural field or not, whether he has been questioned for it or not. Like many examples are coming otherwise. This should be completely stopped. There should be a panel of four or five officers which may be sent by the Governor. There is no problem, but the Secretary (Culture) or JS (Culture) or 2-3 prominent people should sit together and ask few questions whether he is interested in art, what is his background, what

is his knowledge about the art and then taken. It should not be that since he belongs to Rajasthan Cadre or Mizoram Cadre and wants to come back and therefore, may come as the Director of ZCC and remain there for six to nine years and does nothing for culture except cutting short his tenure from the North-East. This should immediately stop.

Regarding interference from the Governor House, I may say that most of the Governors have no time to spare for the ZCC. They are busy with their politics of the State. So, they are left with either Secretary or Additional Secretary or some other staff of the Governor's office and they treat ZCC as one of their offices in the Raj Bhawan. Though that is not the problem with NCZCC, but most of the Centres like SCZCC and SZCC are facing this problem because we keep on talking to each other.

Sir, you will be surprised that SCZCC could not hold a governing body meeting for two years. There is something wrong somewhere. So, this should not be the system. The Minister of Culture or Secretary (Culture) should directly have interventions in these things so that these things are sorted out. Otherwise it will happen that NCZCC will become UP Zone Cultural Centre and West Zone ZCC will become Rajasthan Cultural Centre. This should not happen. When I joined, I saw that 75-80 per cent programmes are happening in UP. Now, I am ensuring that our presence is felt equally in all the States. I am talking to Culture Secretary of all the seven States at least twice in a month over telephone. They are all very good and cooperating. What do we want? It is local hospitality and programmes and they are all accepting it. Even as today you were talking, our Seemanchal Yatra of 150 artists is travelling with BSF, Army and Air Force along Pakistan Border at Barmer, Jaisalmer districts. We are camping in the villages with the villagers. We are eating dal-bati and makki ki roti. On the border, all the logistic are given to us by the BSF. The Chief Minister, Mr. Ashok Gehlot, was so happy that he himself came to the Seemanchal Yatra. When I was SP, he refused and said why I should leave from a district to the ZCC, but the day before yesterday, he was in the yatra. He told that I did a right thing. The same thing is happening in Bihar, Uttarakhand and Mahdya Pradesh.

When I am bringing octave, like one of the Directors told in the morning, to Bhopal, then it is going to Sironj, Vidisha and other places also. I told you last time also that when I was SP in Bikaner and folk troupe were to come, I took them to Khajuwala and you asked me whether I used to do it earlier or I do it even now. Sir, I used to do it then and I do it now also and take them to villages because we stress on folk only and do other things also.

It was told that strengthening of headquarter infrastructure was not one of the ideas. There is a programme called Suranjali every day in my Centre where new artists will come and show their talent. Now, we have included Bihar and Madhya Pradesh also. That State is paying their TA/DA, bringing them to our headquarters and doing the Suranjali programme. It has come up so well that the Ministry of Culture in its Annual Report has mentioned about it. Why can it not be done in other States? Otherwise, most of the ZCCs wait for the seasonal

programmes, like Shilpa Mela. So, the total expenditure in eight months is 20 per cent and 80 per cent is spent in November-December. We are not an event management company. We should not come down to that. It should be spread throughout the year in every State, to the nook and corner of the villages and society. I think, I am in touch with most of the Collectors about what is happening. Why should we bring people to our programme; why not we go to places where the people are, like Dadri Mela in Balia, Harihar Nath Mela in Chhapra or Pushkar Mela or Nagaur Fair. We see where the people are there in the countryside and go there.

In Jaisalmer, we are doing the Desert Festival this year. Rajasthan Government has said that you do it. We are also doing even the Camel Festival in Bikaner. We are doing in Narmada, in all the places we are going and presenting ourselves. I think, all the Culture Ministers and Secretary (Culture) continue to be in touch with me and we are doing the best possible.

Anand Vardhan Shukla: The only thing is that the Director, who is interested, should be brought here. Otherwise, it will be a fiasco. Brining an art and literature fellow will be another problem. I know the good people who were sitting over here. Amol Sir knows. They even did not talk to each other, whatever you are talking of running a Centre. I mean to say that you ask one personality about the second, he has his own ideas and says that he is a useless fellow etc. So, it is like that. So, it is better to have a bureaucrat who has some interest, some knowledge, some control and some administrative experience. I have written a 4-page report and given it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: But that does not absolve you from doing all the things that I have asked you to do over the next few days. That will be useful. We will take it in your account. I will like you to write up your own profile for NCZCC.

SHRI MATILAL.: I will do that.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Kamei, I understand that you are from the Indian Postal Service and you are a Manipuri who has dared to cross the border and come over!

SHRI KAMEI: Sir, my wife is from Nagaland. So, I am safe there.

MR. CHAIRMAN: But you are not a Naga yourself.

SHRI KAMEI: I am a Naga myself, but there is a big divide.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Which is your district?

SHRI KAMEI: I am from Tamenglong.

Respected Chairperson, I feel that I am very lucky to take over at such a juncture when a review is going on where we take out the programmes and other things for Centres. So, I feel that I am in a position to improve the things and carry forward the good work

all other Directors before me have done. This is because in the North-East, as we all know - and Sir, you know better - there is so much conflict situation between ethnic communities and others. I feel that the NEZCC has been very successful in acting as the cultural torch bearer of the State. This is not because I am boasting or saying that I am better than others, but the facts of the report which we have sent also will speak that we have covered 90 per cent of our programmes in the rural areas and out of the cities because apart from Shillong and Guwahati, there is no other big town in the North-East.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Can you give me an idea of how the geographical spread you have in the North-East. For instance, you tell the areas where you have gone in Arunachal Pradesh.

SHRI KAMEI: Just last month, we conducted a border area programme in Machuka. Nobody expected that to happen. The people of Machuka were so thankful that we brought a troupe from Manipur to perform over there. The artists also enjoyed.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Last time any ZCC visited Machuka was when the Chinese invaded Machuka in 1962. I have been very deeply disturbed to find that most Arunachalis I have met were youngsters of 7-8 years old when the Chinese invasion took place. Even the present Chief Minister of Arunachal Pradesh has the most happy memories of the occupation by the Chinese. This man Dorji, the Chief Minister, told me that they had brought a 16 mm projector and that was the first time ever the people of Tawang saw a movie on a screen and he remembers it with joy all these years.

Have you only been to Machuka or also to other places?

SHRI KAMEI: We have gone to Morray, Dauki etc., all these border areas. Recently when this tension between Manipur and Nagaland came up, during the Hornbill Festival, for one day, we called all the cultural troupes from all the States, including Sikkim, to perform for it because the Chief Minister had requested the NEZCC. When we had that show for the whole day, the biggest applause was by the Phuntsholong team from Manipur. I really felt that day that the cultural linkage was appreciated by a Naga crowd, while politically they do not see eye to eye. Those boundaries were broken down with that huge applause. They have a Parliament Secretary there. They do not have Ministers. He was telling me that you bring them next time also. This was the sort of role that a ZCC like NEZCC can play in breaking down that artificial or political divide through various ethnic communities or different States that have been there.

We have also been collaborating with other States, like NSD. For the last two years, I have seen the programmes and we have been conducting seminars and workshops and have been collaborating with them, with the regional office in Guwahati. The Centre may not be aware, but we are interacting with the best of academies in the region. In the Finance Committee or the Programme Committee, the participation from the North-Eastern States is such that even the Ministers participate from Mizoram and Tripura. They all come all the

time in Programme Committee. We have a rotational chair. Every year, we allow each State to chair that Committee so that there is a balance.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Is this the practice everywhere to rotate the chairmanship?

SHRI KAMEI: It is not every year. We have it for three years. Also, we have a Nodal Officer from the respective Department of Culture who will act as the Nodal Officer for us.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Is this a common practice? I think, it is a good idea. Please put this into our report.

SHRI KAMEI: Yes, Sir. With this, we have been achieving most of the mandate that originally started. It is a blessing for the region that such a ZCC was started. Otherwise, who cares about bamboo dance? They just see it in the Republic Day Parade and forget it. But now I was told by the Director of Culture in Mizoram that they have more than 200 groups of bamboo dance and if any of the Zonal Centre organizes an octave and ask for it, at the same time, I can send 10 groups. That is the impact that this ZCC has made.

I can only say that I am learning. Also with all the feedback from all the experts who have come here and also from the esteemed committee members, I think, we can further carry on this job. But there is one thing which I have also given in writing. It is that, as you know, the infrastructure in the North-East is very poor. Sir Sitakant had visited Dimapur. He saw the museum. It is a wonderful collection of artifacts that we have collected from all the tribal groups surrounding Nagaland areas, but we do not have the space. Maybe annexe to the main building of the museum may be constructed. Yesterday the NSD and the donor representatives came. I will be pestering Madam Jayshree for that.

MR. CHAIRMAN: But does anybody visit there?

SHRI KAMEI: Yes.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Where do they come in from? I am asking about Dimapur Centre.

SHRI KAMEI: Sir, last year we have started a Stone Sculpture Garden. We had invited sculpture artists from all over.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am asking about visits to your museum. Does the general public turn up?

SHRI KAMEI: They do, but in that scale. For example, it has seasons.

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is part and parcel of the normal tourist circuit for Dimapur.

SHRI KAMEI: Especially during the Hornbill Festival, visitors come to Kohima. Then, they will drop in because in Dimapur, there is hardly anything. There is this sculpture garden and museum, which are attractions for them.

MR. CHAIRMAN: When I went there many years ago, perhaps 10-12 years ago, I was

disappointed when I was told that nobody comes here. It is located inconveniently, outside the airport area.

SHRI KAMEI: Now the surrounding area has got developed.

Then, we have collaboration with other institutions and youth clubs and NGOs. We are overwhelmed with requests to sponsor programmes etc. In fact, we try to avoid as much as possible, if we repeat. We try to help all the student groups that come to us and sponsor some of the programmes, especially cultural troupes, bring them from across the States. Those are the things we already do. Fund is a problem over there.

MR. CHAIRMAN: What are you all going to say about funding, we would like you to project what the funding ought to be with an indication how you propose it to be. Supposing you have an ideal project, how would you split it up in different things that you would be doing? What is it that you will put to capital construction and what is it that you will put to outreach programmes and how much of it to the guru-shishya parampara, on which I would like to lay a very special emphasis because of what we have heard from all of you, I do not think that any of us three had this clearly in our mind, but as a result of your bringing when we were talking to the ZCCs separately, it did occur to us that this cradle to grave assurance that when you are born, there is a guru to teach you, then there is a prospect that you can yourself will become a guru. So, your parents will allow you to go into culture. Then, we have a social security back up scheme which involves your being a teacher of your art until such time as you retire and then you have a pension that takes you eventually to the grave. So, this guru-shishya parampara instead of just being an artistic artifact becomes a means of livelihood and a career pattern. So, how much would you put into all these kinds of things, I would like you to put together. If you want to consult together to come up in this regard with any kind of joint suggestions, please feel free to do so. Especially with the kind of communication facilities that are available these days, you have to communicate with each other and finalise something and send it to us, but of course, deadlines are important because we do not have too much time.

SHRI KAMEI: Everyone has commented on funding. The corpus fund is not enough. We barely have enough money to pay to our staff. There is no fund to conduct extra programmes or even headquarter programmes. Whatever funds come from the Centre, with that we do only that thing. Thank you.

SHRI SAROYA: I am a civil servant interested in culture. I am Director since January 2009, but I am very fortunate that NZCC had 2-3 very great Directors. The last Director, Mr. R T Jindal, is in Assam now and he did a very great job. NZCC was virtually a sinking ship 9-10 years back and he proved to be a financial wizard and made it financially number one ZCC.

MR. CHAIRMAN: When you moved out of Sheesh Mahal, why did you move into some

residential colony?

SHRI SAROYA: No.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Where are you operating from now?

SHRI SAROYA: We are now in Virsa Vihar Kendra. It is a building for which the Rajya Sabha MP donated the money out of MP Fund. It is near Language Department building. It is deep in the city of Patiala.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is an old fort which we were looking at. Qila Mubarak is a magnificent palace.

SHRI SAROYA: But Punjab Government is not interested. They want to develop it as a heritage building and tourist centre.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Do you use it for all your performances?

SHRI SAROYA: During the last ten years, we have spent less than one per cent of the total budget at Patiala programmes. This is a positive thing.

When I studied the 25 years' performance of the NZCC, I made a presentation in September. So, we have avoided AC auditoriums. The most of the performances were for aam adami and a very few presentations were in auditoriums. They were mostly in educational buildings, in school auditoriums or in university auditoriums.

I have given my written comments on the recommendations. These are not the recommendations of the Governor. I am yet to discuss them with the Governor.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I do not want you to discuss your recommendations with the Governor. Let the Governor send his own recommendations because we have sent these papers to the Governors themselves or to their Secretaries and the Secretaries have not responded to us saying that they needed to get the comments cleared by the Governors. Let the Governors come to us on their own accord, but do tell your respective Governor's Secretary that we are waiting for their comments. If we get them on time, we will be able to incorporate them. If we do not, then we have to go on our own.

SHRI SAROYA: These recommendations are unexceptionable and I have to make observations.

Collaboration with academies is of paramount importance. You have recommended that, but NZCC's experience is that collaboration is very negligible. They have never participated in our Governing Body meetings or Executive Board meetings. During the last 20 years, I think, hardly in one or two meetings in the beginning they have participated, but during the last more than 15 years, none has attended the meetings.

About infrastructure at the headquarters, I would submit that the recommendation is very laudable. We should not have spent so much. From the NZCC's point of view, I will say

that the bare minimum infrastructure is definitely needed in consonance with the very vast area of zone. So far as NZCC is concerned, the infrastructure at headquarters as well as at the Shilpa Gram level which we call Kala Gram at Mani Majra, is less than the bare minimum. During the last two years, there have been several brainstorming sessions at the level of Governor and they have decided that there should be some minimum infrastructure. When the team visits Kala Gram and says 'yes', I will pursue the matter because during the interactive sessions with artists in the zone as well as outside the zone, they have given a strong feedback that they long to identify themselves with the Mecca of culture in the Zone. If we have absolutely nothing, where will they come? Once in a while, they come to the Zone, even during the chain programmes.

Regarding the chain programmes, I may tell that whenever a mega event is organized in a big city, the artists also go to remote places. For example, an octave's artists go to remote places. They perform away from the main venues, at other places also. Last time, I gave the example of Amritsar. Artists went to border areas. Even for the beating retreat ceremony, we tied up with the BSF. During this ceremony, 15,000-20,000 people are on the either side of the gate. They hear the shouts of each other. That was a remarkable thing. Those tourists and rural people, everybody was there.

In regard to relationship of budget with objectives of the ZCC, I have already stated that one per cent of the fund is spent on activities at headquarters at Patiala. According to 2001 Census, 74 per cent population belongs to rural areas in villages and now in 2010 this might have reduced to 70 per cent. My attempt was, and my suggestion also is that we should allocate 70 per cent for performances in the rural areas and 20 per cent for performances in the towns, for slums etc.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I totally agree with that. There is no problem with that. You are referring to rural areas, mofussil areas and metropolitan slums. That is fine.

SHRI SAROYA: My friend has told about management of the staff. When the NZCC was established, we had many performing art persons as programme officers. At this point of time, I do not have even a single person on my establishment who is from the art community. There is one person who got diploma in theatre. He is a Programme Officer. He does not know about theatre. He is a handicapped person. So, all are ministerial or clerical people. My suggestion is that the staff needs to be taught the basics of event management. We need to impart training to them.

Guru-shishya parampara is an important point. I will send a write up on that to you. We have a very elaborate system of how gurus are allotted work and selected. We have a Committee of Experts from university professors, from among those who are in the know of folk art forms. All persons are involved and those experts see their performances and recommend whether he is a potential guru or not, whether he should be engaged as a guru or not, whether he can impart training to others. In the end, after one year, there is a

monitoring camp for 3-4 days where his disciplines are asked to perform. We document their performances, what they have learnt and then the same Committee gives an elaborate report whether we have achieved anything or not. That is the reason we have not signed an MoU with IGNOU because my experts say that they need a bit more time to think about modalities of certification.

Collaborations with cultural institutions and youth clubs and panchayats is another important thing. More than a year back, we made an encouraging start in this direction. With my report, I have enclosed a brief note on few collaborative programmes organized by us with youth clubs and panchayats.

If you permit me, there was a mega event in Kala Gram when we organized second Chandigarh National Crafts Mela at Kala Gram and 500 dance artists from all over the country put up performances there. They performed in group there for hardly two days at a time. First, 150 people came and performed. Then, there was a chain programme in the villages of Punjab, Himachal Pradesh, Rajasthan and Haryana. I will give you one example. In district Ropar, we contacted a sarpanch Rajwant Kaur in village Khijrabad. It is about 20 kilometres from the boundary of Chandigarh, UT. There is a club Shaheed Bhagat Singh Memorial Sports Club. In turn, they invited panches and sarpanches of 12 villages in the radius of about 5 kilometres of Khijrabad. There was a performance by 124 folk artists. They had never seen it in their lives. Old people were there and school children were also there. We have replicated this in the Patiala and Ropar districts of Punjab and Bilaspur district of Himachal Pradesh.

Next time I make a chain programme, I will select 10-12 central villages where I can perform. Then panches and sarpanches of 10-12 villages in the periphery of each central village can be contacted. So, if I organize ten performances, then I can cover 10 villages' audience. I started this in the beginning of this year. We did this Khijrabad thing in November. The first experiment was done in March, 2010.

Similarly, I have got support from very good NGOs and theatre. There is one G S Channi. He is a full bright scholar and he is called founding father of street theatre in Punjab. He is a film-maker also. His programme Forts of India is being telecast on Doordarshan. He gave me a play Khuli Hawa ki Talash Mein about environmental degradation and women issues and female foeticide. It is a very popular play. I sent this to a few places in the villages of Haryana and Himachal Pradesh. The aforesaid performance takes place in the round, in the street theatre style, without the use of stage and microphone, lighting and other paraphernalia of theatre. It can be arranged in parks, community halls, schools, colleges and courtyards and in noise-less public places. Aam adami witnesses aam kalakars trained by experts. Similarly, I have given the details of all these collaborative efforts in the form of annexure to my comments.

We have got a very good idea where we can associate with NYKs. In fact, Jawahar

Navodaya Vidyalayas invited me to their zonal functions. I could immediately tie up with them. They have about 70 schools in J&K and in Punjab also. In the northern region, they have a total of about 150 schools. I am going to tie up with them so that their children are much better city scholars because they come through a competition and a lot of talented children are there. These are all residential schools. I think, they can become our set in Himachal Pradesh and J&K. There, we can involve panchayats and hold workshops in their schools. The response from them was very encouraging.

About documentation, throughout we have been acting as a facilitator. Whatever films we have, we have involved the university professors in Srinagar and Punjab University in Patiala. The scholarly input is from them and then some good cameraman, who is equipped with some latest technology, is engaged. This is the way we are doing it. This is what in brief I wanted to say. Thank you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. That has been very useful. This leads me to believe that I may have to modify my introductory chapter. I will have to do that now.

SHRI PATHAK: Sir, I will not go into the details of the programmes we do because I think, Mr. Sontake has made it in a very elaborate way. I am here for the last five months. I just wanted to bring to your kind notice that we are spread in five States - Maharashtra, Madhya Pradesh, Chhattisgarh, Andhra Pradesh and Karnataka. The staff we have needs to be properly oriented and sent on different programmes regularly rather than their sticking to their headquarters, which definitely needs to be done.

As it is already suggested by one of our Directors, structuring of the organization is needed. General structuring of the organization can come only if they have some promotional or career options so that they can go up in the ladder and then shoulder greater responsibility, while they perform their normal duties in the particular ZCC. Their recruitment rules are also not very clear, which need to be totally revamped and properly done. I think, we should not ask two of the top officials - Director and Deputy Director - who as per the SCZCC Memorandum of Undertaking, are on deputation. That really leads to confusion at the top level and the bottom level people try to project things as per their polarization to the new incomer and then accordingly, he gets polarized and probably there is a drifting or diversion from the main course of action, which otherwise the ZCC is supposed to do.

Secondly, I would like that all the database of artists and others, which are available with all the ZCCs, should be networked amongst the ZCCs because that will lead to reducing the confusion of repetition. That is already there in your recommendation. If we can have an easy access to the database of other ZCCs, then repetition can be avoided.

I found that on many of the occasions we get a request directly for a particular artist or a particular group. It should be left to the ZCC to decide because they are the people who are giving encouragement to the newer groups and new performers. If it comes directly that

a particular group has to be sent, then we need to look into that. You can just ask for a particular performance or a particular type of group that you require, but not that X Y or Z group is required.

Then, there was the issue of networking of the State Government which came up, for having a Nodal Officer who can collaborate. I had the recent experience in Haryana and Bangalore. We organized an octave programme for these two States. Even though I had a meeting with the Principal Secretary and briefed him about their support because we are coming all the way from Nagpur and it will not be possible for us to spend our total manpower or money here to organize some of the things, but the State Government officials were almost reluctant as if it is our own baby because we had requested them to tell us which are the dignitaries to be called on the day. They said that they will not tell us that we must call this person or that person. The said that 'it is your baby' because they wanted to get rid of criticism from their own people why they did not call this person or ignored the other person. That is really a difficulty when we go into other States than where we have our headquarters. There, naturally everybody will feel at home and get things organized. I think, the idea of a Nodal Officer specifically appointed from a particular State, who can look into this matter and help us so that more and more programmes can be held in the participating States, is a good idea. As far as the SCZCC is concerned, two States are yet to contribute their amount into the corpus fund. Every time we send them the reminders, we get the assurance that it is being done. It is still being done and nothing has been done. So, that is the thing.

I strongly suggest that whenever it comes to the decision-making, instead of having a very high official at the apex of any Governing Body or any Programme Committee, he should be made available or he should be available for holding meetings. Otherwise, for my Centre, as I keep talking to Mr. Shukla, two years have passed and no Governing Body meeting is held. It is the greatness of Mr. Anand Kulkarni who is the Principal Secretary, Government of Maharashtra, who on his own, when I contacted him, said that 'I know that. Otherwise you will face difficulty.' So, he held Finance Committee meeting so that finances are cleared and programmes can continue. We expect that sort of attitude. Okay, there may be differences, there may be hindrances for not holding the meeting, but it must be delegated to somebody so that some of the routine decisions can be taken in the normal course of action. Otherwise, it becomes really difficult for the functioning of the ZCC.

Now-a-days, with the RTI becoming a very handy tool, it is really difficult to answer the queries of people as to who has approved this and if there is no approval then why this has been continued. We are standing on a double edge sword. If we do it, why we have done and if we do not do it, why we did not do it. Both the things are there. So, we have to strike a balance in that and then, accordingly, get the programmes also through.

These are the things which I would like to submit. Thank you very much for this

opportunity. I think, this is the last time I am interacting with you all people because my successor has been selected. He may be joining in a very short time.

MR. CHAIRMAN: But we should have from you what you are saying. We do not want him to provide it because he will be too new to it.

SHRI PATHAK: Before I go, I will pass on the information.

MR. CHAIRMAN: We will continue to be in touch with you, if we require, even in your new assignment.

SHRI PATHAK: Okay. Thank you very much.

SHRI DASHORA: West Zone Cultural Centre tries to follow the mandate given during the formation of the ZCCs. Many of the programmes are organized in rural, tribal and semi-urban areas. We participate in almost all major traditional melas, like Pushkar Mela, Nagaur Mela, Dusshehra Mela and Shiv Mahotsava in Goa and Maharashtra. We have a scheme of programme of Yatra Pashchim Alaap, which I explained in the last meeting where we collect groups from all the four zonal States. A bus will take them to a particular district and in that particular district at all the tehsil places, we organize one day programmes. So, we cover all the districts in one go.

One phase has been completed and we have covered all the districts of Rajasthan, Maharashtra, Gujarat, Goa and UTs. We have covered 750 tehsils in the first phase. In the next phase, just yesterday we have started. We have completed one district of Khera and there are seven tehsils. Before that, we had done it in Jalore district of Rajasthan. Next will be in Maharashtra's Nandurbar district where we will be doing it.

We are fortunate enough that National Youth Festival is being organized in Udaipur. We are given the duty of the cultural part, where 5,000 students will be participating in that festival. Then there is an idea in the recommendations on promoting display of local cuisine, craft and performing art together. We do it in all the States in Shilpa Utsava which will be from 21 to 30 December. Then, we will do it in Gujarat in February and in Goa in January. Then, it will be there in Maharashtra. In these melas, about 70 per cent of the visitors are from rural and semi-urban areas.

Then, we collaborate with various academies, but since it is very costly, we cannot take them to the village areas.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Obviously I can understand it if your budget does not permit it. The answer is not to exclude the artists but to increase your budget. In your model budget, please make special provision for this point.

SHRI DASHORA: Then, there is recommendation that 90 per cent of funds should be for

rural areas. I agree with Shri Saroha that it should be 70 per cent.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I think, the point which should have been made is that 90 per cent of it should be for aam adami and aam kalakar. This is really what is meant, but it was badly drafted.

SHRI DASHORA: The idea of cultural audit is very good and an excellent one. It will improve the working and stop diversion from the desired path. But we should not go in for quality of artists because all the artists are either rural or tribal or uneducated or upcoming. So, we should not ask that they should have very good quality. The only quality we should ask for should be there in process of selecting these artists.

SHRIMATI RITA SINHA. : Let me tell you about the quality of artists what we used to do when I was the Director. There was no system of knowing what kind of artists they are. People will come and say that they will perform and he can perform. So, what I did was that every Thursday anybody was free to come to the Centre and give his performance. We also got experts to see their performance and classify them as A, B and C grade artists. Where you have a mela, where throughout the day people have to see their performance, it cannot be very expensive and cannot have very good artists all day long. So, we used to send 'C' grade people to these melas. Then, they also have a chance to come back and get themselves graded again and say that these are the things they have improved on. When you have very bigger functions, you can use 'B' grade artists and reserve 'A' grade artists for the really big functions where knowledgeable people are coming as audience. You can grade the artists and send them accordingly to different functions. I think, you will have to do grading of the artists because artist has also to be seen along with the type of programme they are putting up, but at the same time, you also cannot have a besura man singing.

SHRI DASHORA: He is not besura, but we give chance to the new people.

SHRI DASHORA: Yes.

SHRI AMOL PALEKAR: An artist of what grade?

SHRIMATI RITA SINHA : If you are saying that he is a 'C' grade artist, even the audience will also be 'C' grade.

SHRI MATILAL. : This is exactly what I am doing in Shanti Niketan for making it vibrant.

SHRI DASHORA: Many headquarter programmes we do in the headquarters because we have got Shilpa Gram and we have got artists already there throughout the year. We take these artists for local headquarter programmes. It does not cost anything to us. There is a programme Dharohar which we do everyday near headquarter. It is showcasing local dances and songs. Everyday one hour programme from 7 pm to 8 pm is there. It is an outsourced programme and the person which is undertaking the programme is giving Rs. 20,000 per month. We get revenue also and we get the performance also. There is an open area in my

office itself at the headquarters.

SHRI AMOL PALEKAR: When you say local song and dance, please elaborate what they perform.

SHRI DASHORA: They perform mewadi folk dances and songs. They do gori, tera taal. It is going on all the 365 days and so many tourists are there everyday.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Is this on the platform leading to the lake? Or, are you doing it in the Shilpa Gram?

SHRI DASHORA: Sir, in Bagor ki Haveli itself, there is a chowk. There is no stage on that. We did not spend any amount on that.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Bagor ki Haveli is something to be seen.

MR. CHAIRMAN: When you go to Bagor ki Haveli, you will see why my heart breaks that you left Sheesh Mahal and have not gone to Qila Mubarak. Anyway, this cannot be helped now.

SHRI DASHORA: Sir, I just propose the name of my Centre to be Shourya because all the people in Rajasthan, Maharashtra, Goa and Gujarat know martial art.

SHRI SHUKLA : We just call our campus as Kala Sangam.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You are welcome to suggest whatever name you think is appropriate.

SHRI MATILAL. : Our Centre is also called Bharatiyam Cultural Complex in Kolkata.

SHRI AMOL PALEKAR: Shourya is associated with valour, bravery and all that, but there is no reflection of art and culture in that.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Anyway, make your suggestions. I am not sure that the suggestions will get accepted or whether anybody would want to change the name, but do try and remember two elements of that. One is that it must be related to West or South or something like that. His suggestion for Bharatiyam would indicate that it represents all of India, which it does and should not. It represents East Zone. You may think of that. There is no hurry and no compulsion either. I think Kala Sangam is appropriate because Allahabad is located at the sangam. Therefore, it has certain resonance. The name years ago suggested was Dhruva Zonal Cultural Centre. I do not know whether you want to recommend that. There is a connection there because it is a north star. One could think of that kind of names. Take your Shourya. It is fine, but try to ensure that it is paschimi shourya or hara hua shourya, whatever you want.

SHRI DASHORA: Maharana Pratap and Shivaji have been from there.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, that is there.

SHRI DASHORA: Shivaji was from Maharashtra.

SHRI AMOL PALEKAR: Anything to do with art and culture would be appropriate.

SHRI .: Sir, four States out of seven member States not just giving their corpus of Rs. 1.5 crore.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I think, we have found an answer. As far as our recommendation goes, we brought all these States into this zone. It is a Central Government decision. Now you tell them either to remain in the Zone and pay for it or opt out of the Zone so that you do not have to spread yourself that far. They will lose the cultural advantages that they get by being in your Zone. Therefore, there is a price to be paid. At that point, maybe there minds may begin to focus.

SHRI .. : There is another headache that from one or two States as there are received a sort of factory generated fax messages to the NZCC - daily seven or eight - as if their Culture Department is giving nothing and they do not have any funds. For example, I will name Himachal Pradesh. Everyday I get letters from all over the Zone - from the Ministry or elsewhere - but they are generating more letters than all clubbed together. From tehsil level to district level, they will always say that it is a State level programme, send this much or we have got a theatre and you send some troupes.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Have they paid to you?

SHRI .: No, they do not pay. They say that we are a very poor State and we cannot pay Rs. 1.5 crore which we owe you since 2004. They have given this in writing.

MR. CHAIRMAN: What does the Ministry of Culture say about this?

SHRI .. They say that you resist and manage.

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is a very irresponsible attitude.

SHRI .: Every time I invite their suggestions for the Programme Committee, along with agenda I append a copy of the objectives of the NZCC and say that please formulate your proposals in consonance with the objectives, but still they will not bother about that. This is the headache that we have.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have to firmly say 'no'.

SHRI SAROYA. : This Kala Gram in Chandigarh happens to be seat of three Governments - Haryana, Punjab and Chandigarh UT. They are also doing the same bores in the head. I have to oppose and then they complain. Their Secretary will straightaway come to Delhi on phone.

MR. CHIARMAN: Do you need sub-centres or will you just be competitive yourself? Why not have a Nodal Officer?

SHRIMATI RITA SINHA : Sir, a larger State like Rajasthan requires it where the area is too large. In the State of UP, I had specially made a sub-centre because coordination with the State Government was very difficult.

SHRI S.K. MAHAPATRA: Dimapur has the most massive acreage of all the ZCCs. I know that. You can bring out a small brochure on your museum in which you may also give the gist of the seven States. It is very well formed even as it exists. You were right that North-East being what it is, a better formation for the museum is necessary. Additionally, you can bring small brochures on museum and Sculpture Garden. It is so well done. Over two years, massive stone sculptures have been built up. You may make these brochures available to the tourists.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.

(ENDS)

## 15th December, 2010 Pre Lunch

MR. CHAIRMAN: I would just like to give a brief background about why this committee has been set up and what we are hoping to get from you by way of inputs. Some of you will remember that about 25 years ago in 1985, late Rajiv Gandhi, the Prime Minister at that time, established seven ZCCs with the hope that through these vehicles, we would be able to take the best in our cultures from different parts of the country out to the masses of the people who do not normally have the opportunity of being able to witness or participate in our diverse forms of culture. Of course, every locality and every habitation has its own cultural traditions and they are familiar with those, but those from elsewhere are familiar to urban middle class audience, but there was no organized method of trying to get these arts and crafts out to people where they live. So, if you would care for an industrial and commercial explanation, while the Akademis were concerned with the production and nurturing of our cultural heritage, we did not have any instrument for marketing of these or its distribution in a wide way. So, these centres came to be established. All this has been explained in some considerable detail in the note that has been circulated to you, which is in the form of a draft chapter called Introduction. Along with that, we have also given you a set of 22 recommendations for reviving and rejuvenating the ZCCs, that arose out of our earlier interactions with people who are as of today connected with these ZCCs, such as ZCC Directors and the officials in the Ministry of Culture. These are placed before you for your consideration.

At this stage, let me introduce my two fellow members of this committee. They are Shri Sitakant Mahapatra, who used to be Secretary (Culture) and is himself an artist of considerable renown and Shri Amol Palekar who was responsible for Apna Utsav in Mumbai. When it happened in 1988, it was called Bombay. He has subsequently also been involved in the centres, but of course is well known as a theatre and cinema personality. I have been assisted in my work here by my Principal Advisor, Smt. Rita Sinha who has recently retired as Secretary to the Government and earlier had a stint as the Director of NZCZZ in Allahabad. We have with us Ms. Seema Nayyar as Advisor who did begin her own career with the same NCZCC in Allahabad and was then transferred to Delhi. Subsequently, she got married and became rather distanced from culture, but she is here because she was the one who assisted U.R. Ananthamurthy Committee in a similar capacity, which had looked into these ZCCs about 15 years ago. Then, we have Mr. Amit Goyal who had been associated with Rajiv Gandhi for a very long time and with me since 1990. He is coming to help us. Of course, we have the assistance of Ministry of Culture, particularly, Ms. Rupa Srinivasan who has been sitting in all these discussions.

The floor is really yours. I would have had my say in the documents that have already been sent to you. I would like you to freely and frankly advise us on what we should do about ZCCs, including what might be a favoured option, which is to abolish them altogether. The suggestions are in front of you to guide our committee on how you think we should be working with these ZCCs, if at all, and if we are to work with them, how are we to attend better to their objectives than has already been accomplished.

I suspect that some of you at any rate would have had some more recent and immediate experience of these ZCCs and therefore your very frank views are required on how they are functioning and that you thing should be done with them and in particular, the interface between the classical arts, which is the sphere to which almost all of you belong and what is done for the classical arts with or through ZCCs is also a point that I would like to be enlightened on. For any actual practice, if not always in theory, these centres have functioned with folk and tribal art much more than with classical artistes. Yet initially when we set this up, we had not really expected or wanted to see such a crass distinction made between classical arts and what people should get in terms of folk and tribal arts. We would like to have your thoughts on that.

On the one hand, we were given to understand that major artistes like yourselves were somewhat reluctant to get involved with the hoi polloi which are the characteristics of the ZCCs and the fertilizer distributors who tend to become Directors of the ZCC before they move on to handle rural development or health. At the same time, we were pleasantly surprised to know from Ustad Amjad Ali Khan yesterday that he had been very deeply involved with the Nagpur Centre, the SCZCC. The detail in which he explained what he had done and the enthusiasm he was still expressing was really encouraging. So, maybe there is a role for the classical artistes in the work of the ZCCs, but this is a meeting without an agenda in that sense. We would like to keep it as open as possible.

We have a much fuller house today than I had feared we would have. Many thanks for that. But that does impose a certain discipline on all of us. We have got about 300 minutes in all and if we divide these 300 minutes equally among all of you, it will come to about five minutes to each. But there is no reason why we should be so restricted because some will have more to say and others not. So, I am not going to stand in the way of any detailed exposition or a point of view, but the price will eventually have to be paid because we are quite ready to go on till 7 pm in the evening and thereby give an opportunity to everybody. Let me begin with the former president of the Sangeet Natak Akademi, Ms. Sonal Mansingh.

MS. SONAL MANSINGH: Thank you very much. It is very timely. I thank you for even thinking about culture because culture has become quite peripheral in the way of thinking.

I will come straight to a small event which I was happy to be associated with, as an example. The SZCC invited me in 2008 to choreograph a huge event of folk music and folk dances. There were over 400 of artistes drawn mainly from southern States. There were some troupes from Manipur, Himachal Pradesh, Mizoram, Rajasthan etc. I went there also in March. It was very hot in Thanjavore. The Thanjavore Palace and the ground behind was used for the first time. So, we had the use of an 8-storeyed beautiful minar, the parapet of the palace behind and the gopuram of the temple nearby. We had created three stages. I took two assistants. I got special people - Sai Venkatesh from Bangalore and another one for lighting from Delhi. The point is that auditions went on and I was there for three weeks. Working with them was such a joy! One was able to create a choreography. It was called

Shalengenatham and what came through was something so unusual. There were about 15,000 people who watched it on the opening day and then I came away. The reactions were that for the first time a great artiste was speaking to them with respect. That was a huge difference because the folk and tribal artistes are now used as props and they have been used to being called nee, koda, idhar baith, udhar baith, ye kar, wo kar etc. Respect for them, respect for their art stems from my belief that there is no hierarchy in the arts, as has been created over the years unfortunately. The classical dance, for example, sits at the top, then comes the folk dance and then tribal dance. There is no such hierarchy.

In the ZCC, if I remember correctly, we had quite a bit of pat, pat. It was mainly to enhance the prestige and respect and appreciation of so-called folk and tribal arts, performing arts especially. I do not see that happening very often because the interaction between classical and folk and tribal has not really happened the way it should have in all these years. I would go a step further and say that now the ZCCs, if they continue and I hope they continue, after all these years of money poured into them, energy poured into them and work poured into them, to look for events where you involve classical dances, classical musicians to work with their counterparts in these fields. In all your Festivals of India which happened abroad - I have only been to one which was held in Russia in 1991 - I have never seen this thing happening. They are separate and we are separate.

I would also like to say one thing regarding the Directors of the ZCCs that somebody is from Forest Service and somebody is from Police Service and somebody not even from IAS, who is in a limbo, waiting for a posting. That happens very often. So, this should not be treated as a corner where pushed officers are waiting for their posting. These Directors should be chosen with great care and given at least 3-5 years to work because, as said by Mark Twain, a round man cannot be expected to fit in a square hole right away. He must have time to modify his shape. Creativity is trying and making mistakes, but art is which mistake to keep. We all make mistakes. There has to be give and take. There have to be trials of what will happen, what will look good, what can be carried forward, but we all seem to be in a comfort zone, like this is right and we should do this.

ZCCs are 'a perfection of means and confusion of aims'. There are lot of aims, lot of money, lot of opportunities, but there is confusion of aims and there seems to be the confusion. Thank you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. I thought it is a perfection of aims and confusion of means, but we will let that go. They are running their shows properly. I think, it should be fairly clear what they are supposed to do. There is a lot of confusion over what is to be done and it varies so much over time and between zones and depending so much upon whether a Director is somebody with a feeling for the arts and interested in the subject or whether to use your very colourful expression, he is somebody in limbo waiting for his next posting. The performance of individual ZCCs has varied tremendously over time.

The performance of different centres at any given point of time is also subject to enormous variation, but from what you have said, the really most heartening thing that I have heard over the last three days is to get classical artistes to work with the folk and tribal artistes rather than just work along side them or over them and to do so, so as to enhance the prestige and respect in which the folk and tribal arts are held. An example of what you achieved in Thanjavore in itself is a very satisfying thing. But it is causing me some concern that it is only when they do these functions at their own headquarters or in their State Capital and more often than not in Raj Bhawan that they attempt to rise to new heights whereas one would hope that some heights would be conquered when they go into village area and mofussil area or into urban slums. That is what they were really conceived for.

MS. SONAL MANSINGH: As I said, they also tend to keep all these things separate in Festivals of India.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Festivals of India are supposed to have little to do with ZCCs, but you can see the priority of the Directors of the ZCC from the embarrassment they caused us by beginning their presentations on their superb performance over the last 25 years by saying that I went to Burundi and the Finance Minister was there to applaud and in the next slide. That is where I got worried about what their attitude is. Subsequently when we got more information from them as to what exactly they have been doing, they were not trying to impress me with what they had been impressed with. Then, we found that a lot of them had been doing a lot of good work, but lot of it is extremely uneven. So, we have to see how we can introduce not uniformity in performance but uniformity in quality and outcomes and venues and all that.

MS. BHARTI SHIVAJI: As a mohiniattam practitioner, I would like to express that Kerala comes within the Thanjavore SZCC, but I am totally unaware of the aims and objectives of the ZCC. So, I will not be able to speak much about it, but the purpose, I understand, is to propagate all the classical, the folk and the regional art forms of that particular region. But I have not been able to see any of the Kerala art forms because Kerala is perhaps the richest of all dance traditions, whether it is classical, semi-classical, proto-dramatic folk, recreation, the percussion ensemble and there are so many of them, but none of these traditional arts one is able to see being propagated, supported or promoted by the SZCC.

MR. CHAIRMAN: We have been somewhat disappointed by the recent experience of the SZCC. So, it was something of a relief to hear from Sonal that in 2008, they had done something. At least in Thanjavore, they have been very slow, in this whole decade, with enhancing their finances and doing their performances here and there. We had Kerala Kalamandalam man here two days ago as also the Principal Secretary, Culture, from Kerala. Both of them indicated that they have had some experience of the ZCC and perhaps its brightest moment was when a Kerala Cadre Officer, whose origins lie in Thanjavore itself, had served, Mr. Ramamurthy, there for five years. That is when it seems to have peaked, but really peaked badly because it has then fallen into a valley. So, I will take on board what

you have said and we will see how we can dynamize SZCC to take all these different art forms, all of which are extremely valuable and which ought to be propagated certainly within the zone, but also outside the zone, in inter-zonal events.

MS. SHANTA SERABJEET SINGH: I start with a great sense of déjà vu. I was present in March 1985 at the Press Conference that you organized on behalf of late Rajiv Gandhi. You have taken much longer to lose your innocence, but we in the media do not have that advantage. So, I remember very clearly that it is a question which I put to Mr. Gandhi in response to which he immediately later told me at that very time that he had passed an order. I had said that now all that is going to happen, are we going to have new seven more bhawans in seven new locations and that will be the end of the story? I had also said that you are not looking at what the requirement of the cultural field is. So, he said that that would not happen. That did not, but I noted in this whole draft report that your expenses and capital investments have been very high. So, how has that happened? That happens because you are looking at the whole pyramid from the wrong side. There are so many contradictions here. The Government, whichever Government it was, has been extremely sincere in wanting to promote culture, arts - classical arts, folk and tribal arts - and all the craftsmen. In fact, I do not know where that is, but I suggested to the hon. Prime Minister that maybe you can extend NREGA to artistes in the villages and in the rural areas because their primary need is sustainability of income for at least 100 to 120 days. He seemed positive, but I do not know where the matter is in the Ministry of Culture.

However, to come back to the ZCCs, what you needed was a policy which appoints a right head for the work that you assign to that team under that particular head. You have never looked at cultural personalities. There are so many sitting on this side of the table. You could have gone to any of them and because they have a passion for this area, they would have given freely all their experience, their time, their knowledge and whatever else you needed. Even if you so wanted, they would have served you because the contradictions are so apparent to me all these years that I am aghast why money is being wasted. We are talking so much of soft power, the great Indian soft power push. The MEA is talking about that, the HRD is talking about that, the Department of Culture is talking about that, but soft power has to be accompanied by the correct human resources also. Over 30 years, I have never seen one initiative towards setting up a Course A school, anything to train cultural tribals. Soft power to be in town, in this particular area, requires a very specialized approach to delivering it.

On the one hand, you cannot expect and it is not fair to think that the highest IAS, who may have learned rudravina twenty year ago or a lady officer who may have learned ikebana twenty years ago, to equate culture to this kind of a focus is the biggest problem of this entire period of 30 years. There is no sense of how important it is to train people to deliver culture, how important it is to create directories of performers, how important it is to create directories of tribal art forms or rural art forms. How ridiculous it is.

I was at this very well set up high value UNESCO Seminar in Nagaur and a lot of Mumbai people were also there. One session was about piracy. The highlight of those three days in that absolutely marvelous tented city that was put up, was the evening performances by the manganihars. Everybody sat out and listened to them under the moonlight and that is what they would have taken back in their memories. There were big representatives of the big industry complaining about how their music is not safe any more as piracy is going on. Finally, I had to point out that nimura, nimura is creation of one man. It is not even a traditional song created by Ghazi Khan of Langamanganihar tribe, but who has bothered to give him Rs. 100 out of the moneys they have made and they are sitting in forums and complaining that X or Y is stealing their music and rest of the world is running away with their copyright.

The Government needs to economize its energies and use them in areas which involved two sectors - cultural drivers, who are your biggest friends, and cultural workers whom you will use for whatever you wish to do in order to sustain that culture that you dream about. We have all vision of Indian culture, but that culture is rapidly vanishing and it is vanishing because we are not looking at the source. I do not have to point out where the pollution is coming from. Shadipur Depot has been there for thirty years. It is only the western world and the heads of festivals or the mandapa in Paris, who have picked up the great folk artistes and given them a face and recognition. This great puppeteer, Puran Bhatt told me that when we come to Delhi, we get to know that we have reached India. When I asked why, he told me that when they look towards us, they feel like us. We win so many awards there and earn so much of money. They are well known in Malacca, Spain, Madrid and Paris. The whole of western world knows them, but they lack recognition and respect in our own country. That bridge is the cultural driver. Find them and train a new generation. This is a specialized field. Do not treat it as something which can just happen. It cannot happen. We need specially trained, experienced cultural administrators, who are given continuity of a job, who are given a minimum of five years with this mandate that reach out and see how best you can bring back results to us about protecting this cultural heritage. If they deliver, you have got your work done through these ZCCs. They can work beautifully.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I think, that is a very useful suggestion. We have not had it so clearly placed before us before and the rationale why this could be done and how this could be done. I agree with you about bhawans. I feel that we succeeded in resisting bhawans for five years and then somebody went in and assassinated Rajiv Gandhi. Before his ashes were quite cold, the ZCCs started building their bhawans, saying that they want an office. So, we could not stop it.

MS. SHOBHANA NARAYAN: I think, I have gone through the papers. A lot of points have been touched in the papers and of course, a lot of points have been touched by the previous speakers over here. I would like to address just a couple of aspects.

When we are talking about ZCCs and we are talking about who are catering to the traditional arts of our country in terms of folk art and tribal arts and the arts that form cultural foundation of our country, I wanted to say that in my recent experience in which Bansiji was a close partner, the difference of respect that was accorded at different levels, that Shantaji touched upon, came through very vividly and that is something which really is a cause of concern. When we are talking about what is the yardstick of success, the ZCCs also unfortunately have to cater to those yardsticks of success - large groups, marketing avenues, whether there is wide dissemination of knowledge about what is happening, whether it is financially viable even for the artistes who are involved in that programme. All this comes about in the attitude of the ZCCs and the artistes' platform that they are catering to. I think, those are areas which we really need to address.

There is also blurring of lines in the activities of the ZCCs as well as the Akademis. There is a lot of talk about preservation and propagation of arts, but at the same time, when we see the activities of the Sangeet Natak Akademi, there has to be a clear demarcation or clear role about how the two can come together and the areas in which they can come together and they can synergise their energies and activities. I also feel that because of a very good and logical reason, the cultural activities or the culture of many areas come together and are overlapping and therefore, a certain number of ZCCs have been set up. I am not disputing on that, but the fact is that sometimes culture of certain areas tends to lose sight of because they are so much happening that certain aspects do tend to lose sight of.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Can you tell us what those areas are?

MS. SHOBHANA: I am coming to that.

For example, I am just quoting a personal experience of mine. I was performing in Gaya when somebody asked me whether I as a Kathak dancer know Kathak village. I said what Kathak village is. Later on, I found that there were three Kathak villages which were all along or around the region of Gaya. One was more than 1,000 years old, another was about 400 years old and the third one was about 150 years old. I also came to know that that whole region had a thriving kathak population. First of all, Allahabad ZCC was too remote. So, I could not go there. I did speak to Sangeet Natak Akademi. They did help me in providing the necessary facilities and along with an epigrapher, a Sanskrit scholar, a videographer and a photographer, we went and photographed those areas and had an interview. Even the fact is that in those areas, they had excavated ghungaroes buried under those villages. There was predominance of some temples all over. They were little, little temples. Again, this aspect also shows that this was the kathak.

She talked about inter-relationship between the classical and the folk. We, classical artistes, also tend to live in a very idealistic or different world. The folk artistes are in a different world and the popular contemporary artistes are in a different world. But here was a beautiful linkage that you saw that it was kathak of the villages. Their last surviving

gentleman was recorded over there. I would have thought that perhaps the ZCCs could have undertaken this aspect also in their course of activities. They should have looked at that there was a disappearing tribe because most of the artistes had disappeared. When we asked them where they had gone, they replied that they might have gone to Mumbai. When I asked what they were doing there, they replied that they had gone there to become extras in the films. Now, it was a sad statement that here you had a thriving group of an art form, however rural it may be in its form or character, but there was a continuity of some form, which was lost. So, we do not know.

This also brings me to the point of disappearing arts. There are many little little art forms which are also now on the verge of extinction, if we do not address them. My little experience with this kathak village brings me to that fact whether it was also about the financial viability of these artistes. If the ZCCs could provide platform to them, their condition might have been better.

We are talking about Apna Utsav. Apna Utsav became so popular because of the places it was presented at. It was presented in the major cities. Again, it was a question of showcasing and, as you rightly used the word, marketing. The marketing was done in the place where the opinion-makers were centered. If the same marketing had been done in local villages, it tends to lose focus and perhaps there is also disinterest among the local population who are looking somewhere else, as she said about Ghazi Khan and others.

Of course, copyright issues are there. Of course, it is a question of art forms or folk forms or folk songs which become the base for many things, later which are taken and where copyrights are done by the others. I think, perhaps we also need to address this. But largely, I agree with what the paper has said and what many of the speakers before me have said, that it is a question of cultural administrators. The paper talked about Udaipur and that gave us an example that if we recollect, we did have a very dynamic person, who was knowledgeable about the arts, who was passionate about the arts and who created the whole for a of Shilpa Gram. Today, I think, we need to choose the right person for the right place at the right time to be able to give that motivation, to be able to give that direction and to be able to motivate not only the functioning of that area, but also all the art forms around that area. If that is the cultural platform on which we as Indians base our sense of pride and urgency and respect, as far as our cultural traditions are concerned.

Thank you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. The question arises who will bell the cat. How do we identify these people? Our experience has shown that if as a category you say that IAS are suited. Some of the best ones we have had were IAS officers, but at the same time, I would rush to add that some of the worst have also been the IAS officers. We have just now even the curious examples of policemen, who instead of accepting bribes along with traffic cops, are involved with the ZCCs and are running them with immense passion. We had

somebody from the Indian Postal Service and in fact, he is sitting with us just now, who has got sick of licking stamps or whatever they do in the Indian Postal Service and is now deeply involved in what he is doing at Dimapur Centre. We have to identify who will do it.

Here is where we have a certain problem, which I would like to share frankly with you so that we can have comments from you on it. Cultural personalities as such do not have an adequate equivalence with cultural managers, with cultural administrators and very many of them are involved in long-standing battles among themselves which they are likely to carry over into an assignment such as this. On the other hand, we certainly do not want people who have no interest whatsoever in the subject but who studied in Udaipur and who has a sick mother in Udaipur and therefore, wants a posting there rather than being in Mizoram where they belong according to their cadre. Which is the body that can do it? We have a suggestion for establishing a ZCC Council, which can be entirely manned by cultural personalities who have an interest in this subject. Even in the course of last two or three days, we have identified several people who would rather be involved with this than be involved with any other aspect of cultural administration and people that could be relied upon.

There was this suggestion from Mr. Mahapatra, rather an unfortunate expression but still the only one I can think of, that maybe we should have Search Committees that would determine who could be short-listed and put into the thing. I just mentioned that they will end up finding their nephews who would be most suitable to be posted over there. There is always this danger, but we can overcome that. That way, throw it completely open that nobody is encouraged and nobody is debarred. It is that actually anybody who wants to go to Thanjavore, first puts in his name and then we check from among those who have the declared interest of going to Thanjavore as to who would perhaps be the most suitable through this Search Committee or Council itself and Delhi in that sense takes on the responsibility of appointing the Director. A lot of trouble that we seem to have experienced in the last few years arises out of the Governor of the host State being excessively influenced by the administrative requirements of the host government and in any case finding that appropriate people are often those who want to live in Chennai and make an occasional appearance in Thanjavore rather than people who are quite ready to go and sit in Thanjavore and make it their headquarter and run it.

The EZCC, of course, has beaten all of us. They have simply hijacked their headquarter centre from Shanti Niketan, which has some kind of cultural aura about it, to Salt Lake city and they did that because they said that Salt Lake City is not Kolkata and since they were not permitted to put up it in the State Capital, they find a convenient suburb to do so. Ever since they talked to us here, they kept slipping into referring themselves to us as Kolkata ZCC. So, we know that the lids are off their story. But these are some practical difficulties that have caused very serious problems in consequence and what we may henceforth call the Shanta Sarabjit Singh syndrome has in fact operated and more of her fears than her hopes and expectations have been realized in the course of last 25 years. She wants to intervene.

MS. SHANTA SARABJIT SINGH: The problem you are discussing about searching for suitable heads, again begs the question ..

Like National Museum did. Now they have trained people. Sudha, I would like you very much to talk about that. These are trained people now. Instead of looking for somebody who would be happy in Thanjavore for climatic reasons or whatever, we should look for people who know the history of that region, who has studied it and who knows that by doing this, this and this, we can create something worthwhile.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I do not know whom we should be asking. At the moment, we have a Centre for Cultural Resources and Training, which probably you may be aware of. We learnt yesterday about IGNOU having taken an initiative to set up a centre in Shillong of all places, but I am very happy that they established it in Shillong, which is undertaking the processes of certifying artistes, where what we are talking about is really managers of culture. We also had NCERT here who said that now within their curricula, they are trying to work out how they can make arts and culture a subject of study and, perhaps through the ZCCs, offer an opportunity for people to even have a career stream, possibly even shift from one ZCC to the other, starting at lower levels and eventually becoming Directors. That would involve the creation of a kind of cadre and at the same time, have a lot of scope for lateral entry and lateral exit, but it is quite clear that the professionalisation of these ZCCs is the key to that type of success.

MS. VIDYA SHAH: First of all, thank you very much for having me here because I think, I can claim to be one of the young people here. So, I feel quite humbled and, at the same time, daunted to make any suggestions.

I have actually put together a small list and would rather stick to it than making any other comment, which is really based on the recommendations that have come out of this meeting that was held earlier. I see three kinds of issues that have come up and also in the conversations that have happened earlier before me. One is, of course, performance and performers. The other is the issue of training and advocacy of idea of supporting or idea of encouraging classical arts through training and engaging young people through breathing more energy and vibrancy into it. I think there is one thing that is very critical and which sometimes get overlooked or sideline and that is documentation. There are the issues of performance, training and documentation. These are the issues as I look at it from the recommendations.

In terms of the documentation ideas, I think the issue of copyright and all of that is also very closely linked to the fact that there is perhaps very little reference material. You look at the whole Ghazi Khan episode, which has been spoken about so often now, the nimura case and the issue that Ismail Darbar did not give him any money. While speaking to Ghazi Khan, he said that he did not want any money. He just wanted to get credibility as the person who composed this song. To most artistes, I think, that is more critical than even the moneys that

could come their way. So, documentation could address this issue of ownership. How do you establish that this is his composition? I think, this is mentioned somewhere here to systematize archiving in a more intense and disciplined way. It could be one way of creating a culture bank in each of the Zonal Centre where people can have access to the materials that have emerged from the region.

Secondly, you also have, therefore, some idea of who has composed what and which tradition it comes from. It is also a way in which younger people can get to know some of these things. I do not know whether engaging with other institutions to do documentation is already happening. I cannot really say that. I have a sense of déjà vu or nostalgia, but I am just saying in terms of what I have read. We may go for getting younger people to even do internship, dissertations, engaging with organizations like FTII or NID or people like this, who may not be the performing artistes but at least in terms of looking at design or photography or how these things can be documented interestingly, a sort of looking at those kinds of partnerships with other institutions and maybe even instituting a student fellowship or something like that so that they can be pro-actively engage in this process of documentation.

With reference to performance, Sonalji said earlier about the distinction between classical musicians or performers and folk artistes. A part of it has also to do with the fact that for most folk artistes, it becomes a livelihood. It is their livelihood. So, how does one work around that? That is what they are earning their livelihood from. It is a survival mechanism for them. How do you deal with it? To give them a sense of greater ownership and pride, what kind of platforms can be established through these Centres, which can provide for this new found identity? I would even call it that because it is really about respect and dignity here. There are so many festivals that happen across India. Perhaps these Centres could create one or two such things. Apna Utsav has been mentioned here repeatedly, but why not something like Sawai Gandharva Festival or the kind of music that happens at Jaipur Festival? There is so much international collaborative work that comes out of, for instance, Jaipur Festival. There are artistes and art councils which are continuously inviting and involving musicians to work with them - Indian musicians or local musicians. Maybe the ZCCs can find ways of connecting with these international bodies.

There is something which says that since this is the time of growth of commercial television, the idea is what you are pitted against. Essentially how do you get more eye-balls? That is one of the recommendations mentioned at no. 12. How do you make it hip? I am sorry for using words like this, but I think, that is really what it is, about making it cool and hip and engaging and pushing it to a level where people know why ZCC is so happening.

I was also at a consultation with Community Radio. I am not aware if you are already engaging with them in terms of popularizing or using it as a publicity mechanism just to put out messages and information about what the cultural centres are doing or what artistes are associated with the cultural centres. If they can introduce themselves and speak about themselves, perhaps it may be one of the ideas of disseminating the cultural richness of these

centres. Just last week, there was a whole group of artistes, I think some of you were part of it, who went and met the Prime Minister with the agenda of giving classical art forms a more centre stage. The concern perhaps was that they are little sidetracked or marginalized, given the way the reality television is taking over patronage. So, one of the suggestions that was made there, and I see no reason why it may not be considered here, is the idea of involving corporate interest. The artistes did suggest this to the Prime Minister that some very small, negligible looking percentage of their profits could be tax-exempt and put into a corpus which is looking at promoting classical arts. Of course, Dr. Singh at that time said that money is not an issue. But if it is an issue here, then perhaps that is one way of also looking at regional corporate interest coming into the cultural centres.

I think, I will stop here because I have a lot of things.

MS. SONAL MANSINGH : I would like to make quickly two points. One is about the ownership and intellectual property right issue. I think, in the Indian context, it is very difficult because there are lot of compositions where we do not know who the poet is and nobody can claim ownership. So, the Indian context is very dubious.

The second thing is about the media, which Vidya briefly touched upon. I was going to make that point earlier, but I forgot. Media reaches every village and every corner of India and abroad also and that is where culture is totally missing. This is where you can think about how to pressurize them or persuade them to start doing something. Maybe the ZCCs could be in the lead to offer them some very good programmes.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Can I just startle you? I discovered that in my tiny little constituency, there are 12 independent TV channels. Their only audience is local. I think, this is an excellent idea of Community Radio, and that is what I had called local TV, where you do not have to think of it. In fact, they would welcome it because it would be the material that they would get. They are all 24-hour channels. I think, they run largely on the basis of pirated films, but they are very lively and people do engage in local debates on international and local issues on these local TV channels and you get a lot of aspiring Barkha Dutts there. This is something new.

It is certainly post-Rajiv Gandhi. It is all now that this is happening. Of course, radios have been there earlier. I think, under the new Radio Licensing Policy, the ZCCs could set up their own Community Radio and it costs next to nothing and yet might be the way in which they can secure income for artistes who are on their pay-rolls. Even if they are not being used for performances, their dances are shown and their music is displayed.

MS. VIDYA: Just to respond to what Sonalji has said about copyrights, I would say that it is an absolutely valid issue that you have raised as to how you document the folk tradition as in the folk music, it is very difficult to find out the composer, who has written the lyric and all that.

MS.SONAL MANSINGH. : Not only folk, Vidya, but even in the classical compositions also.

MS. VIDYA: Absolutely. That is why, it gets lifted in all kinds of fusion music, much to our frustration. For instance, American Institute of Indian Studies has excellent archives where they have consistently worked with the manganiyas over many years. They are setting templates, looking at what are the ways in which at least you have a list of 10,000 compositions which they perform. So, some very simple things have been put in order and they are also engaging with these communities in looking at other avenues. For instance, you are looking for free licensing. What is that? If you are using a composition from the bank which I have created and established that this is part of my folk tradition.

MS . : They are hereditary compositions.

MS. VIDYA: Those are hereditary compositions, but I am just saying that if we at least just look at some of the templates which are working and which are really giving the community a lot of sense of participation, maybe not ownership as yet.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Are things like community or group rights possible?

MS . : Not in India. I have written things and Vidya, people are using it. They hear it and record it in the programmes and use it. I do not mind because Vedvyas or Thyagaraj or Purandar Das will not mind, but we are not in that league. It is a compliment.

MS. SHOBHANA: In popular music terms if you are taking a composition, say, of Sohar from UP and which has been popularized, the question is whether the ZCCs can function today like an IPRL, that those traditional things which are not of this generation but of thousands of years of tradition which has come through and perhaps some percentage from IRPL, if they are taking it, something goes through the ZCC to that community. It is just a thought that I am giving you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: It is a good thought. My problem is that I do not think that ZCCs themselves will ever have the technical ability to handle proper archiving or to do this kind of a thing because they exist in the community and they are out in the field rather than sitting at the end of Ferozshah Road. It is possible for them to act as facilitator, that if the academis or other bodies that are concerned with this were to use them as their instruments for getting specialized work done, but they would act mainly as the facilitator and the expertise will have to come from elsewhere.

If we are going to have interns and student fellows going there, I do not think that ZCCs would be the appropriate body to choose these interns, but what would be done is that if there is somebody who is properly authorized to choose or discover students or research scholars, their work in that zone is facilitated by the ZCCs, helping them to identify where to go.

MS. SHOBHANA: I had a different point. Suppose there is a very traditional song, say a Sohar from UP and it is being utilized in a film, of course, in a re-mix fashion, but it is that basic Sohar. There is an IPRL over there. If you utilize a percentage of that, say, in a film composition, whatever be the percentage, even 0.05 per cent may be given to the community.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The only way in which this would work is for the ZCC to be the link between the experts who would know all that and the community. They can act as a link, but I do not say they are having the ability to go and see Dabang and say that I have heard these three songs and these songs belong to this lot in Gaya. They will not have the ability to do that, but if they can get somebody who is concerned with all this, it will be better.

MS. PRATIBHA PRAHLAD: I thank you for having me here this morning. The reason I said that I was going to come back later was because I had a number of points because I have been engaged with all these bodies not just as a performer but also as a person who would ask for festivals and tries to increase the public space for serious arts in this country. I have gone through this paper that was sent to me about recommendations placed before the Committee. I would like to take them one by one.

The first one is the need to restore the original idea behind the ZCCs. I would imagine that the original idea behind the ZCCs was that they should be to art administration what panchayat raj is to political administration. In that particular area, they identify them, harness them, nurture them, promote them, propagate them and then evaluate cultural administration of that particular region. So, I am not talking of Thanjavore, Nagpur or Dimapur or Udaipur, but in all the seven ZCCs. We do know that some States belong to one ZCC but some other belong to two ZCCs, like Karnataka, where I come from, which belongs to South Zone and South-Central Zone. Therefore, I feel that having a bureaucrat to head cultural administration in this country is not working for the very same reasons that you pointed out and many others in this panel have pointed out. In my opinion, every region has principal stakeholders of culture, there are cultural organizations which are already involved in promoting the culture of that particular region, wherever they be, whether it is Kumbakonam, Thanjavore or Thiruvananthapuram. They are the best judge of what is the good within the parameters of that particular form, in that particular area. Like you said, sitting at the end of Ferozshah Road, we cannot be the best judge of what is happening in that particular region, those stakeholders of the cultural organizers, the cultural practitioners, the cultural institutions of that particular region should be on that ZCC for a period of three or five years and they should elect a head who would head that particular ZCC for that particular period and set out a mandate of that particular period of three or five years and deliver the mandate. Then, you have an evaluation. When the person finishes his tenure, a committee gives a report about the particular tenure of that head and see as to what has happened, who are the practitioners, how they have been identified, what are the modalities employed and how they have been promoted. Whether you have addressed the issue of sustainability of the art forms and the practitioners of the art forms, their hereditary lineage and whether there

are newer people engaging with the practitioners. The newer people are those who are taking to practice that art.

She said about dying art forms. Why are they dying? It is because of lack of sustainability. It is not cool any more to be a folk dancer. So, the sons of the hereditary folk dancers take on to some other profession. Are we trying to engage with them and trying to accord them sustainability, which can then help them engage with the arts of the family? That is something that can be done. If we have a bureaucrat or a body of people that you decide to sit within the ZCC, they may not be in tune with the people of that area or the region or the practitioners of culture of that area or region. So, I think, it is the best thing to do that you get, let us say, 10, 12 or 15 organizations, principal practitioners, the heads of institutions and get them together and within themselves, they elect their own Director for that particular tenure. I do not think, it is the business of ZCCs or Akademis to engage with the corporate or to get moneys because it is the business of the Ministry of Culture to go to the people who are engaged in promoting and propagating culture in this country.

The Ministry of Culture should not act with arrogance, with indifference or in a corruptible manner. They should be sensitive. They should have a humanistic approach towards people who are serious about spreading public space of the arts in this country. At the moment, you look at the Ministry of Culture deliberating art in this country. There is so much red-tapism, there is too much paper work and there are too many people who would like you to go to them, interact with them and tell them who you are. They demean you, they diminish you and they humiliate you. This has happened to me in the last six months by the Secretary, Ministry of Culture when I had tried to speak to him about Delhi International Arts Festival. You asked me to be frank and I am as frank. I hope, you will appreciate that.

I do not want to engage with people; I want to engage with issues. If I have something to say who do I engage with, is there a neutral space that I can engage with and put forth my proposal to? Is there somebody to whom I can just say that this is my proposal and this is my merit? This is what I have done in the last 10, 20 or 30 years and I would like you to support it because we deal with public money here; we are not dealing with feudal nawabs here who are doling out money because they like your face or they do not like your face, or they like the way you speak or they do not like it. So, this is a part of this whole business of professionalization of the arts scenario in this country for the practitioners and for the people who are involved in the business of management of arts. I am talking in my dual role as a practitioner-performer and as a person who does try to manage arts professionally.

Having said this, I would also like to say that most ZCCs have ended up being Song and Drama Division of that particular place. What is ZCC for? I want 50 folk artistes. You just ring ZCC to send 50 folk artistes and ask one Bansi Kaul to choreograph. I am sorry Bansiji, but I know that is the attitude. It is a wrong thing. I am attempting that given in a position, because I am not engaging with that neutral space, I have to go to ZCC to say that give me

50 folk dancers. It is a wrong strategy to employ them. I am attempting that. Basically what I am saying is that it has been the attitude of people sitting in Delhi or in any State headquarters to the ZCC. They just say that Hampi Festival is happening and we need 100 folk dancers to perform. So, call South Zone Cultural Centre or call South-Central Zone Cultural Centre and ask them to send 100 folk dancers. These 100 folk dancers come through the ZCCs and they perform in Hampi Festival and go back. Nobody knows who they are, why they came, what they did and why they went back. At the end of the day, we have statistics like 500 or 5,000 dancers performed in our festival, but nobody knows who are these 500 or 5,000 dancers who performed in our festivals, where they came from and what they performed.

She said about documentation. Are you documenting it? What we are doing is we are having a very step-child kind of an attitude towards the ZCCs. We look at them only as a place to harvest folk dancers and send them to Apna Utsavs, to all headquarters and to Festivals of India abroad, but Festivals of India belong to the propagation of India's soft power aspect. I think, for folk propagation, you should have something called Directorate of Performing Arts, like you have Directorate of Film Festivals of India which engages with international bodies and as IFFI in Goa. There are serious festivals of films. Why can't we have a serious body which deals with organizing performances as a directorate, which may be the Directorate of Performing Arts or Festivals of Performing Arts of India and that body should engage with ZCCs, Akademis, local cultural bodies to identify artistes, to engage with artistes who are good and then promote them abroad through this Directorate. You can also have something called EPA where you have a market place. For example, on the sidelines of IFFI, you have marketing kind of opportunity for your art. If you want to market, the ZCCs can be made a part of that marketing to market the forms that they have nurtured, identified, harnessed and promoted over the years. That is how you have some sort of factor of continuity.

About cultural management and art administration, a lot has been said. I know Mr. Aiyar that you are also involved in this. So, I am not going to touch upon this again and again, but I do know that a lot of people, who have done business management, have given up business management now to practice arts management. They are going abroad to study arts management because we do not have a serious institution in our country which gives a degree in arts management. So, they are going to America to get these degrees. Why can't we request the HRD Ministry for IIMs to have an arts management course for those who wish to study arts management in these IIMs so that you have a respectable institution endorsing that arts management is a respectable profession and not something which has come over time as patronizing a feudal kind of mindset? Now, it is a professional activity. That is how you can have younger people involved in the area of cultural management and art sector.

The next point is about copyright. During the Delhi International Arts Festival, four days ago, we had something called Bands Festival in DLF Promenade. We kept getting calls that copyright people have landed up there from the Ministry of HRD and want Rs. 35,000 per

day towards IPRS or something like that. I did not understand what they meant. I said that we are just having performances; we are not commercializing it. We are just an arts management body and an NGO, how does this apply to us? We just gave a performance to whoever. Like I engage Sonalji and she performs. So, how am I responsible for the copyright of what she performs? It is not my responsibility. The person said that I am from the Ministry of HRD and we are going to take you to court, we are going to take DLF Promenade to court and we will talk in the court now. This was done to my people who were working there. They really panicked. The DLF Promenade said that we cannot have the performance any more. The volunteers working for me said that they did not want to work any more. I said that okay, we will talk in court. This performance will continue and you may send me notice afterwards. I was hoping to address this issue after the festival was over and the festival is over just now. So, it was a very sticky problem. There are small people who want to make money and want to take advantage of this whole copyright issue and say us to stop the performance; otherwise, you give us this much money.

It was one of those incidents encouraging corruption because we do not have IPRS in this country. I mean to say that it has not matured. In America, you do a dance production and if somebody else is doing it, you can take them to court and sue them for copyright. In India, you cannot and if you do that, it will take you years to establish that it is actually yours. As Sonalji said, everyone is working with same Thyagaraja or whatever. If you create your own music, then it is difficult for you to go to court because it is a long drawn battle of 10, 15 or 20 years to prove that that song was yours and no artiste has the financial bandwidth or emotional bandwidth to sustain a battle for the IPRS and copyright issue. That is another issue altogether.

I think, I will intervene in-between if something comes up. I have been associated with ZCCs and performing for them and engaging with them and directing dance-dramas for them, also sourcing folk artistes and things like that. So, for the present, I think, I will just confine myself to this.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much and do feel free to give us, this is addressed to all of you, what you are saying in writing also because that will then more accurately reflect what you are saying. We are making our notes and we are recording what you are saying and transcribing it, but it will help best if you sum up what you really want to say, in writing and give it to us.

SHRI VISHWAS MEHTA: Sir, I am ex-Director, WZCC, Udaipur, presently posted in National Defence College as a member of faculty. In 1998, by accident I landed in the Ministry of Culture as Deputy Secretary and then I had the opportunity to go through Ananthamurthy Committee Report. I have gone into it in detail and I was also asked to make presentation before the Secretary and all ZCC Directors on the recommendations. Within 2-3 months of my joining the Ministry, I found that this post of Director, WZCC was vacant.

As I was willing to go there, I had to struggle for eight months to get posted there, even though the post was vacant there. Fortunately, for six years, I am one of the longest surviving Directors of the ZCC. From 1999 to 2005, I had the opportunity to work in Udaipur, which is one of the finest centres. That also gave me the privilege to work with many of the eminent personalities who are present over here, many of them have become my life-time friends.

One of the things that I noticed is the dichotomy or paradox between the culture and the tourism. When I joined the Ministry, It was part of HRD, then Sports and Youth Affairs and then Education. Even now I am not sure whether it is a separate Department or Ministry. This was my last field assignment before I became a glorified babu sitting in the Secretariat. I was really interested in working in the cultural centre and I thought that as a field assignment, I should try to make best use of it. I started asking few questions like why is it that culture is not given the importance. Having picked up from the Ananthamurthy Committee Report and your interview particularly, Sir, which has been mentioned in great detail there, I looked at two reasons which were always associated with 5-star culture and all that. That prompted me to do my Ph.D. from Udaipur. My Ph.D. was not basically for getting a doctorate and getting Dr. Viswas Mehta in front of my name, but it was basically to find out something from that and then publish a book on that. I did publish two books and a few articles which have come. One of them has come in The Administrator of IAS Akademi. I have brought a copy of that. If you can kindly go through that, I will be grateful to you. I just want to say that out of my 25-27 years of service, the best time I had was those six years in Rajasthan

If you ask me in nutshell what is it that ZCC is all about? It is about dealing with artistes at grass root levels. ZCC is about folk and tribal artistes. These ZCCs, whether they have lost their relevance or whether they have chased their directions, all those questions we can go on debating, but the fact is that the whole lot of folk artistes are surviving because of ZCCs, whether they survive in a form or on individual basis, whether they are repeated or not in various performances, but they do survive. Many of them are associated with ZCCs. At least in Udaipur, I had the great fortune of working with many of them. The original idea needs to be and has to be there that the ZCCs must continue in the core area of tribal folk art. Unfortunately, for the tribal folk art, we do not have any other forum while for classical forms, we still have the central Akademis and they are far more specialized, but the fact is that having been from Rajasthan and having worked in this area, if you ask the basic question what is the difference between a raga and manganihar, how many people will be able to tell. Even people from Rajasthan do not know that. What are the instruments that they use? Is it kamaicha or sarangi? I have worked with people like Bansi Kaul for very many years. I have had long sessions with late Komal Kothari at Jodhpur and I had seen whole lot of his documentation.

I have also visited Banswara village, which is a musicians' village. Why do we not talk about that? I have seen goti puas performing and the only request these people had in various

festivals was whether they can go abroad. I said 'no', it is ICCR which sends them. Then I asked them whether they had passports. They asked what that is. These are the kind of artistes we are dealing with. I remember a Ramanatha artiste taking along with me to participate in Edinburg Festival. This man had never seen aircraft in his life. I got him a passport. Sitting next to me, he asked me how did they build a road on 30,000 feet height. These are the type of questions they ask. I really felt honoured and privileged. I had the honour of working with such artistes for a long time.

Of course, many of them are being repeated, but then networking among the ZCCs is very important. I must say that from 2002 to 2005, we had a very good team of Directors who used to meet very often with and without the help of Ministry of Culture. We used to discuss things like what do you mean by RDFD, Republic Day Folk Dance. Rita madam is here. She was first of the few Directors. They always used to word it RDFD. We used to question how many people will know RDFD. That is how this Lok Tarang came into being. Today, we know it as Lok Tarang and not as RDFD. When you talk about ZCC as a marketing agency, why do we not call this something else?

Thanks to Shilpa Gram in Udaipur that we were also able to link with the Ministry of Handicrafts and Handloom. I was fortunate that we could link it up with many of the things they were doing. In fact, lot of repetition happens. So, we have to do networking. Somebody talked about Virasat Festival in Jaipur. The day the Virasat Festival began, the WZCC was associated, but over the years, we could not sustain and this happened because of the personalities involved. Even six years that I continued as Director of ZCC, I was struggling to get my tenure renewed every time. First it was given for three years, and then again for one year. Shri Anand Vardhan Shukla, who is now looking after Allahabad ZCC, was Addl. S.P. there and he was involved in some of the theatre activities we did. We do not have exponents of vanishing art forms, like maand. We had one and we adopted guru-shishya parampara. For that, many of them were thankful to us.

We did a whole lot of documentation. Unfortunately, we are not good at marketing or publicizing all this. All that we did was that we had very active collaboration with some of the State Governments. In Gujarat, there is a Shilpa Gram, which they call Sanskriti Kunj. Sir, you must have seen it. It is between Gandhinagar and Ahmedabad. Every year, they were organizing festivals. I said why not we collaborate together. Many of the handicrafts and handlooms, wherein we started getting the crafts and arts together, were possible because of the networking that we had developed. In Goa, we had a very active collaboration with Kala Akademi, Goa. I had personally interacted with Mr. Pratap Sinha for a very long time. We had lot of documentation done with them. We used to share resources. We had active collaboration with some of the State Akademis, but with most of them we did not have much.

Infrastructure is not important, but then we do need something like Shilpa Gram for artistes to come and stay in. The structure of ZCCs needs to be reviewed because especially the

Governing Body has become too unwieldy. At Raj Bhawan, once in a year we used to call them, but we used to find most of them discussing things like why we are not being given air fare and all that. When we are not giving air fare to the artistes, then where is the question of giving it to the members? These are the issues which were there. I had left five years ago. So, I do not know what has happened now.

It is important to get good Directors, but how do you get them? Sir, I am in a training institution now. You have come and spoken at National Defence Akademi two or three times. One of the things that they did to attract good people to work in training institutions, because nobody wants to go there, is to give them extra incentives. Today, I get 25 per cent extra pay because I am working in a training institution. Why can't we do that for something like ZCC which is not a higher priority thing? There should be something to do with their performance relations. For the six years when I was Director, I got lot of appreciation, but not from the Ministry. It is because my own people, my own colleagues, my senior and my juniors, used to make fun of me - like Pratibha madam has just said that it has become a Song and Drama Division - saying whether this is a work of an IAS officer that you organize dance. The Collector, the DC, the SPs and DIG used to make fun of me, but notwithstanding that, the kind of recognition that I got of working with people like Bansi Kaul and Bhanu Bharati. In fact, we revived Lok Kala Mandal there. Unfortunately, it is personality-driven. I do not think, we should only look at administrators or artistes or art administrators. Sometimes you get people who are willing to work with artistes. We should give them all support and we should give them all incentives. If they do well, we should give them encouragement. Fortunately, the six years I worked as Director, ZCC was one of my best tenures. I had the honour and privilege to get all the support from the Ministry.

All kind of theatre activities are happening there. There are lot of theatre activities which are happening at the lower level, but unfortunately, there are not many people to support that. Under the ZCCs, we started reviving some of those things, calling these artistes and having regular theatre shows, having a fixed day and doing it at places like Lok Kala Mandal. Maybe, the same troupe was having two or three shows in the next two or three days and then we used to publicise it. It was very successful. As a result, theatre has been revived in some of these areas. It is a very good idea that the Prime Minister can head it. He should be involved.

The last thing that I would like to say is about guru-shishya parampara, documentation and vanishing/dying art forms. I think, it is very important that the heads of all the institutions sit together and do the networking. That is very important. Unfortunately, the left hand does not know what the right hand is doing. State Akademis and Central Akademis as well as ZCCs, all are working on their own. We had a good networking among the cultural centres.

One of the few things that we did was to increase the corpus fund. The whole idea of corpus fund was to survive from the interest amount. Unfortunately, the interest rate came

down and we are finding it difficult to survive. If I look at the number of days we had performed, I was surprised to find that out of 365 days, we had performed 500 days.

If you visit Chittorgarh Fort, Kumbalgarh fort in Rajasthan, what do you see there? There are semi-literate boys and girls explaining things like that Rana used to sit there, Rani Padmini used to sit here. You find only vacant halls. You find large halls where they would tell there used to be Diwan-e-Khan and all that. There is no display. If you have visited the Bagor Ki Haveli, this is the first time we made a sincere attempt to not only restore the place but also display how the kitchens used to look like, how the bedrooms used to look like or teaching room or music rooms used to look like that. Why can't we have a richer display? We can use some of these artistes so that these places become lively. Some of these folk artistes can be associated with these places where they can not only perform but also show some of these monuments and palaces. You go to any palace or monument other than Udaipur City Palace. Many of these places are under ASI. There, I find only vacant halls, vacant monuments, mostly restored but without any light, without any living artiste and without any document and without any display.

In some of those things, ZCCs can be involved. Their mandate has to be clear. The ZCCs are for folk artistes. The whole lot of folk artistes survive on ZCCs and it is above the question of dignity and respect of folk artistes. Some of them do get it, some of them do not get it. It all totally depends on the person who is heading the cultural centre. Thank you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: It is very encouraging to know about your own interest in this and the amount of time you spent there, how you regard it as your most lively posting in your career spanning nearly three decades.

My only comment would be that the ZCCs are not really for the folk artistes. ZCCs are for the rural audiences. They are really the focus. Of course, you cannot cater to the rural audience without the folk artistes, but from the description of what you had done, I get the impression very strongly that you did an enormous amount to build up these folk artistes and give them a livelihood and discover who there were.

Chairman. .contd.

. who would never otherwise have had the opportunity. You do something with that institution in Goa. The people who come to that auditorium are all those who are all the time going to ticketed or non-ticketed or usually to ticketed performances with complimentary tickets. To provide folk artistes to them is to do no great service except to the artistes. We would hope that ZCCs would give people in large numbers who otherwise do not get any kind of exposure to any kind of art form other than that which is totally localized to their habitations the opportunity of seeing what is available. Let us see how it goes, but I think, in the light of all that, you have jotted some points down. We would appreciate receiving in writing what you have to say.

SHRI RUDRAPRASAD SENGUPTA: I have a performance in the evening. So, I would like to leave early.

My association with ZCC is on the receiving side. I have always received help from the ZCC. I belong to a theatre group called Nandekar which is 50 years old. I am 75. We have been running National Theatre Festival for the last 27 years. In the early stages, these were supported by the corporates and then the corporates thought that this is no longer their cup of tea. Therefore, through the Department of Culture, I came to know that I could have benefited from the ZCCs and that gives me a little peep-hole in the running and functioning of the ZCCs.

Irrespective of whether the person at the helm was IAS, IPS or anyone else, I found some very officious and some taking that place as a fiefdom. This year, I did not have any representation from the SZCC because the Finance Committee meeting could not be held because of the absence of the Chief. And once the Finance Committee was held, then there was nobody to sign. It is something like if the mother is not in the house, everyone will go without food because the sister or others do not have the right to cook or serve. This one experience is of one SCZCC. In spite of the pressure I could bring upon them through the Ministry of Culture, I could never make them pay for one single troupe in terms of Rs. 25,000 and travel by second-class. That is one part. The other part is that over telephones, these people understood. Vishwas does not remember me and his successor, Dashora Saheb is a wonderful person. He is doing a lot. So, ultimately, whether he is an IAS, IPS or whatever, some people get the ZCC and some of them want to use it as an opportunity that I have got, I have got an office space, I have got some funds and I want to do something for which I am given this chair. There are some such people, a good many, and on the other hand, there are some people who believe as if they are paying through their pockets and making us really bleed and suffer. So, it is the individual which matters. Now, how can this thing of an individual be monitored?

One, there should be regular interaction between the zones with the persons of our National Monitoring Committee so that everybody knows what the other is thinking and what the other is doing or not doing. There needs to be a very good network at the national level between the Departments and between the Zones and within the Zones. For example, in West Bengal, there is a Section for Tribal Art and Welfare. They do excellent job, but unless that is related to the ZCC and there is knowledge about what is happening, they cannot coordinate. It took some of my dancer friends chancily, by quantum mechanics, to come across that there is a Kathak village. How can a ZCC Director come to know the net worth of knowledge? So, there has to be very precise local advisor or whichever supportive group from various agencies, institutes and individuals. It is just not the artistes. That local State to State and inter-State functioning needs to happen. In this way, I believe from my experience, ZCCs have actually kept our festival on. This year, there will be five groups coming from different parts of the country because of the ZCCs, the little financial support that they can give to an old festival of 27 year old standing.

Similarly, I am using my case in point as an example. I repeat that there should be a national body to oversee and guide, and occasionally meet the people who are running the thing. Then, there a need for inter-State networking, the networking within the States and involvement of the local State's regional institutes' persons, artistes and managers, with a degree of accountability so that some people who are fief-holder can understand it. I just cannot even refer to something which happened in one of the zones, where one director had to be thrown out of State. The Governor had taken the step because of the kind of misbehavior he had indulged in. These are the extremes, but again these people have made us cry. There would be good people like Vishwas, Dashora and earlier ZCC Directors. The question is how to monitor them at multiple levels so that there is always an inflow of information of what is happening and how things are happening. That is very important. That will create a kind of accountability and transparency. Otherwise, some good people remain isolated and insulated and some bad people also remain isolated and insulated.

SHRI SITAKANT MAHAPATRA : At this stage, I would like to make some general observations because I feel that it will be useful to get the response of all of you to them. Firstly, in our system, it is recognized everywhere and we are all aware of the continuum. We are not thinking of folk tribal culture different from classical culture. There is a continuum. There is everywhere in the world search for roots. Luckily, in our system also, for classical arts, whether it is classical dance or classical songs, it is going on. In so many ways they are doing search of roots in performing arts, in visual arts and so on. When you hear Hari Prasad Chaurasia playing, he also goes to a dhun which is a folk tune. Bhim Sen Joshi also goes back accordingly. No one would know better than Sonal Mansingh and others how Odissi Dance is a classical form which has emerged from the village in ghoti puas. I would not multiply as several instances are there. Therefore, that continuity and awareness of the classical tradition is there that our roots spread somewhere. It is not today but many yesterdays are behind it and the roots are spreading.

For example, Leela Samson was here day before yesterday. Naturally, the Sangeet Natak Akademi was mandated to look after the classical and luckily, the classical systems, that is, the ancient songs have stabilized and have been written about and so on, but it is not so for the folk and tribal thing because the repertoire is massive which is spread over this whole country over the years. People have still been creating it now. It is not that classical artistes are not creating. There are more choreographies and all that. But here not much has been done. Even the Sangeet Natak Akademi has agreed, that is what Leela Samson felt, that a time has come when we should also give more attention to folk and tribal culture. I was wondering in that context whether just as we have Centre for Classical Dances or Classical Songs, why can't Sangeet Natak Akademi think of a separate centre for folk and tribal, particularly the performing arts. I am not worried about literary arts. I am aware that Sahitya Kala Akademi, beyond the 15 major languages, have gone to Santhali and many others. I know very much about it because I am myself fluent in Santhali. That is being done

particularly for folk performing arts. Therefore, particularly for folk performing arts, there could be some mechanism. We have been thinking of where it can be done.

So much has been said about the Director and the Chairman also observed day before yesterday that Search Committee of Public Sector undertakings go on searching and ultimately finds somebody's nephew. That was a good observation. I did not mean that. All that I thought of is that we have to caste our net and wherever you find a good cultural manager, we should know of him. In this country, management is difficult. You have got extremely good professors, but when it comes to Director of Education, no one would like to take even a good profession. The same thing is about doctors. You will find excellent surgeons and doctors, but you will not find a good Director, Health Services. The only thing is how to get the cultural managers. I will not name the person, but some years ago a great architect was chosen for Lalit Kala Akademi and put there, he had confided to me that he feels out of place here and then he thought of resigning after a month. That sort of thing is there.

Our Chairman mentioned about the example of Indian Postal Service or IPS. Wherever you find them, you have to know of them. That is how we have to caste our net wide. And having done that, it should not be the end also. We are deeply aware the culture is such a moving thing and technology is so fast-going these days, maybe they should also go for a refresher course, not only the Directors but also Programme Officers. There is a Council of Cultural Resources and Training. I am deeply aware of what kind of work they are doing. Surely, they could train some of the people of seven ZCCs, maybe for a fortnight or ten days so that they are enabled to do this.

Archiving is difficult because they are not equipped technologically, professionally or managerially to do it. What about NGOs and outreach etc. I am aware of some of the work which has been even done by the so-called professionals. Even they are not up to the standard because it has come to so much now on the system, how it is to be done. There are two different schools, for example. While some group says that it should be isolated and there are others who say that no, when you are recording in these areas, you should do in situ. Therefore, if there is a passing car or anything, let it come because tomorrow you will find that your NGOs or Doordarshan or others will take them to a separate place and do the recording. The most important thing, to my mind, is that between the classical artistes and the folk artistes, we have to see the environment in which they operate. A classical artiste has the privilege of having symbolism, whether it is in gestures or paintings or whatever, but that kind of higher symbolism is not available to the folk artistes because his roots are more in the social wave and he derives from that. Therefore, for me, this is a problem. Many folk artistes are excellent in a particular environment and they take so much of time to acclimatize. I know about the details of chhau because I did so much for it. I am deeply aware of their problems. When they went abroad for the first time, they were at a loss because they did not know how to get adjusted to that kind of milieu. So, their acclimatization should be proper. There should be reasonable thing. Nobody is saying that they should be paid the same thing as

classical artistes or Tejan Bai, but the point is that it should not be so disparate that it looks very bad.

The whole thing of copyright is also coming now that why should you only make folk artistes dance. From the British days, that tradition has been followed that the Minister has come and you come and perform. What I mean is that there should be proper acclimatization because they perform in situ in their village festival or whatever. It is always a triad - song, dance and ritual observation. Now, transplanting that on to urban milieu is not easy for the performer, but that is where the ZCCs have made a good beginning and they need to go ahead with this.

As regards archiving, we feel that at least whatever has already been done in terms of performing arts and other things, whatever be the quality, they will try to obtain copies of them. Even some of the films have been made by several people. They can also be obtained. For each zone, they should build up something relating to cultural baton, publish literary book so that some kind of library plus archive is there, but not a detailed or large because then they will feel the need of having a Librarian. But it has to be done.

These are the general points I wanted to make at this stage so that we could get the benefit of eminent people like you.

MS. SONAL MANSINGH: I had 18 months as Chairman of Sangeet Natak Akademi. I had broken the taboo and I was the first dancer. I am gladly liaising out there, but for political interference, I would have finished my tenure and done a lot of things that still need to be done.

Regarding documentation, there is so much of duplication or triplication between the ZCCs, this agency and that Akademi. What is the purpose of documentation unless we can put it in a systematic way and give it to public? It is not available to anyone.

Secondly, I would suggest creation of an Indian Heritage Service where so many services like the Railway Service, Forest Service, and Information Service are existing. There, you train officers particularly in this entire field. It is a fast field. It is not just dance and song. As we have been talking about this all about India, I think, this is a very serious thing. I think, Mani you can suggest it and take up it. I think, the time has come, after 63 years, to look at it very seriously.

I would also take up this issue of what Pratibha has mentioned. I did not want to come to that, but the arrogance of officers, most officers unfortunately, is there. There are some nice officers also. It is too much for an artist like me to bear. I have nothing to do with the Ministry of Culture, but I am told that you were never available. There is no committee and nothing. A Sonal Mansingh is fit enough to get a Padmavibhushan but not fit enough to give advice or expertise or opinion or suggestion for any of the cultural bodies. I am very grateful to you Mani that you thought of me. Thank you

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ustad Amjad Ali Khan was also making the same point yesterday. Obviously there are sarkari artistes and non-sarkari artistes. Let me apologise to all of you on behalf of my biradari for rude behavior, but then they come in all shapes and sizes.

I suggest that we break for lunch now.

**(LUNCH BREAK)**

## 15th December, 2010 Post Lunch

### (AFTER LUNCH BREAK)

SHRI BANSI KAUL: I think, I am the only one here amongst everybody present, who has been part of the ZCCs from the day it began and I did not discontinue my relationship with them. That is from when the first preamble was written at 12 o'clock in the night and Mr. Mani Shankar Aiyar was there. I remember, Shri Rajiv Gandhi calling us to his house. He would meet us only at 1 o'clock in the night because that was the only time he would have to talk about these things. Before the preamble was written, he said that I want this nation to know each other. He meant that a Kashmiri does not know Manipuri and a Manipur did not know a Malyali. So, the idea was basically to get people to know each other through these art forms and artistes also know each other, at least a Kashmiri rope artist would know what is happening in Manipur. I suppose, it was because of that first Apna Usav happened. In the hilly State, it was for the first time that 7,000-8,000 artistes met and they looked at each other like some aliens watching each other who has come from where. Suddenly, a Malyali would ask Kashmiri what you do. He would reply in broken Hindi that I do machnagma, what do you do? He would say that I also dance. But you need translators. Then, this village was created where all of them would stay. Khanpur was the first village that was created. East Zone had created their own kitchen. So, it is only after the whole day performances were finished that actual performances would start in the night, only after 9.30 pm or 10.30 pm where they would meet and talk to each other. There were camp fires and you will get to know of lot of problems within the nation also. For instance, I remember that one day there was a very big fight. Two groups from Kolkata Zone were fighting - Bengali and Oriya people - because traditionally it looks that all Oriya were cooks in the Bengali families and they had an Oriya cook in that camp, who refused to give food to Bengalis. Then Bengali said that this is your work. He said that no, it is for the first time that we have come here on equal footing. I have also come to dance and I will not cook for you. I think, there was a kind of secularism that was created through these art forms in getting to know each other. It continued, in fact, for many years. The ZCCs did become a hit. I had seen all Kathakali performers excepting one episode of Putana Vadh. For some reason, I had missed it. I saw that ultimately in a village in Haryana. There was Mahabharat Festival and one group had come from Kerala. This group was asked to perform around 40 kilometres from Kurukshetra in a village, where all jats and others were sitting. There were 800-900 people sitting in an angan where I saw Putna Vadh. It is very fascinating that you could see Indian art not at a place where it originated but at another place, which created some kind of dialogue between the people, the relationship within the people.

There is another very interesting thing, if you remember Dr. Saheb. Twenty five years ago, many Indian art forms, particularly the agrarian forms, I will not call them folk forms, were still community dances. Therefore, it was a way of life and that way of life becoming a performing art has happened in the last 25 years, which means that these ZCCs and the idea

of ZCC has created this new idea of way of life becoming a performing art. Since the way of life was changing in this country, the art forms would have died because the agricultural modes were changing, the economy was also changing.

Another thing which happened simultaneously with ZCCs, if we remember correctly, was that on the one side there were ZCCs created and on the other, there was communication technology revolution which was becoming a major thing and which was initiated by Sam Pitroda. All of you may remember. There was one more thing that happened. There happened three things together. Fortunately, the other two things went ahead and we were left behind - the arts. These three things did not develop simultaneously, which could have really helped arts.

The third thing was that the Literacy Mission of India was started. The creation of literacy art movement was done by these art forms. That is why, kalajathas were created. It was 90 per cent kalajathas which were used. They were folk artistes, agrarian artistes or tribal artistes and their songs were used to spread the literacy message and suddenly, in certain States where the literacy rate was 5 per cent, it went up to 20 or 60 per cent except Kerala, which was highly literate. This was done unknowingly by the ZCCs because it was they who would provided this input to Literacy Mission of India. The SRCs were started in this country and SRCs took help from the ZCCs where ZCCs provided them these agrarian artistes and these kalajathas helped literacy rate go up to 50 per cent. Now, literacy became 50 per cent literacy, but the folk performer remained where he was. To me, now the ZCCs need to look at these issues. If it helps others, how would others help them now? How will communication technology help them now? How can education help them now? These things need to be taken seriously.

When we say that we were supposed to go and perform only in villages, it is a good idea that villagers need to be entertained and we should go and perform for them. It is also important that even the villager himself does not want to perform in his own place only; he wants to perform outside also as he wants to get exposure. Secondly, the things have changed in the last 25 years. This very performer whose son or child or daughter would become part of a performing group, they have stopped becoming performers. Because of the literacy mission, they have become literate. They have started going to schools and colleges. So, their children do not perform since we did not give respect whereby they would think that art is important in their lives. They were treated and are still being treated as pariahs. I can give you hundreds of examples in the last five to ten years. Whenever big festivals have happened in this country, they have gone back so discontented that they did not say anything. They just kept quiet. I can give you a list of people, particularly in Chhattisgarh, some of Madiah and Mariah groups which do not now come and perform. Now, they go and support naxalite movement because we have really misbehaved with them. We need to respect them, to give them a feeling that they are not pariahs, even if they go and perform all over the world.

Therefore, what the ZCCs need now at this stage is funds. Then, they should concentrate on

asking their officers really how to deal with these artistes, how to respect them and how to treat them as human-beings. Then, lot of training programmes are needed because they were only way of life art forms. Then, it was a community dance. Now once they have become performing arts, performing arts have different rules. Whenever it was a way of life, everybody was dancing. Now when you make him into an artiste, there are two communities - one which is performing and one which is watching. When you have two communities, the rules change. Therefore, the ZCCs need to pick up lot of training programmes for these people. Like you have Drama School and all other kinds of schools, I think a lot of training programmes are needed to tell about how to present them. I am not saying how they look, and how to use technology. Even if they do not have technology, how to use performing space, how to do your entry and exist and how to use make up? You give them exposure as things are changing in this world now.

Funds are important because it started with this whole idea of giving them a corpus. These people had invested their money into public sectors when the interest rate was 15 per cent. Then, subsequently when Governments changed, they did not really care much and the interest rate came down to six or seven per cent. So, half of their work was finished. So, they could not do any activity. It is only some officers who were genuinely interested who had been Culture Secretary, who on their own would go and get money. They would go to different politicians and say that please give us some money. But unless you have a regular Plan budget for them, they cannot run. You cannot run these institutions on non-Plan budget because after all SNA or NSD are running because they have a definite Plan budget. How do you expect seven ZCCs to run their programme on Non-Plan budget? Non-Plan budget depends on if it is a good bureaucrat and he is happy with you, he will say that give him a project. So, you are always at the mercy of somebody. In the last fifteen years, these ZCCs have survived on the mercy of individuals. If there is a good bureaucrat, he will say that you take your group to Republic Day Parade, do this or that. I think, this Plan budget for them is necessary; otherwise they will not survive.

It was, I think, in the First Apna Utsav that Apna Utsav Society was created. It was only at that time that you had decided that we should have an apex body and Apna Utsav Society was supposed to be the apex body. It is still registered with the Ministry of Culture and Ministry of Culture has still Rs. 2 crore left. They do not know what to do with it. If they can survive this Apna Utsav Society, whose Chairman used to be Mr. J P Agarwal who is now Congress President of Delhi, and if that becomes an apex body, it would help. It is already there in the Ministry of Culture with Rs. 2 crore.

There are two or three things which the ZCCs need to do. Let us not think of only villages. If you say that India will have 60 per cent youth in the days to come, then we need to concentrate on students now. Art now needs to go to students, to schools, to colleges and to universities where at least Indian students will get to know what Indian heritage is and what Indian arts are. It is important that we should go and perform for villages, but we also need

to cater to this whole major segment in this country, which is 'students'. We should really concentrate on that and go and perform in colleges, universities and schools. It is being neglected because we think that it is not important. That collaboration can be done with one of your own other Ministries, called CCRT. All of them could be brought together to do a lot of things. These are my suggestions.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. You have taken us on a nostalgia walk and also given us some very useful suggestions.

MS. SUDHA GOPALAN: Like my colleagues who have presented, I also agree with the diagnosis that ZCCs in the recent past have become more offices than live centers of culture. After Shilpa Gram, perhaps not many ZCCs have been able to put together very significant activities, even when population interested in culture is on the rise, not just in India but elsewhere also. When we look at the West, I feel that many people from all over the world look at us as cultural leader and we have not been able to tap that kind of a potential by revitalizing cultures and that too cultures at the grass root level - the local cultures, the folk cultures.

In my opinion, what the ZCCs would now require is big idea that could revitalize them. So many points have been raised here which are all very vital, but in my opinion, one program which would be kind of re-positioning the ZCCs as nodal centres for creating a national inventory of items of intangible cultural heritage, which is of very vital significance not just nationally but internationally also in terms of reckoning that we ourselves can make of what we have and how much we have, what we can do with it. In terms of how to put this in practice, I would like to say that this could be a kind of an electronic database which could work by positioning all these ZCCs to have a larger network with other academies and cultural institutions, coming up to the Culture Ministry at the Central level. It could be made into a whole network in which at the grass root level, the ZCCs could take up documentation at the ground level and put them into a record kind of thing.

In my previous assignment as Mission Director, National Mission for Manuscripts, we have done such an experiment. In the last four years, we have been able to make database of one million manuscripts which were scatter all across the country. So, I am not saying that we have to replicate that kind of a model. Whatever model that works will be very worthwhile to get things together. I do not think any other institution has the same reach as the ZCCs into the interiors of India. What they now perceive as a disadvantage in terms of not being Sangeet Natak Academy could be turned into an advantage because who else has that kind of a reach. I think, if this kind of a perception can be developed, it will be very beneficial.

This also involves documentation of not just performing arts but a wide range of heritage expressions, so-called classical traditions and also folk population traditions of culture, such as oral traditions. For example, performing arts, social practices, rituals and festive events,

many of which we do not have the memory right now and many of which old people have some traditional knowledge but are not really passed on to the younger people. These could be also traditional craftsmanship, material arts and even monuments and sites across those areas. These young people in and around those areas could be revitalized to document these things through the process of documenting oral history. I think, that could be a very important step and only the ZCCs could take up that kind of work. By doing so, the ZCCs would be able to connect with roots, which otherwise we will not be able to do and which is fast losing in our time and in our culture.

Then, of course, I would like to emphasise on training. Training is very important because there are old people who are the bearers of knowledge. There should be such a provision that they should be made to pass on that knowledge to young people. I do not think that all this needs very big technical skill, but a small DVD or camera is something that we need to catch all that. That will be very vital for future generations, maybe after 30 or 40 years. If that could be woven into the structure at this time when you are planning a new revitalization programme for the ZCCs, it will be better. Thank you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: That was a very useful set of suggestions.

SHRI SITAKANT MAHAPATRA. There is one thing that all this literature is not being taken seriously. I would not have known about Santhali poetry if I had not read *Awakening Wind* which was a collection of oral poetry. Otherwise, in the next five or ten next years, we will not have any oral poetry left in this country. Performance arts will still survive, but oral traditions and literature will be gone forever which is not a big document. You have to record it and transcribe it. I think, this is very important which we need to take up very seriously.

MS SUDHA GOPALAN : For this documentation of heritage, we had registration officers. They are very highly qualified people because to identify what is worth recording is very difficult. If you go to a village and see an ancient stone, you do not know whether it is of great significance or not. In this scheme, the Government of India was funding 50 per cent and the States were funding 50 per cent. They did register a lot of valuables all over the country. There was a scheme that if you own valuable, you can come to them and get it evaluated and registered. They only registered it. This information was available, but unfortunately, the Government of India started winding up that scheme. So, in the ZCC, there is no qualified person who can identify what is a heritage thing to register.

MS. : Again, I would like to differ with what you are saying. What we need to make is only a standard data-sheet in which the name, the locale, the address of the person and name of the bearer is to be mentioned. I am sure, there will be local people who will be aware of what they have. Once you get into the network of civic society, you could work together with local bodies and also civic society. I am sure, many people would know what they have. I think, as much as possible a beginning is always vital rather than saying that it is not impossible. It is always possible. This is my feeling.

MS. : I am not saying that this is not possible. What I am saying is that then the ZCC would require well qualified persons to do this because later on all this becomes very debatable. If you take a temple, it has to be carbon dated to know whether it is an ancient temple or not, whether it is a replica, what is its historical significance. These are more technical kind of things.

MS .. : I am sure that there will be people associated with the temple that somebody from the outside who would be able to very authoritatively say about this. The second thing is that there is always a contestation between the good and the best, but I am sure that something is possible.

SHRI AMOL PALEKAR: Let us not burden the ZCCs with this because they are not qualified is a very realistic way of looking at it. I appreciate this. But this needs to be done and they can take assistance from other agencies. I think what Mr. Bansi said, it is a very important that our oral traditions, oral treasures which are soon going to be forgotten, soon going to be overtaken by Munni badnam hui and all that, which is being bombarded into us day in and day out and right into our bedrooms. So, we have to face that and live with that. At the same time, all this needs to be recorded and preserved in the best possible manner. How to do it, which agency can help etc. is a technical matter and managerial way of how to deal with it, but for us is to acknowledge that it needs to be preserved, recorded and archived.

MS. . : I feel that this is an opportunity rather than a problem.

SHRI AMOL PALEKAR: Even with performing arts, it is a big problem. What is a traditional performing art, how it was being performed 50 years back and how it is being performed today, whether it has been bastardised today, vulgarized today. But unless we know what was the original form, we cannot keep criticizing and rejecting it by saying that now everything has become influenced by Bollywood dances and which is how it is going to be, but what was the original form. As I had mentioned earlier, I will quickly share with you all that. There is one very veteran, great artiste from Maharashtra called Yamuna Bai Vaikar. She is still alive fortunately. This lady has a great khazana of over 300 lavanis which are traditional, original songs of oral tradition. They will vanish away. I have been trying to tell people at least to go and record literature part of it, if not visual part of it. I am not capable of doing that because there has to be an agency that can take this up, do this. I can only guide them, take them. I can sit with Yamuna Bai and make her talk. All this needs to be preserved. If we do not do it, we ourselves will be deprived of it.

SHRI .. : I think, this is part of intangible heritage.

MS. . : Yes, oral history is part of intangible heritage.

MS. : Sangeet Natak Academy has a documentation centre where they were looking at major traditional forms and they do document it.

MS. . : Maybe in those areas, you can look at PPP mode with people who have the expertise.

SHRI AMOL PALEKAR: All I would like to say is that all these academis and all these ZCCs, unfortunately, tend to become their own ivory towers and want to create their own kingdom and then how to preserve that kingdom and let nobody else enter into that. This is the mindset which, I personally think, needs to be changed so that we can have something good on interactive front.

MS. .: Unfortunately, they hate each other.

SHRI.SITA KANT MAHAPATRA: In this connection, I want to say something about oral literature. In the early seventies, a gentleman called Jagdish Triguna Yat was among the mundas. He collected their oral poetry, one of the first, and he took the original on the left hand side and the right hand side of this - bansuri baj rahi hai. He sent me a copy because we used to know each other. At that time also, I had started my work on oral poetry of Eastern Indian tribes. I wrote to the Chief Secretary, Bihar. He said that some of our researchers went - I think Jagdish Triguna Yat is no more - and found that the songs he had collected from the villages are not longer available. I was not surprised because I had collected songs from 8 or 9 tribal communities of Eastern India and some of the songs have gone out already. But luckily, they have put them together, first in monograph and now in a major volume, which is published by UNESCO called They Sing Life.

On the performing art dance side, these traditions are dying out and before our own eyes, they are dying away. Now even ten years back, these dance forms were there. I have seen Santhal dance of a particular type. The girls and boys used to have appropriate floral garlands and bracelet etc. which is no longer there. The boys do dance, but some of them in the colleges and all that. They go back with their trousers and maybe T-shirt, but so long as they know the dance, the lore of the tribe, to that extent, the core is preserved and that itself becomes a method of hope because in these matters one can only hope and whatever you can retrieve, the better it is. That is why, it is inter-linking and networking aspect that we are concerned with.

SHRI SIDDHARTH KAK: I start with just a small preamble. As you said, who is to decide what has to be recorded. I would advise against that because what can be considered worthless today is very valuable tomorrow. So, just record. If you have somebody coming in and telling you that this is what is to be recorded, then you are already taking a pre-judgement. Even there is no problem in respect of monuments. There are well known monuments and there are lesser known monuments. We have in our time covered stuff which is under the ground, just taking out what it is and it has not even been interpreted. It has been maintained by the local villagers. They say that somebody should come before somebody steals all these things because these idols and stuff lying around is taken away and then sold somewhere else. So, just record. For recording, you can just use any kind of simple

equipment. As we just discussed earlier, this is the best of your intellectual property right. If you do not record, it does not exist or nothing exists. If you have to prove it before a council that this is the previous property right owner, you have to have some documentation.

To Amol, I may just say that yes, it is so tragic what you are talking about. Recording is such a simple thing. Even if somebody takes a DVD out there - it will not even cost you Rs. 1,000 to get it done in a particular day. Then, there are millions of such examples lying there. I would also say that Munni is part of our culture as well and if Munni badnam hui is able to popularize some folk music or for something behind it and acknowledges it and pays for it so much, the better for Munni badnam hui, according to me. Every culture is like the river flowing. So, you cannot put your finger in it and stop it out there.

MR. CHAIRMAN: In fact, I have just read in Outlook in an article by Maria and Babbar that all WikiLeaks relating to conversation between the American Ambassador Anne Patterson and Zardari and others are being played there with the background being munni badnaam hui.

SHRI.KAK : It is doing something for India. Bollywood is popular round the world because of such things. I will perhaps come back to it in a slightly different way later.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I think, the point Amol was making is of the danger of Munni badnaam hui overtaking whatever was there rather than saying that you should not have both; he is saying let us have both but he thinks that Munni will survive on her own accord because she has got plenty of darlings whereas these other oral traditions need some patronage. That is what we need to get preserved.

SHRI KAK : So, we need to examine and understand why Munni badnaam hui has so many darlings.

MR. CHAIRMAN: It seems to me clear from this discussion that there needs to be a special emphasis on building synergies between the ZCCs and those who are really professionally capable of doing this instead of either leaving it to the ZCCs to do the archiving in an extremely unprofessional manner or leaving it to organizations, that do not know the existence of the ZCCs, to do it on their own. So, all can work together.

Please carry on.

SHRI AMOL PALEKAR: I was just going to add that other than this Munni badnaam hui and all that, the actual danger, according to me in my very small humble opinion, is the reality shows which are going on and we are getting carried away by Rakhi Sawant ka Insaaf and Rahul Mahajan ka Swayamvar. These are the things which on one hand you do know how to stop, that onslaught, how to stop that bombardment. On that background, we need to see seriously how this can be preserved and nurtured.

SHRI SIDDHARTH KAK. : Then, we should give eent ka jawab pathar se. Now the point is that if you are going to see, you cannot wish away Rakhi Sawant but examine what makes

them powerful and apply those principles to folk and culture. That is really what I am trying to say. I do not think that the heavy hand of the Government is really going to get it going because we have seen how it has worked all this while. What I am also hearing in this room up to now is what should be and how it should be. We are diagnosing the problem all over again. What is the solution?

With your indulgence, I would like to outline two or three areas. First and foremost, if you carry the battle to the enemy camp and say theoretically that Munni is the enemy, she has become popular for some reason in the eyes of the audience. She has audience. What is the value of the Munni? It is nothing. If the film was a flop, no one would have talked about it. You talk about it because the film has succeeded and struck a chord. Similarly, if you have folk artistes, folk performances, folk exhibitions etc. which do not strike accord with the audience, no one is going to talk about them after that. Once you strike a chord, you will find entrepreneurs coming in and waiting to join with the, then take that artistes and take these things until it has a life of its own. This must be replicated down the line and not only in the urban areas.

SHRI AMOL PALEKAR : There is one very interesting thing that this Munni badnaam hui is a Bhojpuri song. It was a very popular song. Due to the song which has been sung now, the original song has come back to Bhojpur. Now those cassettes have started again. Now people have forgotten the new song and an industry has started of the old songs because at that time, it was recorded also on a gramophone, four lines of it. If you listen that song, you will find that this song is nowhere in comparison to that. Suddenly, the original song has become again popular.

MR. CHAIRMAN: May I call the meeting to order and get the meeting back to ZCCs because Munni has overtaken the whole proceedings.

SHRI KAK: I think, there are two or three things which I may suggest could be the solutions, which are over-arching solutions and would obviously have to be fine-tuned for it. Can the attitude of ZCCs change from just a government institution to a public-private partnership concept? Can each ZCC involve those who are in the private field as well in the work that they do? I was just reading about cultural celebrities. That is fine and some of them bring baggage with them also. There must be NGOs, events managing organizations. There may be corporate wanting to do local CSR. There may be public sector organizations also wanting to do CSR. Can they be engaged or involved in the activity so that you are able to popularize these programmes and have many more programmes? I do not think they should be only in the villages because, as he said, they also want to go out. Now in urban areas, there are huge gaps between privilege urbans and the less privileges urbans who do not get anything at all, who do not even have an opportunity to go to those theatres, but there are grounds and open spaces where so much of performances can taken place and they are very vibrant. Those people in the urban areas, uprooted from their homes, are equally

in the same position as wanting to recall their culture or be exposed to other cultures. So, the first thing is whether we can have public-private partnership as a mantra.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Can I just interrupt to say that it was originally envisaged in exactly the same way, but as we generally discover, until the market cap of an organization goes up, the private sector does not get interested and the market cap of ZCCs has not gone up. So, if there were ways in which we could promote corporate or NGO interest in these organizations, it is only to be welcomed. That is why, they were conceived even initially as registered societies. They are not government offices, although they have been run like government offices. Legally speaking, they are all autonomous registered societies who are free to establish whatever linkages they can with the private sector. Whether it is local or across miles, they are welcome to do so, but we really need to get them dynamised internally because the corporates would do this instantly but they would expect them to do the job and into that they put the money, but it is for themselves to run the show. So, we would need to build them up to the point where they become attractive enough to find partners. They are still the ugly ducklings rather than the white swan stage.

SHRI : I am not only referring to corporate because I would say that you have local artistes and you have successful entrepreneurs and NGOs. Even if they link with them, there would be greater friendship.

SHRI . : We are working with corporate sector. IIFCO is giving us funds to protect alah singing of UP. We did the documentation with the help of IIFCO. Now ONGC has come with another plan that we sill support, do it for us.

SHRI : That is good that you are doing it with public sector.

MS . : Once you are talking about public sector, there is what is known as backyard CSR, especially for corporate that are located there.

SHRI .. : IIFCO did it only because of that CSR.

SHRI SIDDHARTH KAK: If you have got anything from ONGC or whoever, it is the second point that I am saying. It is to professionalize it. You have to make a proposal. In order to make a proposal, you really need professional people. How do you professionalize? It is the training and all that. It is a long term process. That will happen, but the first thing is whether we can set targets in each zone. Now you are going into the next financial year. Can we plan for 2011-12? Can there be a cultural objective? Can there be a financial objective? Can there be a geographic objective? Can all these three then become the mandate to be reviewed, every quarter if you feel like, as any organization's activities are reviewed, and pass judgment? Obviously, the person who is going to head that has now got to be capable of that. If you want to find people, you have to look at a remuneration package which also offers if not as much but somewhere near. It is going to be transformed by individuals. Finally, if the system is conducive, the individual will work much better out there. If you say

where to find them, if you give adequate remuneration package, just advertise it and you will be surprised to see how many young people will respond to it. You will be surprised that a lot of young people in our country are proud to be Indian, but they do not know what to be proud of because they are bombarded with the Western media, with the images, material and so on. They are very Indian, but should they be proud of Nike shoes? What are they to be proud of? Here are things that they can be proud of.

Lastly, I would say that recognition will only happen in terms of success that the community accepts. You will not be able to force respect from the people at the airport or from those people who are not respecting because you are telling them to respect them. They want to be convinced of giving them respect and they can only be convinced if the ZCCs, they first respect the artistes, they first highlight them. If they have a very professional system of promoting them, marketing them, valuing them, actually seeing them in the shows, actually earning moneys through them, making them sustainable and themselves becoming sustainable in the process, other people will automatically respect them because today you respect somebody who is independent. If we were all on the dole out here, we would not have been called here to give any suggestion. People have survived in this kind of scenario which means that they have somehow professionalized themselves. Since they have got independent value, they will get respect. It will have to be earned. Unfortunately, it cannot be dictated. We are not respecting them. Then, why should anybody else respect them. I am not too sure that some other agency is more qualified to do it.

As far as documentation is concerned, that is an extremely important thing. For the last 25 years, I have been hearing that traditions are dying out. They are dying out, but they are evolving and dying. You have to put your boat into the flowing river and at some point, you will start flowing with it because the river will continue to flow. What shape that river will take tomorrow I do not know. But if you put your finger into it right now and coast along with it, then you will move with the culture. So, I think, documentation should not be seen as a footnote. It should be seen as the first step towards understanding, recognizing, establishing and then giving honour and credibility to the very artistes who have created this intangible culture because that is why, we are Indians. So, we are proud of that, but are unable to support it in any manner.

I would tell you that we have recorded 15,000 hours of footage on Indian art and culture not because anybody paid us, but we were lucky to have a programme. We were fortunate and privileged. How to handle that is another issue altogether. How do you preserve it over the years? Through you, I would like to say that for the last ten years, I was desperate about what to do. We are creating what, I believe, is the world's first heritage theme park in New Bombay. We have now got the land from the State Government. It is the first such park based on India. It is the first one which will take Indian folk, Indian culture, Indian history and Indian traditions to masses. We will create original constructs of Shivaji's history, Indian cinema, Panchatantra and so on and so forth to create engaging interactions with India's art

and culture. It would also be a cultural hub pretty much as these ZCCs are and to encourage that.

I am glad that somebody talked of Community Radio because I have a meeting tomorrow. We have applied for a Community Radio space out there. I can tell you that from the media, folk art and folk culture has got no efforts on television today. It was at one time that Doordarshan will become only a social broadcaster. Nowhere is the space for folk art and culture because it does not make any money for you. You have to start it to make some money and to have it to appear on radio and TV, you have to make it cool so that it becomes very popular.

I am looking it to be a cultural hub as well. Community Radio should be able to popularize cultural forms around in the district and give platform to young people to interact with them and know about their own art and culture. There should be actually volunteer programmes. ZCCs can have young people's volunteer programmes. We had suggested to ASI why don't you have young volunteers programme so that you have people coming from all over the country and documenting monuments for you. There would be people coming from schools and colleges, if you have two-week programmes. ZCCs may offer these fellowships etc. for cultural things at higher level, but volunteer programmes for young people may be there so that there is a sense of ownership for art for it to survive. It cannot be imposed. Give energy from within. Try to give that type of sanctity from inside rather than imposing it from outside.

MS. MAITRI: I am a dancer and do choreography. For the last few years, I am working with folk artistes and rural artistes. I can only share my experience with you. It is a very nice opportunity to convey their problems. We discussed so many things, but I can say their practical problems. Today that rural art is alive only because of ZCCs. Their art forms are famous only because of ZCCs. Initially, it was very classy, it was a pride for them. Now also it is there, but I think, the work level has increased and because of that the quality is not there, the class is not there. Now-a-days, too many festivals are happening. Rather than we concentrate on their training, their process of developing, we are too much looking forward to their festivals.

Lok Tarang is the only national folk dance festival. During the Commonwealth Games, it so happened that seven or eight Lok Tarangs happened in Delhi's street corners. It is painful to see such a nice festival on the streets. We cannot do it with classical festivals. The ZCCs take even that type of decisions. I do not know who will take care of those types of decisions, but there are some wrong decisions which they are taking. Since we are choreographing festivals, I know that the artistes are forgetting their own dance and are now preparing their dance according to our demand. They cannot dance for 15-30 minutes. They are preparing their dance for three to five minutes because we are demanding like that. That has to be taken care of. Sometimes, they improvise something from other culture and change their

customs for dance. Who will take care of that? ZCC has to take care of that. They have changed, but you cannot change that.

Secondly, the folk artistes' children are not learning their own dance. Kalvelia is a very famous dance. We will not get 20 Kalvelia artistes from Rajasthan now-a-days because their children are not learning. Everywhere they are facing the same problem. If the ZCCs can take care of that aspect and the school children can also learn their original dance, it will become popular. Like school children are learning Bharatnatyam and Kathak at school level, they can also learn regional dance at school level. So many festivals are happening and we call them at the last minute at a notice of three to five days. How will they come? We do not think about that. They do not get reservation. Anyhow, they have to come and they come also, but if there is some emergency and the ZCCs can take care of their reservation and all that, it will be better. The ZCC tries to arrange for their stay and boarding and lodging, but sometimes it is very sad to see that arrangement. It has to be taken care of properly. They should take care of their basic boarding and lodging. In any case, they are getting very less for their performances. I asked artistes why your children are not doing it, why your son or daughter is not doing it, they say what they will do. After five years, I cannot dance and I do not know how I will survive. So, it is better if they pull rickshaw or do something else. After ten years or twenty years when a folk dance will not dance, how will he survive? We should pay attention to that also.

So many seniors have discussed so many things. Thank you.

MS. ARSHYA SETHI: Thank you very much for including me in this discussion. For a very long time, I had been concerned about the idea which was touted, which I grew up with, as unity in diversity. I always felt that the state of Indian arts was about celebrating unity and less about celebrating the diversity. In that context, the ZCC played a very important role of correcting the balance of the initial distortions. When the ZCCs were born, they were created at a time when India had already been an independent country for four decades and there was no further need to prove to the world that despite being a young nation, we actually have a very old civilization. More important at that time were other issues that were raising their heads, which included political centrifugal forces and all the social problems that arose from the breaking up of the protective net of the closely-knit communities. While ICCR and national academies address the former concerns, the ZCCs were directed mostly towards the later. This decentralization and maturation of federalism that was reflected in the ZCCs such that there was a concerted effort to stay away from the national image and the State image and we were looking at zonal areas of operations. I think, that was a sign of maturity of the whole idea.

Today if we need to go back to revisit the idea, I think, we need to understand some of the issues that why it went wrong. I feel one of the reasons was that while the idea was very good, maybe it was little before its time. Definitely, it was a little before the time of

PPP model, which today is pretty much the buzzword. They had this provision for PPP built into it, but it was not exploited. I do not know of any ZCC Director who was not from the Government or very closely associated with the Government in 35 years of myself being in art administration. I am not a performer. Frankly, so, I have no place to be in many forms, but that is despite being in arts for 35 years and serving the arts. There was never an opportunity like this that came up. I think that PPP may be taken in a larger context of including civil society agencies, non-government organizations, no-profit organizations to expand the reach of the arts in new areas, new dance under a low cost model. I used the word 'low cost' with great care and deliberation because despite the fact that the Prime Minister has generously said that there is no shortage of money as such for arts, but there is just that much available and India's pool that it needs to serve is very large.

The fact is that we have dying or languishing art traditions. I remember that Suraj Kund Mela. Till recently, there used to be an area that was kept aside and there were little marks saying 'languishing art tradition' and some of us would consciously make an effort to buy something from them in our little to keep things going. But today, despite their being an abundance of the arts, obviously the money that is going into different areas and not feeding the languishing arts, they are very vulnerable. So, I feel that there should be low cost model so that money can be dispersed on a wider scale. For the ZCCs for the change, that Siddharth talked about, to come from within, I think it becomes very important to have an Advisory Board or the Assisting Board or Facilitating Board which consists of well-known cultural personalities, audience-members, writers, art scholars and those interested in the arts. If the word gets around, they will come up to the top. Then, we need to channelize energies for the next generation, but for this generation, there is just about adequate energy that we can harness.

Before I say the experience of the Sangeet Natak Academy, I must compliment the Sangeet Natak Academy. One of the finest folk dance festivals that I used to see, which I do not see now, was Lok Utsav when Keshav Kothari was Director of SNA. Absolutely stunning Lok Utsavs used to happen in the lawns of Rabindra Bhawan. Between that and the Folk Dance Festival of the Republic Day, one got to see a huge amount of India. If anyone who was sensitized, there was always this excitement that I am travelling to this part, I have already seen a dance of that area, I know the costumes they wear and something like that, but today the Folk Dance Festival at Republic Day remains, but Lok Utsav is not to be seen.

MS : For the last two years, that Lok Tarang is also not happening.

MS. ARSHYA SETHI: Okay. There we are. We have new things like octave, but that is for the North-East alone. I think the advantage that North-East enjoys is that it already has five to six octaves. It is time now for us to look at octave like programming for other areas. Otherwise, we will get to know a little more about North-East and as much as we know is

always too little for the North-East. We should have these kind of glamorous festivals for others as well.

Now the experience of Sangeet Natak Academy has given us many lessons that we can learn. One thing I feel that Sangeet Natak Academy has suffered from is that it gives excessive importance to classical arts and the stranglehold of it is very definitive structure. It is not a flexible structure. It does not encourage new blood to come in. It does not allow fresh breezes to blow in. It is part of that one cycle where once you are in, you keep moving within the system, but the newer energies do not necessarily. The most important thing that one has to be careful about when dealing with the arts that the ZCCs represent is the hierarchy between the classical and the non-classical, which is almost as severe as the caste system, which really needs to be contained. I feel that the traditional artistes have to be given their due recognition and respect. The argument that I have heard throughout the day is that ZCCs should continue. I am really happy to know that there are more people who feel this way. Your statement in the opening part was that one of the options is to close them down. I think, we need the ZCCs to continue and we hope that they will now raise the issue about giving the traditional artistes respect because frankly speaking, there is no one else speaking for the traditional artistes except the ZCCs.

How do you add value to the ZCCs? Much has already been said and some very valid points have been made. Siddharth very articulately mentioned some of the points, especially the theme park part, which makes it more glamorous and desirable so that you can put up a fight to Munni on her terms and on her turf.

With no particular order, because I was just trying to organize them, I am going to mention some of the points. Scholarship for the arts that the ZCCs represent is abysmally low, almost non-existent. I think, in the last ten years, maybe I have come across two books written intelligently on these things, not as a little tourism brochure kind of a thing. I think that some of the higher institutions of learning may be encouraged to go into that. One of the points is that these days I am associated with a higher institution of learning.

(ENDS WITH THANKS)

## Written Submissions of Witnesses

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.	Shri Shyam Benegal, Eminent Film Maker and Member CABC	255
2.	Shri M. Bendang Ao, Founder Director, NEZCC	256
3.	Shri S. K. Mishra, Emeritus Vice Chairman, National International Trusts Organizations	257
4.	Dr. J. Prasad, Vice Chancellor Kerala Kalamandalam	260
5.	Smt. Arshiya Sethi, Founder Kri Foundation, Eminent Art Scholar	264
6.	Comments of Shri. K Raamamoorthy, Former Director, SZCC	269
7.	Recommendations arising out of the 21st-22nd September 2010, meeting held in New-Delhi	277
8.	Remarks on these recommendations by :	
i.	Shri. S.S. Jawahar, Secretary, Tourism and Culture, Govt. of Tamil Nadu	280
ii.	Smt. Leela Samson, Chairperson, Sangeet Natak Akademi	284
iii.	Shri. D.S. Saroya, Director, NZCC	288

## A note

1. The draft Chapter I of the report on ZCCs refers to the success of Shilpagram on the outskirts of Udaipur. This can serve as a template for similar art and craft villages in different regions of India. However, for Shilpagrams to be successful, they need to become commercially viable for the artists and craftsmen who live there. This is only possible with fairly aggressive marketing and networking with the markets both in India and abroad which the ZCCs are not likely to be able to do. NGOs and other entities who have marketing skills can be supported and helped by the ZCCs wherever and whenever possible.
2. Performing arts festivals in different regions should be conducted during fairs and festivals that take place in different parts of India in the natural course. For instance the camel fair in Pushkar which culminates on Kartik Purnima attracts a large number of Kalbeliya dance troupes. All that needs to be done is for them to get better performance venues at the fair. The zonal cultural centres can help in providing such venues where audiences can watch performances comfortably. These can be ticketed and the proceedings directly passed on to the troupes. In fact, the Pushkar fair can become a magnet for getting Manganiyar and Langa performers as well as all the different folk artists of Rajasthan and even Gujarat. Similarly festivals in other parts of India can serve as an attraction for theatrical groups such as Nacha in Chattisgarh, Bedni dancers in Bundelkhand and Baghelkhand and so on. The zonal cultural centres have to function as catalysts rather than as bureaucratic organizations that would be administrated in a top down manner. The organization of these can be flexibly designed and opportunities to perform maximised by offering attractive venues at such festivals. They would also need to be publicised in both TV and press media. Such promotional activities would have to be one of the responsibilities of the ZCCs. A good example is the manner in which the Edinburgh Festival has developed over the years.
3. Archiving requires both passion, commitment, and specialized training. The Ministry can take the help of Institutions such as India Foundation for the Arts who support such activities and also fund them.
4. As for the rest, I agree with the points made in the report. The idea of creating a Fourth Akademi devoted to folk and tribal arts and culture is an excellent one.

Shyam Benegal

December 10, 2010

## Suggestions

1. Many good and beautiful cultural practices are slowly disappearing from the Northeast region in particular. (It may be so in other regions also). Alien cultures have started invading the region and this affected the minds of our young people. It is therefore felt that ZCC should formulate suitable programmes to involve the youth such as youth festivals, seminars, debating etc. This may be organized during school and college holidays to get maximum involvement and participation of the youth. Training programmes on cultural practices may be also organized by utilizing the services of some prominent cultural personalities of the region.
2. Choir singing has become very popular in the Northeast region. They have performed in international forums as well as in India including New Delhi recently during the visit of US President Barack Obama. The choir singing conveys meaningful messages not only on religions but folk and cultural too. If their services are utilized in different forums by ZCCs especially by the NEZCC, this will go a long way in popularizing cultural heritage of the country.

(N. Bendang Ao)  
Founder Director NEZCC

S.K. Misra  
C-56 Nizamuddin East  
New Delhi 110013  
(+91) 9810244747  
skm810@gmail.com

12 December 2010

Shri Nihal Chand Goel  
Joint Secretary  
Ministry of Culture, Government of India

My dear Goel,

Thank you for your letter of 30 November 2010. I look forward to participating in the meeting of the Committee on ZCCs under the Chairmanship of Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar on 14 December 2010. I shall give my detailed observations at the meeting, but as requested in your letter, am giving some preliminary observations below.

I fully endorse the view that the ZCCs have not lived up to expectations. It seems they have not been able to meet even to a limited extent the objectives for which they were set up. It is time that serious efforts are made to bring about a radical change in ensuring effective implementation of decisions and real results.

The suggestion for a ZCC Council at the centre is good, but there is a danger that it may degenerate into one of those committees that meet once in a while without being able to achieve much. My suggestion in this regard would be to have a Council that would include the chairpersons of the three Akademis, some eminent persons from the cultural field, all the heads of the ZCCs, and officials of concerned ministries. There should be an annual 2-day conference at which each zonal chief should be asked to make a power-point presentation which should include programs undertaken during the year and plan of action for the following year. Based on the performance and the future plans, a view could be taken regarding quantum of funds to be provided for the following year. This conference should be open to interested members of the public, who may also be encouraged to interact. The conference should preferably be held in mid-January every year, on fixed dates, before the formulation of the budget for the next year. It is necessary that at this conference the Minister and Secretary of the concerned Ministry should be present throughout. This will ensure that decisions will be reached and implemented, and that the decisions will be based on experience of other experts and participants.

Keeping in mind the original objectives for the ZCCs that were specified by former Prime Minister Rajiv Gandhi and with the advantage of twenty five years experience behind us, I would suggest that we now might focus on the following specific goals:

- To give local populations (especially in rural/village areas) a sense of pride in their own cultural traditions, and a motivation to preserve and maintain them;
- To give local populations throughout India the opportunity to experience art and culture of other areas;
- To take advantage of the growing realization that heritage assets can be a powerful tool for general economic growth and development. The ZCCs can provide a means of income and livelihood in cultural fields that will motivate young people to make them their career.
- To serve as a means of discovering and nurturing talent that lies hidden in our rural and village areas.
- To add some excitement to the entire process, so that young populations especially see culture as a vibrant, lively, attractive part of their lives, whether they participate as audience members, viewers, or as professionals. This means using technology.

### Specific Suggestions

No doubt many suggestions will emerge from this and future meetings and from the open exchange of thoughts and ideas. However, I would in advance suggest three potentially useful areas of activity.

- Rural Museums concentrating on specific cultural assets of a particular region should be developed. A very striking example of how this can be achieved is that of the Museum of the Desert (Arna-Jharna), in Moklawas village, outside Jodhpur. The dream of the folklore historian Komal Kothari, the museum has been brought to fruition by his son, Kuldeep Kothari, and a team of dedicated and talented young professionals. Concentrating in the first stage on the history and cultural meanings of brooms, the museum is an extremely successful and creative venture in presenting layers of unsuspected meaning and beauty in a craft form that no one previously regarded with any interest. In the process, they are highlighting the identities of the broom making communities and specific individuals, and bringing them pride and recognition. This museum has become popular with tourists as well as with local visitors (including school groups). It was developed by a team of creative and dedicated young professionals (some of whom were local residents), funded by the Ford Foundation and one American funding agency (the Asian Cultural Council). It is an excellent model.
- Localized "mini-centres" might prove to be a more effective use of funds than the construction of air-conditioned auditoria and the organization of functions for VIPs. Such "mini-centres" could be equipped with computers, video cameras, webcams, and

the other equipment that has become an essential part of contemporary life. Arts professionals skilled in integrating technology with culture could tour to these centers, conducting training for interested youngsters; the mini-centers could then be under the supervision of a local manager, and open to those who had gone through the training. Each mini-center could develop a Facebook site, and establish contact with other mini centers. The equipment and technology at the mini-centers could be used to document local cultural resources, as well as for creative activity, and all could be shared with other mini-centres throughout India. In today's world, this is the way to achieve national integration in the arts, and to capture the attention and interest of our young citizens. Salaried positions could be created at each mini-center, along with fellowships, etc., so that those with special talent or interest would see a viable future. Such mini-centers could also serve as a focal meeting point for elderly artists; who can participate in training programs and provide content for oral history. If oral history is put into Facebook/web pages, young Indians will be much more interested in working with it (and learning from it). And the older professionals might get excited by this experience with new technology as well.

- A "culture corps" might be established for college students to join for a limited time. College students in even the most remote areas of the country these days are skilled users of facebook, internet, and related technologies. Serving as volunteers (or on small stipends), they could function as trainers in these skills, while at the same time they themselves would develop new appreciation for and understanding of their country's rural roots. They could be encouraged to make films or other creative documents of their experiences, with perhaps substantial annual cash awards (and recognition) for the best efforts.

These are just preliminary thoughts. I look forward to the meeting and to sharing ideas.

Regards, yours sincerely,

S.K. Misra  
Cc: Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar

Some comments/suggestions arising out, which deserve to be discussed in detail:

The Zonal Cultural Centres have been set up with the prime objective of creative development of Indian culture in the different regions and for building up a sense of cultural cohesiveness in the country.

**1. Organizational Structure should be modified:**

The Zonal Cultural Centres have been set up as registered autonomous bodies under the Societies Registration Act. They are governed by a governing body which is headed by the Governor of the state in which the Zonal Cultural Centre has its headquarter. The governing body consists of the nominees of the Government of India not below the rank of Joint Secretary in the Ministry of Culture, nominees of the participating state Governments and eminent personalities in various art disciplines. As far as the organisational set up of the ZCC is concerned, the present design has unfortunately not been helpful in the fulfilment of its objectives. The indefinite continuation of the bureaucratic staffing pattern of the ZCCs, often by reluctant officers, fails to give the beneficiary society a sense of ownership of the ZCCs. This adversely affects the possibility of vibrant autonomy that was part of the original conception of the ZCCs. A professional, but democratic, system of management would be the most ideal for the ZCCs. A proposed organizational structure to that effect is placed for consideration below.

i. Director

The tenure of the director is for three years. The director may be appointed in rotation from all component states/UTs.

ii. The Nominees of the participating state Governments may be;

- a. Minister of Cultural Affairs of the State,
- b. Secretary to Government, Cultural Affairs,
- c. Chairmen of State Akademis,
- d. Five eminent academics/artists nominated by the Governors of each component (participating) states from a panel submitted by the State Government.

iii. Nominees of the Central Government; The present format can be followed.

The other Statutory Committees of ZCC should also consist of representatives of component states selected in the above manner.

The practice of appointing the Governor of the host state as the ex-Officio Chairperson of the Governing Council of ZCC should be followed. It will only help different state Governments involved within the region of ZCC. If the chairperson is appointed from a state, the vested interest of that state and the political interest of the state will dominate. This will adversely affect the functioning of the ZCC.

## **2. Prioritization of Training of Art forms**

Training may be taken as a major priority of ZCCs, since propagation of culture can be effective only when there is an assurance of continuity for traditions and traditional forms. Even while sharing the Committee's anxiety that ZCC programmes should not become "adjuncts to urban schools meant for the children of the urban middle class who have other avenues of securing access to training and exposure to the best of our cultures," the fact remains that there are many traditional performance and art forms that have little urban representation or acceptance, and are languishing due to the want of support systems that would ensure their continuity. (A significant case would be that of the tradition of shadow puppetry of Kerala, which has a steadily dwindling number of artists practising it, and very few of the younger generation taking it up, because of the paucity of support and popularity.) In this context, significant support for institutions, individuals and agencies that are engaged in the training of traditional, endangered and local forms would serve as a new lease of life for many that are on the verge of extinction. At the same time, institutions following unique teaching methodologies in the training and dissemination of art forms may be provided with special financial assistance to further and develop their pedagogic practices. Along with this, scholarships may also be instituted to talented young artists being trained in such forms. Needless to say, meticulous care needs to be taken to ensure that such support is extended only to the most deserving recipients, and not to urban, affluent classes.

## **3. Support to innovative attempts in traditional forms**

One objective envisaged for the ZCCs is the "encouragement of innovation, especially in relatively new domains of culture such as photography, cinematography, the graphic arts, hybrid arts, etc. Such encouragement and support may be extended to innovative attempts in traditional forms too, because it is a proven historical fact that it is not stasis but judicious change, through which new and contemporary concerns are addressed, that art forms have guaranteed their survival. Innovative efforts that aim at making traditional forms more contemporaneous, even while maintaining their fundamental performative and artistic culture, could be supported, thereby giving a contemporary, dynamic dimension to preservation.

## **4. Inviting proposals from the recipient areas and Institutions**

At the moment, the ZCCs are functioning in a top-down manner, wherein the nature and system of programmes are pre-decided by the ZCCs, and carried out in the different parts of the respective zones. However, if it were possible to amend this style, at least to some extent, and solicit suggestions and proposals from the recipient areas and institutions about possible programmes, in accordance with their aspirations and requirements, it would go a long way in addressing the different realities of different localities/provinces in the zone. (For instance, if the system is amended, the Kerala Kalamandalam Deemed University will be able to come up with proposals for training

and performance that are in keeping with the fundamental culture of Kerala art forms.) This could also bring in very innovative ideas about propagation and popularization of art forms.

## **5. Nodal agencies in Component States and UTs**

A major problem today is the very unequal distribution of funds and efforts over the total territory of the Zone and also nationally, due primarily to the centralised nature of the ZCCs and the varying degrees of geographic, linguistic and cultural proximity to them.

In order to rectify this situation, a system of nodal agencies could be introduced, whereby under each ZCC there will be one or more nodal agencies functioning in each state/UT in the zone. The budget and programmes of each nodal agency could then be pre-allocated, thereby ensuring fairer distribution of funds and efforts, and also opening channels of dialogue between the centre and the peripheries. Such nodal agencies could also co-ordinate the inter-zonal programs.

## **6. Welfare Scheme for Artists**

Hundreds of artists working in the field of arts, especially traditional arts, are in dire straits today with even their day-to-day survival being a veritable challenge. Although several institutions are engaged in the preservation and promotion of the arts, their scope of activities are restricted to imparting training and providing opportunities for performances. In the specific instance of traditional performance artists of Kerala, most often the only recourse open to them are the performance programs they get as part of temple festivals taking place from late September to early May every year. The income they get from such presentations is hardly enough for livelihood for the festival period, with the rest of the year offering nothing but bleak prospects. It is only in the case of a few well known performers that the plight is relatively better. Taking this situation into consideration, it is suggested that that welfare fund be launched to ensure timely assistance to them in the off-season period days and in times of distress and ill-health.

Such an Artists' Welfare Fund may be instituted under the aegis of each ZCC. This fund could provide assistance to needy artistes, through different schemes such as:

- a. Pension scheme for older and incapacitated artists,
- b. Assistance scheme for artists suffering ill-health,
- c. Assistance scheme for artists pursuing art forms whose presentations are periodic in nature,
- d. Pension scheme for artists not regularly employed in any organization/institution that has a pension scheme,

A sizable amount should be earmarked for these schemes every year, and norms for selection of recipient artists can be formulated by the ZCC. The Scheme however should comprehensively cover the entire community of artists. (Incidentally to say, Government of Kerala has instituted a welfare scheme for Artists')

**7. Financial Assistance to Institutions and Organizations**

Financial assistance may be given to Institutions to undertake such programs as seminars, workshops, lecture-demonstrations, etc. with a view to encouraging and involving the youth of each zone to familiarize themselves with traditional culture and art forms and to foster links among themselves and with those of the rest of the country for creative cultural communication.

**8. Follow-up Action**

The draft recommendations of the three member committee should be circulated.

Presented by  
Dr. J Prasad  
Vice-Chancellor  
Kerala Kalamandalam Deemed University for Art & Culture  
Vallathol Nagar, Cheruthuruthy  
Thrissur- 679531

## Some thoughts on the ZCCs

- Arshiya Sethi

Thank you for inviting me to present my ideas and thoughts on the state of the ZCCs. For over thirty years I have been serving the arts in many capacities- as critic, writer, presenter, interlocutor, scholar, researcher, organizer and as an institution builder. I am however not a performing artiste and that precludes my inclusion from many such panels. Thank you once again for including me in this.

For long I have been concerned about the idea of "Unity in Diversity", which since childhood, I learnt, as describing the arts of India. The adage smacks of a single 'unity' being imposed on a large and multiple 'diversity'. But diversity is what a country like India exemplifies. I have instead preferred the description of "Many Nations in One", for that represents better the mosaic ( or bouquet, if you prefer) of India.

In the speech given by Shri Rajiv Gandhi, the Hon'ble Prime Minister of India, on the Role of the performing Arts in promoting National integration, recognized this. Examples of these are contained in these few excerpts: a) " the many hues and colours in which our culture and heritage is painted"; b) "Unity is strengthened not weakened by the diversity of our country"; c) " India's civilization is distinguished by its antiquity and by continuing collectively in its heterogeneity"; d) "Our diversity is a practical reality and not a theoretical concept". It is evident from these excerpts, and much more stated in that address, that the decade of the eighties had proved to the highest office in the country, that India urgently needed to recognize its own vastness, richness and variety of culture, to which it was an inheritor.

The Zonal Cultural Centres, that were born over two decades ago, were created at a time when India had been an independent country for four decades. The need to prove to the community of the world, that despite being a young nation, it was an old civilization, was no longer so pressing. More important in that period, was to address and control the politically centrifugal forces that had begun to raise their head, and the social problems that arose from the breaking up of the protective net of close knit communities. Thus, while the ICCR and the National Akademi's set up around 1950, addressed the former concerns, the ZCCs were directed towards the latter.

The 80s and 90s were the period of decentralization, of the maturation of federalism and hence it was not necessary to invoke the nation. Invoking regional identities was sufficient. Thus the ZCC's belonged to composite geographical regions sharing significant cultural similarities, were not head -quartered in state capitals but cultural capitals and made every attempt to stay away from the purview of politics and a bureaucratic mind set.

However, those were times before the age of PPP and so a huge pool of art administration talents that the ZCCs could access, shriveled up as the positions remained mostly in IAS

hands. In my days, jobs like this were not a possibility. This, when the ZCCs had a provision of far casting of the net. Fortunately, today having realized that only a man or woman of passion can work this complex area, we are more open to step out of the Babu mindset! Even more fortunately, today there are still people with a passion for the arts who could be called in to bear this responsibility. A search committee, constituted by those who have no personal agendas or baggage can help harness the right person for the right job at the right time. Even Ms. Sonal Mansingh's suggestion of the Indian Heritage Service is an idea that is worth exploring! Most certainly on Human Resources there is an urgency of creating a degree course that would equip and train the next generation of arts and heritage managers. Any of the existing institutions- IGNOU, NCERT, CCRT, National Museum Institute, could be encouraged to expand their courses to include this course.

The budgets of the ZCCs also remained the dispensation of the Government, and the offices and functioning of the ZCCs fast began to reflect a government office. In a country like India, where the sheer size and the diversity of the arts, would demand a huge spend, low cost models or models of shared costs must be explored. It may also become necessary to draw on corporate support, even if it is just 'Backyard CSR'. For example, in the Jamshedpur area, Tata's may be approached for helping support the arts of the area. It may be prudent to look at enhancing the role of the National Culture Fund to help enhance the funds for the ZCCs. At present, although the constitution of the NCF refers to support for intangible heritage, it is not being undertaken. But as the NCF itself is going through a revitalization process, it may be possible to link the two. Most certainly, to think the issue holistically, in an interrelated manner today could create some desirable synergies.

In the years of its existence, while many of the folk artistes owe their continuing artistic profile to the efforts of the ZCCs, somehow the ZCCs got into a comfort zone (read as moribund zone) for the role of unearthing arts, new practitioners, identifying threatened and vulnerable art forms, remained a distant dream. Many arts are fast disappearing and that too without even a trace of documentation. Revivals are possible, as seen in the case of dastangoi, but when a system is in place, such a risk need not be taken.

The urban obsession, the preference for auditoriums, even for ZCC programmes, has ended up duplicating the work that other agencies were doing, and all of this for the benefit of the same group of audience members and culture consumers. Thus the outlays available to the multiple government agencies working in the constituency of the arts was limited, and offered to benefit to a very small number of people.

In all the above mentioned contexts this meeting, around detailed recommendations, is very welcome and timely. Please find detailed below, some thoughts on specific recommendations.

1. It is high time that we revisited the original idea for setting up the ZCCs, even as we start the process of re-engineering them.

2. This process must not be taken up in isolation, but in an integrated manner, facilitating interaction and linkages between all the constituent departments, agencies, and institutions that come under the purview of the Ministry of culture.
3. One can advocate for a quantum leap by recommending the mainstreaming of the arts, amongst all the Ministries, in the same manner as has happened with HIV. As it is, there is a strong connect with schemes of Ministries of Women and Child Development, Youth and Sports Affairs, Rural Development and Panchayati Raj, External Affairs, Tourism, Poverty Alleviation, DONER , Social Justice and Empowerment, Textiles etc. With support coming from so many hands, it will be as if the 'ashtabhuja' Goddess herself has blessed the marginalized, rural, and traditional artist and artisan, for whom to network through the corridors of power for opportunistic patronage is unthinkable, unimaginable and undoable.
4. It is recommended that in the spirit of Public Private Partnership, the ZCCs should cooperate with several civil society agencies, non- governmental and non- profit organizations, to creatively expand their reach in low cost models.
5. Each ZCC should have a board/ committee made up of representatives of well known cultural personalities, audience members, writers, art scholars and those interested in the arts, to facilitate the process of expanding showcase and outreach possibilities for ZCCs.
6. If it becomes necessary to draw on corporate support, then we could explore the possibility of drawing on 'Backyard CSR'. Towards this it may be prudent to look at enhancing the role of the National Culture Fund to help enhance the funds for the ZCCs.
7. For this effort at re-engineering of the ZCCs, it is essential to, think the issues through completely, and think the issue holistically, in an interrelated manner, for only then can we create some desirable synergies.
8. The experience of Sangeet Natak Akademi has given us many lessons to learn. The excessive importance to classical artistes, the stranglehold of GB and EB members, the stories of "crony capitalism" functioning in the corridors of SNA, the immense bureaucratization and extension of whimsical patronage, need to be avoided in any serious re-engineering effort of ZCC.
9. Most importantly the hierarchy of the classical and non classical (Often as severe as a caste system) needs to be contained (a point heard repeatedly from the panelists today) and the traditional artistes have to be given their due, recognition and respect. The ZCCs are the only body that can speak for them, failing which they will blip out of the radar, as they are unlikely to speak for themselves.
10. How can one add value to the traditional artistes who come under the care of the ZCCs? Through preferential patronage, planning and programming. Some of the areas that could be part of this value enhancing process are:

- Scholarships being made available for the younger generation members from the families of traditional artistes.
  - Scholarships being made available for those youngsters who are interested to learn even though they may not be either from the families or communities of traditional artistes
  - High value creative programming
  - Documentation
  - Serious academic publications on the non classical arts, that must be put in the public domain, and which could be part of a research fellowship scheme or part of a Publication programme of a respected institute like the IGNCA/ SNA NBT etc
  - Through mature and cutting edge marketing
  - Positioning on TV and Radio, especially Community radio.
  - Training of choreographers and arts professionals who would present these arts in more imaginative ways- After all its all about that one big idea!
  - Linking the work of traditional rural artisans with NREGA to ensure livelihood
  - To introduce a group insurance scheme that will help with sustainability
11. In principle, I have reservations about an SNA type National Akademi for folk and tribal arts for that would create yet another vertical working disjointedly and in an unconnected manner. Secondly the spectrum of arts on which the ZCCs can lay claim are infinitely more than just those that fall into the folk or tribal categories. All performance is far too synthesized to be pigeon holed into narrow categories. Cuisine and crafts are not just folk or tribal but could reflect festivals, sub groups, specific communities and could be linked to ritual practices. Finally, and most importantly, labels and appellations like classical, folk, tribal are so incongruent with the reality of the traditional and indigenous arts of India. In the past we have referred loosely to Classical arts, semi classical etc. These categories were adopted without much thought. Our deeper understanding and scholarship of the Arts prove that such segmentation is irrelevant to India where all art is in a continuum.
  12. To avoid any duplication with the ongoing work of the Akademies, and wasteful expenditure from the limited allocation available to the arts, coordination and collaboration with the Akademies is critical. A bridge body between the ZCCs and other agencies working in the field of the arts, must be established.
  13. Independent monitoring and evaluation of programmes, plans and budgets, must be built in from the first stage of the re-engineering. In fact, the setting up of an expert post of Cultural Auditor may be considered.
  14. Chain programmes: SPIC MACAY has proved the efficacy and economies of chain programmes. Chain programmes need good and advanced planning and a certain flexibility of opportunism.

15. Care should be taken to hire people fired by the love for the arts, rather than those who come recommended or have the necessary qualifications on paper. For this, once again the board/ committee can help in the head hunting.
16. Experts must be harnessed to help identify those arts in need of special nurturing programmes
17. Scholarship around the non classical arts is abyssimally low. For the variety of arts that India nurtures, critical scholarship that contextualizes and helps in understanding the authentic arts, must be made as intrinsic a part of this programme. It is as important as the Guru Shishya parampara in perpetuating these arts.
18. An international role for the ZCCs should be actively encouraged for today the world is a village, a global village, and feeding the cultural aspirations and hunger, of the large Indian Diaspora, is well within the scheme of the original idea of the ZCCs. Additionally, India's rural, folk and tribal arts are unmatched, unparalleled and unique for they remain uncontaminated, pure, rich, varied and vibrant. They exude a strong appeal across cultural, national and language barriers, and speak equally eloquently as any classical artiste, for brand India.

Arshiya Sethi  
9818998747, arshiyasethi@gmail.com  
[www.arshiyasethi@gmail.com](http://www.arshiyasethi@gmail.com)

Date: 08/09/2010

Dear Sh. Jawhar Sircar,

This has reference to the advertisement in "The Hindu" calling for applications for the post of Director, South Zone Cultural Centre, Thanjavur. In this regard, I would like to mention that I was Director of this Centre during 1996-2001 and had the privilege of putting up the Office-cum-Cultural Complex at a cost of Rs. 2.5 crores, a 100% assistance mobilized from Govt. of Tamil Nadu. During my tenure, I ran major festivals including the one "Golden Jubilee Year Celebrations" on the sands of Marina Beach, Chennai. I could plan and execute such major programmes with my background in art and culture.

Since I left the centre, the Officers, who succeeded me did not have adequate flair for art and culture. They administered the centre purely as a Public Administrator and had contributed nothing substantial for the improvement and upkeep of the complex. As one who is interested in promotion and preservation of art forms and as one who hails from Thanjavur town, I have a personal interest in its growth. With that in mind, I suggest the following:-

1. The Director need not be an Officer of Tamilnadu cadre as he considers it as a dumping yard and hardly shows any interest in developing the centre.
2. Mostly, he operates from Chennai and avoids staying in Thanjavur, the headquarters of the Centre. Therefore, it should be made compulsory for the Director to permanently headquarter at Thanjavur and not to operate from Chennai or any other place,
3. The Centre may hire residential accommodation on lease for the Director or a decent house (Type IV) may be constructed in the sprawling campus of the Centre,
4. As Thanjavur lacks in good schools/colleges, some incentive may be provided for the education of their wards either in Tiruchy or in Chennai,
5. The tenure of the Director may be minimum 4 years extendable by one year. It may be stipulated in the offer of appointment itself,
6. A post of "Assistant/Deputy Director (Programmes)" may be created and a duly qualified and renowned person in the field of art and culture posted to oversee the programmes right from the planning stage. He may be either on deputation or on a permanent basis. In the case of a person appointed through a direct recruitment process (preferably by UPSC/SSC), he may be on probation for 2 years and made permanent. He may be given promotion upto the level of Additional Director. He may be appointed on Govt. of India pay scale,
7. Accounting procedures followed are hardly on the Central Govt. pattern. An Accounts Manual and an Administrative Manual may be prepared with the approval of Govt. of India used,

8. There shall be no deviation from the approved programme. Any additional programme involving an expenditure of more than Rs. 10 lacs may have to the approval of the Ministry of Culture,
9. Settlement of accounts may be compulsorily made in 15 days from the last date of the festival and will be well within 30 days of drawal of advance. You may be surprised to know that advances drawn remain unsettled even for months and in some cases for years,
10. The centre may have an Auditor for only 3 years and not beyond. He should be selected from the list of CAG Panel of Auditors,
11. It may be made mandatory that people, who are professionally competent and qualified in required fields alone need be recruited and given promotion. Even though, I had left behind a "Handing Over Note" in early January 2001. None of my successors acted upon or pursued the issues listed out,
12. It may be made mandatory for the Govt. of India's nominee on the Executive Committee and Governing Body to compulsorily attend the meetings annually held and make necessary contribution to ensure that the centre moves in the right direction,
13. An N.G.O. of repute operating from Thanjavur town be made a member of the above two bodies of the Center so as to keep on eye on the functioning of the centre and to collaborate with the centre in reaching out to the masses, and the centre serves the purpose for which it was set up,

I am sure, the above suggestions, would merit your consideration.

Yours sincerely,

**(K. Raamamoorthy)**

To

Sh. Jawhar Sircar  
Secretary,  
Ministry of Culture  
Shastri Bhawan  
New Delhi

## **COMMENTS ON THE PROPOSAL FOR TONING UP THE FUNCTIONING OF ZONAL CULTURAL CENTRES**

### **GENERAL**

Twenty five years have gone by since the ZCCs were set up and only now Govt. are taking a critical look at the functioning of these institutions. BETTER LATE THAN NEVER.

It is a fact that these ZCCs have performed, though not to the desired extent, in promoting art and culture. I wonder whether there is a need to close them down. Rather, Govt. should make attempts to rejuvenate them, make them perform better, hold them responsible and accountable as they draw their sustenance from the Corpus Fund given by GOI and the constituent states. It is gladdening to know that the Committee under the leadership Sh. Mani Shankar Aiyar M.P, who ignited the concept of ZCCs and paved way for setting up these centres in 1985, is taking a critical look at them.

### **APPOINTMENT OF DIRECTORS**

As I mentioned at the meeting on 13 Dec.2010, only those who have a flair for art and culture and interested in promoting and preserving them be appointed as Director. They need not necessarily be from the Civil Service of the host state. It is a common knowledge that IAS/IPS/IFS officers, who are not wanted by the party in power is sponsored by the state Govt., and Governor, the Chairperson simply appoints him. All that such officers do is warming the chair of the ZCC and leaving everything to the lower level staff. Mostly, they operate from the state capital for obvious reasons. They are always on the lookout for better posting at the State headquarters. It has caused inexplicable damage to the organization and the morale of the staff.

### **NEED FOR STAFF PATTERN, RESRUITMENT RULES, ADMINISTRATIVE & FINANCIAL CODE**

ZCCs have become institutions mostly run by staff picked up from the open market without following any Staff Pattern, Recruitment Rule, Service Rules and required specialization in the field of art and culture. Sizeable number of ZCCs has become centres of nepotism and corruption. In the absence of uniform Recruitment Rules, Administrative and Financial Code,

Directors/ mostly ill equipped staff run the show following whatever is suitable for them. Nobody is held accountable. Advances drawn for conduct of festivals/ programmes remain settled for even years. When the Director raises questions and initiates proceedings, they gang up and create nuisance for him by writing series of complaints to the Governor and state govts. And There is, therefore, urgent need to have in place these essential instruments of governance.

### **CONDUCT OF AUDIT & SETTING UP OF VIGILANCE MECHANISM**

Regarding Audit of Accounts, less said the better. Auditors have also developed vested interest and they conduct audit just for the sake of it and keep their eyes closed to the irregularities. In fact, they are hand I glove the regular staff of ZCCs. On top of it, staff, even though small in number, have formed Unions backed by political parties and indulge in mudslinging and maligning. They have made quite a lot of money as they draw huge amount of money as advance and misuse them for their own ends. It is nothing but temporary defalcation of Govt. money. Moreover, they file false vouchers for the advance drawn. Nobody cross checks whether the vouchers/bills are genuine. Some of them lend the balance cash on interest and make money. Why can't we have a system to set right these maladies? We may make it mandatory for all the members of staff to file their Annual Property Return( of movable and immovable) . We may think of setting up a Vigilance Cell at the Regional level ( 2 ZCCS may constitute a Region and the Vigilance officers should operate from one of the centres. Or Central Vigilance machinery can be asked to earmark one officer from their pool. This Officer could operate from the parent organization itself. At the national level , we may have a Chief Vigilance Officer.

### **WEB SITE FOR ZCC, A MUST**

It must be made mandatory to have a web site, which is updated every three months. The list of programmes scheduled for the year, their location, the partner of the programme , budget allocation for the year, details of complaint redressal mechanism, artistes engaged during the quarter with the remuneration paid, dates on which fresh audition of upcoming artistes will be done etc., must be hosted in the web site. GOI may consider designing a web site, which can be adopted with necessary modifications according to the local requirement. Moreover, artistes should be graded and differential payment be made according to their grade. Academies can lend their support in this regard. RTI provisions should also be made mandatory so as to have transparent system of functioning.

### **INSURANCE OF THE ARTISES ENGAGED**

Artistes travel from their native place to various destinations in the country for performance .Sometimes; they are away for more than a week and at times for a month. There have been instances when some had fallen seriously ill and some meet with accidents. Therefore, there is a need to insure all the artistes engaged during every year. During my tenure, artistes

were insured for a month from the date they left their home and returned . Oriental Insurance Co. was roped in for this purpose. The same way, staff who accompanied the artistes and the money they were carrying for running the programme were insured.

## **CORPUS FUND**

Ministry and the constituent states should periodically replenish the Corpus of ZCCS. Allocation of funds for programmes for the constituent states should be in proportion to their contribution. It may be stipulated the no ZCC should eat into its Corpus as it has happened with some of them in the name of unscheduled and expensive programmes.

## **COMMENTS SPECIFIC TO THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE 21-22 2010 MEETING**

### **Recommendation No.1**

While endorsing this Recommendation, I suggest that at least one major programme be held in each of the constituent states during the most important festival of the state. The cultural heritage of the zone and the country may be show cased at this function. Budget limit may be indicated for such a programme on the condition that board and lodging, local transport and other logistics are provided by the host. Of course, as I did during my tenure, a chain of programmes may be organized in the mofussil towns and major villages within a radius of 100 kms from the main venue with the active participation of the local bodies. They would love it, provided we consult them, involve them in the conduct of the programme and recognize their participation. They may be asked to host the event and take care of all the local logistics at their cost. All that the ZCC has to do is to pay for the artistes and their transport. It would enable the artistes to get back home with income commensurate with the no. of days they would be away from home.

### **Recommendation No.2**

Fully endorsed

### **Recommendation No.3**

While fully endorsing this recommendation, I suggest that each Academy be made to earmark certain percentage of its budget for staging at least one programme in each of the ZCCs for minimum duration of 10 days. The troupe sponsored should perform in at least five venues within a radius of 100 kms. Again, the local bodies should be involved in planning and hosting the event.

### **Recommendation No.4**

Fully endorsed. This Apex Body should be held accountable and its function periodically reviewed. It should ensure that each Centre brings out its Annual Report with details of Programmes planned and staged, press clippings, press reviews, photographs and Annual Audit Reports by September every year.

### **Recommendation No.5**

Fully endorsed

### **Recommendation No.6**

I do not agree.

GOI should support those centres, which do not have an Office -cum- Cultural complex. Even if they have one, necessary funds may be released for creating semi- permanent structures for conducting training, rehearsals and workshops. Fund for maintenance of the structures already created / to be created be provided. My experience was that nobody noted the existence of the SZCC till the time a building fully funded by the host Govt. sprang up in the open air jail compound, Thanjavur, and felt the need for associating themselves with the programmes organized by the centre. Lot of local school children joined the courses offered. That's how, one has to propagate culture. RESPECTABILITY came in only after that.

### **Recommendation No.7**

- a) Minimum 60% be spent on programmes in rural areas.
- b) 20% may be allocated for programmes in towns
- c) 10% may be allocated for state level programmes
- d) 10% may be allocated for training, conduct of workshops and Guru Shishya Parampara training

### **Recommendation No.8**

Fully endorsed. The Director should have the assistance of

- a) Dy. Director of Administration ( on deputation from any GOI organization) ,
- b) Asst Director of Programmes ( on deputation - an expert from the field of art & culture preferably from a GOI set up in the Zone on deputation.),
- c) Asst Director of Accounts ( on deputation from the office of the local Accountant General),and
- d) a Vigilance Officer (from any GOI organization).

**None of them should be from the local Revenue Administration.**

### **Recommendation No.9**

- a) Administrative set up should be clearly delineated. Recruitment Rules, Service Rules, promotion channels etc., should be in place,
- b) the existing staff should be evaluated with reference to their qualification, experience and field of specialization. If need be, they may be trained in fields relevant and designated accordingly. Periodical training for a duration of at least one month be given to the staff in position every year according to the aptitude and requirement of the centre

**Recommendation No.11**

Fully endorsed. May be through the new set up proposed.

**Recommendation No.12**

Fully endorsed

**Recommendation No.13**

- a) List of artistes available with the ZCCs should be hosted in their respective Web sites immediately. To ensure uniformity, Ministry may get a website designed with appropriate links to sites where people can access the programmes planned for the year, place of programme, budget allocation, participation of local bodies, brief sketches about the art forms of the Zone, documentation made, sound recordings available, facilities for training, details of Guru Shishya Parampara Programmes, Corpus Fund, Administrative set up, complaint mechanism, Audit Reports, artistes/groups engaged year wise etc.. This will make the centre transparent and people can question them on any issue,
- b) Regular audition be held for the entire Zone and upcoming and new but unidentified artistes selected and the details uploaded in the web site,
- c) Artistes much be graded and accordingly remuneration paid,
- d) To promote art and culture, competitions at school and college levels can be conducted and talented artistes selected. This is one way of promoting traditional art form and identifying talents,
- e) There should be mixture of upcoming and experienced artistes in programmes organized by the centres,

**Recommendation No.14**

Fully endorsed

**Recommendation No.15**

- a) My experience shows that local bodies would be too glad to host events and the Youth Clubs ( be they Nehru Yuvak Kendra, NSS,YWCA,YMCA and other) would be interested in associating themselves provided we involve them right from the planning stage. They will be useful in carrying out publicity and would be handy in running the show in an orderly fashion,
- b) Local Cultural Organizations would be very handy to organize an event and make it more successful. Outreach would be appreciable.

**Recommendation No.16**

- a) Artistes should never be repeated within a span of three years. Hosting of the artistes performed year wise would help us in this regard.

**Recommendation No.17**

Fully endorsed

**Recommendation No.18**

Fully endorsed

**Recommendation no.19**

Fully endorsed

**Recommendation No.20**

Fully endorsed. Summer Camps would be most appropriate for school children

**Recommendation No.21**

This is very much essential as many theatre Groups are languishing for want of patronage

**Recommendation No.22**

Fully endorsed

## Some Recommendations arising out of the 21-22 Sept. 2010 Meeting

### 1. **Need to restore the original idea behind the ZCCs:**

As the ZCC's have gone beyond their original mandate there is an urgent need to restore them to some semblance of the original idea behind creating them. It is required to take them out of air conditioned auditoriums that nearly all ZCC's have built or the existing practice of confining programmes to major townships. The practice of 'chain programmes' along mofussil towns needs to be revived.

### 2. **Core area of ZCCs should be performing arts - cuisine and crafts could be promoted, presented and displayed simultaneously.**

All folk forms, pertaining to performing arts, local cuisine and crafts have to be identified judiciously and then promoted. People recreate their lives in culture. The original idea was to let the performers be as pristine as possible. No synthetic clothes or extra makeup was to be put on. But slowly as auditoriums started becoming air conditioned, falsity appeared in these areas.

### 3. **Collaboration with other Akademies is of paramount importance.**

The Akademies should consider the ZCCs as principal agents for taking culture to the rural areas. Collaboration with other institutions under the Ministry of Culture should also be examined.

### 4. **Structure of the ZCCs should be reviewed.**

It is felt that the policy making body is unwieldy and consists of people who are often too busy to attend meetings. An Apex Body is needed to spearhead the activities of the ZCCs ( maybe like a Directorate General at the Centre).

### 5. **ZCCs must be patronized at the level of the Prime Minister.**

In the early years of the ZCCs, the then Prime Minister, the late Shri Rajiv Gandhi focused a lot of attention on them. Folk forms, during this period, were for the first time given a high status. This fervour can be recreated if there is support from the highest levels.

### 6. **Infrastructure at the headquarters of the ZCCs was never the objective.**

Nearly all the ZCC's have built elaborate infrastructures that now need maintenance which absorbs a lot of the funds which should have been directed at programs. This construction of infrastructure also has the fall-out of most programs being headquarter focused, rather than being done in the field of the ZCC's jurisdiction. Construction of building further infrastructure should be discouraged.

**7. Relationship of the budget with the objectives of ZCCs should be clearly earmarked.**

Percentage of expenditure should be fixed for outreach in rural areas vis-à-vis expenditure in urban centres / head quarter. At least 90-95% of the programmes should be held in rural areas.

Sizable amount of the budget should be earmarked for payment of honorarium to artistes, sustainable livelihood of the artistes must be ensured.

**8. Qualifications for appointment as Director of ZCC**

The job demands young, dedicated and dynamic persons who have their heart in culture but who can administer, lead and coordinate. We need to cast the net wide to get cultural administrators.

**9. Management of staff of ZCC**

Employment rules, pay scales etc. should be modified and made more flexible. Working hours could be made more flexible. Professionals should be given due place in the ZCCs. A suggestion came that no staff of the ZCC should remain at the headquarter, most of them should be in the field. The administrative structure is a handicap in the functioning of the ZCCs. Orientation and training for staff members should be made mandatory. Suitable training material should be designed.

**11. Independent assessment mechanism of various programmes organized by the ZCCs must be worked out.**

There needs to be regular, independent assessment of the programmes of the ZCCs. A proper review mechanism needs to be put in place.

**12. Some quality control systems should be put in place and a system of cultural audit should be suggested.**

Since this is a time of gross and crass commercial television the cultural inputs need to be extremely refined with a touch of entertainment value to grab eyeballs. In such a scenario quality control is very important.

**13. System must be suggested so that a handful of artistes are not used repeatedly and opportunities to other artistes should be provided on a wider scale.**

It is important to identify performers across the zone, instead of just focusing on a few groups. Innovative methods of identifying such performers need to be developed and experiences of the ZCCs in this should be shared. Some ZCC's have adopted a practice of releasing advertisements in newspapers to encourage fresh talent in folk art forms to apply, then they are given a platform at the local level and appraised on merit for future opportunities.

**14. Wider dissemination of the Guru Shishya Parampara concept must be encouraged.**

Some ZCCs have signed a MOU with IGNOU for specific certification of the beneficiaries

of this scheme either through written or oral tests. Care for aging artistes is of paramount importance so that their children do not hesitate to follow in their parents footsteps. Innovative programming, planning, felicitation of elderly local artistes is needed when performing in that area,

**15. Collaborations with cultural institutions on the one hand and youth clubs and panchayats on the other should be encouraged.**

**16. Honararium paid to artistes may be increased.**

There seems to be a practice in place where only a handful of artistes are repeated: this hampers proper preservation of various art forms. Fool proof payment mechanism should be examined.

**17. On the lines of the 3 Akademies, a recommendation could be made to the competent authority for creating a Folk and Tribal Akademi.**

**18. For Hill States and the North East a separate travel policy should be made.**

Remote areas can be covered only if these logistical hurdles are removed. Highest level of emotional integration is required in border areas. Appropriate rules should be framed as the cost would be disproportionately higher than other areas.

**19. Apna utsavs ought to be revived and taken to all States by rotation.**

Participation in yatras, utsavs fairs and festivals should be encouraged.

**20. Workshops on different art forms should be encouraged for school children. For this the Navodaya schools are taking an initiative.**

**21. Collaboration with local theatre groups should be encouraged. Traditions of folk theatre like nautanki etc ought to be preserved by training younger practitioners. Similar traditions that maybe on the verge of extinction ought to be unearthed and preserved for future generations.**

**22. Documentation**

Only professional bodies equipped with the latest technology in this area should be involved in archiving and documentation. The ZCCs should act as facilitators to these expert groups.

**Remarks on the recommendations arising out of  
21st September to 22nd September, 2010  
Meeting in regard to revamping of  
Zonal Cultural Centers.**

**Recommendation No.1 Need to restore the original idea behind the ZCCs**

Agreed to this recommendation.

More emphasis has to be given to the rural programmes but at the same time programmes may be conducted in major towns also. By conducting the programmes in major towns, urban dwellers will also get an opportunity to know about the various art forms practiced in rural villages.

1. An action plan for reviewed may be worked out
2. Commissioner of Art and Culture to be fully involved in finalising programmes. Perhaps a Committee may be constituted that meets at least bimonthly.

**Recommendation No.2 Core area of ZCCs should be performing arts - cuisine and crafts could be promoted, presented and displayed simultaneously.**

Agreed to this recommendation

**Recommendation No.3 Collaboration with other Akademies is of paramount importance.**

Other Akademies should definitely consider ZCCs as a Principal Agents for taking the Culture to the rural areas. Periodical meetings have to take place in this region.

**Recommendation No. 4 Structure of the ZCCs should be reviewed.**

Agreed to this recommendation

**Recommendation No. 5 ZCCs must be partonized at the level of the Prime Minister**

Agreed to this recommendation

**Recommendation No. 6** Infrastructure at the headquarters of ZCCs was never the objective

Agreed to this recommendation

**Recommendation No. 7** Relationship of the budget with the objectives of ZCCs should be clearly earmarked.

A ratio of 50 : 50 may be followed in rural areas visa viz expenditure in urban centre.

Rural Minimum 50%

Urban Minimum 50% + 20 depending upon State proposal.

**Recommendation No. 8** Qualification for appointment as Director of ZCC

Agreed to this recommendation

**Recommendation No. 9** Management of staff of ZCC

Agreed to this recommendation

**Recommendation No. 10** Nil

**Recommendation No. 11** Independent assessment mechanism of various programmes organized by the ZCCs must be worked out

Agreed to this recommendation

**Recommendation No. 12** Some quality control systems should be put in place and a system of cultural audit should be suggested

Agreed to this recommendation

**Recommendation No. 13** System must be suggested so that a handful of artistes are not used repeatedly and opportunities to other artistes should be provided on a wider scale.

Agreed to this recommendation

Artiste Data Base may be created with Number restriction.

**Recommendation No. 14** Wider dissemination of the Guru Shishya Parampara concept must be encouraged.

Agreed to this recommendation

**Recommendation No. 15** Collaborations with cultural institutions on the one hand and youth clubs and panchayats on the other should be encouraged.

Agreed to this recommendation

The Services of Nehru Yuvak Kendra and continuing Education may be utilized.

**Recommendation No. 16** Honararium paid to artistes may be increased.

Agreed to this recommendation

**Recommendation No. 17** On the lines of the 3 Akademies a recommendation could be made to the competent authority for creating a Folk And Tribal Akademi.

Agreed to this recommendation

**Recommendation No. 18** For Hill States and the North East a separate travel policy should be made.

Agreed to this recommendation

**Recommendation No. 19** Apna utsavs ought to be revived and taken to all States by rotation.

Agreed to this recommendation

**Recommendation No. 20** Workshops on different art forms should be encouraged for school children. For this the Navodaya schools are taking an initiative.

Since the Navodaya Schools are not in existence in the State of Tamil Nadu, one school selected by the District Collector in each District under the control of State Government may be encouraged to conduct workshops on different art forms.

**Recommendation No. 21** Collaboration with local theatre groups should be encouraged. Traditions of folk theatre like nautanki etc ought to be reserved by training younger practitioners. Similar traditions that may be on the verge of extinction ought to be unearthed and preserved for future generations.

Agreed to this recommendation

**Recommendation No. 22** Documentation

Agreed to this recommendation

### General Suggestions

- The role of ZCC should be only a facilitator so far the various programmes to be conducted in the respective states. The National level and Inter ZCC levels programmes may be conducted by the respective ZCC.
- The ZCC level officers should consult only the Commissioners / Directors of Art and Culture Departments of various States. These should be periodical meetings between ZCC level officers and Commissioner of Art and Culture of the respective States.
- The staff may be deputed to the ZCC from the various State Governments on deputation basis so that responsibility can be fixed on them. The staff of the state Art and Culture may be utilized for this purpose.
- ZCC should not ask extra funds from the various State Governments for conducting any programmes.
- The Director of ZCC may be drawn from the any one of the All India Services s who has got flavour for cultural activities.
- Periodical meetings may be conducted with the respective Commissioners of Art and Culture of various states.

S.S. JAWAHAR,  
SECRETARY TO GOVERNMENT

**Recommendations arising out of 21st - 22nd September 2010 meeting:**

1. In agreement.
2. Generally in agreement. I do not believe any performing art can remain fossilised in time however beautiful or pristine. Admittedly some change is visible as all art is dynamic. However, with minimal advice and workshops, changes that are not palatable may be made known to the artists. Elderly members of the art community in their area can guide them.
3. In agreement.
4. In agreement however the Directorate Generals' role responsibility and functions will have to be clearly laid down, as well as his hierarchical relationship to the Ministry of Culture and other Central Cultural bodies.
5. In agreement.
6. In agreement.
7. Budgeting exercise should be concurrent, and zero based for each of the projects. Currently there is lack of clarity on the methodology of budgeting, allocation of funds and review of the same through the year is hardly there.

Clear guidelines have to be issued on the following:

- i) The schedule for drawing up the annual programme, its approval and the stages of review through the year.
- ii) Norms for incurrence of expenditure in the scheduled programme for each state. Currently it is seen that interest accrued on the corpus contribution from each state is utilised as per the list of activities / festivals submitted by the states. The Zonal Centres seem to have now assumed the role of a keeper of the member states' funds and the disburser of its resultant interest. The Zonal Centres are not independently drawing up a programme to reach out to the common man as envisaged in the founding documents of the organisation. There appears to be no original 'outreach' programmes either in the way of dissemination of cultural knowledge or in way of genuine exchange, done by the centre. As far the SZCC is concerned no documentation of any kind is visible after two decades of functioning. This is a serious lapse in the utilisation of artistic resources and a lack of understanding of the value of timely documentation. Where this documentation will be protected and preserved is also to be considered and this will require inter-institutional dependency.

Directions and guidelines have to be clearly laid out for the manner in which the funds are to be utilised and the norms of incurrence and sharing of expenditure between the states and the ZCC. This is particularly relevant as very often the SZCC is funding state sponsored cultural festivals / extravaganzas and the states do not reimburse the centre for the expenditure incurred for such participation.

- iii) Apart from the above, there are projects such as Vedic chanting documentation where work has been held up because of lack of detailed guidelines, both for methodology and incurrence of expenditure. Further, periodic review of each of these projects, for both the physical and financial targets for each year, is not carried out.
- iv) If rural outreach programmes are a priority, then clearly under each project (both scheduled and central government sponsored) the amount of funds available for rural and non-rural based programmes for each state should be clearly laid out.

8. Qualifications for appointment as Director :

- 1a) currently it is seen that the Director is being appointed on deputation from the state cadres (of the state in which the centre is situated) such as I.A.S., I.P.S. and the Indian Forest Service. Considering that the task at hand is of a specialised nature, it is suggested that deputation may called from civil servants of all the associated state cadres as well as all central government services (though as of now there is no bar on recruitment / postings from central services) as a matter of established norm, through circulation of deputation notices through all regular channels such as D.O.P. T. etc.

The same may be done in the case of all the gazetted post (AR, Accounts Officer etc.) at the centres, so that the net for appropriate officers for manning the post is cast wider.

- b) To ensure that creative inputs are given for all administrative decisions, it would be worthwhile to consider the appointment of a Creative Director alongside the Director, having the responsibility and authority to make decisions on all matters of creativity and associated issues of selection, grading of artists etc.

In case the appointment of a senior Creative Director is not possible on a substantive basis (due to financial and other administrative constraints) the same can be done by appointing them as consultants on contract basis.

- 2) For all the posts it is suggested that the posting/ appointments and repatriations are done only with the prior approval of the Ministry of Culture. This will ensure that the Ministry of Culture has the final decision on appointment/postings. It will also prevent officers being repatriated out at inappropriate time such as before finalisation of accounts, convening of important meetings such as P.C. and F.C.

for the year. These appointments should also be done only after the candidates are duly screened, the credentials for a job of this nature studied, and they are interviewed by a panel to assess their suitability for the job. This should be insisted on for all the gazetted posts.

9. Management of staff of ZCC :

The whole staffing pattern of the ZCC needs to be revamped. We have to ensure that the programme coordinators have a background in the field, are suitably trained in areas of assessment, database management, grading and project management. Currently, the staffs are ordinary clerical staff (in matters of staffing and their official grades) of regular government departments and are extremely unsuitable for an organisation such as this, where interest, awareness and training are of preponderant importance.

10. In agreement. Feedback and assessment from both the organisers, and artists should be regularly sought, processed and the same recorded for reference for further grading. Surprise site inspections to particular outreach programs must be made by the Director and other officers of the Centre to check on the standards of performance and the treatment of artists.
11. In agreement. Methodology, periodicity and nature of cultural audit, has to be laid out. How do you do this, though? Laid down procedures may be followed for the implementation of each of the projects and audit done against those standards.
12. The immediate requirement is a creation of state wise database for each art form. This has to be done in a scientific manner involving a consultant and/or a panel of experts in the field, from the individual states and the database apart from all physical details, should also have a transparent form of grading and associated levels of remuneration.
13. Supporting the gurus is the first step, whether they have children of their own or teach other children in their vicinity. Then, sitting with the committed among them, and helping them create a 2 year program that IGNOU will then certify is the next step. Seeing that the classes take place - by paying both the guru and his shishyas a stipend is likely to ensure the necessary certification to both. The payment and the important certification are the tools of making sure that this happens.
14. No comments
15. Remuneration has to be linked to the artist grading and the same has to be reflective of the prevalent rate paid for such performances in the field.
16. No comments.
17. No comments.
18. This is happening in some form or the other and an activity of the ZCC's .
19. The arts of dance, music, fine art, weaving, spinning etc must to be incorporated as subjects in the schools across the country and part of the grading, like the CBSE

schools that offer these subjects as electives. Else an appreciation course at least must be the norm in all schools.

20. A scheme has to be formulated to ensure this objective. The operation and review of the scheme is equally important.
21. In agreement. I propose that 6 to 8 main documentation centres be started that come under a single operating apex body, as the MoC is about to open in Delhi. It involves the digitisation, archiving and documentation of audio, video - both of temporal and plastic art material. It may also house the instrument and mask collections of the areas around the centre.

## **TENTATIVE COMMENTS ON SOME RECOMMENDATIONS ARISING OUT OF THE 21-22 SEPT. 2010 MEETING**

**[Yet to be discussed with His Excellency the Governor of  
Punjab & Chairman, North Zone Cultural Centre, Patiala]**

**1. Need to restore the original idea behind the ZCCs:**

As the ZCC's have gone beyond their original mandate there is an urgent need to restore them to some semblance of the original idea behind creating them. It is required to take them out of air conditioned auditoriums that nearly all ZCC's have built or the existing practice of confining programmes to major townships. The practice of 'chain programmes' along mofussil towns needs to be revived.

There can not be two opinions about the need to restore the original idea behind the ZCC's and to rectify wherever any deviation has taken place.

We have the great satisfaction to record that NZCC has endeavored to organise its activities strictly as per the objectives set out in 1985. We have generally avoided air conditioned auditoriums ever since the inception of NZCC.

**2. Core area of ZCCs should be performing arts - cuisine and crafts could be promoted, presented and displayed simultaneously.**

All folk forms, pertaining to performing arts, local cuisine and crafts have to be identified judiciously and then promoted. People recreate their lives in culture. The original idea was to let the performers be as pristine as possible. No synthetic clothes or extra makeup was to be put on. But slowly as auditoriums started becoming air conditioned, falsity appeared in these areas.

The activities organised by NZCC over the years have subscribed to this idea.

Most of the performances are in the open for aam aadmi and very few presentations are made in the auditoriums and that too mostly in the educational institutions.

**3. Collaboration with other Akademies is of paramount importance.**

The Akademies should consider the ZCCs as principal agents for taking culture to the rural areas. Collaboration with other institutions under the Ministry of Culture should also be examined.

Yes.

So far the collaboration with other Akademies - Sangeet Natak Akademi; Lalit Kala Akademi; & Sahitya Akademi - has been very negligible.

**4. Structure of the ZCCs should be reviewed.**

It is felt that the policy making body is unwieldy and consists of people who are often too busy to attend meetings. An Apex Body is needed to spearhead the activities of the ZCCs (may be like a Directorate General at the Centre).

Yes.

**5. ZCCs must be patronized at the level of the Prime Minister.**

In the early years of the ZCCs, the then Prime Minister, the late Shri Rajiv Gandhi focused a lot of attention on them. Folk forms, during this period, were for the first time given a high status. This fervour can be recreated if there is support from the highest levels.

It's a great idea.

**6. Infrastructure at the headquarters of the ZCCs was never the objective.**

Nearly all the ZCC's have built elaborate infrastructures that now need maintenance which absorbs a lot of the funds which should have been directed at programs. This construction of infrastructure also has the fall-out of most programs being headquarter focused, rather than being done in the field of the ZCC's jurisdiction. Construction of building further infrastructure should be discouraged.

It is true that infrastructure at headquarters of ZCCs was never the objective, but a bare minimum infrastructure is definitely needed in consonance with the scope of activities in the vast area of the Zone.

So far as NZCC is concerned, the infrastructure at headquarter as well as at Shilpagram (re-christened KALAGRAM) is less than bare minimum required to run the society.

Interactive sessions with artistes in the Zone as well as outside the Zone have given a strong feedback that they long to identify themselves with a 'Macca of Culture' where they can come once in a while even though they are to participate in chain programmes at far off places.

In the Memorandum of Association of the Society- North Zone Cultural Centre registered in 1985 it was stated that its chief object would be to preserve, innovate and promote arts of the Zone under the broad disciplines of Sangeet, Natak, Lalit Kala (the field of visual arts such as Paintings, Sculptures, Graphics, Photography, Ceramics and other arts allied to the field of fine arts) and Sahitya, and to develop and expand a zonal centre of excellence in creative arts. For achieving this objective, a reasonable/ bare minimum infrastructure would be needed.

**7. Relationship of the budget with the objectives of ZCCs should be clearly earmarked.**

Percentage of expenditure should be fixed for outreach in rural areas vis-à-vis expenditure in urban centres / head quarter. At least 90-95% of the programmes should be held in rural areas.

Sizable amount of the budget should be earmarked for payment of honorarium to artistes, sustainable livelihood of the artistes must be ensured.

**8. Qualifications for appointment as Director of ZCC**

The job demands young, dedicated and dynamic persons who have their heart in culture but who can administer, lead and coordinate. We need to cast the net wide to get cultural administrators.

**9. Management of staff of ZCC**

Employment rules, pay scales etc. should be modified and made more flexible. Working hours could be made more flexible. Professionals should be given due place in the ZCCs. A suggestion came that no staff of the ZCC should remain at the headquarter, most of them should be in the field. The administrative structure is a handicap in the functioning of the ZCCs. Orientation and training for staff members should be made mandatory. Suitable training material should be designed.

It is absolutely necessary that percentage of expenditure for outreach in rural areas should be fixed vis-à-vis expenditure in urban centres / head quarter.

NZCC has spent less than 1% of its funds on activities at its head quarter during the last 10 years.

As per 2001 Indian Census, about 74% of population lives in villages. In 2010, it may be around 70% only. Therefore, it would be appropriate, if, 70-75% programmes are held in rural areas instead of 90-95% as recommended. 20-25% programmes need to be organised in towns and cities for the aam aadmi living there.

This recommendation is unexceptionable.

Director of a ZCC must have his heart in culture, who can administer, lead and coordinate.

As regards management of staff of ZCC, the need is for a judicious balance between number of clerical/ trained accounts officials on one side and dynamic professionals on the other.

Professionals with bare minimum support staff can be deployed in the field most of the time.

To make orientation and training for staff members mandatory is also a good idea. For example, the staff needs to be taught the basics of Cultural Event Management.

**10. No para exists.**

**11. Independent assessment mechanism of various programmes organized by the ZCCs must be worked out.**

There needs to be regular, independent assessment of the programmes of the ZCCs. A proper review mechanism needs to be put in place.

There is in fact an inbuilt assessment mechanism of various programmes organised by the NZCC during a particular year by the Programme Committee and Governing Body of this ZCC under the Chairmanship of Governor of Punjab. Since recommendations of the Programme Committee are deliberated upon and approved with modifications wherever necessary by the Governing Body and its implementation during a particular year is in turn again reviewed by Programme Committee followed by Governing Body in the subsequent meeting and so on. Therefore, if any further review mechanism is desired to be put in place then views of the Chairmen of ZCCs should also be ascertained.

**12. Some quality control systems should be put in place and a system of cultural audit should be suggested.**

Since this is a time of gross and crass commercial television the cultural inputs need to be extremely refined with a touch of entertainment value to grab eyeballs. In such a scenario quality control is very important.

Unexceptionable.

**14. Wider dissemination of the Guru Shishya Parampara concept must be encouraged.**

Some ZCCs have signed a MOU with IGNOU for specific certification of the beneficiaries of this scheme either through written or oral tests. Care for aging artistes is of paramount importance so that their children do not hesitate to follow in their parents footsteps. Innovative programming, planning, felicitation of elderly local artistes is needed when performing in that area.

Wider dissemination of Guru Shishya Parampara concept is certainly the need of the hour but so far as MOU with IGNOU for specific certification of the beneficiaries of this scheme either through written or oral tests is concerned, NZCC has certain reservations which still need to be resolved by the Experts already assisting us. The matter will be placed before the Governing Body for a final view on the subject.

**15. Collaborations with cultural institutions on the one hand and youth clubs and panchayats on the other should be encouraged.**

Unexceptionable.

NZCC has already made an encouraging start in this direction during the past one year. A brief report on collaborations with Panchayats and Youth Clubs and also NGOs is annexed with these comments. [Page 9 to 12]

**16. Honorarium paid to artistes may be increased.**

There seems to be a practice in place where only a handful of artistes are repeated: this hampers proper preservation of various art forms. Fool proof payment mechanism should be examined.

Unexceptionable.

**17. On the lines of the 3 Akademies, a recommendation could be made to the competent authority for creating a Folk and Tribal Akademi.**

Debatable recommendation.

**18. For Hill States and the North East a separate travel policy should be made.**

Remote areas can be covered only if these logistical hurdles are removed. Highest level of emotional integration is required in border areas. Appropriate rules should be framed as the cost would be disproportionately higher than other areas.

Unexceptionable.

**19. Apna utsavs ought to be revived and taken to all States by rotation.**

Participation in yatras, utsavs fairs and festivals should be encouraged.

Unexceptionable.

**20. Workshops on different art forms should be encouraged for school children. For this the Navodaya schools are taking an initiative.**

Unexceptionable.

**21. Collaboration with local theatre groups should be encouraged. Traditions of folk theatre like nautanki etc ought to be preserved by training younger practitioners. Similar traditions that maybe on the verge of extinction ought to be unearthed and preserved for future generations.**

NZCC is already working on these lines.

Apart from a number of local theatre groups, we have very active collaboration with Department of Theatre and T.V. of the Punjabi University, Patiala.

**22. Documentation**

Only professional bodies equipped with the latest technology in this area should be involved in archiving and documentation. The ZCCs should act as facilitators to these expert groups.

We would like to suggest that only Research Scholars and Professors in the Universities with a proven track record and Camera persons equipped with latest technology should be involved in archiving and documentation. As recommended, this ZCC is already acting as facilitator to the Experts.